Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
IDEAL PROCUREMENT SYSTEM FOR NEW ZEALAND PRIVATE SECTOR CONSTRUCTION CLIENTS

Research Thesis
MPhil (Construction)

Wan Norizan Binti Wan Ismail
06153364
IDEAL PROCUREMENT SYSTEM FOR NEW
ZEALAND PRIVATE SECTOR CONSTRUCTION
CLIENTS

A research thesis presented in fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of

Master of Philosophy
(MPhil)
In
Construction

at
Massey University
Wellington, New Zealand

Wan Norizan Binti Wan Ismail

2007
ABSTRACT

Making the right choice of a procurement system at the onset ensures successful project delivery, a satisfied client, a successful service provider, and a reputable construction industry. Research has shown that client's requirements have not been properly addressed due largely to wrong choice of procurement systems.

This research aims to identify the priority needs of clients and the appropriate procurement system that can ensure the delivery of satisfactory outcomes. Investigations were limited to the views expressed by private sector construction clients, consultants and contractors, registered with their respective umbrella organizations in New Zealand. The descriptive survey method was used, which involved pilot interviews and structured questionnaire surveys. Content analysis, multi-attribute analysis and rank correlation tests were used in the analysis of the data.

Results showed that clients' would prefer a procurement system that can ensure the delivery of the project within time, budget and quality/specification targets. Other priority needs include fixed price tender, competitive/ lowest price tenders, separate service provider for the design and management of the construction, life cycle cost, risk preference and to accommodate variation orders without incurring financial penalties. Construction management type of procurement system offering responsibilities for monitoring and coordinating the construction process is the ideal procurement route that could best meet the needs of the New Zealand construction clients. However, the sequential traditional procurement system is the most commonly used; clients are not prepared to adopt any other system that could better meet their procurement needs. The most influential reason for this is the perceived risk evasiveness of clients in the adoption of other systems which are not tried and tested. The use of partnering clause in the prevailing sequential traditional system is recommended to ensure win-win outcomes for all stakeholders and to motivate service providers to deliver more satisfactory outcomes to their clients.

Keywords Construction clients, construction industry, clients' needs, construction management, procurement system
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to the following people:

- My supervisor, Dr J.I Mbachu for his invaluable time, constant support, parental guidance and instructions and constructive criticisms in the development of ideas for this research
- My beloved family for their endless encouragement, patience and unfailing support.
- MARA University of Technology (UiTM) for supporting this research with the grant for “Young Lecturer Scheme”
- The Massey University Human Ethics Committee (MUHEC) for the approval granted for the undertaking of the questionnaire survey.
- The participants in the surveys, for their time and valuable information.
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

(MPHIL SCIENCES, CONSTRUCTION) THESIS

TITLE: IDEAL PROCUREMENT SYSTEM FOR NEW ZEALAND PRIVATE SECTOR CONSTRUCTION CLIENTS

I declare that the above thesis is my own original work. It has not been submitted elsewhere for assessment.

The guidance received from my supervisor is hereby acknowledged. Human Ethics requirements have been complied with in accordance with Massey University research requirements.

STUDENT'S NAME : Wan Norizan Binti Wan Ismail

STUDENT'S SIGNATURE : [Signature]

SUPERVISOR'S NAME : Dr Jasper Mbachu

SUPERVISOR'S SIGNATURE : [Signature]

DATE : 15 December 2007
STATEMENT OF AUTHORSHIP

Except where specific reference is made in the main text, this thesis contains no material extracted in whole or part from a thesis, dissertations, or research paper presented by me for another degree or diploma.

No other person’s work (published or unpublished) has been used without acknowledgement in the main text of the thesis.

This thesis has not been submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any other tertiary institution.

STUDENT’S NAME : Wan Norizan Binti Wan Ismail

STUDENT’S SIGNATURE : [Signature]

DATE : 15 Dec 2007
AVAILABILITY OF THE THESIS

AUTHOR'S NAME : Wan Norizan Binti Wan Ismail

TITLE OF THESIS : Ideal Procurement System for New Zealand Private Sector Construction Clients

DEGREE : Master of Philosophy (MPhil) (Construction)

YEAR : 2007

I hereby consent to the above thesis being consulted, borrowed, copied or reproduced in from time to time in accordance with the provisions of the Library Regulations made by the Academic Board. Permission must be obtained from the author when complete copies or large portions are required.

STUDENT'S NAME : Wan Norizan Binti Wan Ismail

STUDENT'S SIGNATURE : [Signature]

DATE : 15 December 2007
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Priority needs of clients in the procurement process .................................................. 34
Table 2: Chart for the assessment of client's procurement needs, and choice of appropriate procurement route (Adapted from: Turner, 1990) ................................................................. 54
Table 3: Client's categories ........................................................................................................... 59
Table 4: Purpose group of building procured .............................................................................. 60
Table 5: Professional affiliations of consultant respondents ...................................................... 60
Table 6: Professional association of consultant respondents ..................................................... 61
Table 7: Construction businesses of contractor respondents .................................................... 61
Table 8: Trade associations of contractor respondents ............................................................... 62
Table 9: Prioritization of clients' procurement needs (Clients' responses) ................................. 65
Table 10: Prioritization of clients' procurement needs (Service providers' responses) ............. 66
Table 11: Ideal procurement system score by clients ................................................................. 68
Table 12: Ideal procurement system score by service providers ............................................... 69
Table 13: Reasons for not adopting a different procurement system by clients and service provider respondents ................................................................. 75
Table 14: Priority criteria of procurement criteria rated by clients and consultants .................. 79
Table 15: Priority criteria of procurement criteria rated by clients and contractors ................ 80
Table 16: Matrix chart of procurement arrangement option (PAO) and procurement assessment criteria .......................................................................................................................... 83
Table 17: The frequency usage of procurement systems by all respondents ............................ 84
Table 18: Reason of clients for not adopting other procurement systems ................................. 86
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Traditional procurement system (Source: Ashford, 1989) ........................................ 12
Figure 2: Design-and-build system (Source: Wilkinson and Scofield, 2003) .............................. 15
Figure 3: Novation system contractual relationships (Adapted from Ng et al (2006)) .............. 17
Figure 4: Management contracting system ................................................................. 22
Figure 5: Construction management system (Adapted from Kelly et al, 2002) ....................... 23
Figure 6: Design-and-manage contractor project management contractual relationship structure (Adapted from Kelly et al, 2002) ............................................................ 24
Figure 7: Design-and-manage consultant project management contractual relationship structure (Adapted from Mbanjwa (2003)) ........................................................................... 25
Figure 8: The differences in the structures of PPP and Conventional private sector procurement (Adapted from Ascarì Partners, 2005) ................................................................. 28
Figure 9: Broad categories of clients and the category delineated for the study .................. 33
Figure 10: Flowchart of the process used in carrying out the research project from conception to completion ..................................................................................................... 51
Figure 11: Research model / conceptual framework ........................................................ 57
Figure 12: Length of experience of the all respondents ....................................................... 62
Figure 13: Respondents' status in their respective organizations ........................................ 63
Figure 14: Frequency of use of procurement systems - clients' perspectives ...................... 71
Figure 15: Frequency of use of procurement systems - service providers' perspectives .... 72
Figure 16: Willingness of clients to adopt new or different systems in future ....................... 73
Figure 17: Snapshot of research Propositions and Methods of Analysis ............................. 76