

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

THE ETHICS OF CHARITY ADVERTISING

ANNE THERESE KELLY

B.A. (MASSEY)

This thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Master of Philosophy (M.Phil.), Massey University.

Institute of Development Studies
Massey University
February 1994

ABSTRACT

This thesis examines a selection of promotional material from the five largest, development oriented non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in New Zealand. A variety of investigation techniques have been used to assess the ethics of the advertising practices of World Vision, Save the Children Fund, Christian Children's Fund, Tear Fund and Christian World Service. Each NGO is placed in its appropriate social and historical context. These organizations not only provide aid but also produce images of the Third World. A content analysis is undertaken of 655 promotional images, followed by a more detailed semiotic investigation of three case studies. Areas where the strategies of particular agencies are inconsistent with various advertising standards and recommendations are identified. This thesis concludes with general recommendations of ethically appropriate techniques in charity advertising.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank all the staff members from the NGOs studied who have been involved with me in this project from the outset. Special appreciation goes out to those who have been in constant correspondence with me over the past two years, and who have given generously of their time and energy, not to mention the generous amounts of promotional material made available to me without hesitation. Special thanks go out to Beulah Wood (WV), John Bowis (SCF), Jill Eagle (CCF), Vivienne Coombs (Tear Fund) and Barbara Stephens from CWS. I also wish to express my appreciation to all those who took the time to complete my questionnaire. Without the co-operation of the above people (and many others) this research would not have been possible.

CHAPTER FIVE - CONTENT ANALYSIS OF NGO PROMOTIONAL MATERIAL

- Introduction.....	59
- Methodology.....	60
- Section A.....	64
- Section B.....	66
- Section C.....	67
- Section A - Discussion of Results.....	69
- Section B - Discussion of Results.....	75
- Section C - Discussion of Results.....	79
- Summary of Content Analysis Results.....	83
- Conclusion.....	85

CHAPTER SIX - SEMIOTIC THEORY

- Introduction.....	87
- Peirce's Icons, Indexes and Symbols.....	90
- Codes.....	90
- Levels of Meaning - Denotation and Connotation.....	92
- The Role of the Reader.....	93
- Additional Semiotic Concepts.....	94
- Ideology and Imagery.....	96
- Conclusion.....	99

CHAPTER SEVEN - SEMIOTIC ANALYSIS OF THREE CASE STUDY ADS

- Introduction.....	100
- Breakdown of Elements Fig 7.1.....	103
- Summary of Case Study One.....	106
- Case Study Two.....	106
- Breakdown of Elements Fig.7.3 (Page 1).....	108
- The Ethics of Images of Suffering.....	112
- Summary of Case Study Two.....	119
- Case Study Three.....	120
- Breakdown of Elements Fig.7.6.....	122
- The Use of Colour.....	123
- Additional Features Which Create Meaning.....	124
- Why Focus on Children?.....	128
- Associated Themes: White Surrogate Parents, White Feeders of Sickly Third World Children.....	130
- Summary of Case Study Three.....	134
- Conclusion.....	135

CHAPTER EIGHT - INDIVIDUAL ASSESSMENTS OF THE ADVERTISING
ETHICS OF EACH NGO

- Introduction.....	136
- World Vision - Ethics and Advertising.....	137
-Advertising and Evangelism.....	137
-Ethics and Sponsorship.....	139
-WV and the Use of Starving Child Images.....	142
-The Third World Perspective.....	144
-Partners as Equals.....	145
-The Gateway Travel Scheme.....	146
-The Impact of Images of Suffering.....	146
-Summary.....	150
- Save the Children Fund - Ethics and Advertising.....	151
-SCF's Stance on Religion and Politics.....	151
-SCF and Child Sponsorship.....	154
-SCF and Images of Starvation.....	158
-SCF and Their Apolitical Philosophy.....	158
-Summary.....	159
- Christian Children's Fund - Ethics and Advertising.....	159
- CCF and Child Sponsorship.....	161
-CCF and Their Worldview.....	165
-Summary.....	166
- Tear Fund - Ethics and Advertising.....	167
-Tear Fund and Child Sponsorship.....	169
-Sponsorship: Individual Child Focus Versus Community Focus	171
-Tear Fund's Child Focus.....	171
-Tear Fund and Evangelism.....	172
-Poverty and the New Zealand Connection.....	173
-Tear Fund and Advertising.....	175
-Summary.....	178
- Christian World Service - Ethics and Advertising.....	178
-CWS and Child Sponsorship.....	179
-CWS and Advertising.....	180
-The New Zealand Connection.....	182
-CWS, Theology and Advertising.....	183
-CWS and Images of Suffering.....	184
-Summary.....	186
- Conclusion.....	186

CHAPTER NINE - CONCLUSION

- Aims	188
- Findings	189
- General Ethical Considerations	195
- Alternative Techniques of Charity Advertising.....	196
- Summary.....	202

LIST OF APPENDICES:

1.1 Questionnaire on Ethics and NGO Advertising.....	203
5.1 List of Promotional Materials (used in Content Analysis) for the five NGOs: WV, SCF, CCF, Tear Fund and CWS.....	210
7.1 Selection of Starving Child Ads with Absent Backgrounds Which Decontextualize Subjects.....	220
7.2 Selection of WV ads which appeal to the parental instinct to provide materially.....	221
7.3 Selection of Images of First World Women in the Role of Global Mothers.....	222
8.1 Why Does Clean Water Make Kundai Happy? - Photo 1 and 2.	224

BIBLIOGRAPHY:

Books.....	225
Articles.....	228

LIST OF TABLES

2.1 NZODA as a Percentage of GNP 1970-1994
2.2 Net ODA from DAC Countries in 1991
2.3 International Comparisons of NGO Grants Per Capita
2.4 Aid to Least Developed Countries - 1991
4.1 Central Financial Features of Five Developmental NGOs
4.2 Summary of Characteristics For Five Developmental NGOs
5.1 Categories of Promotional Material For Each NGO
5.2 People Categories used in the Content Analysis
5.3 Background Categories used in the Content Analysis
5.4 Activity Categories used in the Content Analysis

- 5.5 Three Most Common People Categories for the Five Sample NGOs
- 5.6 Three Most Common Background Categories for the Five Sample NGOs
- 5.7 Three Most Common Activity Categories for the Five NGOs
- 5.8 Summary of the Most Common Images used in the Advertising Material of Five NGOs
- 5.9 The Proportion of Black and White to Colour Images in the Promotional Material of Five NGOs

LIST OF FIGURES

- 2.1 "Dear Prime Minister" Flyer
- 2.2 Geographical Distribution of New Zealand's Bilateral Aid

- 5.1 Example of a Matrix Ad
- 5.2 Third World People + First World Helper - Example Images

- 6.1 Saussure's Elements of Meaning
- 6.2 Peirce's Elements of Meaning

- 7.1 Case Study One - "I Thirst" (PAGE 1)
- 7.2 Case Study One - "I Thirst" (PAGE 2)
- 7.3 Case Study Two - "This is Disaster (PAGE 1)
- 7.4 Case Study Two - "This is Disaster (PAGE 2)
- 7.5 "Maybe you can't feed the starving millions..."
- 7.6 Case Study Three - "The Cost of Living Has Dropped".
- 7.7 Audrey Hepburn in the Role of White Surrogate Parent
- 7.8 Audrey with her Third World 'Family'.
- 7.9 Image of a Sickly Third World Infant being Feed by a First World Adult.

- 8.1 "Don't Hold Back Your Love"
- 8.2 "This is Nazma"
- 8.3 "Save the Children Fund does so much more than feeding hungry mouths ..."
- 8.4 SCF - Somalia Appeal Ad
- 8.5 A Selection of CCF Ads
- 8.6 "You May be Their Last Chance"
- 8.7 "What Does Tear Fund Do? ..."

- 8.8 "Bringing Children Love"
- 8.9 "Let My People Go!"
- 8.10 A Selection of CWS Ads

- 9.1 "Africa Starves"
- 9.2 Example of a Direct Eye-Contact Gaze
- 9.3 Woman with Child
- 9.4 Mother and Starving Child
- 9.5 "Chainsaws and Cheque Books"
- 9.6 "Change My World"

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

W V	World Vision
SCF	Save the Children Fund
CCF	Christian Children's Fund
CWS	Christian World Service
CCJPD	Catholic Commission for Justice Peace and Development
NZODA	New Zealand Official Development Assistance
ACEAD	Advisory Committee on External Aid and Development
VASS	Voluntary Agency Support Scheme
MERT	Ministry of External Relations and Trade
MFAT	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development