Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
A QUANTUM LEAP IN INFORMAL BENCHMARKING

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Organisational Excellence

At Massey University, Palmerston North, Manawatu
New Zealand

Alan Samuel
2017
Abstract

Despite the paucity of available literature on informal benchmarking and the consequential lack of its understanding, informal benchmarking has outranked established benchmarking (formal), placing 4th out of 20 of the most used business improvement tools, based on a 2008 Global Benchmarking Network (GBN) survey of 450 organisations worldwide. This paradox is exacerbated by the growing popularity of informal benchmarking, even though it is not correspondingly as effective as it is widely used. Therefore, two significant gaps need be filled: firstly, to develop a theoretical understanding of, and secondly, to investigate how to increase the effectiveness of informal benchmarking as an organisational improvement tool.

A pragmatic mixed method quantitative-qualitative sequential design using an abductive-deductive-inductive approach is adopted. The product of abduction is a preliminary conceptual model of informal benchmarking from the transdisciplinary academic review of benchmarking, informal learning, organisation learning and knowledge management, augmented by concepts on quantum thinking, innovation and positive deviance. The model informs the quantitative survey questionnaire, whose deductive results of 81 survey responses from 14 countries informs the in-depth semi-structured interviews of 16 informants from 7 countries, the resulting dataset being inductively coded into conceptually-driven dendrograms. The integrated findings refine the conceptual model of informal benchmarking, and develops a toolset-based application model (a pragmatic outcome of the conceptual model), a maturity assessment framework and an eco-system strategy. From here, an informal benchmarking roadmap is synthesised, representing a sustainable platform for informal benchmarking to be deployed as an effective organisational improvement initiative.

The research sets the stage for a leap in scholarly understanding of informal benchmarking in the wider context of business and organisational improvement, and offers organisational improvement practitioners an invaluable cost-effective solution in a time-scarce executive world. This pragmatic study of informal benchmarking has possibly unleashed a different epistemological stance within the benchmarking field, by advocating an organic approach to benchmarking, in contrast to the highly methodical approaches associated with conventional benchmarking.
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APQC</td>
<td>American Productivity and Quality Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPIR</td>
<td>Business Performance Improvement Resource</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBN</td>
<td>Global Benchmarking Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IB</td>
<td>Informal Benchmarking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IL</td>
<td>Informal Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KM</td>
<td>Knowledge Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LO</td>
<td>Learning Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OL</td>
<td>Organisational Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSD</td>
<td>Non-social Dimension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Social Dimension</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

I am extremely indebted to my chief supervisor Dr. Robin Mann for his continuous and timely support. His expertise, superb pragmatic advice and brilliant academic resources has helped me gain a strong footing in my study. His expertise and wealth of experience in benchmarking and organisational excellence has polished and added finesse to the practical deliverables of my thesis. Exposure to global benchmarking experts and opportunities to network has been invaluable.

I am extremely grateful to supervisor Professor Nigel Grigg for his strategic insight, and his incredible academic ability in building rigour into my thesis. His guidance throughout the process has been supremely enlightening, eye-opening and very enjoyable. The provision of solid resources and being part of his network has given me plenty of opportunities to learn from other disciplines, and to expand my network.

I would also like to thank the SEAT team for being so very helpful and efficient in the processing of trips and claims, and for making me feel at home when I first stepped into Massey University.

My gratitude goes to all informants in my research, without which this thesis would not have been possible.

The journey in New Zealand has been challenging and thrilling at the same time. Words cannot express my gratitude to my wife and 3 children for their immense support and understanding, to my mother for her care and support, and to my brother for being such an inspiration to me. Most of all I would like thank my Lord Jesus Christ for making all this possible.

Alan Samuel
# Table of Contents

Abstract .......................................................................................................................... ii

Abbreviations ................................................................................................................ iii

Acknowledgements .......................................................................................................... iv

Table of Contents .......................................................................................................... v

List of Tables ................................................................................................................... x

List of Figures ................................................................................................................ xiv

Chapter 1  Introduction ................................................................................................. 2
  1.1 Chapter Overview ................................................................................................. 2
  1.2 The Research Problem ......................................................................................... 2
  1.3 Research Aims .................................................................................................... 5
  1.4 Research Questions ............................................................................................. 5
  1.5 Research Objectives ........................................................................................... 5
  1.6 Significance of Research ..................................................................................... 6
  1.7 Researcher’s Role ............................................................................................... 7
  1.8 Working Terms ................................................................................................... 7
  1.9 Research Structure ............................................................................................. 8
  1.10 Chapter Summary ............................................................................................. 10

Chapter 2  Literature Review ...................................................................................... 12
  2.1 Chapter Overview ............................................................................................... 12
  2.2 Informal Benchmarking ....................................................................................... 12
  2.3 Transdisciplinary Approach ................................................................................ 14
  2.4 Discipline 1: Benchmarking ............................................................................. 17
    2.4.1 Definition, Purpose and Characteristics ...................................................... 19
    2.4.2 Taxonomy of Benchmarking & Informal Benchmarking ............................. 20
    2.4.3 Methodologies of Benchmarking ................................................................. 24
  2.5 Discipline 2: Organisational Learning (OL) ...................................................... 26
    2.5.1 The Learning Organisation (LO) ................................................................. 27
    2.5.2 Holon Framework for Knowledge Elicitation and Learning Dynamics ....... 28
  2.6 Discipline 3: Informal Learning (IL) ................................................................. 29
4.4.1 Demography of Respondents (Q1-4 & 22) ................................................................. 65
4.4.2 Effectiveness and Popularity of Tools (Q5-Q12) ......................................................... 67
4.4.3 Key Findings for Effectiveness & Popularity of Tools .............................................. 83
4.4.4 Maturity Grid – Importance, Culture, Support & Impact (Q18-Q21) ....................... 89
4.4.5 Key Findings for Maturity in Organisations (Q18-21) .............................................. 92
4.4.6 Formal Benchmarking vs Informal Benchmarking (Q13-Q17) ............................... 94
4.4.7 Key Findings for Formal Benchmarking vs Informal Benchmarking ................... 95

4.5 Summary of Findings ..................................................................................................... 99
4.5.1 Useful Findings ............................................................................................................. 100
4.5.2 Unexpected Findings ................................................................................................. 100
4.5.3 Regression Analysis not Appropriate ...................................................................... 100

4.6 Recommendations for Future Research ................................................................. 101

4.7 Chapter Summary ......................................................................................................... 101

Chapter 5 Analysis of Interviews ................................................................................... 103
5.1 Chapter Overview ........................................................................................................... 103
5.2 Interview Plan ................................................................................................................ 103
5.2.1 Thematizing .............................................................................................................. 103
5.2.2 Designing .................................................................................................................. 104
5.2.3 Interviewing .............................................................................................................. 105
5.2.4 Transcribing ............................................................................................................. 105
5.2.5 Analysis .................................................................................................................... 105
5.2.6 Reporting .................................................................................................................. 107
5.3 Neo-positivism, Romanticism & Semi-Structured Approach .................................... 107
5.4 Interview Process .......................................................................................................... 108
5.4.1 Interview Question mapped to Research Objectives ............................................. 109
5.4.2 Techniques to Interpret Interviews ......................................................................... 111
5.4.3 Data Saturation of Interviews ............................................................................... 111
5.4.4 Phases of Interviews ............................................................................................... 112
5.5 Analysis by Meaning Condensation ............................................................................ 115
5.5.1 Reflection ................................................................................................................ 115
5.6 Analysis by Meaning Coding in NVIVO .................................................................... 116
5.6.1 Concept Driven Data ............................................................................................... 116
5.6.2 Five levels of Coding ............................................................................................... 117
# Chapter 7 Discussion

## 7.1 Chapter Overview

## 7.2 Review of the Research Objectives

## 7.3 Informal Benchmarking in the Context of Organisational Improvement

### 7.3.1 Conceptual Model & Toolset Application Model

### 7.3.2 QUANTUM Assessment Framework & Strategy

### 7.3.3 Interpretation of Unexpected Finding

### 7.3.4 Praxis & Reflexivity

## 7.4 Chapter Summary

# Chapter 8 Conclusion

## 8.1 Chapter Overview

## 8.2 Theoretical Contributions

### 8.2.1 Theorising a Conceptual Model of Informal Benchmarking

### 8.2.2 New Epistemic View on Benchmarking

### 8.2.3 Pragmatism, Complemented by Praxis & Reflexivity

## 8.3 Practical Implications

### 8.3.1 Informal Benchmarking as a Strategic Initiative

### 8.3.2 Complement to Formal Benchmarking

## 8.4 Limitations

### 8.4.1 Limitations due to Literature

### 8.4.2 Limitations associated with Method

### 8.4.3 Limitations due to Outcomes & Findings

### 8.4.4 Researcher Reflexivity

## 8.5 Future Research Directions

### 8.5.1 Based On Limitations of the Research

### 8.5.2 Based on Limitations of the Conceptual Model

### 8.5.3 Based on Limitations of Toolset Application Model & QUANTUM Roadmap

### 8.5.4 Based on Unexpected Finding

## 8.6 Concluding Statement

# Bibliography

# Appendices
List of Tables

Table 2-1: Types of Benchmarking According to APQC ........................................... 14
Table 2-2: Classification Schemes and Types of Benchmarking ................................... 23
Table 2-3: Classification of Benchmarking ..................................................................... 23
Table 2-4: Three Forms of Informal Learning .............................................................. 31
Table 2-5: Newtonian vs Quantum Thinking ............................................................... 35
Table 2-6: Inputs to Preliminary Conceptual Model ..................................................... 38
Table 2-7: Working Definition of Informal Benchmarking ........................................... 39
Table 2-8: Purposes of Informal Benchmarking ........................................................... 39
Table 2-9: Preliminary Characteristics of Informal Benchmarking ............................... 41
Table 2-10: Preliminary Informal Benchmarking Toolscape ....................................... 43
Table 3-1: Levels of Integration in Mixed Method Research ....................................... 48
Table 3-2: General Characteristics of Pragmatism ....................................................... 50
Table 3-3: Research Stages ......................................................................................... 53
Table 3-4: Minimum Sample Sizes for Common Quantitative Research Designs ....... 57
Table 4-1: Breakdown of Pilot Survey .......................................................................... 61
Table 4-2: Breakdown of Final Survey ......................................................................... 63
Table 4-3: Breakdown by Country .............................................................................. 65
Table 4-4: Industry of Organisation ............................................................................. 67
Table 4-5: Legend for 8 dimensions of Informal Benchmarking Tools ....................... 68
Table 4-6: Colour Code for Most & Least Effective and Popular Tools ....................... 68
Table 4-7: Descriptive Statistics of Social-Internal-Deliberate Toolset ....................... 69
Table 4-8: Legend for Social-Internal-Deliberate Toolset ........................................ 69
Table 4-9: Top and Bottom Tools in SD1 ................................................................. 70
Table 4-10: Descriptive Statistics of Social-External-Deliberate Toolset .................... 71
Table 4-11: Legend for Social-External-Deliberate Toolset ..................................... 72
Table 4-12: Top and Bottom Tools in SD2 .............................................................. 73
Table 4-13: Descriptive statistics of social-internal-incidental Toolset ...................... 74
Table 4-14: Legend for Social-Internal-Incidental Toolset .......................................... 74
Table 4-15: Top and Bottom Tools in SD3 ............................................................... 75
Table 4-16: Descriptive Statistics of Social-External-Incidental Toolset .................... 75
Table 4-17: Legend for Social-External-Incidental Toolset .......................................... 76
Table 4-18: Top and Bottom Tools in SD4 .............................................................. 76
Table 4-19: Descriptive statistics of non-social-internal-deliberate Toolset ........................................ 77
Table 4-20: Legend for Non-Social-Internal-Deliberate Toolset ................................................................. 77
Table 4-21: Top and Bottom Tools in NSD1 .................................................................................................... 78
Table 4-22: Descriptive Statistics of Non-Social-External-Deliberate Toolset .............................................. 79
Table 4-23: Legend for Non-Social-External-Deliberate Toolset ................................................................. 79
Table 4-24: Top and Bottom Tools in NSD2 .................................................................................................... 79
Table 4-25: Descriptive Statistics of Non-Social-Internal-Incidental Toolset .................................................. 80
Table 4-26: Legend for Non-Social-Internal-Incidental Toolset ................................................................. 80
Table 4-27: Top and Bottom Tools in NSD3 .................................................................................................... 81
Table 4-28: Descriptive Statistics of Non-Social-External-Incidental Toolset .................................................. 82
Table 4-29: Legend for Non-Social-External-Incidental Toolset ................................................................. 82
Table 4-30: Top and Bottom Tools in NSD4 .................................................................................................... 82
Table 4-31: Top 5 Most Effective & Popular Tools .......................................................................................... 83
Table 4-32: Top 30% Most Effective & Most Popular Tools in Social Dimension ...................................... 84
Table 4-33: Top 30% Most Effective & Most Popular Tools in Non-Social Dimension ............................... 85
Table 4-34: Effectiveness & Popularity Means of Both Dimensions ............................................................ 86
Table 4-35: Rank of 8 Categories of IB Tools .................................................................................................. 86
Table 4-36: Legend for 8 Categories of IB Tools ............................................................................................ 87
Table 4-37: Correlations between 8 Categories of Tools .............................................................................. 89
Table 4-38: Informal Benchmarking Maturity Grid for Organisations ......................................................... 91
Table 4-39: Maturity of Informal Benchmarking in Organisations .............................................................. 92
Table 4-40: Correlation between Maturity Characteristics & IB Tools .......................................................... 93
Table 4-41: Level of Performance Benchmarking within Organisations ....................................................... 94
Table 4-42: Level of Formal Best Practice Benchmarking within Organisations ....................................... 94
Table 4-43: Mean of Better Practices Learnt ................................................................................................... 95
Table 4-44: Mean of Better Practices Implemented ....................................................................................... 96
Table 4-45: Mean of Activities that Aid Formal Benchmarking ................................................................. 97
Table 4-46: Correlations between Items in Q13-Q17 .................................................................................. 97
Table 5-1: Interview Questions Mapped to Objectives of Research ......................................................... 110
Table 5-2: Template for Coding of Tools in NVIVO .................................................................................... 118
Table 5-3: Level 2 Sub-category Example .................................................................................................. 120
Table 5-4: Level 3 Main Category Example .................................................................................................. 120
Table 5-5: Level 4 Sub-theme Example ....................................................................................................... 121
Table 5-6: Main Themes Description .......................................................................................................... 122
Table 5-7: Sub-themes from Meaning Coding & Meaning Condensation .................................. 124
Table 5-8: Work Practice Sharing Meta-tools and Techniques ........................................... 128
Table 5-9: Sub-themes for Characteristics of Informal Benchmarking Tools ......................... 141
Table 5-10: Exemplars of Top 10 Most Effective Tools in the Social Dimension .................... 171
Table 5-11: Exemplars of Top 10 Most Effective Tools in the Non-Social Dimension ............. 173
Table 6-1: Definition of Informal Benchmarking .................................................................. 177
Table 6-2: Purposes of Informal Benchmarking .................................................................. 178
Table 6-3: Characteristics of Informal Benchmarking ....................................................... 179
Table 6-4: Taxonomy of Informal Benchmarking ............................................................... 180
Table 6-5: Description of Contents of Benchmarking ........................................................ 181
Table 6-6: Tools & Activities in Social Dimension ............................................................. 186
Table 6-7: Tools & Activities in Non-Social Dimension ...................................................... 187
Table 6-8: Social Dimension/Internal-Deliberate .............................................................. 189
Table 6-9: Social Dimension/External-Deliberate ............................................................. 190
Table 6-10: Social Dimension/Internal-Incidental ............................................................ 190
Table 6-11: Social Dimension/External-Incidental ............................................................ 191
Table 6-12: Non-Social Dimension/Internal-Deliberate ..................................................... 191
Table 6-13: Non-Social Dimension/External-Deliberate .................................................... 192
Table 6-14: Non-social Dimension/Internal-Incidental ...................................................... 192
Table 6-15: Non-Social Dimension/External-Incidental ..................................................... 192
Table 6-16: Assessment Framework - Qualify the Vision & Readiness ................................ 194
Table 6-17: Assessment Framework - Use & Commitment of Resources ............................ 196
Table 6-18: Assessment Framework - Assess Competitive & Culture .............................. 196
Table 6-19: Assessment Framework - Nullify Risks & Threats ......................................... 197
Table 6-20: Assessment Framework - Training & Facilitation .......................................... 198
Table 6-21: Assessment Framework - Useful Measures of Effectiveness ............................ 199
Table 6-22: Assessment Framework - Momentum & Sustainable Impact .......................... 200
Table 6-23: Self-Assessment Score ..................................................................................... 201
Table 6-24: Maturity Assessment Levels ............................................................................. 201
Table 6-25: Informal Benchmarking Maturity Assessment Grid ........................................ 203
Table 6-26: QUANTUM Strategy - Qualify the Vision & Readiness .................................. 206
Table 6-27: QUANTUM Strategy - Use & Commitment of Resources .............................. 208
Table 6-28: QUANTUM Strategy - Assess Competitiveness & Culture, Nullify Risks & Threats ................................................................................................................. 210
Table 6-29: QUANTUM Strategy – Training & Facilitation ........................................ 211
Table 6-30: QUANTUM Strategy - Useful Measure of Effectiveness.......................... 214
Table 6-31: QUANTUM Strategy - Momentum & Sustainable Impact ...................... 216
Table 7-1: QUANTUM Components Linked to Sources ........................................... 222
Table 7-2: An Integrative Framework for Strategy-making Processes ...................... 225
Table 7-3: Strategy-Making Process for Informal Benchmarking Eco-System ............ 226
Table 7-4: Dimensions of Absorptive Capacity ...................................................... 239
List of Figures

Figure 2-1: Description of Informal Benchmarking .......................................................... 13
Figure 2-2: A Schema of informal Benchmarking ............................................................... 17
Figure 2-3: Genealogy of Benchmarking ........................................................................... 18
Figure 2-4: 12-Phased, 54-Step Benchmarking Process ...................................................... 25
Figure 2-5: Peter Senge’s Three-legged Stool .................................................................. 27
Figure 2-6: The Integral Cycle of Learning and Knowledge Development ......................... 29
Figure 2-7: Continuum of Formality .................................................................................. 31
Figure 2-8: Nonaka's SECI Model .................................................................................... 33
Figure 2-9: The Four Characteristics of “BA” .................................................................. 34
Figure 2-10: Model of Absorptive Capacity ...................................................................... 36
Figure 2-11: Preliminary Taxonomy of Informal Benchmarking ........................................ 42
Figure 3-1: Abductive-Deductive-Inductive Research Process ............................................ 52
Figure 4-1: Position in Organisation .................................................................................. 66
Figure 4-2: Size of Organisation ....................................................................................... 66
Figure 4-3: Mean Effectiveness of Social-Internal-Deliberate Toolset (SD1) ................. 68
Figure 4-4: Mean Effectiveness of Social-External-Deliberate Toolset (SD2) ............... 71
Figure 4-5: Mean Effectiveness of Social-Internal-Incidental Toolset (SD3) ................. 74
Figure 4-6: Mean Effectiveness of Social-External-Incidental Toolset (SD4) ................. 75
Figure 4-7: Mean Effectiveness of Non-Social-Internal-Deliberate Toolset (NSD1) .... 77
Figure 4-8: Mean Effectiveness of Non-Social-External-Deliberate Toolset (NSD2) .... 78
Figure 4-9: Mean Effectiveness of Non-Social-Internal-Incidental Toolset (NSD3) .... 80
Figure 4-10: Mean Effectiveness of Non-Social-External-Incidental Toolset (NSD4) ... 81
Figure 4-11: Mean of Extent of Better Practices Learnt .................................................... 95
Figure 4-12: Extent of Better Practices Implemented ........................................................ 96
Figure 4-13: Extent of Activities that Aid Formal Benchmarking ...................................... 96
Figure 5-1: Interpretation of Interviews ............................................................................ 111
Figure 5-2: Survey Data Infoms Interview Sample ........................................................... 112
Figure 5-3: Phases of Interview & Data Saturation ............................................................ 114
Figure 5-4: Development of Main Themes via Meaning Coding ....................................... 117
Figure 5-5: Level 1 Nodes & Sub-Nodes Example .............................................................. 119
Figure 5-6: Level 5 Main Theme Development .................................................................. 121
Figure 5-7: Main Themes & Sub-Themes ....................................................................... 123
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part 1 - THE RESEARCH PROBLEM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **PART 1**  
**THE RESEARCH PROBLEM**  
Chapter 1 **INTRODUCTION** |
| **PART 2**  
**RESEARCH DESIGN & METHOD**  
Chapter 3 **MIXED METHODS RESEARCH DESIGN, DATA SAMPLING, VALIDATION AND ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS** |
| **PART 3**  
**DATA COLLECTION & ANALYSIS**  
Chapter 4 **ANALYSIS OF QUANTITATIVE SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE** |
| **PART 4/CHAPTER 6**  
**DEVELOPMENT OF INFORMAL BENCHMARKING QUANTUM ROADMAP**  
Chapter 5 **ANALYSIS OF QUALITATIVE INTERVIEWS** |
| **PART 5**  
**DISCUSSION & CONCLUSION**  
Chapter 7 **RESEARCH REVIEW BY OBJECTIVES & IN THE CONTEXT OF ORGANISATION IMPROVEMENT** |
| **PART 6**  
**DEVELOPMENT OF INFORMAL BENCHMARKING QUANTUM ROADMAP**  
Chapter 8 **IMPLICATIONS, LIMITATIONS & FUTURE RESEARCH** |