

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**An integrated approach: Holistic assessment of  
vocational trainees in the NZ dairy farming industry**

**A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the  
degree of:**

**Master of Education (Tertiary Education)**

**At Massey University, Manawatu, New Zealand**

**Graeme William Couper**

**2016**

# **Abstract**

Vocational training qualifications in New Zealand have undergone significant change since 2008 due to the Targeted Review of Qualifications (TRoQ) initiated by the New Zealand Qualifications Authority (NZQA). In 2016, Primary ITO introduced programmes for these new qualifications to the dairy farming sector. A new holistic assessment approach was implemented, centred on an integrated Evidence Portfolio.

The purpose of this research was to:

- a) Compare the new assessment methodology with the previous approach, from the perspective of the Trainees, Employers, and Assessors, and;
- b) Determine the extent to which the new assessment approach enabled Learners to apply theoretical knowledge to practical workplace situations.

While much research has been done about competency-based Vocational Education and Training (VET), it largely focusses on institution-based learners, not those who are based in the workplace. This research aimed to contribute to the literature by examining competency-based assessment in a post-TRoQ, New Zealand workplace-based context.

The sample groups for this research were drawn from dairy farming trainees who were enrolled in the new qualifications, and had also achieved one of the previous qualifications. The employers and assessors of these trainees were also included. The research utilised semi-structured interviews with the participants to gain their views on the new assessment methodology and how it compared to the previous method.

The findings of this research largely reinforce the literature on competency-based VET. A new contribution is made by examining competency-based VET in a workplace-based context. The new assessment methodology was successful in enabling trainees to apply their theoretical knowledge to practical workplace situations and it was preferred by the participants over the previous assessment method.

It is concluded that the notion of how competence is viewed in a New Zealand VET context should be revisited, and that it could assume a wider focus. This research also highlights the link between underpinning theoretical knowledge and practical workplace performance and suggests that performance of practical workplace tasks could provide sufficient evidence to assess Trainees' theoretical knowledge in the final stages of their qualification.

## Acknowledgements

I would firstly like to acknowledge my supervisors for this thesis, Dr Jenny Poskitt and Dr Alison Sewell. Without their support, guidance, wisdom and encouragement I would never have made it to the end.

Also, from an academic perspective, I am grateful to Dr Linda Leach, as it was she who originally ignited my interest in post-graduate study and helped me to realise that this was something I could achieve.

Secondly, I would like to acknowledge the support from my employers, Primary ITO and in particular Tracey Shepherd, for always encouraging me to continue, and for recognising the value of what I was learning to our business.

Thirdly, I appreciate all the participants in this research. The Trainees, Farmer Employers and Training Advisers who agreed to take part, and were generous with their time, information and opinions. Your contributions will contribute towards improvements in our training programmes for the future. A special mention to Andrew Roche for the enthusiasm with which he assisted me in arranging and carrying out the visits in the South Island!

Finally, I would like to thank my wife, Susan, for putting up with the highs and lows of two years of study, at nights and weekends. She has been positive and supportive at every step on the journey, and exhibited incredible patience at times!

# Table of Contents

<i>Abstract</i> .....	II
<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	III
<i>List of tables and figures</i> .....	VI
<i>Chapter 1: Introduction</i> .....	1
1.1    Background.....	1
1.2    Why do the research?.....	3
1.3    How was the research done?.....	3
1.4    Outline of this Thesis .....	4
<i>Chapter 2: Literature review</i> .....	5
2.1    Principles of Adult Learning .....	5
2.2    Vocational Education and Training.....	7
2.3    Competency based assessment and training .....	10
2.4    Assessment of competence .....	15
2.5    Authentic assessment .....	17
2.6    Conclusion .....	22
<i>Chapter 3: Study design and methodology</i> .....	24
3.1    What type of research? .....	24
3.2    Research questions .....	24
3.3    Evaluative case study .....	25
3.4    Limitations of case studies.....	26
3.5    Data collection and types of evidence .....	28
3.6    Validity and integrity of data, and triangulation .....	31
3.7    Ethical issues.....	32
3.8    Summary .....	33
<i>Chapter 4: Practical application of the research</i> .....	34
4.1    Sampling.....	34
4.2    Realities of data collection in the field .....	35
4.3    Ethical issues.....	38
4.4    Data analysis.....	38
4.5    Limitations of the study.....	40
<i>Chapter 5: Findings</i> .....	41
5.1    Introduction.....	41
5.2    Integration of theoretical knowledge learning with practical on-farm skills.....	42
5.3    Learners are more flexibly and actively engaged with their learning .....	45

5.4	More “real world” evidence is available to make assessment decisions .....	48
5.5	More active interaction between those involved in the assessment process .....	50
5.6	Preference for new assessment method .....	53
5.7	Practical challenges of change .....	54
5.8	Practical contextualisation of theoretical knowledge assessments.....	56
5.9	More understanding and clarity of what trainees are learning.....	57
5.10	Summary .....	58
<i>Chapter 6:</i>	<i>Discussion.....</i>	<i>60</i>
6.1	Introduction.....	60
6.2	Application of knowledge to the workplace .....	60
6.3	Authentic assessment .....	62
6.4	Portfolio assessment .....	65
6.5	The notion of competence.....	66
6.6	Summary of discussion .....	67
<i>Chapter 7:</i>	<i>Conclusions.....</i>	<i>68</i>
7.1	Introduction.....	68
7.2	Research questions .....	68
7.3	Key outcomes .....	69
7.4	Implications from this research.....	69
7.5	Future research.....	70
7.6	Recommendations .....	71
7.7	Value of the research .....	72
<i>References.....</i>		<i>73</i>
<i>Appendices .....</i>		<i>82</i>

## List of tables and figures

Table 1: General approaches to competence by various countries -----	14
Table 2: Strategies to determine rigour -----	27
Table 3: Summary of Participant numbers -----	37
Table 4: Data triangulation across the three groups -----	42
Table 5: Reasons participants preferred the new assessment method -----	54
Table 6: Research findings compared to five dimensions of authentic assessment -----	63
Figure 1: Sample of data coding chart -----	39