Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
COMPETITIVE BODYBUILDERS AND IDENTITY
Insights from New Zealand

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Department of Management,
College of Business
Massey University, Palmerston North,
New Zealand.

Anne Probert
2009
ABSTRACT

This research explores competitive bodybuilders in New Zealand and their identities. Bodybuilders have often been construed as being broadly similar – excessively muscular people, who build their physiques for sometimes questionable reasons, such as for a cover for internal insecurities. Bodybuilding is often considered acceptable for men because muscles are symbolic of masculinity – on women they are seen as unnatural and unfeminine. While external critiques have tended to portray bodybuilders in a negative light, phenomenological accounts have often emphasised participants’ positive experiences.

Existing research concerning the identity of bodybuilders has only scratched the surface. Identities reflect an understanding of ‘who one is’ – the continuing meanings people associate with themselves and as members of social groups. Furthermore, bodybuilders are not just ‘bodybuilders’, they are also people. Bodybuilding is not their only identity, it is one of their numerous identities. This research explored not only the meanings participants attribute to bodybuilding, but also how it is lived and experienced within the broader self.

A phenomenological-inspired, mixed methodological approach was adopted using quantitative and qualitative methods. Participants were male and female competitive bodybuilders of varying ages residing in New Zealand. They were at different stages in their bodybuilding career and represented a range of competitive experience. A postal questionnaire was completed by 382 competitive bodybuilders, and in-depth interviews were conducted with 32 participants. Photo elicitation was also used.
A key outcome of this research has been to highlight the changeable, complex, contradictory nature of bodybuilder identities. Fluidity, ambiguity and pluralism existed amongst the everyday practices and identities of participants. Although bodybuilders shared commonalities, their identities were not identical or stable: bodybuilding could be about transforming the body, looking good, being competitive, creative and/or healthy. It could be a lifestyle, involve personal challenge, self-development, social belonging and friendship. Identity experiences could be influenced by personality, background, gender, sexuality, age, ethnicity, work, family and church. The bodybuilder identities were also found to be closely connected to participant perceptions concerning their natural body, genetic advantages and limitations. Furthermore, their identities were not depthless but entailed commitment, passion, mental, social and emotional dimensions. Competitive bodybuilding was a meaningful activity, that often left an indelible mark and continued to shape participant lives even after they had ceased competitive bodybuilding.
DEDICATION

For mum.

She completed her entire University degree by correspondence, while working and raising us. At the time, I was young and rebellious and did not appreciate the enormity of her accomplishment.

But now I do. This is dedicated to her memory.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank everybody who has contributed directly or indirectly, to this research.

My Supervisors, Dr. Sarah Leberman and Dr. Farah Palmer have provided guidance, support and mentoring. Sarah, my Chief Supervisor, has been my guiding light. She has kept me focused throughout the research process and enabled me to distinguish the forest from the trees. Farah has provided ideas and feedback. Sometimes I did not always appreciate them at the time, but later I often found they contained gems which made all the difference to my work.

The scholarship funds provided by Massey University have enabled me to remain financially afloat during the period of my research – so to them a huge thanks!

Greg has listened to all my bodybuilder talk and has supported me throughout the process – he did this even though he would prefer to watch the rugby and have a beer.

Stuart and the team at Venture Taranaki and Antony at MP Studios have always had faith in me, provided friendship not to mention practical support.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge the participants in this research who have willingly dedicated their time and energy. Competitive bodybuilders in New Zealand sometimes struggle to find recognition, understanding and appreciation of their sport - I hope in my own small way, I have helped.
# CONTENTS

Abstract...................................................................................................................... i
Dedication................................................................................................................ iii
Acknowledgements ..................................................................................................... iv
Table of contents .......................................................................................................1
List of Tables, Figures and Photographs ................................................................. 7
1.0 Introduction .............................................................................................................11
2.0 Literature Review ..................................................................................................16
  2.1 Theory overview and position ...........................................................................18
    What is identity? ....................................................................................................19
    Identity: Progress to date ....................................................................................19
    Research position ...............................................................................................21
    Identity concepts .................................................................................................26
      Personal and social identities ............................................................................26
      Multiple identities ............................................................................................27
      Fragmented identities .......................................................................................28
    Assuming identities, and their changing evolving nature ....................................29
    The nature of groups ............................................................................................35
    Managing identities ............................................................................................37
      Salience .............................................................................................................38
      Reflexivity .........................................................................................................40
    Bodies, embodiment and identity ........................................................................41
    Identity – Synthesis and summary .......................................................................47
  2.2 Sport, identity and key identity intersections ...................................................51
    a. Sport and identity ............................................................................................51
3.3 Ethical considerations and approval .............................................................136

3.4 Data collection and analysis .....................................................................136

a. Phase one: quantitative – postal questionnaire.................................136

Measures ..................................................................................................136

Sample ....................................................................................................137

Analysis ..................................................................................................139

Limitations .............................................................................................140

b. Phase two: qualitative-In-depth interviews and photo

elicitation ................................................................................................141

Participant selection and interview process .......................................141

Photo elicitation ....................................................................................144

Data analysis ........................................................................................145

Validity, reliability and trustworthiness .............................................148

4.0 Bodybuilder demographics and sporting practices ..................................152

Who are the bodybuilders? .....................................................................152

4.1 Demographic findings ........................................................................153

Gender ..................................................................................................153

Ethnicity ............................................................................................154

Age .......................................................................................................156

Other demographic findings .............................................................157

4.2 Bodybuilding training and competitive experience ............................158

Competitive bodybuilding experience ............................................158

Competition categories ........................................................................159

Training, weight changes and supplementation ................................163

Training support and knowledge ......................................................165

5.0 Views and Experiences of New Zealand Bodybuilders ........................167
5.1 Analysis of questionnaire statements........................................................167
Levels of support ..........................................................................................167
Factor analysis ............................................................................................175
5.2 Analysis of questionnaire statements by gender.......................................176
Levels of support – differences based on gender........................................176
Factor analysis - gender .............................................................................179
5.3 Analysis of questionnaire statements by age ............................................185
Levels of support – differences based on age.............................................185
Factor analysis - age ..................................................................................187
5.4 Ethnicity ...................................................................................................193

6.0 Becoming a competitive bodybuilder and what it means ......................194
6.1 Pathways and motivations ......................................................................195
Starting out – the gym and weightlifting ....................................................195
Triggers to take up competitive bodybuilding ..........................................195
6.2 What does it mean to be a competitive bodybuilder?.............................197
a. The transformational body ......................................................................199
b. The attractive body .................................................................................209
c. The healthy–unhealthy relationship .......................................................214
d. The competitive element ........................................................................223
e. Performance, creativity and self-expression .........................................234
f. The personal challenge and development .............................................242
g. Social belonging and difference .........................................................256
h. Bodybuilding as a lifestyle ......................................................................265

7.0 Bodybuilding as one of multiple identities ..............................................269
7.1 Gender ....................................................................................................269
The body .......................................................................................................269
9.4 Identity meanings ..........................................................350
9.5 Multiple identities ..........................................................362
9.6 Commitment ............................................................385
9.7 Retirement .................................................................390

10.0 Conclusions .................................................................394

References .................................................................409
Appendix 1: Questionnaire ..................................................430
Appendix 2: Interview consent form ....................................438
Appendix 3: Interview question schedule ................................441
Appendix 4: Interview field notes guide ................................444
Appendix 5: Methodology coding examples ............................445
Appendix 6: New Zealand Bodybuilding: Competition categories and Rule Guides
– extracts from the NZFBB and NABBA rules .........................459
Appendix 7: Quantitative findings
  a. respondent differences based on gender .........................459
  b. Respondent differences based on age .........................460
Appendix 8: The competitive bodybuilders Interviewed ............461
Appendix 9: Published articles .............................................465
LIST OF TABLES

2.1 Paradigm shift: modernism to postmodernism ......................................................... 24
3.1 Fundamental principles of phenomenology ............................................................... 119
5.1 Most supported questionnaire statements .............................................................. 168
5.2 Least supported questionnaire statements ............................................................. 168
5.3 Ratings for bodybuilding statements ..................................................................... 169
5.4 Factor analysis inclusive of all participants ............................................................ 171
5.5 Significant differences between male and female questionnaire statements ....... 177
5.6 Factor analysis by gender ...................................................................................... 180
5.7 Significant differences pertinent to bodybuilder age ............................................. 186
5.8 Factor analysis by age .......................................................................................... 188
9.1 Bodybuilder commitment and identity management strategies ......................... 389
## LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Identity framework to inform this research</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>The research relationship framing this research</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Elements of the pluralistic approach</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Analysis of bodybuilder respondents by gender</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Ethnicity of respondents and comparison with New Zealand’s population base</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Age of respondents and comparison with New Zealand’s population base</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Comparison of age profiles of male versus female respondents</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Number of Competitions</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Competitive category - female</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Female competitive category preference by muscularity</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Competitive category - male</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Male competitive category preference by muscularity</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Category/muscularity comparison by gender</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>Use of Supplements – Off-season versus pre-competition</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Competitive bodybuilding meanings</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Bodybuilder identity construction process</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Identity construction process - comparison of models</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Bodybuilder-broader identity “fit”</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>Bodybuilder meanings and connecting themes</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Competitive bodybuilding and gendered experiences/meanings</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>Competitive bodybuilding and age-related experiences/meanings</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>Competitive bodybuilding and experiences/meanings related to race/ethnicity</td>
<td>373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>Competitive bodybuilding and experiences/meanings related to work</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>Competitive bodybuilding and experiences/meanings related to religion</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9.10 Reasons for retirement and links to identity ..........................................................392
10.1 The sport-identity research framework..................................................................407
10.2 Research results .....................................................................................................408
| 1. | Bodybuilding as a vehicle of physical transformation | 200 |
| 2. | Body assessments, parts and pleasures | 207 |
| 3. | Bodybuilders, attractiveness and self-assessments | 213 |
| 4. | The mandatory posing line-up | 230 |
| 5. | Winning and emotion | 233 |
| 6. | Posing as artistic | 235 |
| 7. | The stage as an arena for personality and entertainment | 237 |
| 8. | Displaying the triceps: Learning and mastering posing | 238 |
| 9. | Identity, stage and crowd | 240 |
| 10. | The mental-physical connection | 245 |
| 11. | Bodybuilding as not only outward but internal | 246 |
| 12. | Personal challenges and achievements | 251 |
| 13. | Bodybuilding, identity and meaning | 268 |
| 14. | Male bodybuilders, bodies and muscular descriptions | 270 |
| 15. | Assessments and changing perceptions about the body due to time and participation in competitive bodybuilding | 272 |
| 16. | Female bodybuilder highlighting the muscular, lean and feminine dimensions of the body | 277 |
| 17. | Female bodybuilding: Leanness and concerns of the ‘bum’ | 278 |
| 18. | Men, masculinities and leanness: feeling ‘small and skinny’ | 280 |
| 19. | Combining ‘dance’ and bodybuilding: male bodybuilders could be ‘elegant’ | 288 |
| 20. | Bodybuilding, women, friendships and the ‘girls weekend away’ | 289 |
| 21. | Pride and positiveness at an older age | 307 |