Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Are treatments effective for youth with anxiety disorders? A meta-analysis

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts
in
Psychology
at Massey University, Wellington,
New Zealand.

Kirsten McMurray
2003
Abstract

Anxiety disorders are a disabling and enduring problem for a significant number of children and adolescents. Research in New Zealand has indicated anxiety disorders in adolescence are associated with anxiety, depression, substance dependence and academic underachievement later in life (Woodward & Fergusson, 2001). The purpose of this study was to examine the effectiveness of cognitive-behavioural treatments for childhood anxiety disorders. An additional aim was to establish the clinical significance of treatment outcomes. The design used was a meta-analysis. Seventeen outcome studies were identified for inclusion dating back to 1970, with a sample of 984 child participants, all diagnosed with a primary anxiety disorder. Though not one of the inclusion criteria, all studies employed behavioural or cognitive-behavioural approaches to treatment. Results indicated treatments were successful in alleviating anxiety symptoms and disorders as well as related areas of functioning. Overall findings indicated the average treated child was 79% more improved than untreated children or those treated with attention placebo conditions. Results also indicate that treatment effects are maintained across studies at various follow-up intervals. Moderator analyses suggested treatments to be effective for a range of anxiety disorders. Methodological limitations are identified and suggestions are made regarding future research. The relevance and application of the findings to the New Zealand context are considered.
Acknowledgments

Thank Dr Kevin Ronan for sharing his expertise and knowledge and in supervising me in completing this project. I also wish to thank John Bushnell for his helpful suggestions and comments throughout the writing and planning of this thesis.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ............................................................... i  
Acknowledgments ................................................... ii  
Table of Contents .................................................. iii  
List of Figures ....................................................... vi  
List of Tables ....................................................... vii  

## 1 Introduction .................................................. 1  
1.1 When is Anxiety a Problem? ................................ 2  
1.2 Prevalence and Course ...................................... 4  
1.3 Chronicity .................................................... 5  
1.4 Comorbidity of Disorders ................................... 6  
1.5 Age ............................................................. 7  
1.6 Gender .......................................................... 7  
1.7 Family Factors ............................................... 9  
1.7.1 Genetics and Neurobiology ............................. 9  
1.7.2 Family Processes ....................................... 10  
1.8 Cognition ....................................................... 12  
1.9 Assessment of Anxiety Disorders Diagnosed in Childhood 12  
1.10 Treatment ..................................................... 13  
1.10.1 Overview: Psychopharmacological and Psychosocial Approaches 13  
1.11 Behavioural Approaches ................................... 14  
1.11.1 Systematic Desensitisation ............................ 14  
1.11.2 Contingency Management .............................. 16  
1.11.3 Modelling ................................................ 17  
1.12 Cognitive Self-control Training ......................... 18  
1.13 Cognitive Behavioural Therapy ......................... 18  
1.14 Preventative Interventions ............................... 22  
1.15 The New Zealand Context ................................ 23  
1.16 This Review .................................................. 24  
1.16.1 Meta-analysis ............................................ 24  
1.16.2 Criticisms of Meta-analyses .......................... 25  
1.16.3 Effect Sizes in Meta-analyses ........................ 26  
1.16.4 Clinical Significance in Meta-analysis ................ 29  
1.17 Meta-analyses of Child Psychotherapy Outcomes ...... 31  

## 2 Method ......................................................... 33  
2.1 Inclusion Criteria .......................................... 33  
2.2 Search Procedure ............................................ 34
2.3 Outcome of Search ______________________ 36
2.4 Coding Procedure ______________________ 36
2.5 Schmidt-Hunter Meta-analysis Methods _________ 37
2.6 Analyses _________________________ 37
2.6.1 Missing Data _________________________ 37
2.6.2 Calculation of Effect Sizes _______________ 38
2.6.3 Between-group Effect Sizes ________________ 40
2.6.4 Within-group Effect Sizes _______________ 42
2.6.5 Effect Sizes from Proportions ______________ 43
2.6.6 Multiple Outcome Measures _______________ 44
2.6.7 Outliers __________________________ 45
2.6.8 Evaluation of Clinical Significance ___________ 45
2.6.9 Homogeneity ______________________ 48
2.7 Moderator Analyses ____________________ 48
2.8 File Drawer Analysis ____________________ 50
2.9 Power Analysis _________________________ 50

2 Results __________________________ 51
3.1 Descriptive Statistics _____________________ 51
3.1.1 Characteristics of Participants _____________ 51
3.1.2 Characteristics of Studies _________________ 52
3.2 Main Effects ________________________ 55
3.2.1 Diagnostic Outcomes ______________________ 60
3.2.2 Within-group Effects ______________________ 60
3.3 Clinical Significance ____________________ 61
3.3.1 Reliable Change Index ____________________ 61
3.3.2 Normative Comparisons ____________________ 61
3.4 Moderator Analysis ______________________ 62
3.4.1 Interaction of Gender ______________________ 62
3.4.2 Interaction of Age _________________________ 63
3.4.3 Interaction of Homogeneity of Sample _________ 63
3.4.4 Interaction of Assessment Modality __________ 64
3.4.5 Interaction of Treatment Modality ___________ 64
3.4.6 Interaction of Control Group _________________ 65
3.4.7 Effect moderated by Methodological Quality _______ 65
3.5 File Drawer Analysis ____________________ 67
3.6 Power Analysis _________________________ 67

4 Discussion ___________________________ 68
4.1 Overall Treatment Effects __________________ 68
3.2 Summary of Study Characteristics ____________ 69
4.3 Methodological Issues ____________________ 73
4.3.1 Limitations of Meta-analyses ______________ 73
4.3.2 Calculation of Effects ________________ 75
4.4 Recommendations for Future Research _________ 80
4.5 Implications for New Zealand _____________ 85
List of Figures

Figure I 56
List of Tables

Table 1 ........................................... 52
Table 2 ........................................... 57
Table 3 ........................................... 58
Table 4 ........................................... 59
Table 5 ........................................... 62
Table 6 ........................................... 66