Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

## ASIA-PACIFIC ZOOS IN THE 21<sup>ST</sup> CENTURY: STAKEHOLDER PERCEPTIONS OF THE ROLES AND FUNCTIONS OF ZOOS

# A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
IN
ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT

AT

MASSEY UNIVERSITY
NEW ZEALAND

JERALDINE SHAN-WEI TENG 2015

#### **ABSTRACT**

The advent of the anthropocene accentuates the transformation of ecosystems on a global scale. This study responds to these concerns by assessing the role and function of 21st century zoos in general and the Asia-Pacific zoos in particular. The lack of information on key zoo stakeholders (visitors, staff members, corporate sponsors and zoo associates) is significant in the Asia-Pacific region, particularly in Asia, where there are complexities that may stem from cultural and societal differences. Furthermore, current literature is predominantly based upon Western research and case studies, which rarely take into account the complexities and differences of Asia. This research considers the diversity of the Asia-Pacific region by examining the perceptions and attitudes of the four groups of key stakeholders.

Zoos in six countries across the Asia-Pacific were visited over a period of six months to March 2013 in order to assess the diversity of the study region. A literature survey and meta-analysis of 138 zoo-based publications was employed to create a matrix table of themes, stakeholders, and research outcomes. These results were used to design survey instruments directed at stakeholder groups as well as provide a framework against which the results of this study can be compared and contrasted. Quantitative analysis such as Principal Component Analysis, Spearman's Rho and Kruskal-Wallis H test were used to analyse the results. The face-to-face and computer-based instruments were augmented with the use of a reflective diary and personal work experience to triangulate and validate the research results.

The results show that individual zoos across the world are facing similar challenges. Differences in educational backgrounds and socio-cultural norms within the Asia-Pacific region are reflected in stakeholders' experiences, perceptions, and evaluations of zoos. The results show that there are many differences amongst Asia-Pacific zoo practices, visitor satisfaction, and stakeholder participation and these differences would make it extremely difficult to coordinate activities at a regional level to give them a single voice with a single agenda.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

My journey to complete this thesis has been exciting and challenging. To my parents, thank you for all your sacrifices so that we have the opportunities to pursue the choices and paths we want. To Jaime, Martine, Isaac, and Lincoln, who have supported me throughout this process – this would not have been possible without any of you. A special thanks to Carl, who always believed, and never once doubted me.

To the first person that believed in my abilities to complete this thesis – John Holland. I have learnt so much from the way you value family, friends, and work. You have been instrumental in this process – I cannot thank you enough. You have been and still are a great teacher that inspires. I am fortunate to have four additional intelligent individuals that have supervised and guided me along the way - Trisia Farrelly, Paul Perry, Ed Minot and Bob Stewart, I am grateful to have worked with you at some point in this thesis.

There are countless people in my life that have shared this journey with me in one way or another – I am so grateful that you have fed and ate with me, laughed with and at me, listened to me, and most importantly, be my extra pair of eyes. You know who you are – thank you.

I am grateful to my Sifu and fellow students from the Shaolin Nam Pai Chuan School for your patience during this programme. To the zoos and thousands of participants that agreed to partake in my pilot study and fieldwork, without your time, this research would not have been possible; equally important are the people that I befriended during this period, I am very appreciative for your friendship and hospitality.

A special acknowledgement to AMP and Freemason scholarships, the financial support had been incredibly timely.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. BACKGROUND	1
1.2. PROBLEM STATEMENT	2
1.2.1 AIM	
1.3. OBJECTIVES	2
1.4. CONTRIBUTION OF RESEARCH	3
1.5. SCOPE AND SCALE	3
1.6. RESEARCH DESIGN AND PARTICIPANTS	4
1.7. PERSONAL REFLECTIONS	5
1.8. FIELDWORK PREPARATION	6
1.8.1 Attire	7
1.8.2 Language	7
1.8.3 Logistics	7
1.8.4 ACCOMMODATION	8
1.9. LIMITATIONS	8
1.9.1 Gender disparity	8
1.9.2 Language barriers	9
1.9.3 Translation limitations	. 11
1.9.4 Operational concerns	. 11
1.9.5 Natural disasters	11
1.9.6 Organisational culture	. 11
1.9.7 CORPORATE SPONSORS AND ZOO ASSOCIATES	12
1.10. THESIS OUTLINE	.12
CHAPTER TWO: BACKGROUND	15
CHAPTER TWO: BACKGROUND	,13
2.1. INTRODUCTION	15
2.2. ASIA-PACIFIC	15
2.2.1 DIFFERENT VALUES	18
2.3. HONG KONG, SPECIAL ADMINISTRATION REGION (PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA)	
2.3.1 STUDY ZOO ONE: OCEAN PARK	

2.4. INDONESIA		21
2.4.1	STUDY ZOO TWO: TAMAN SAFARI	22
2.5. MALAYSIA		22
2.5.1	STUDY ZOO THREE: ZOO NEGARA	23
2.6. NEW ZEALA	AND	24
2.6.1	STUDY ZOO FOUR: AUCKLAND ZOO	25
2.7. THE PHILIP	PINES	25
2.7.1	STUDY ZOO FIVE: ZOOBIC SAFARI	27
2.8. THAILAND		27
	STUDY ZOO SIX: KHAO KHEOW OPEN ZOO	
2.9. CONCLUSIO	)N	28
2.9. 0011020510		20
CHAPTER TH	REE: LITERATURE SURVEY	31
3.1. INTRODUCT	ΓΙΟΝ	31
3.2. EVOLUTION	N OF ZOOS	32
3.3. THE MODE	RN ZOO	34
3.4. STAKEHOL	DERS	36
3.4.1	Visitors	37
3.4.2	STAFF MEMBERS	38
3.4.3	CORPORATE SPONSORS	40
3.4.4	ZOO ASSOCIATES	41
3.5. CONCLUSIO	ON	42
CHAPTER FO	UR: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS	45
4.1. INTRODUCT	ΓΙΟΝ	45
4.2. RESEARCH	DESIGN	45
4.3. QUESTIONN	NAIRE DESIGN	46
-	META-ANALYSIS – MATRIX TABLE	
4.4. SELECTION	OF STUDY SITES	49
4.5. SELECTION	CRITERIA FOR RESPONDENTS	50
4.6. PILOT STUL	ΟΥ	51
4.7. OUESTIONN	NAIRES	52
	VISITOR OUESTIONNAIRE	

4.7.2	STAFF QUESTIONNAIRE	52
4.7.3	CORPORATE SPONSOR QUESTIONNAIRE	53
4.7.4	ZOO ASSOCIATE QUESTIONNAIRE	53
4.8. TRANSLATION	ON PROCESS	54
4.9. QUESTIONN	AIRE DISTRIBUTION PROCEDURES	55
4.9.1	VISITOR QUESTIONNAIRE	56
4.9.2	STAFF MEMBER QUESTIONNAIRE	58
4.9.3	CORPORATE SPONSOR QUESTIONNAIRE	59
4.9.4	ZOO ASSOCIATE QUESTIONNAIRE	59
4.10. DATA MAN	NAGEMENT	59
4.11. STATISTIC	AL SOFTWARE	60
4.12. DESCRIPTI	IVE DATA ANALYSIS	60
4.13. QUANTITA	TIVE ANALYSES	60
4.14. QUALITAT	TVE ANALYSES	62
4.14.1	REFLECTIVE DIARY	63
4.15. ETHICAL C	CONSIDERATIONS AND PROCESS	65
4.16. CONCLUSI	ON	66
CHAPTED EW		(7
CHAPIER FIV	E: RESULTS	
5.1. INTRODUCT	ION	67
5.2. VISITOR STA	AKEHOLDERS	67
5.2.1	RESPONSE RATES	68
5.2.2	VISITOR DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE	70
5.2.3	CONCEPTUAL THEMES	73
5.2.4	STATISTICAL THEMES: VISITORS	77
5.2.5	FURTHER ANALYSIS: VISITORS	88
5.2.6	OVERALL SATISFACTION	90
5.2.7	VISITORS: SUMMARY	90
5.2.8	QUESTION EXCLUDED FROM ANALYSIS	91
5.3. STAFF MEM	BER STAKEHOLDERS	92
5.3.1	RESPONSE RATES	93
5.3.2	STAFF DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE	95
5.3.3	CONCEPTUAL THEMES	98
5.3.4	STATISTICAL THEMES: STAFF MEMBERS	104
5.3.5	FURTHER ANALYSIS	113

5.3.6	STAFF MEMBERS: SUMMARY	115
5.3.7	QUESTION EXCLUDED FROM ANALYSIS	115
5.4. CORPORAT	E SPONSOR STAKEHOLDERS	116
5.4.1	CONCEPTUAL THEMES	118
5.4.2	THEMATIC ANALYSIS	121
5.4.3	CORPORATE SPONSORS: SUMMARY	122
5.4.4	QUESTION EXCLUSION FROM ANALYSIS	122
5.5. ZOO ASSOC	CIATE STAKEHOLDERS	122
5.5.1	CONCEPTUAL THEMES	123
5.5.2	THEMATIC ANALYSIS	126
5.5.3	ZOO ASSOCIATES: SUMMARY	127
5.6. CONCLUSIO	ON	127
CHAPTER SIX	X: DISCUSSION	129
6.1. INTRODUC	TION	129
6.2. VISITOR EN	IGAGEMENT	130
6.2.1	Identify visitors	133
6.2.2		
6.2.3	ADOPT COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY	137
	TION TO NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL CONSERVATIO	
	ND HABITAT	
6.3.1		
6.3.2	DEVELOP AND MAINTAIN PARTNERSHIPS	144
6.4. STAFF ENG	AGEMENT	145
6.4.1	HEALTHY WORK ENVIRONMENT	147
6.4.2	SUPPORTIVE AND INCLUSIVE LEADERSHIP	150
6.4.3	STAFF DEVELOPMENT	152
6.5. ANIMAL M	ANAGEMENT STANDARDS	154
6.5.1	ETHICAL AND SUSTAINABLE PRACTICES	154
6.6. INFRASTRU	JCTURE FOR ANIMALS	157
6.6.1	NATURALISTIC ANIMAL EXHIBITS	157
6.7. RESEARCH	PROGRAMMES	160
6.7.1	SUPPORT RESEARCH	161
6.7.2	PROMOTE GUIDELINES AND PROTOCOLS FOR RESEARCHERS	165
6.8. COMMERC	IAL VIABILITY	166
6.8.1	FINANCIAL, ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL SUSTAINABILITY	167

6.8.2 MUTUALLY BENEFICIAL PARTNERSHIPS	168
6.9. CONCLUSION	170
CHAPTER SEVEN: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATI	ONS 171
7.1.1 Broad global issues	177
7.1.2 REGIONAL AND LOCAL ISSUES	178
7.2. RECOMMENDATIONS	181
7.3. FUTURE RESEARCH	183
7.4. CONCLUSION	184
CHAPTER EIGHT: REFERENCES	185
APPENDIX A: MATRIX FRAMEWORK FOR THE META-ANA LITERATURE THAT INFORMED THE SURVEY INSTRUMEN THIS RESEARCH.	TS FOR
APPENDIX B: VISITORS RESPONSE RATES	295
DAILY VISITORS RESPONSE RATES FOR ALL STUDY SITES	296
APPENDIX C: SURVEY INSTRUMENTS (ENGLISH)	297
VISITOR SURVEY	297
STAFF MEMBER SURVEY	301
CORPORATE SPONSOR SURVEY	305
ZOO ASSOCIATE SURVEY	309
APPENDIX D: ETHICS APPROVAL	313
MASSEY UNIVERSITY HUMAN ETHICS (LOW RISK NOTIFICATION)	313
APPENDIX E: DISTRIBUTION OF RESPONSE IN PERCENTAGE	GES 315
DISTRIBUTION OF VISITORS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM NI	
DISTRIBUTION OF VISITORS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM IN	
DISTRIBUTION OF VISITORS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM M	ALAYSIA 320

	VISITORS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM THE32	2
DISTRIBUTION OF	VISITORS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM THAILAND32	4
DISTRIBUTION OF SAR	VISITORS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM HONG KONG,	6
DISTRIBUTION OF ZEALAND	STAFF MEMBERS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM NEW	8
	STAFF MEMBERS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM	0
DISTRIBUTION OF MALAYSIA	STAFF MEMBERS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM	2
	STAFF MEMBERS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM THE	4
DISTRIBUTION OF THAILAND	STAFF MEMBERS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM	6
	STAFF MEMBERS RESPONSES IN PERCENTAGES FROM HONG33	8

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1.	Summary of the Chinese language variations used and encountered in Hong Kong9
Table 2.1.	Area size of protected and total land in case study countries in the Asia-Pacific region
Table 2.2	Key characteristics of each case study zoo in this research adn their country of origin
Table 4.1.	Conceptual themes extrapolated from the body of literature for each stakeholder group. The full matrix from which these themes derived is provided in Appendix A
Table 5.1.	The analytical methods adopted to examine the role and functions of zoo as perceived by visitors in the Asian-pacific region
Table 5.2.	The response rates in percentages of visitor questionnaires, categorised by country
Table 5.3.	The demographic variables of visitors' responses in percentages, catagorised by the study zoos in their respective countries (HK: Hong Kong, IN: Indonesia, MY: Malaysia, NZ: New Zealand, PH: Philippines, TH: Thailand, ALL: All countries)
Table 5.4.	Percentage of visitors' self-identified religion at each study zoo in their respective countries.
Table 5.5.	Percentage distribution of visitors' with 'strongly agree' responses regarding statements surrounding their motivation, perceptions, behaviours, and expectations at each study zoo in their respective countries. (Qs¹: Question number, NZ: New Zealand, IN: Indonesia, MY: Malaysia, PH: The Philippines, TH: Thailand, HK: Hong Kong, ALL: All case study zoos)74
Table 5.6.	Percentage of variance for each of the seven components extrapolated using Principal Component Analysis. Each component groups the statements that explain the variance of visitor responses in the data
Table 5.7.	The list of visitor questionnaire statements, grouped by the components calculated using Principal Components Analysis. (T: Refers to the corresponding conceptual themes from Table 5.5, and Q: Question number from the visitor questionnaire). Shaded columns represent the corresponding component number that each statement belongs in
Table 5.8.	Spearman's rho correlation coefficient values reflecting the strength of the relationship between demographic variables of visitors and each component <sup>1</sup> for all six study zoos.
Table 5.9	Thematic grouping of visitors' reasons for visiting the zoo (Question 51) 89

Table 5.10	Percentage distribution for questions 49, 52, and 52 from visitor questionnaire per study zoo's country (Y: Yes. N: No, M: Missing data)90
Table 5.11	The analytical methods adopted to examine the role and functions of zoo as perceived by staff members in the Asian-pacific region93
Table 5.12	. Total staff questionnaires from each study zoo in their respective countries. (Employment numbers include regular volunteers, casual staff, and permanent staff members)
Table 5.13	Percentage distribution of staff members by demographic characteristics from each study zoo and all zoos combined (HK: Hong Kong, SAR, IN: Indonesia, MY: Malaysia. NZ: New Zealand, PH: Philippines, TH: Thailand, ALL: All study zoos)
Table 5.14	Percentage distribution of staff members' with 'strongly agree' responses regarding statements surrounding their motivation, perceptions, behaviours, and expectations per case study sites in their respective countries (Qs: Question number, NZ: New Zealand, IN: Indonesia, MY: Malaysia, PH: The Philippines, TH: Thailand, HK: Hong Kong, ALL: All case study zoos)
Table 5.15	Percentage of variance for each of the eight components extrapolated using Principal Component Analysis. Each component groups the statements that explain the variance of staff member responses in the data
Table 5.16	Statistical themes: Statements from staff member's questionnaire grouped into the eight components as extracted using Principal Component Analysis. (T: Conceptual themes extrapolation from Table 5.15; No: Question number from questionnaire)
Table 5.17	Spearman's rho correlation coefficient values reflecting the strength of the relationship between demographic variables of staff members and each component for all six study zoos
Table 5.18	The top ten most rewarding aspects of staff members' job, categorised under each study zoo in their respective countries. These aspects were coded as follows: (1) working with or being close to wildlife; (2) interaction with the public/visitors; (3) interaction with fellow colleagues; (4) contributing to conservation efforts; (5) physical environment of the zoo; (6) financial incentives; (7) intrinsic factors; (8) development; (9) miscellaneous; and (10) no comment
Table 5.19	The extent to which corporate sponsors agree with the statements regarding their perception, attitudes, opinions, and evaluation — percentage of responses for each statement in corporate sponsors' questionnaires with the distribution of response (Qs: Question number, $n = 15$ ; SD: Strongly Disagree, D: Disagree, N: Neither disagree nor agree, A: Agree, SA: Strongly Agree, DK: Don't Know, M: Missing data)
Table 5.20	The extent to which zoo associates agree with the statements regarding their perception, attitudes, opinions, and evaluation – percentage of responses for each statement in zoo associates questionnaires with the distribution of response (Qs: Question number, $n = 20$ ; SD: Strongly Disagree, D:

Disagree, N: Neither disagree nor agree, A: Agree, SA: Strongly Agree, DK: Don't Know, M: Missing data)
Table 6.1. Key characteristics and attributes of the modern zoo as perceived by major stakeholders in the Asia-Pacific region
Table 6.2. Summary of literature and research findings: Visitor engagement
Table 6.3. Summary of literature and research findings: Contribution to national and international conservation of species and habitat
Table 6.4. Summary of literature and research findings: Staff engagement147
Table 6.5. Summary of literature and research findings: Animal management standards
Table 6.6. Summary of literature and research findings: Infrastructure for animals 157
Table 6.7. Summary of literature and research findings: Research programmes161
Table 6.8. Summary of literature and research findings: Commercial viability167
Table 7.7.1. Key research findings and recommendations for the Asia-Pacific zoos172

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1.	Selected case study countries in the Asia-Pacific region for this research 16
Figure 2.2.	Regional map of Hong Kong, SAR with the location of the case study zoo identified
Figure 2.3.	Regional map of Indonesia with the location of the case study zoo identified.
Figure 2.4.	Regional map of Malaysia the location of the case study zoo identified 23
Figure 2.5.	Regional map of New Zealand with the location of case study zoo identified.
Figure 2.6.	Regional map of the Philippines with the location of the case study zoo identified
Figure 2.7.	Regional map of Thailand with the location of the case study site identified.
Figure 3.1.	Evolution of captive wildlife facilities through the centuries - Adapted from Chicago Zoological Society, 1994 (Rabb and Saunders, 2005)33
Figure 4.1.	Translation process used for this research (Brislin, 1970)
Figure 5.1.	The distribution of local versus foreign visitors at each case study site ( <i>n</i> = 2279, HK: 397, IN: 346, MY: 449, NZ: 375, PH: 354, TH: 358). <i>Missing data</i> refers to the percentage of respondents that did not answer this question.
Figure 5.2.	Distribution of staff questionnaires across all countries ( $n = 756$ )94
Figure 6.1.	Left to right: Non-traditional interactive animal displays at the Hamadryas baboons' exhibit (Auckland, New Zealand) and conventional displays at the deer enclosure (Zoo Negara, Malaysia)
Figure 6.2.	Displays near the Orangutan exhibit informing visitors about the palm-oil free campaign at Auckland Zoo, New Zealand
Figure 6.3.	Non-animal zoo staff members volunteering in local conservation efforts (Left) and keeping the local community clean by picking up litter during office hours (Right).
Figure 6.4.	An excerpt from my personal diary regarding my opinions and experiences about working alongside my colleagues in a zoo
Figure 6.5.	An experience I encountered regarding ethical and sustainable practices of animal management when travelling in Southeast Asia

Figure 6.6	Photo-taking opportunities with endangered species such as leopards and Asian elephants found on roadsides in popular tourist areas in Thailand (O'Connor and Reyes, 2011).
Figure 6.7.	Permanent housing conditions for surplus and non-display animals that are hidden from the view of the public
Figure 6.8.	Asian small-clawed otter exhibits at two zoos. Both may be considered natural but only the exhibit on the left is suitable for the animal. Exhibition on the left allows the otters to express natural behaviours such as diving as it contains a deep body of water, whereas the exhibit on the right does not. 159
Figure 6.9.	Viewing platform in the Singapore Zoo's Treetops Trail, where visitors look for siamangs in the canopies of trees (A siamang is an arboreal species of ape)
Figure 6.10	2. Current range of research disciplines in zoos (World Association of Zoo and Aquariums, 2005)
Figure 6.11	. An example of applied adaptive management framework with recommended steps for creating and evaluating a five year Zoo Biodiversity Action Plan (Hambly and Marshall, 2014, p. 3)