Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
SOCIAL FORESTRY FOR ECONOMIC AND ECOLOGICAL SUSTAINABILITY

by

Josimar B. Sobrevinas

A thesis
submitted to Massey University
in partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the Degree of
Master of Philosophy
in Development Studies

Massey University
1993
ABSTRACT

This study looked into the prospects of state and other agency-sponsored social forestry project in addressing poverty and abating environmental degradation in the uplands. Forest destruction is rooted both on poverty condition of the swiddeners and their traditional farming practices. The social forestry's participatory component, scientific cropping modules and incentive schemes are viewed as effective measures to these problems.

The social forestry project which is jointly implemented by the New Zealand government and the Philippine National Oil Company (PNOC) in the three geothermal reservations managed by PNOC was chosen as the study areas due to the presence of the above-mentioned social forestry components in the project.

The research findings supported the strength of the monetary incentive scheme in eliciting farmers' participation in development projects which subsequently controlled their destructive kaingin-making practices. This, however, must be coupled with extensive social, economic and environmental training of the kaingineros.

The attractiveness of the project scheme to both project and non-project beneficiaries was also established. This study also demonstrates some successes of participation in terms of the development of the farmers' potentials and capabilities in self-management and realization of individual rights.

The financial analysis in the study determined the economy of scale of the combination of cropping modules while the economic analysis has established the project's beneficial effects on the environment. It justifies financial allocation to projects of this nature.

The natural and social problems in the implementation of the social forestry project could be addressed locally through the joint effort of project staff and the farmers-participants. The donor and proponent agencies, on the other hand, showed their sincere intention to minimize the occurrence of administrative problems.
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

It is very worthy to mention the number of people whom I owe a sense of gratitude for completing this piece of work. These people, regardless of the magnitude of their contribution are part of this accomplishment.

I must give a deep sense of gratitude to my supervisor, Professor A. C. Walsh, Director of the Institute of Development Studies, Massey University for his personal guidance and helpful suggestions in the development of this work. Also his array of academic colleagues gave me an opportunity to obtain ideas in this study from John McKinnon, Professor in Geography, Victoria University of Wellington, who likewise gave me an encouragement to pursue this research. My sincere thanks to Tony Banks, Lecturer in Agricultural Economics, Massey University, for his helpful comments and suggestions on financial and economic analyses in this study.

My personal thanks must go to Ms. Agnes C. de Jesus, Manager of Environmental Management Division, Philippine National Oil Company for giving me the opportunity to undertake this academic pursuit and for her moral support in the course of my study.
A lot of people helped me during my fieldwork and data gathering activities in the Philippines. Mar L. Gecolea lent me a hand in compiling project documents and other secondary information in Manila. My able field assistants in the different project areas, though their names are not mentioned here, helped me facilitate gathering of primary information. My million thanks go these people.

The social forestry project participants in Baslay, Bediao, Tongonan and Tublijon deserve my wholehearted thanks for their cooperation and unquestionable willingness in providing primary information in this study. In my belief, these people had tried disclosing flawless information.

A sincere thanks to all my fellow Filipino students in the university whose companionship and camaraderie had lessen the pressure in my study. The Carambas Family deserves a compliment for providing us the Philippine atmosphere during special occasions. Likewise, I am very grateful to the Baker Family for providing me an accommodation and a home atmosphere during the writing of this manuscript.

My must apology to my family whom I abandoned in pursuit of this academic advancement. Nevertheless, they served as my inspiration in the timely completion of this undertaking. I dedicate this work to them.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**ABSTRACT** ................................................................. ii
**ACKNOWLEDGMENT** ......................................................... iii
**TABLES** ........................................................................ x
**FIGURES** ....................................................................... xii
**GLOSSARY** ..................................................................... xiii

## CHAPTER I - INTRODUCTION ......................................................... 1

- Statement of the Problem ............................................. 1
- Purpose of the Research .............................................. 5
- Specific Objectives ...................................................... 5
- Research Hypotheses .................................................. 6
  - Initial Participation and Enlistment in Development Projects ... 6
  - Demographic Factors Affecting Initial Participation ................ 9
    - Household Income Level ........................................... 10
    - Age ..................................................................... 11
    - Sex ..................................................................... 12
  - Educational Level and Training Background ...................... 12
- People's Participation in Development Projects ................. 13
- Project Design, Monitoring and Evaluation ....................... 14
- Organization of Farmers' Associations .............................. 17
- Participation in the Decision-making Processes .................. 18
- Project Benefits ........................................................... 19
- Project Impact Indicators .............................................. 20
  - Improvement of Economic Condition ............................. 20
    - Increased Environmental Awareness Among Upland Farmers ... 21
    - Decreasing Environmental Degradation ......................... 22
  - Project Replicability .................................................. 22
- Significance of the Study .............................................. 23
- Researcher's Stance ..................................................... 27

## CHAPTER II - RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ...................................... 29

- Research Design .......................................................... 29
- Selection and Description of the Study Area ....................... 30
  - Selection of Study Area ............................................ 30
  - Description of the Study Area Before the Implementation of the Project .... 31
The Baslay and Bediao Project Areas
Physical Features
Socio-economic Condition
The Tongonan Project Area
Physical Features
Socio-economic Condition
The Azupre Project Area
Physical Features
Socio-economic Condition
PNOC Social Forestry Project Background
Major Elements
Description of Physical Interventions
The Baslay and Bediao Agroforestry Projects' Modules
The Tongonan Rattan Plantation Project Module
The Azupre Agroforestry Project Module
Funding Components
Selection of Sample Respondents
Data Collection Methods
Instruments
Orientation of Research Assistants
Data Collection Schedule
Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA)
Non-participant Observation
Secondary Data
Inventory of Ayanguile trees
Approaches of Analyses
Logical Framework Approach (LFA)
Data Encoding and Summarization
Statistical Tools
Financial Analysis
Economic Analysis

CHAPTER III - RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Chapter Organization
Demographic and Social Characteristics of the Sample Respondents
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Project Area
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Sex
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Age
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Educational Level
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Training Background
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Household Size
Distribution of Sample Respondents by Sex of Household Members
Distribution of Respondents' Households by Number of Children in School Before Joining the Project
Economic Characteristics of Sample Respondents 74
Distribution of Respondents' Households
According to Primary Sources of Income 74
Distribution of Respondents' Households
According to Secondary Sources of Income 76
Respondents' Household Income from Different
Sources Before and After Project Implementation 76
Household Income from Ka'ingin-making 77
Household Income from Farming of Private Land 78
Household Income from Livestock Production 80
Household Income from Other Sources 82
Household Income from Original Sources and Social Forestry Project 84
Test of Research Hypotheses 85
Hypothesis 1 85
Hypothesis 2 89
Hypothesis 3 90
Hypothesis 4 92
Hypothesis 5 93
Hypothesis 6 94
Hypothesis 7 96
Hypothesis 8 98
Hypothesis 9 103
Hypothesis 10 106
Hypothesis 11 107
Hypothesis 12 109
Economic Analyses of the Social Forestry Project 109
Farmers' Involvement in the Different Phases of project Cycle 115
Planning, Formulation and Design 115
Implementation 118
Monitoring 118
Evaluation 121

CHAPTER IV - PROBLEMS IN PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION 122
Problems in the Implementation of the Social Forestry Project 122
Administrative Problems 122
Administrative System 122
Project Staff Assignment 125
Inter-agency Problems 126
Social Problems 127
Cynicism and Filipino Values Affecting Participation to the Project 127
Factionalism 128
Discipline of Association Officers 128
Natural Problems 129
Crop Infestation 130
Long Dry Season 130
Typhoons 131
Soil Condition .................................. 131

CHAPTER V - CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS .................................. 132

Conclusion .................................. 132
Recommendation .................................. 137
Administrative Recommendations .................................. 137
Technical Recommendations .................................. 138
Socio-economic Recommendations .................................. 140
General Recommendation .................................. 141

APPENDICES .................................. 142 - 226

1 : Project Social Development Training Programme for Farmers-Beneficiaries .................................. 142
2 : Registration Certificates of the Beneficiary Associations .................................. 145
3 : Original Target Plantation Area by Project Area .................................. 149
4 : Target Plantation Area After 1990 Mission Review .................................. 150
5 : Target Plantation Area After 1991 Project Review .................................. 151
6 : Breakdown of Project Funding Between the Philippine National Oil Company and the New Zealand Government .................................. 152
7 : Questionnaire for NZ-PNOC Social Forestry Project Beneficiaries .................................. 157
8 : Questionnaire for Non-project Beneficiaries .................................. 166
9 : Questionnaire for NZ-PNOC Social Forestry Project in Tagalog Dialect .................................. 167
10 : Participatory Rural Assessment Result by Tublijon Farmers' Association .................................. 174
11 : Ayanguile Stand Inventory .................................. 176
12 : Logical Framework Chart .................................. 177
13 : Summary of Codes Used in Data Encoding and Summarization .................................. 179
14 : Crop Yield Data .................................. 184
15 : Crop Prices Data .................................. 185
16 : Financial Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project .................................. 188
17 : Financial Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project .................................. 191
18 : Financial Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project .................................. 194
19 : Financial Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project .................................. 197
20 : Economic Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project (Without Project Situation) .................................. 198
21 : Economic Analysis for Bediao Agroforestry Project (Without Project Situation) .................................. 199
22 : Economic Analysis for Tongonan Agroforestry Project (Without Project Situation) .................................. 200
23 : Economic Analysis for Azupre Agroforestry Project (Without Project Situation) .................. 201
24 : Economic Analysis for Baslay Agroforestry Project (With Project Situation) .................. 202
25 : Economic Analysis for Bediao Agroforestry Project (With Project Situation) .................. 204
26 : Economic Analysis for Tongonan Agroforestry Project (With Project Situation) .................. 206
27 : Economic Analysis for Azupre Agroforestry Project (With Project Situation) .................. 208
28 : Draft Memorandum of Agreement Between the Philippine National Oil Company and New Zealand Government on the Joint Implementation of the New Zealand - PNOC Social Forestry Project .................. 210
29 : Waiver of PNOC's Accounting Procedures .................. 214
30 : Delegation of Authority .................. 221
31 : Increasing Trend in Membership in Beneficiary Associations .................. 226

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................. 227
TABLES

Table 1: Question-Hypothesis Summary Table ........ 24
Table 2: Area of Plantations with Healthy Crops ...... 48
Table 3: Distribution of Sample Respondents by Project Area ........ 64
Table 4: Distribution of Sample Respondents by Sex ...... 65
Table 5: Distribution of Sample Respondents by Age .... 66
Table 6: Distribution of Sample Respondents by Educational Level ........ 68
Table 7: Distribution of Sample Respondents by Training Background ........ 69
Table 8: Type of Training Attended by Sample Respondents ........ 70
Table 9: Distribution of Respondents' Households by Household Size ........ 71
Table 10: Distribution of Respondents' Household by Sex of Household Members ........ 72
Table 11: Distribution of Respondents' Households by Number of Children in School Before Project Implementation ........ 73
Table 12: Distribution of Respondents' Households According to Primary Sources of Income ........ 75
Table 13: Distribution of Respondents' Households According to Secondary Sources of Income ........ 77
Table 14: Area of Kaingin Farmers in Each Project Area .... 78
Table 15: Mean Annual Household Income from Kaingin-making Before and After Project Implementation ........ 79
Table 16: Reasons Cited by the Respondents' for the Decrease in their Mean Annual Income from Kaingin-making and Farming of Private Land ........ 79
Table 17: Mean Annual Household Income from Farming of Private Land Before and After Implementation of the PNOC Social Forestry Project ........ 81
Table 18: Mean Annual Household Income from Livestock Production Before and After Implementation of the PNOC Social Forestry Project ........ 82
Table 19: Reasons Cited by the Respondents for the Increase in Their Mean Annual Income from Livestock Raising ........ 83
Table 20: Mean Annual Household Income from Other Sources Before and After Project Implementation ........ 83
Table 21: Mean Annual Household Income From Original Sources After Project Implementation ........ 84
Table 22: Mean Annual Household Income from Original Sources and Project Income After Project Implementation ........ 85
Table 23: Farmers' Purposes for Joining the Social Forestry Project ............... 86
Table 24: Respondents' Mean Annual Household Income and Percentage of Respondents That Selected Income Generation as Primary Purpose for Joining the project .................. 88
Table 25: Respondents by Income Level and Percentage of Respondents That Selected Income Generation as Primary Purpose for Joining the Project ........ 89
Table 26: 1988 Poverty Levels at the Study Area .............. 90
Table 27: Respondents by Income Level and Date of Enlistment to the Project ........... 91
Table 28: Respondents by Age Level and Date of Enlistment to the Project ............ 92
Table 29: Respondents by Sex and Date of Enlistment .......... 93
Table 30: Helpfulness of the Project Training Programme to the Respondents ......... 94
Table 31: Association's Decision-making Processes Cited by the Respondents ........ 95
Table 32: Association's Sharing Scheme Cited by the Respondents ...... 96
Table 33: Kainginero’s Attitude Towards Stopping Kaingin-making Practices ............ 97
Table 34: Respondents' Mean Annual Household Income Before and After Project Implementation ........................................ 99
Table 35: Comparison Between Number of Children in School Before and After Project Implementation ............. 99
Table 36: Capital Stock of the Associations .................. 100
Table 37: Equipments Acquired by the Associations ............ 101
Table 38: Summary of Project Net Present Values and Average Net Returns ........ 103
Table 39: Respondents' Means of Acquiring Knowledge About the Environment .......... 104
Table 40: List of Environmental Protection and Conservation Activities Initiated by the Respondents ................. 105
Table 41: Kaingin-making Incidence Before and After Project Implementation ........ 107
Table 42: Farming Scheme Preferred by Respondents .......... 108
Table 43: List of Farmers groups Adopting the PNOC Pilot Social Forestry Project Scheme .......... 110
Table 44: Acknowledgment of Farmers from Other Communities That Their Projects was Patterned with the Pilot Social Forestry Project ....... 111
Table 45: Comparison Between Net Present Values "Without" and "With" Project Situations .......... 114
# FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>The Geothermal Energy Recharge Model</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>Location of the Four Social Forestry Project Areas</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Location of the Baslay and Bediao Social Forestry Project Areas</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>Location of the Tongonan Social Forestry Project Area</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>Location of the Azupre Social Forestry Project Area</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6</td>
<td>Baslay and Bediao Agroforestry Projects Cropping Module 1</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7</td>
<td>Baslay and Bediao Agroforestry Projects Cropping Module 2</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 8</td>
<td>Tongonan Rattan Plantation Project Cropping Module</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9</td>
<td>Azupre Agroforestry Project Cropping Module</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10</td>
<td>Logical Framework Matrix</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abaca A banana-like plant whose fibers are used in the manufacture of rope and handicrafts
Ayanguile A leguminous tree primarily used for soil protection and watershed conservation
Barangay Village
BAS Bureau of Agricultural Statistics
Bayanihan Free and voluntary group work
BPI Bureau of Plant Industry
CBCR Community-Based Contract Reforestation
CBU Capital Build-Up
CSC Certificate of Stewardship Contract
CTF Communal Tree Farm
DA Department of Agriculture
DBP Development Bank of the Philippines
DENR Department of Environment and Natural Resources
FAR Family Approach to Reforestation
FIDA Fiber Industry Development Authority
FMB Forest Management Bureau
FOM Forest Occupancy Management
Gabi A variety of root crop
Guiron Commonly called tiger grass whose flower stalks are used in making soft broom
ISFP Integrated Social Forestry Programme
Kaingin Area cleared through slash-and-burn shifting agriculture
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kainginero</td>
<td>Upland farmer engage in slash-and-burn shifting agriculture, swiddener</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kakawate</td>
<td>A deciduous leguminous tree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFA</td>
<td>Logical Framework Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFC</td>
<td>Logical Framework Chart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOI</td>
<td>Letter of Instruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFAT</td>
<td>Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO's</td>
<td>Non-governmental Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPV</td>
<td>Net Present Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palasan</td>
<td>A species of rattan (<em>Calamus maximus</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peso</td>
<td>Philippine currency (approximately 29 pesos = US $1 in 1993)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNOC</td>
<td>Philippine National Oil Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRA</td>
<td>Participatory Rural Appraisal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Province</td>
<td>Political unit composed of towns and cities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sari-sari</td>
<td>Variety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sitio</td>
<td>Cluster of residential houses in a village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Town</td>
<td>Political unit composed of group of villages</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>