Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Management of Threats and Errors in Normal Operations of Assistant Controllers

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master
in
Aviation

at Massey University, Palmerston North
New Zealand

Timothy Kwan Chi Yeung

2007
Abstract

"To err is indeed human, so to err is normal."

Human errors are usually pronounced in accident or incident reports. Seldom does one pay enough attention to these errors during daily normal operations as these either go unnoticed or unreported for whatsoever the reasons may be. Therefore, the causes of these errors and also the system threats prevalent in the daily operations may not be fully contained. On the other hand, problematic situations that are successfully tackled by human skills are quite often treated as less important than they really are.

The job of an assistant controller (AC) is one of the important domains in air traffic management (ATM). The AC work together with air traffic controllers as team members and they do have direct and indirect contributions to the safe, orderly and efficient flow of air traffic. In this study, the threats, errors and potential undesired states occurring with AC during normal operations will be recorded by a methodology, which is new to Hong Kong Air Traffic Control (ATC). This methodology, called Normal Operations Safety Observation (NOSO), is built on the Threat and Error Management (TEM) framework. The results will generate a broad outline on what sorts of threats, errors and undesired states an AC can be facing during normal operations. The relative frequencies of occurrence of these conditions will be presented separately in tables and figures. The AC’s potential vulnerabilities and capabilities to cope with these threats, errors and undesired states will be discussed together with a suggested ranking. It is envisaged that an analysis of the data collected will aid the development and evaluation of safety defence measures in ATM and further support the applicability of this data collection methodology in other ATM operations and subsequent researches.

KEYWORDS:- Normal Operations Safety Observation, Threat and Error Management, Safety Management, Air Traffic Control
Acknowledgements

This research could not have been completed without the help and support of many people. It is a pleasure of mine to express my gratitude to the following:-

**Thesis Advisors**

Dr. Hans-Juergen Hoermann  
Senior Scientist Human Factors  
German Aerospace Center  
Institute of Aerospace Medicine  
Sportallee 54a  
22335 Hamburg, Germany  
Germany  
+49-40-51309642  
hans.hoermann@dlr.de

Dr. Andrew Gilbey  
School of Aviation  
Massey University  
Turitea Campus  
Palmerston North  
New Zealand

**Professional Advisors**

Mr. Peter Pui Kong Leung  
Senior Operations Officer  
Civil Aviation Department  
Air Traffic Control Complex  
Hong Kong International Airport  
Hong Kong

Mr. David Kwok Wai Cheung  
Senior Quality Assurance Manager  
Civil Aviation Department  
Air Traffic Control Complex  
Hong Kong International Airport  
Hong Kong

I am obliged to the Hong Kong Civil Aviation Department for its support in granting me the approval to conduct this research in the Hong Kong Air Traffic Control Centre and for the approval of two-month’s leave associated with data collection. I would also like to express my gratitude to Massey University and the Hong Kong Polytechnic University for their academic support. Most importantly, I wish to thank my family for
their patience with my four-year Master Degree studies.

There are two gentlemen who are advocates of aviation in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region and New Zealand respectively. They have put forward dedicated efforts in the establishment of this locally run Master Degree of Aviation course. Their names, which should be remembered by all the students of this course, are as follows:-

Professor Kee Ying Fung, Hong Kong
Professor Graham J F Hunt, New Zealand

Above all, my heartfelt thanks to those participating assistant controllers who have to remain anonymous for confidentiality. They allowed me to conduct the research while they were on their job. The success of this research relies heavily on their trust and participation. Without their kind assistance, there is no way that the research would yield a successful completion.

“Thank you”

The research undergoes an ethical consideration from Massey University that the research strictly follows the Code of Ethical Conduct for Research (Massey University, 2006).
Table of Contents

List of Figures ................................................................. ix
List of Tables ................................................................. x

Chapter One: Introduction ...................................................... 1
The "Swiss Cheese" Model of Defences ....................................... 2
ATM Vulnerabilities and Strengths .......................................... 2
Line Operations Safety Audit (LOSA) ....................................... 4
The Objectives .................................................................. 5

Chapter Two: Literature Review ................................................. 6
Human Errors .................................................................. 6
Human Performance Models .................................................. 8
The Causes of Error -- Rule-based, Skill-based and Knowledge-based ................................................................. 9
The "Wolf or Sheep" -- Violation ............................................ 10
The Impact of Levels of Experience on Human Performance .......... 11
Workload and Task Complexity .......................................... 11
Threat and Error Management (TEM) ..................................... 12
Hypothetical Scenario ...................................................... 13

Chapter Three: Method ............................................................ 16
Participants .................................................................. 16
The AC Sectors .......................................................... 17
Materials ....................................................................... 17
- NOSO Observation Forms ........................................... 17
- NOSO Codebook ..................................................... 19
- NOSO Database ....................................................... 22
- Information Sheet and Consent Form ............................. 22
Procedures ................................................................. 22
Stage One: Preparation .................................................... 22
Stage Two: Data Collection ................................................ 24
2-Week Review (for Stages One and Two) ............................... 24
Chapter Six: Conclusion .................................................................................. 64
Bibliography .................................................................................................... 65
Appendix A1: NOSO Observation Form – Observation Demography ............... 73
Appendix A2: NOSO Observation Form – Handover and Takeover ................. 74
Appendix A3: NOSO Observation Form General Operations ........................... 75
Appendix A4: NOSO Observation Form – Threat Management ....................... 76
Appendix A5: NOSO Observation Form Error Management ............................ 77
Appendix A6: NOSO Observation Form – Undesired State Management ........... 78
Appendix A7: NOSO Observation Form Threat and Error Countermeasures ...... 79
Appendix B1: NOSO Codebook Threat ............................................................ 80
Appendix B2: NOSO Codebook Error .............................................................. 85
Appendix B3: NOSO Codebook – Undesired State ......................................... 88
Appendix C1: NOSO Database – Demography Worksheet ............................... 89
Appendix C2: NOSO Database – Threat Management Worksheet .................... 90
Appendix C3: NOSO Database Error Management Worksheet ........................ 91
Appendix C4: NOSO Database – Undesired State Management Worksheet ...... 92
Appendix C5: NOSO Database Threat and Error Countermeasures Worksheet ... 93
Appendix D: Information Sheet ....................................................................... 94
Appendix E: Consent Form ............................................................................ 95
Appendix F: Abbreviations and Codes used in Threat Management, Error Management and Undesired State Management .................................................. 96
Appendix G: Threat Management .................................................................. 97
Appendix H: Error Management ..................................................................... 117
Appendix I: Undesired State Management ...................................................... 129
# List of Figures

| Figure 1.1 | Reason's Swiss-cheese Model | 2 |
| Figure 1.2 | Heinrich Pyramid | 3 |
| Figure 2.1 | Three Levels of Human Performance | 9 |
| Figure 2.2 | Threat and Error Management Model | 13 |
| Figure 3.3 | NOSO Coding System (Threat) | 20 |
| Figure 3.4 | NOSO Coding System (Error) | 21 |
| Figure 3.5 | NOSO Coding System (Undesired State) | 21 |
| Figure 4.1 | Scatter Graph to show the Years of Experience in ATC with Number of Errors | 42 |
| Figure 4.2 | Scatter Graph to show the Years of Experience in AC with Number of Errors | 42 |
| Figure 4.3 | Scatter Graphs to show the Years of Experience in ATC/AC with Number of Errors | 44 |
List of Tables

Table 1  Observation Program ................................................................. 17
Table 2  Description of NOSO Observation Forms ........................................ 18
Table 3  Performance Marker Scales ............................................................ 19
Table 4  Summary of NOSO Data in the NOSO Observation Forms .................. 27
Table 5  List of Threats recorded in NOSO ................................................... 28
Table 6  List of Errors recorded in NOSO ..................................................... 30
Table 7  List of Undesired States recorded in NOSO ...................................... 32
Table 8  Summary of Threat and Error Countermeasures ................................. 32
Table 9  List of Threat Category ................................................................. 33
Table 10 Linkage of Threats to Operations .................................................. 33
Table 11 Linkage of Threats to Errors ........................................................ 34
Table 12 Threat Management by AC ............................................................ 34
Table 13 Category of Errors ...................................................................... 35
Table 14 Percentage of Intentional Non-compliance in Different Categories of Errors ................................................................. 35
Table 15 Linkage of Errors to Operations .................................................... 36
Table 16 Linkage of Errors to Threats ........................................................ 36
Table 17 Error Discovery by Personnel ......................................................... 37
Table 18 Outcome of Errors ........................................................................ 37
Table 19 Linkage of Undesired States to Threats/Errors ................................. 37
Table 20 Undesired State Management ........................................................ 38
Table 21 Undesired State Discovery by Personnel ......................................... 38
Table 22 Outcome of Undesired States ........................................................ 38
Table 23 AC Positions versus Average Number of Threats ............................. 39
Table 24 AC Positions versus Average Number of Errors .............................. 40
Table 25 AC Positions and Shifts versus Occurrence of Undesired States ........ 40
Table 26 Years of Experience in ATC/AC versus Number of Errors .............. 41
Table 27 Ranks for Years of Experience in ATC/AC and Number of Different Types of Errors ................................................................. 46
Table 28  Correlation Matrix for Years of Experience in ATC/AC and Different Types of Errors ................................................................. 47
Table 29  Ranks for Years of Experience in AC and Types of Errors (Chek Lap Kok Group) ................................................................................ 48
Table 30  Ranks for Years of Experience in AC and Types of Errors (Kai Tak Group) ................................................................................ 48
Table 31  Correlation Matrix for Years of Experience in AC and Different Types of Errors for Kai Tak Group and Chek Lap Kok Group ................................................................................ 49
Table 32  AC Sectors versus Threats being converted into Ordinal Data Ranks ................................................................................ 50
Table 33  Shifts versus Threats being converted into Ordinal Data Ranks ................................................................................ 51
Table 34  AC Sectors versus Errors being converted into Ordinal Data Ranks ................................................................................ 51
Table 35  Shifts versus Errors being converted into Ordinal Data Ranks ................................................................................ 52