Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
THE CONTRIBUTION OF THE INFORMAL SECTOR TO DEVELOPMENT
A STUDY OF STREET FOOD VENDORS
IN JAKARTA INDONESIA

A thesis presented in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Philosophy in Development Studies at
Massey University
Palmerston North
New Zealand

Fixy

2004
This thesis discusses how the development strategies and policies implemented by the Government have failed to distribute income and wealth and have exacerbated inequality instead. It shows viewpoints which argued that this kind of development has enriched only a few people while leaving others marginalised. It also reveals that the misconception of ideal development as similar to the state found in developed countries has undermined other forms of economic activities and development which are different from and do not conform to the recipe given by those model countries. It leads to the harsh treatment and affects many economic activities initiated by the marginalised people.

This study tries to point out the importance of the informal sector to development, which forms a large portion of the workforce in many developing countries. It studied how these economic activities provided a means for survival for those people. It assesses the contribution of this sector to job creation, income generation activities, improved livelihoods and living standards. It studied the sustainability of this sector against the economic crisis which started in the middle of 1997. It focused on food businesses operated on the
sidewalks in the area known as the Segi Tiga Emas (the Golden Triangle) in Jakarta. The results of this study revealed a number of interesting findings.

This particular informal sector was found to make a huge contribution to the livelihoods of the people involved in it. It also contributed to the well-being of many people who used its services. Some of the income derived from these businesses was transferred to other provinces from where the vendors came from, meaning it helped in the regional distribution of wealth. As most of these businesses employed relatives or family members it also created jobs for the unemployed. These businesses were found not to be badly affected by the economic crisis and seeing how they had been running for a number of years, they were also sustainable. Unfortunately, this good living enjoyed by the people involved in this sector was only for the self-employed or the owners of the businesses. The wage workers who worked at street food stalls did not receive a good income for their labour nor did they get any protection from the Indonesian Government.

Regardless, the existence of the informal sector should not be curbed or eliminated. The Government should take decisive steps in promoting the development of this sector. This promotion should include steps to protect the rights of the workers in this sector. The development policies and programmes should regard the development of individuals, small groups and marginalised people as an important part of development.
I could have never been able to write and complete this thesis without the assistance and support given by so many people. Unfortunately, I could not mention everyone in this limited space but this does not mean I thank them less. There are some people to whom I would like to make some acknowledgements for the special roles they had played in the writing of this thesis and during the course of my study.

First of all, I would like to say thank you to Dr. Susan Maia for all her suggestions, assistance and concerns during the writing of this thesis. I would also like to express my heart-felt appreciation to Dr. Tony Banks for his invaluable inputs, attention, guidance and encouragement, for helping me through the most critical stage in my writing. I would also like to thank him for his understanding and friendship during my two years of study at Massey University which had made this study and thesis writing less daunting. To Professor John Overton, thank you so much for all the constructive suggestions which helped a lot to improve this thesis, for being very supportive and available throughout my study at Development Studies.

Second of all, I want to express my deepest appreciation to my dearest friends Rini and Mbak Endang who had given their assistance and support without having to be asked when I needed them most. Thank you for being there for me, for being patient and understanding and for thinking of me. Your
friendships had helped me through the most difficult time I had to face here. I realise that I am very lucky to have friends like you both.

I would also like to thank other friends at the postgraduates’ office for all the constructive discussions we have had. Knowing that we were all in the same boat had lifted my spirits up when they were down. My special thanks to Kelly for her assistance in pre-testing my survey-interview questionnaire and for proof-reading my thesis. To Olive thank you for being so nice and perceptive. To my other friends in development studies, thank you for making my time in New Zealand full of fun and memorable.

Many thanks are due to other lecturers in development studies who have contributed so much during my study at Massey University. I would also like to thank all the personnel at ISO, Sylvia, Sue, Philip and Joe who had paid so much attention and given all the help they could to make my study ran as smoothly as possible. I must thank NZAID for providing a scholarship which has made this study possible for me.

To my Indonesians friends who welcomed me warmly into their community, thank you for all your assistance and friendships. Particular thanks to Mbak Iin, Mbak Emy and Pak Achmad, Mbak Erna and Pak Trie, Pak Indra and Mbak Jassi, Mbak Ana, Pak Arfin, Mbak Yanti, Mbak Novi and Mas Wawan, and many other who had been very kind and helpful. To Adrian, many thanks for your willingness to help when I was in ‘exile’ and to Kyi Kyi for keeping me company. To Barbara thank you for providing a place where I could work and focus on my thesis.
There were a number of people who had given their assistance and cooperation during my research and study. To all of them are my gratitude sent. I want to thank all the street food vendors who had spared their valuable time to take part in my research. Particular thanks are sent to Ms. Hani from ADB, Ms. Nio from Atmadjaya University and Ms. Dewi from the Central Bureau of Statistics.

I also wish to express my thanks to all my colleagues and superiors at the Ministry of Cooperatives and Small Medium Enterprises for their support and patience. To Mrs. Hermien Head of Data and Information and my other colleagues in that Department who had to work for these past two years without me. Special thanks to Mr. Wayan Suardja, the Head of the Bureau of Planning and Data, for all his attention and support for my study. I would also like to express my deepest appreciation to Mr. Fajar Sofyan the Ministry Secretary for all his encouragement, support and belief in me.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my family who has been extremely understanding of my needs, who is always there for me. I have just realised that I never say that I love you. Please allow me to say it now, I do love you all and am sorry for my detached manner and self-centredness. Thank you for being very patient and for always wishing all the best for me. This thesis is dedicated to you.

My apologies to other people I have forgotten to acknowledge in here, thank you for all your contributions in the course of my study and life here in New Zealand.
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thesis Title</th>
<th>i</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glossary</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER ONE**

**INTRODUCTION**

1.1 Introduction

1.2 The Formal and Informal Sectors

1.2.1 The Failings of the Formal Sector

1.2.2 Growth and Advantages of the Informal Sector and Its Increased Importance in Development Theory

1.3 Micro and Small-Scale Enterprises

1.4 The Case of Indonesia

1.5 The Objectives of the Thesis

1.6 Research Methodology

1.7 Thesis Outline
CHAPTER TWO
LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction 13
2.2 Definitions 15
2.3 The Emergence of the Informal Sector Theories 20
2.4 Characteristics of the Informal Sector in Developing Countries 23
  2.4.1 Interrelationship between the Formal and Informal Sectors 23
  2.4.2 Why Work in the Informal Sector 24
  2.4.3 Who Works in the Informal Sector? 24
  2.4.4 Decision Making Processes 25
  2.4.5 Strategies (Strengths and Weaknesses) 26
  2.4.6 Legality 26
2.5 The Informal Sector in Comparative Regional Perspective 28
2.6 The Contribution of the Informal Sector 31
  2.6.1 Income Generation 32
  2.6.2 Employment Creation 33
2.7 Summary 36

CHAPTER THREE
THE INFORMAL SECTOR IN INDONESIA

3.1 Introduction 38
3.2 Overview of Economic Development in Indonesia 39
  3.2.1 Historical Context 39
  3.2.2 Economic Crisis and Its Impacts 42
  3.2.3 Implications for the Informal Sector 43
  3.2.4 Poverty 44
  3.2.5 Migration (Urbanisation) 47
  3.2.6 Unemployment 49
3.3 Overview of the Informal Sector in Indonesia 53
Table of Contents

3.4 Street Food Businesses 54
3.4.1 Health Issues 54
3.4.2 Legal Issues 55
3.4.3 The Role of the Informal Sector in the Economy 56
3.5 The Role of the Government 57
3.6 Summary 59

CHAPTER IV
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND FIELDWORK 60
4.1 Introduction 60
4.2 Research Design and Procedures 62
4.3 Methodology in Practice 65
4.3.1 Design of Survey-interview Questionnaire 66
4.3.2 Participant Observation 69
4.4 Research Population 70
4.5 Ethics 72
4.5.1 Fieldwork Logistics 74
4.5.2 Consent of Participants and Conducting Interviews 74
4.5.3 Treatment of Data 75

CHAPTER FIVE
FIELDWORK DATA ANALYSIS 76
5.1 Introduction 76
5.2 Street Food Vendors 79
5.3 Profile of the Owners 81
5.3.1 Educational Background and Gender 81
5.3.2 Age and Marital Status 83
5.3.3 Origin and Years Spent in Jakarta 85
5.3.4 Reasons for Working in the Informal Sector 87
5.3.5 Business Strategies 91
Appendix 9: Number of Workers, Working Hours and Open Days and Daily Income

Appendix 10: Marital Status, Children to Support, Residence, Origin, Years Spent in Jakarta, Years of Starting the Business Status and Duration of Employment

BIBLIOGRAPHY
LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 3.1 : Poverty Line in Indonesia (Rp) 1976-1999 45
TABLE 3.2 : The Increase in Number and Percentage of the Poor 1976-1999 47
TABLE 3.3 : Workforce Percentage by Sector in Urban and Rural Areas 1997-1999 50
TABLE 3.4 : The Elasticity of Job Opportunity 51
TABLE 3.5 : Open Unemployment by Gender and Residence 52
TABLE 3.6 : Half Unemployment in Indonesia 1997-1999 52
TABLE 5.1 : Owners, Workers and Others 80
TABLE 5.2 : Educational Background (Owners) 82
TABLE 5.3 : Age and Marital Status (Owners) 84
TABLE 5.4 : Origin and Years Spent in Jakarta (Owners) 85
TABLE 5.5 : Origin and Years of Opening the Current Stall 87
TABLE 5.6 : Reasons for Working in the Informal Sector in Jakarta (Owners) 91
TABLE 5.7 : Number of Workers and Working Hours 92
TABLE 5.8 : Business Strategies 95
TABLE 5.9 : Daily Income of the Stalls .................................................. 96
TABLE 5.10 : Educational Background (Workers) .................................. 100
TABLE 5.11 : Age and Marital Status (Workers) .................................... 101
TABLE 5.12 : Origin and Years Spent in Jakarta (Workers) ...................... 102
TABLE 5.13 : Duration of Employment ................................................ 103
TABLE 5.14 : Reasons for Working in the Informal Sector in Jakarta (Workers) .......................................................... 104
TABLE 5.15 : Employment in the Informal Sector ................................... 109
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 4.1: Research Design and Procedures  
Figure 4.2: Methodology in Practice  
Figure 4.3: Research Population  
Figure 5.1: Connection between Questions and Data Found  
Figure 5.2: Relationship with the Government  
Figure 7.1: The Contribution of the Informal Sector to Development
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACFTU</td>
<td>All China Federation of Trade Unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADB</td>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPS</td>
<td>Central Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ekonomi Rakyat</td>
<td>People's Economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First World</td>
<td>Developed countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRDP</td>
<td>Gross Regional Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBRA</td>
<td>Indonesian Bank Restructuring Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jabotabek</td>
<td>Jakarta, Bogor, Tanggerang and Bekasi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kelurahan</td>
<td>The lowest branch of the Government's body</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDCs</td>
<td>Less Developed Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSEs</td>
<td>Micro and Small Enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pemda</td>
<td>City Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pesantren</td>
<td>An institution which focuses on Islamic teaching, often considered as an informal education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PREALC</td>
<td>United Nations Regional Employment Programme for Latin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term</td>
<td>Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ramadhan</td>
<td>The month in the Islamic Calendar where the Muslims fast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sakernas</td>
<td>National Labour Force Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPs</td>
<td>Structural Adjustment Programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Elementary School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Segi Tiga Emas</td>
<td>Golden Triangle (Business District Centre formed by three main streets)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMA</td>
<td>Senior High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMP</td>
<td>Junior High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susenas</td>
<td>National Economic Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third World</td>
<td>Developing and Less Developed Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trantib</td>
<td>City Public Order Force (Agency) whose job is to clean city streets’ off of its offenders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tukang Ojek</td>
<td>People who used their motor cycle (or others’ that they rent) to transport people to their destination for an agreed fee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>