

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**New Zealand Church  
Initiatives for International  
Development:  
A taxonomy and assessment  
framework**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of  
Master of Philosophy in International Development at Massey University,  
Palmerston North, New Zealand

**Claire Hart**

2016



This thesis is dedicated to:

**Dad.**

*For coming on the journey with me.*



# Abstract

Individuals, groups and organisations are increasingly feeling compelled to take action and become personally involved in the field of development cooperation in an attempt to alleviate poverty and improve the lives of the poor. One such do-it-yourself phenomenon that has been observed in New Zealand involves the Christian church.

A grey area has emerged where development activities are now carried out by churches which are amateurs in the field. These initiatives are run by pastors and congregation members acting on the teachings of the Christian faith but with little understanding of the complexities of poverty or development. The altruistic and often selfless intentions of those involved in such initiatives are commendable. But are these do-it-yourself solutions to complex issues of poverty and development really achieving what they say they are? If these initiatives were tested to determine their level of effectiveness, what would the results be?

Motivated by these observations and questions, this thesis seeks to explore this emerging phenomenon. It asks, what does it look like? How might it be defined? Is it effective? This thesis calls the phenomenon *Church Initiatives for International Development* ("CIID"). It argues that CIID is conducted by new development actors and situates CIID in relation to current trends within the industry: the emergence of a fourth channel of development cooperation and the role of religion in development. CIID is compared to current actors in international development, specifically citizen-led initiatives and faith-based initiatives to demonstrate its similarities and differences.

A taxonomy outlining the different types of CIID is presented which provides insight into the range of forms that CIID takes. The research also explores how the effectiveness of CIID might be understood. To achieve this, an assessment framework consisting of eight criteria was created drawing upon mainstream and alternative approaches to effectiveness. This framework was then tested through in-depth interviews with six CIID case studies from donor churches in New Zealand.

By analysing information from the in-depth interviews with donor churches, the study concludes that CIID is more effective across the criteria of *local ownership & participation, collaboration, relationship* and *partnership*, and less effective in the areas of *accountability, measuring success, holistic well-being* and *attitudes and knowledge*. The research also reveals that CIID is typically more effective when a development organisation is involved in a partnership with a church that is implementing CIID.

The findings on the emerging field of CIID that this thesis presents contribute further insight into the nature of do-it-yourself development initiatives in the fourth channel and the role that NZ churches are playing in international development.

# Acknowledgements

Thank you to everyone who participated in this research – from those who had initial conversations with me about do-it-yourself development to those who participated as case studies during my fieldwork and everyone in between.

Thank you to my supervisor, Professor Regina Scheyvens, for your guidance, support, feedback and encouragement. Thank you as well to Dr Sharon McLennan for coming on board towards the end and for your comments and feedback. I also want to express my gratitude to the rest of the International Development Studies staff who have taught and influenced me over the course of my studies.

Thank you to my Mum and Dad for letting me steal your paper and printer ink, for the chats on our walks and for your ongoing support of my education. Also, thank you to my Dad for the hours at the dining room table refining ideas and brainstorming, for pointing out the holes, for always seeking to improve my writing style and for your comments and feedback on the many drafts.

And finally, a big thank you to my wonderful husband, Ed, for patiently putting up with a grumpy wife and for everything you did at home that helped ease the burden for me.

# Contents

<b>Abstract .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Contents .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Chapter One Do-it-yourself development.....</b>	<b>11</b>
Introduction .....	11
1.1 Rationale .....	12
1.2 Research aim & objectives .....	14
1.3 Structure of thesis .....	14
<b>Chapter Two Research methodology .....</b>	<b>16</b>
Introduction .....	16
2.1 Theory & approach.....	16
2.2 Ethical issues .....	17
2.3 Research process & methods .....	21
2.4 Data processing .....	24
2.5 Limitations.....	25
Chapter Summary.....	25
<b>Chapter Three Where has CIID come from?.....</b>	<b>27</b>
Introduction .....	27
3.1 Changing approaches to development.....	29
3.2 Two trends influencing CIID.....	31
3.3 CIID & other development actors.....	36
3.4 Conceptualizing & defining CIID .....	44
Chapter summary.....	47
<b>Chapter Four Development Effectiveness .....</b>	<b>50</b>
Introduction .....	50
4.1 Can CIID be assessed as “development”?.....	52
4.2 Approaches to development effectiveness .....	54
4.3 Effectiveness, the fourth channel and faith.....	57
4.4 Framework to assess the effectiveness of CIID .....	62
Chapter summary.....	64
<b>Chapter Five Perceptions of Effectiveness .....</b>	<b>67</b>
Introduction .....	67
5.1 Introducing the Case Studies.....	68
5.2 Findings from the effectiveness framework test.....	74
Chapter summary.....	97



<b>Chapter Six A Deeper Look at CIID.....</b>	<b>98</b>
Introduction .....	98
6.1 Implications for effectiveness: CIID and the Criticisms of PIs .....	98
6.2 CIID, faith and development.....	110
6.3 Reviewing the framework.....	117
Chapter Summary.....	118
<b>Chapter Seven A Door to Further Enquiry .....</b>	<b>120</b>
7.1 Tracing the research journey.....	120
7.2 Significant outcomes .....	121
7.3 Contribution to development.....	122
7.4 Recommendations .....	123
7.5 Final remarks .....	124
<b>Appendix 1 Cover letter for interested churches.....</b>	<b>126</b>
<b>Appendix 2 Informed consent.....</b>	<b>127</b>
<b>Appendix 3 Information sheet.....</b>	<b>128</b>
<b>Appendix 4 Interview analysis template: evidence of effectiveness criteria .....</b>	<b>131</b>
<b>Appendix 5 Interview analysis template: common findings .....</b>	<b>132</b>
<b>Appendix 6 Report to participants.....</b>	<b>133</b>
<b>Reference List .....</b>	<b>140</b>

# Figures and Tables

<b>Figure 1:</b> The research process	22
<b>Figure 2:</b> Data analysis procedures	26
<b>Figure 3:</b> Understanding where CIID has come from	28
<b>Figure 4:</b> Factors informing as assessment framework for CIID	51
<b>Table 1:</b> Typification of Private Initiatives	38
<b>Table 2:</b> Clarke (2006) Typology of FBOs	41
<b>Table 3:</b> Typologies explaining faith in FBOs	43
<b>Table 4:</b> Taxonomy of CIID	48
<b>Table 5:</b> Criticisms of Private Initiatives	58
<b>Table 6:</b> Effectiveness framework for CIID	65
<b>Table 7:</b> Case studies at a glance – star ranking system	74
<b>Table 8:</b> Findings from effectiveness framework: Local ownership & participation	75
<b>Table 9:</b> Findings from effectiveness framework: Collaboration	78
<b>Table 10:</b> Findings from effectiveness framework: Accountability & reporting	80
<b>Table 11:</b> Findings from effectiveness framework: Measuring success	83
<b>Table 12:</b> Findings from effectiveness framework: Holistic well-being	85
<b>Table 13:</b> Findings from effectiveness framework: Relationship	87
<b>Table 14:</b> Findings from effectiveness framework: Partnership	90
<b>Table 15:</b> Findings from effectiveness framework: Attitudes & knowledge	93
<b>Table 16:</b> Criticisms of Private Initiatives with CIID	99
<b>Table 17:</b> The role of faith in CIID	112

# Abbreviations

CI	Citizen Initiative
CIID	Church Initiative for International Development
FBO	Faith-based Organisation
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
ODA	Official Development Assistance
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PI	Private Initiative
NZ	New Zealand
RNGO	Religious Non-Governmental Organisation
<b>The Paris Declaration</b>	The Paris Declaration of Aid Effectiveness