Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
The Genesis and Early Evolution of New Zealand Income Tax: An Examination of Governor Fitzroy’s Experiments with Taxation, 1843 - 1845

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
In
Economics

Massey University, Turitea Campus, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Kevin John Heagney
2009
Abstract

This thesis focuses on the genesis and development of direct taxation in early New Zealand. During the study period (1843-45), both taxpayers and tax were new to the colonial settlement and this study traces the early history of the two trying to accommodate each other. Between 1843 and 1845, subject to the politics of tax, the fiscal future of the colony was decided.

The thesis begins by contextualising the study. It critically examines the revenue and expenditure record of the Crown Colony period and then details the antecedents of New Zealand fiscal policy in general and specifically tax policy (our shared English heritage). Thereafter, four interesting events in New Zealand tax law are discussed: (1) Schedule E of the British Land and Income Tax Act, 1842 (arrived in New Zealand 1843); (2) The Property Rate Ordinance, 1844; (3) the proposed Amendment to the Property Rate Ordinance, 1844; and, (4) the proposed Dealers’ Licensing Ordinance in 1845. After analysing the period’s individual direct tax laws, the thesis elaborates on the political process which determined the development of this body of tax laws. Thereafter, the thesis develops a conceptual model to explain the tax reform process of the study period. The thesis finds that tax policy during the study period was driven by four key influences: crisis (internal/external and economic); political considerations; the application of sound nineteenth-century economic policy; and importantly, the precedent of another nation’s experience with tax policy development.

To have knowledge of such events in economic history (the past record of tax law), how and why they occurred, matters. Just as a nation’s financial accounts are built on the foundations of the previous fiscal year, future taxation policy will be based on current taxation policy; tax laws which were developed from past (historic) tax practices. Therefore, knowledge of how New Zealand formulated tax policy in the past and why it did so, is of interest to fiscal policy makers today. Future tax policy is simply a derivation of past tax laws; the development of New Zealand’s taxation policy began in New South Wales in 1839, and thereafter began, what this thesis suggests, was a predictable, evolutionary process.
Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to the memory of Jieun Jung - otherwise known as JJ - my friend, mentor and confidant who, sadly, is no more.

(Miss Jung)
October 1, 1979 – April 29, 2009

How Shall I Remember Her

With love and affection – always;

Kevin
Special Thanks

There are many in the Department of Economics and Finance (past and present) to whom I am indebted, and there are a few who deserve much more than a simple thank you. Professor Anton Meister and Dr. Leanne Smith offered me the opportunity five years ago to join the academic faculty of the department both as a tutor and a doctoral student. This enabled me to be apprenticed to three remarkable teachers - scholars: Dr. Neil Campbell, Dr. James Alvey and Professor Srikanta Chatterjee. To these five named persons, I dedicate the work and say special thanks.
Acknowledgements

There is a long list of people to thank, and this is achieved below, in a concise manner. There is no order of importance; the names are placed on the page as they come to mind. Paul Goldsmith who recently published New Zealand’s first comprehensive tax history, was an inspirational contact, and John Martin the Parliamentary Historian was helpful; so too was Michael Littlewood of Auckland law school, and there is, the always supportive Lesley Davies to thank also. The topic for this thesis came from Dr Stephen Burnell, Head of School, Department of Economics and Finance, Victoria University, Wellington. Gary Burmann read many of the early chapters, and both James Obben and Hans-Jurgen Engelbrecht, were consistent with their encouragement. Stuart Birks was constantly approachable and John Holland made many practical suggestions about the process of organisation.

A special thank you is due to Sam Richardson, from our shared beginning as postgraduate students, we have interacted as friends. Mention of graduate school brings to mind all those who became friends: Antonie Eggink, Andrew Peck, and Mathew Bartleet, Santi, Sharlene, Nicola, Coral, and Fiona. To all of these persons I extend my heartfelt thanks. I also need to mention, and thank, Michael Hogan and his entire family for their logistical support. And, I can’t forget JJ; for the last two years she and I have cared about each other. In addition, for their quiet support, Sue Edwards, Ha-Lien Ton, Kate Hope, Doris Adeyinka, Julia Fisher and Allan Rae, thank you. In addition, all the library staff who have helped in the research process do need to be mentioned; the staff at Archives New Zealand and the Parliamentary Library, those at Turnbull Library, the National Library of New Zealand, Massey University Library, and especially to those in Massey’s inter-loan department.

To all those who have been involved in the gradual process of development and are not named individually, thank you. Finally, all the component parts of this thesis have previously been presented at departmental seminars between the years 2004, and 2008. Furthermore, an early draft of Chapter 4 was presented at the New Zealand Association of Economists (NZAE) conference in 2006.
# Table of Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. ii
Dedication ................................................................................................................................................ iii
Special Thanks ......................................................................................................................................... iv
Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................................. v
Table of Contents ................................................................................................................................. vi
Tables ....................................................................................................................................................... viii
Figures ..................................................................................................................................................... viii

Part A  Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 1

Chapter 1  Thesis Introduction .............................................................................................................. 2

Chapter 2  Literature Review ................................................................................................................. 6
  2. 1. New Zealand Tax History Literature .......................................................................................... 6
  2. 2. Related New Zealand Literature ............................................................................................... 11
  2. 3. New Zealand History Literature .............................................................................................. 13
  2. 4. Comparative Literature ........................................................................................................... 15
  2. 5. Summary and Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 17

Chapter 3  Thesis Methodology, Structure, and Method ......................................................................... 20
  3. 1. Introduction .............................................................................................................................. 20
  3. 2. Conceptual Methodology: Political Economy ........................................................................ 20
  3. 3. Thesis Structure: Chronological Timeline and Historical Narrative ........................................ 22
  3. 4. Subordinate Methods ............................................................................................................... 26
  3. 5. Summary ................................................................................................................................... 27

Part B  Background and Context ........................................................................................................... 29

Chapter 4  Revenue and Expenditure of Crown Colony New Zealand ................................................ 30
  4. 1. Introduction .............................................................................................................................. 30
  4. 2. Method of Analysis ................................................................................................................. 34
  4. 3. Data Analyses .......................................................................................................................... 37
  4. 4. Results of Criteria Assessment ............................................................................................... 58
  4. 5. A Statistical Summary for the Crown Colony period .............................................................. 61
  4. 6. Conclusion ................................................................................................................................. 67

Chapter 5  New Zealand’s Fiscal Inheritance ......................................................................................... 70
  5. 1. Introduction .............................................................................................................................. 70
  5. 2. Seventeenth-Century England ................................................................................................. 73
  5. 3. Eighteenth-Century Britain and the Hypotheses of the Literature ....................................... 75
  5. 4. Nineteenth-Century Great Britain and Direct Taxation ......................................................... 84
  5. 5. Conclusion ................................................................................................................................. 98
Tables

Table 4.1 Revenue & Expenditure for the Crown Colony of New Zealand, 1840-52 ......................... 42
Table 4.2 Revenue & Expenditure for the Crown Colony of New Zealand, 1840-52 ......................... 42
Table 4.3 Revenue & Expenditure for the Crown Colony of New Zealand, 1840-52 ......................... 42
Table 4.4 Descriptive Statistics for Table 4.1 ......................................................................................... 43
Table 4.5 Descriptive Statistics for Table 4.2 ......................................................................................... 43
Table 4.6 Descriptive Statistics for Table 4.3 ......................................................................................... 43
Table 4.7 Criteria Test Results ................................................................................................................ 59
Table 4.8 Revenue .................................................................................................................................... 64
Table 4.9 Expenditure .............................................................................................................................. 64
Table 6.1 Income Tax Schedules: 1803 Act (Codified in the Act of 1842) ......................................... 111
Table 6.2 Official Promulgation of Schedule E in New Zealand ........................................................ 116
Table 6.3 The Application of Taxation under Schedule E of the Act ..................................................... 118
Table 6.4 A Poem on the Subject of Income Tax: 1843 ....................................................................... 121
Table 7.1 Title Page of the Property Rate, 1844 .................................................................................. 158
Table 7.2 Rate Schedule ......................................................................................................................... 160
Table 7.3 Form of Return: Property Rate ............................................................................................ 162
Table 7.4 Property Rate Return ............................................................................................................ 165
Table 7.5 Property Rate Amendment: Schedule of Rates ................................................................... 170
Table 7.6 Dealers’ License Rate Schedule ............................................................................................ 172
Table 9.1 New Zealand’s Macroeconomic Performance, 1956-95 ..................................................... 223

Figures

Figure 3.1 The Fiscal Timeline, 1840-46................................................................................................. 25
Figure 4.1 Revenue & Expenditure for the Crown Colony, 1840-52: Table 4.1 ................................. 43
Figure 4.2 Revenue & Expenditure for the Crown Colony, 1840-52: Table 4.2 ................................. 43
Figure 4.3 Revenue & Expenditure for the Crown Colony, 1840-52: Table 4.3 ................................. 43
Figure 4.4 Crown Colony Revenue and Expenditure: 1840-52 ................................................................ 62
Figure 4.5 Crown Colony New Zealand and Aggregate Revenue and Expenditure: 1840-52 .......... 62
Figure 4.6 Crown Colony Revenue, 1840-52: By Type ....................................................................... 65
Figure 4.7 Crown Colony New Zealand and Aggregate Revenue, 1840-52: By Type ....................... 65
Figure 4.8 Crown Colony Expenditure, 1840-52: By Type ................................................................. 66
Figure 4.9 Crown Colony New Zealand and Aggregate Expenditure, 1840-52: By Type .................... 66
Figure 5.1 British Revenue Breakdown by Major Tax Type: 1802 to 1860 ......................................... 87
Figure 9.1 The Fundmental Model ......................................................................................................... 220
Figure 9.2 Economic Reform ................................................................................................................. 221