Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Property Rights and Wildlife Utilisation:
generating incentives for conservation and economic development

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Economics at Massey University.

Philip Bullen
1999
Abstract

The accelerating depletion of natural resources (biological diversity) range from degraded ecosystems, endangered species, and loss of genetic resources. This depletion has raised concern over future human economic welfare among other things. Conservation strategies have been implemented to preserve remaining biological diversity. The focus of this thesis is on conservation strategies to halt the loss of wild species. Protected areas and trade bans are the most recognised conservation measures. These strategies have their limitations however. This study will argue that increasingly the preservation of remaining wild species will be through economic incentives, specifically at the local community level.

If we are serious about saving wild species, our behaviour towards the utilisation of wildlife must change. A recent innovative idea is to look upon conservation as a form of economic development. Strategies that can lead to the successful implementation of this concept include conservation partnerships that actively involve local communities especially in developing countries, and the commercial and sustainable use of wild species.

Underlying the effectiveness and efficiency of these strategies are property right institutions and markets. Economic theory argues that natural resources will be protected only if direct economic benefits accrue to those most responsible for the care of these resources. In essence, the wise management of biological diversity must generate conservation and economic development benefits. This study examines and discusses the above issues.
Acknowledgements

Valuable help, advice, and support were received from the following people in the preparation of this thesis. I would like to acknowledge the contribution made by, Mum, Bevele and Rod, Robyn and Paul and Greg and this rest of the family. Special thanks to Olga and Aston for love and support. Thanks to Brendan for taking the time to read and comment on all the drafts and for the valuable direction gladly received before finally arriving at this completed product.
## Table of Contents

**Acknowledgements**  iv  
**List of Tables**  viii  
**List of Figures and Boxes**  ix  

### Chapter 1: Introduction  
1.1 Research Topic  1  
1.2 Thesis Outline  2  
1.3 Relevance of Research  
   1.3.1 biodiversity: how many species, and the human/biodiversity connection  4  
   1.3.2 Extinction of biodiversity and related consequences  5  
   1.3.3 Wildlife and attitudes to conservation  8  
   1.3.4 Biodiversity and developing countries  9  
   1.3.5 Values of biodiversity  11  
   1.3.6 Local, national and international dimensions of biodiversity  14  
   1.3.7 Underlying causes of biodiversity loss  15  
   1.3.8 Indigenous Peoples/Local communities  16  
   1.3.9 Conservation and local communities  18  
   1.3.10 Property rights  19  
   1.3.11 Commercialisation of wildlife: trade  20  
   1.3.12 Summary: relevance of research  21  
1.4 Definition of Key Terms  22  
1.5 The Aims and Scope of this Thesis  25  
   1.5.1 Exploring the linkages between the key terms  25  
   1.5.2 Aims and objectives  25  
   1.5.3 Limitations of study  26  
1.6 Why this Topic deserves Economic Analysis  26  
   1.6.1 market and policy failures  27  
1.7 Methodology  29  
1.8 Conclusion  30  

### Chapter 2: Literature Review  31  
2.1 Introduction  31  
2.2 Literature on Biodiversity  32  
   2.2.1 Biodiversity loss  32  
   2.2.2 Threats to biodiversity  34  
   2.2.3 Underlying factors explaining biodiversity loss: economic  37  
   2.2.4 Paths to extinction  38  
2.3 Traditional Conservation Solutions/Strategies  39  
   2.3.1 Conservation: what is being protected  40  
   2.3.2 Protected areas: size and spending  42  
   2.3.3 Trade restrictions/bans: CITES  42
2.3.4 Traditional conservation strategies: implications for local communities 44
2.4 Recent Innovations and Ideas for Conservation 44
  2.4.1 Sustainable use 45
  2.4.2 Protected area partnerships 46
  2.4.3 Criticism of Community-Based Conservation projects 47
  2.4.4 Literature on property rights 48
  2.4.5 A multi-disciplinary approach to conservation: Ecological economics 49
2.5 Economic Development 50
  2.5.1 Economic growth and development defined 50
  2.5.2 Theories and the process of economic growth and development 51
  2.5.3 Economic development and the environment 58
  2.5.4 Critique of development 60
  2.5.5 Sustainable development 63
  2.5.6 Local communities and development 64
2.6 Conclusion 65

Chapter 3: Property Rights 67
3.1 Introduction 67
  3.1.1 Chapter Outline 68
3.2 Property Rights 69
  3.2.1 Why assign property rights to biodiversity? 69
  3.2.2 Types of property rights 69
  3.2.3 Property and property rights 73
  3.2.4 Summary of property rights 75
3.3 Property Rights and biodiversity 76
  3.3.1 Property rights, social customs, biodiversity and indigenous peoples 76
  3.3.2 The tragedy of the ‘tragedy of the commons’ 78
  3.3.3 Private ownership 79
  3.3.4 State property 82
  3.3.5 Other problems with private and state property 84
  3.3.6 Summary: private and state property 85
  3.3.7 Common property regimes (res communes) 85
  3.3.8 Non-property rights or open-access (res nullius) 88
  3.3.9 Summary: Property rights and biodiversity 90
3.4 Conclusion 90

Chapter 4: Conservation Strategies: Protected Areas & Trade Regulations 92
4.1. Introduction 92
  4.1.1 Chapter outline 93
4.2 Traditional Conservation Strategies: Protected Areas 93
  4.2.1 Protected areas 94
  4.2.2 Other considerations for protected areas 102
4.2.3 Summary: Protected areas 110
4.3 Trade Measures as a Conservation Strategy 111
   4.3.1 The wildlife trade 111
   4.3.2 CITES 113
   4.3.3 How CITES works 113
   4.3.4 Why CITES fails 116
   4.3.5 Limitations of CITES 118
   4.3.6 Criticisms of CITES 122
4.4 Summary: Traditional Conservation Strategies 125

Chapter 5: Conservation Strategies: Partnerships & Wildlife Utilisation 127
5.1 Introduction 127
   5.1.1 Chapter outline 128
5.2 Innovative Ideas in Protected Area Management 128
   5.2.1 Partnerships in conservation 128
   5.2.2 Local communities/Indigenous Peoples 129
   5.2.3 Applied approaches linking protected areas and local people 132
5.3 Sustainable Use and Trade in Wildlife 136
   5.3.1 Ways to improve the effectiveness of CITES 136
   5.3.2 Commercial utilisation of wildlife 137
   5.3.3 Comments on sustainability 141
   5.3.4 Problems limiting the effectiveness of legal trade and markets 145
   5.3.5 Summary on the commercialisation and trade in wildlife 147
5.4 Conclusion 148
5.5 A Case Study of Sustainable Use- The Africa Elephant & Local Communities 149
   5.5.1 Introduction 149
   5.5.2 Causes of decline: poaching and other factors 150
   5.5.3 The Southern African sustainable use proposal 154
   5.5.4 Value of elephants 155
   5.5.5 Sustainable use of elephants and local communities 157
5.6 A Partnership in Conservation: CAMPFIRE 158

Chapter 6: Conclusion 162

Appendices
   Appendix 1 171
   Appendix 2 172
   Appendix 3 173

References 175
List of Tables

Table 1.1: Conservation status of Mammals, 1996 7
Table 1.2: Conservation status of Amphibians surveyed, 1996 7
Table 1.3: Number of endemic species in some “hot spot” areas 9
Table 1.4: Countries with the highest number of species for selected organisms 10
Table 1.5: Wildlife habitat loss in selected Sub-Saharan Africa countries 11
Table 1.6: Economic values for environmental goods and services 12
Table 1.7: Market value of recently utilised varieties 14
Table 1.8: Countries where high cultural and biodiversity overlap 16

Table 2.1: Status of threatened species late 1980’s 34
Table 2.2: Four categories of the instrumental value of biodiversity 39

Table 3.1: Four types of property regimes 70
Table 3.2: Property rights regimes and conditions for efficiency 71
Table 3.3: Types of property right regimes: owners, rights, and duties 75

Table 4.1: The development of the protected areas system of the world by CNPPA region 96
Table 4.2: Management objectives of protected areas 97
Table 4.3: Types of protected areas by IUCN category 98
Table 4.4: Numbers and combined areas of reserves by region, and percentage of region protected 100
Table 4.5: Estimates of minimum areas for the protection of biodiversity 101
Table 4.6: Annual world trade in selected wildlife 111
Table 4.7: Psittacines from Irian Jaya, Indonesia (early 1990s) 112

Table 5.1: Selected African elephants population estimates 150
Table 5.2: Land area (km²) used for wildlife conservation and utilisation in Zimbabwe 160
### List of Figures and Boxes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure/Box</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.1</td>
<td>Relative proportions of land area uses</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 4.1</td>
<td>Effects of an ineffectual trade ban</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 5.1</td>
<td>Hypothetical population distribution of a wild species</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 1.1</td>
<td>Recorded threats from known extinctions and endangerment: animals and birds</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 1.2</td>
<td>Threats to India's wildlife sanctuaries</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 1.3</td>
<td>Impact of national policies: Brazil</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 2.1</td>
<td><em>IUCN Red Data Book</em> categories</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 3.1</td>
<td>Social customs in Indonesia and West Africa</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 3.2</td>
<td>Arrow's fundamental Paradox of Information</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 3.3</td>
<td>Nationalisation results in degradation</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 3.4</td>
<td>International Conventions and agreements recognising and Acknowledging indigenous rights</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 3.5</td>
<td>Tragedy of the commons in Indonesia</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 4.1</td>
<td>What are Biosphere Reserves</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 4.2</td>
<td>Importing countries dictating the terms of trade</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 5.1</td>
<td>ADMADE in Zambia</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 5.2</td>
<td>Regional trade agreements</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Box 5.3</td>
<td>Crocodiles: a successful example of a species recovery Program based on commercial incentives</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>