

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

THE CONSTRUCTION AND USE OF BELIEF IN
COGNITIVE THERAPY: A DISCURSIVE ANALYSIS.

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts in Psychology
at Massey University,
Palmerston North.

Aaron John Jarden

2002

ABSTRACT.

This research explores how the notion of belief is constructed and used within the cognitive therapy domain. Utilising a multi-media approach, in which cognitive therapy texts were gathered from instructional books, demonstration videos, and interviews with practicing psychotherapists, the transcripts were analysed using Jonathan Potter, Derek Edwards and Margaret Wetherell's model of discourse analysis. The analytic attention was on the linguistic resources and practices therapists had available and used in constructing and deploying different notions of belief. By approaching therapists' belief talk in this way and showing the contingent, socially constructed, and rhetorical nature of their discourse use, two main constructions of belief became evident. These were of 'a belief itself' and of 'a believing person'. In addition, Davies and Harrés' positioning theory was utilised which highlighted two main subject positions; the therapist as the 'expert' and the client as the 'layperson'.

The findings tend to support the view that there are medium and therapist specific idiosyncratic aspects to belief, which are constructed and constituted in multiple repertoires and by various discursive strategies. This suggests a need for cognitive therapy to re-evaluate the notion of belief and its various uses, and highlights the benefits and pitfall of utilising a multi-media discursive approach.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.

I am indebted to many people who have contributed to the success of this research project, as I was extremely fortunate to receive extensive support and it is a pleasure to have the opportunity to acknowledge my gratitude.

- I wish to thank many friends, family, and colleagues who, at one time or another during the past year, provided advice, criticism, encouragement, intellectual stimulation or practical support. This thesis would have been of less quality without your help.
- I am grateful to have received help from the members of our 'discourse analysis group' (DAG) that met frequently throughout the year to discuss theoretical and practical aspect of discourse analysis (amongst other things!). I will remember the hours spent exploring the often strange world of discourse analysis together, as well as everyone's ongoing enthusiasm and encouragement.
- I would like to thank the Central Districts Branch of the New Zealand Psychological Society for the honour of receiving the much coveted Student Research Award. The financial assistance from this award enabled a synopsis of this thesis to be presented at the New Zealand Psychological Society's annual conference (2002), and thus enabled some of its' inherent objectives.
- I would also like to thank the interviewees for their time and energy, as well as the Waitamata Health Cognitive Therapy Centre for allowing access to their video resources.
- I am very grateful to *all* of the staff within the Massey University psychology department, Albany campus, who were always positive, cooperative and enthusiastic, and in combination provided an enjoyable environment in which to conduct research. I wish to single out especially Kerry Chamberlain who gave generously of his time, energy, knowledge and wisdom.
- Finally, my supervisor, Professor Andy Lock, also deserves special thanks for his critical insights, editorial suggestions, academic freedom and continual cajolement. Many of the ideas contained in this research came from conversations with Andy, and many of mine would have seemed rather jejune without his contributions.

TABLE OF CONTENTS.

	Page.
COVER	i.
ABSTRACT	ii.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii.
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv.
EXCERPT ONE.....	6.
1. INTRODUCTION	7.
The evolution of this research project.....	7.
A paucity of literature	8.
Why has the construct of belief been overlooked in the cognitive therapy domain?.....	12.
An interest in discourse analysis	14.
Reformulating the research question.....	14.
Aims of the research project	15.
Rationale for the aims	16.
Summary	18.
2. DISCOURSE ANALYSIS.....	20.
Introduction	20.
Discourse analysis	20.
The discursive approach of Potter, Edwards and Wetherell	23.
Why I chose this particular discursive approach	31.
Positioning theory	31.
3. METHODOLOGY.....	34.
Introduction.....	34.
The multi-media approach	34.
Text collection, transcription and coding.....	41.
4. ANALYSIS.....	47.
Introduction.....	47.
An outline of how the analysis was conducted	47.
An overview of the analysis.....	55.
5. THE BELIEF ITSELF	56.
Introduction.....	56.
Presentation notations	56.
Overview	56.
An objectification repertoire	57.
A malleability repertoire	60.
A scientific repertoire.....	63.
Chapter summary	65.

6. THE BELIEVING PERSON	67.
Introduction	67.
Overview	67.
A medical repertoire.....	67.
A defective repertoire.....	70.
A changeability repertoire.....	74.
Chapter summary	77.
7. SUBJECT POSITIONS	78.
Introduction	78.
Caveat emptor: Two points	78.
Positioning overview.....	79.
Utilised positioning strategies	79.
A moral repertoire.....	82.
The function of the strategies and repertoire	83.
8. DISCUSSION	85.
Introduction	85.
The tensions within and between the two constructions.....	85.
Reflections on the multi-media approach	88.
The researchers' wish list.....	89.
Research goals.....	91.
Future research	92.
Summary statement.....	92.
Closing thought	93.
REFERENCES.....	94.
APPENDICES	101.
A: Psychology lectures' constructions of belief	101.
B: Post-graduate psychology students and psychology lectures' constructions of belief	102.
C: Reviewed cognitive therapy instructional books	104.
D: Reviewed cognitive therapy research journals.....	106.
E: Transcription notations	107.
F: Study information sheet	108.
G: Study consent form	109.
H: Interview question list.....	110.
EXCERPT TWO.....	111.

EXCERPT ONE.

An irreligious vacationer accidentally fell over the edge of the Grand Canyon and found himself dangling precariously from a small shrub. As he hung agonizingly close to imminent death, he mustered an awesome prayer of faith and conviction. Suddenly, his cries for supernatural intervention were answered by a thunderous question from the heavens, 'Do you believe?' Startled and inspired, the dangling convert cried, 'Yes...oh, yes, I do believe!' The voice thundered back, 'Do you really believe?' 'Yes, dear God...I really, really believe!' There was a brief silence before the heavenly voice wryly responded, 'Then let go of the shrub...'

Excerpt from Mahoney, 1974, p. 229.