

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Massey University Library  
New Zealand & Pacific Collection

## **PEER REVIEW:**

### **ORGANISATIONAL LEARNING FOR NURSES**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in  
Nursing at Massey University

**Brigid Halmai Te Kahui McRae**  
**1998**

**PEER REVIEW:**

**ORGANISATIONAL LEARNING FOR NURSES**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in  
Nursing at Massey University

**Brigid Halmai Te Kahui McRae**  
**1998**

## Abstract

Organisational learning as it relates to the development of a peer review system within a clinical area of nursing practice is the focus of this study. Sixteen Public Health Nurses, with the manager of their service, and three key managers from the employing Crown Health Enterprise in provincial New Zealand, took part with the researcher in this praxis-oriented participatory action research process. A framework of the learning organisation was created to direct the research inquiry and evaluate data in relation to the developing peer review system.

Through the use of critically reflexive discussions in an ongoing spiral of planning, implementing, observing, and assessing, this study illuminates the growth of the learning organisation and the building of a peer review system, within a cost-conscious healthcare service delivery environment. The account of the research process includes factors facilitative of, and critical to, the learning organisation. Use of many direct quotes from participants creates a context against which to visualise problems and constraints faced by the research group, and offers the reader a decision trail with which to resolve issues of credibility.

Use of the peer process, it is suggested, will generate vital information about organisational performance, which will enable nurses to assume legitimate control of clinical nursing workplaces. Conclusions derived from this study suggest that peer review and the learning organisation are important tools for both assuring the quality of clinical nursing performance and securing organisational goals.

## Acknowledgements

My thanks to the Public Health Nurses of the research group, and in particular to their manager, Christine, whose farsightedness, and concerns for an accurate appraisal of nurses' work initiated the peer review process. Thanks also to the outstandingly well-informed Nurse Advisor, as well as to the Chief Executive Officer and the Human Resource manager of the Crown Health Enterprise which employs these nurses. It was an illuminating and rewarding experience to work with you all.

Thank you for supervision and sound advice to Val, Jo, Cheryl and, most particularly, thanks to Phil for your energy, enthusiasm and excellent ideas. Thank you to my son, Christian, for encouragement and humour, and for taking time from a much more exciting life to proof-read and offer very much appreciated IT assistance.

The creation of this thesis is an undertaking that has crowded our lives for so long, and I owe a huge debt of time to my daughters. Thank you Stella and Halmai, for your love, understanding and patience. Thank you for seeing how important it has been to me, and all the things you did to help. I promise that I will repay your very important contributions to my endeavours. Remind me about it, whenever...

To my precious friend and mentor, Dorothy, there has never been anyone who has done for me what you have done; for your love and support and helping hands in so many different ways, on so many different occasions, thank you.

To my dear friends, especially Angie, Frank and Tony, thank you. I could not have done it without you.



## CONTENTS

	Page
Title	i
Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Contents	iv
CHAPTER ONE	
Background to the study	1
The research focus	2
Performance appraisal and performance management	2
The organisational context	3
Focus on health professional performance	6
The public health nurses' role	6
The peer review process	12
Research goal	15
Thesis presentation	15
CHAPTER TWO	
Peer review and performance management for nurses	19
Literature searches	19
Peer review as professional review	20
Performance management in the health care industry	21
Performance appraisal for nurses	23
Performance standards	26
The importance of feedback	26
Quality assurance and peer review	28
Empowerment of the nurse as employee	29
Governance of the clinical practice setting	32

Implementation of peer review	34
CHAPTER THREE	
Organisational learning and peer review	39
The learning organisation	39
What is the learning organisation?	42
Senge's model of the learning organisation	45
The research framework	48
CHAPTER FOUR	
Action research	55
Methodology	55
What happens in action research?	57
Participatory action research and co-operative enquiry	58
An orientation toward praxis	60
The research process	61
The situation at the beginning of the study	62
Data collection	63
Research participants and setting	65
Interviews	68
Ethical considerations	69
Reliability and validity	70
CHAPTER FIVE	
Peer review as organisational learning	75
The first spiral	75
Planning and action	76
Observation	77
Evaluation	82

CHAPTER SIX	
Problem solving and the review team	90
The second spiral	90
Planning and action	90
Observation	92
The review team	94
Evaluation	96
CHAPTER SEVEN	
A workshop aids decision making	101
The third spiral	101
Planning and action	101
Observation	104
Evaluation	109
CHAPTER EIGHT	
Interviews with CHE managers	116
Signs of the learning organisation	116
Interviews with CHE managers	119
Summary of all data evaluation	128
The peer review system	128
The learning organisation	129
CHAPTER NINE	
Discussions, recommendations and limitations	131
Recapitulation of research findings	131
Evaluation	134
Conclusions of the research	135

Implications for nursing practice	136
Implications for nursing education	138
Implications for nursing research	139
Limitations of the study	142
Concluding statement	144
REFERENCES	i-vii
APPENDIX	
Appendix A: Peer review model	i-v
Appendix B: Definition of peer review	vi-vii
Appendix C: Information/consent	viii-xi