Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
“ME AND MUM”:
New Zealand Adolescent Daughters’ Stories
of their Relationships with their Mothers

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of

Master of Philosophy
in Education

at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Andrea Jane Nicholls
2001
ABSTRACT

Adolescent daughters' perceptions of their relationship with their mothers were examined using a social constructionist approach, which identified two conflicting discourses regarding adolescence and the parent-adolescent relationship. The recent academic discourse emphasises the continuing importance of strong bonds between parents and adolescents, particularly between mothers and daughters. The popular culture discourse emphasises separation from and conflict with parents in adolescence, particularly between mothers and daughters. Ten adolescent girls aged between 15 and 17 were interviewed using the Adult Attachment Interview (AAI: George, Kaplan & Main, 1996) to investigate which of these discourses they subscribed to. A narrative approach was used to identify individual relationship themes and cross-narrative themes of agency and communion. These themes were very similar to those found in other comparable research, both national and international. New findings included the influence of the following contexts upon daughters' perceptions: their childhood relationship with their mother, significant events in their lives, their childhood and current relationship with their father, and cognitive maturation. Two groups of five were identified within the ten participants, distinguished by their ability to reflect on their relationship, their perception of their mother, and the amount of reciprocity in their relationship. Overall, the emphasis on mothers' continuing support and availability in daughters' narratives challenged popular culture's emphasis on separation and conflict in parent-adolescent relationships, particularly between mothers and daughters.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank all the people who have contributed towards the completion of this thesis:

Firstly, my supervisors Sue Watson and Barbara Maclean. I sincerely appreciate all they have done for me throughout the whole process of preparing this thesis, particularly as it took much longer than I anticipated. Special thanks to Sue for introducing me to narrative research and helping me to apply it to a large-scale research project, and to Barbara for her excellent suggestions on the construction of this thesis. Without their guidance, patience and confidence in my ability, this thesis would not have been written.

My whole family, for their continual encouragement, being there to listen to my problems, and empathy throughout this experience, particularly as everyone was also busy with their own study. They have set a great example for me to follow, and have motivated me to be the best I can be. In particular: Dad for the use of the tape recorder and transcriber for interviewing and transcribing, and the use of his computer when I needed it. Rhys for typing up two of my interview transcripts and giving me technical advice and assistance when I had computer problems. Paul for always asking how I was doing and having confidence in me. Mum for getting journal articles for me and finding useful books for me to read. For being my inspiration for this thesis: putting up with my tantrums when I was a teenager, always being there for me throughout my life – just for being my Mum.

Darren for being so patient and understanding throughout this long process, for making me go back to my desk and write some more! For never giving up on me, for trusting that I would finish this one day and helping me financially so I could do so.

All my ‘in-laws’ and my friends, who have continued to be interested in my progress and helped me to look forward to life after study.

Last, but certainly not least, special thanks are due to the ten girls who volunteered to be part of this study, who allowed me into their homes and talked about very personal and emotional aspects of their lives with such openness and humour.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td></td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>iii</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>iv</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 1: INTRODUCTION

1

## Chapter 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

5

- Introduction
- Psychoanalytic and neoanalytic theories
- Feminist theories
- Attachment theory
- Family relationships in adolescence
- The mother-daughter relationship
- New Zealand literature
- The social construction of adolescence, motherhood and the mother-daughter relationship
- Similar research studies and research questions
- Similar research studies
- Formulation of research questions
- Research questions

## Chapter 3: METHODOLOGY

57

- Introduction
- Choice of research methodology
- Qualitative methodology
- The narrative approach
- The qualitative research interview
- The Adult Attachment Interview
- General overview
Use of the AAI in the current study ........................................ 66
Additional interview questions .............................................. 67
Recruitment of participants .................................................... 68
Selection of participants .......................................................... 68
Difficulties in recruiting participants ....................................... 69
The interviewing procedure .................................................... 69
Ethical issues ......................................................................... 70
In a narrative approach .......................................................... 70
In the current study ............................................................... 72
Reliability, validity and generalisability .................................... 74
In qualitative studies .............................................................. 74
In a narrative approach .......................................................... 76
In the current study ............................................................... 77
Interviewer influence on participants, interviewer bias .............. 78
In the current study ............................................................... 79
Analysis of findings .............................................................. 80

Chapter 4: FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS ........................................ 85
Introduction ......................................................................... 85
Description of participants ................................................... 85
Individual narrative themes ................................................... 89
  Michelle – “Opposite people” ............................................ 90
  Nicky – “Independent” ....................................................... 95
  Robin – “She’s real helpful” ............................................. 97
  Kate – “It’s better telling the truth” .................................. 100
  Claire – “Mum still worries” ............................................. 102
  Ruth – “She’s quite understanding really” ......................... 104
  Jane – “We have a really open relationship” .................... 107
  Miriam – “Mummy’s girl” ................................................. 111
  Karlene – “We both keep an eye out for each other” .......... 113
  Ania – “She’s my rock” .................................................... 118
Cross-narrative themes ........................................................ 121
  Agentic themes: .............................................................. 122
“She’ll get shitty” – Disagreements .............................................. 122
Topics of disagreements ......................................................... 122
Resolution of disagreements ....................................................... 129
Daughters’ perceptions of disagreements .................................... 133
“She trusts me” – Changes in trust and respect ......................... 134
“She’s got her own life” – Perceptions of mother: Social role versus
person ..................................................................................... 136
Communal themes: ..................................................................... 139
“Doing stuff together” ................................................................. 139
“Being there” ............................................................................. 141
Physically .................................................................................. 141
Practically and financially ......................................................... 141
Emotionally ................................................................................ 144
“I’m there for her as well” – Reciprocal support ....................... 149
“She knows me probably better than Dad” – Differences between
mother-daughter and father-daughter relationships .................. 152
“This massive long conversation” – Intimacy and change in
communication ........................................................................ 156
“I can’t talk to her” – Barriers to communication and closeness .160
“Closer and closer” – Changes in intimacy and mutuality .......... 163
“I realise how lovely my Mum is” ............................................... 166
Conclusion ................................................................................. 169

Chapter 5: DISCUSSION ........................................................................ 171
Introduction ................................................................................... 171
Conflict in mother-daughter relationships .................................. 172
Change, renegotiation and mutuality .......................................... 173
Agentic and communal themes ................................................... 178
Contexts influencing participants’ perceptions ......................... 181
Daughters’ relationships with their mother in childhood .......... 181
Significant events in participants’ lives ....................................... 182
The father-daughter relationship in childhood and adolescence ..183
Comparison to similar studies ....................................................... 185
Social construction of motherhood and adolescence.................................................. 187
Limitations of this study .......................................................................................... 192
Strengths of this study ........................................................................................... 194
Suggestions for further research ............................................................................. 196
Conclusion ................................................................................................................. 198

References ................................................................................................................. 201

Appendix 1 Advertisement for participants ............................................................... 213
Appendix 2 Daughters' information sheet ................................................................. 215
Appendix 3 Daughters' consent form ........................................................................ 217
Appendix 4 Mothers' information sheet .................................................................... 219
Appendix 5 Adult Attachment Interview .................................................................. 221
Appendix 6 Additional interview questions ............................................................... 225