Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Political and Ethnic Representation
in Chinese Local Governance

Analysis of the Roles of the Deputies of Leishan County People’s Congress,
Guizhou Province, China

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Development Studies
Massey University, Manawatu
New Zealand

Yuanheng Zheng
2016
This thesis investigates the political and ethnic environment of local Chinese political actors and their representational dilemmas in the Miao-dominant area of Leishan County, Guizhou Province, China. The investigation is conducted via two research questions: how do the deputies of a Miao County People’s Congress in China play their roles in representing the interests of the state towards the community, and how do they represent the interests of the community towards the state? The achievements of the deputies and the challenges they face in their dual representational roles are a focus of the analysis. The thesis provides insight into the governance and politics of a local government body dominated by an ethnic minority and the interplay of these dynamics with central government authorities presided over by Han Chinese.

The representative structure of the Leishan County People’s Congress (LCPC) and its deputy membership is explored to understand how the deputies enact their roles in promoting, intervening in and restructuring development projects as both agents of and remonstrators to the central state. Case studies of village governance and cultural tourism are used to illustrate how the LCPC deputies are both coordinators and negotiators in a polycentric local governance structure.

The fieldwork was carried out in the ethnic area of Leishan County. Relevant data was collected through four interrelated research methods: focus groups, semi-structured individual interviews, purposive observation and document analysis. The quantification of pairwise ranking by the focus groups highlighted the achievements and challenges in the key functions required of the deputies. The data also led to two further areas for in-depth analysis: central-local relations, and the political and ethnic representation of the deputies.

The research found that when conflicts exist, political representation that favours the state prevails over community interests. At the same time, the deputies’ representation of their ethnic communities is enhanced and augmented when they undertake to localise the national development policies and projects handed down by central authorities. Finally, the concept of polycentric governance enables a more precise understanding of the changing local governance systems in China among the diverse stakeholders present in the ethnic communities.
Acknowledgements

There are a number of individuals and organisations who gave me support and assistance in my journey of Ph.D. study. First of all, I would like to convey my sincere gratitude and appreciation to my supervisors Gerard Prinsen, Glenn Banks and Rosemary Haddon, for their persistent patience, sharing of experience and encouragement through the whole process of my study. Their work is a good reflection, a typical example of the good teamwork of supervision. They have made diverse contributions to my thesis. I sincerely appreciate their untiring efforts. Their encouragement has strengthened my determination to explore the field of development studies in the ethnic areas of southwest China.

They read my draft thesis chapter by chapter and offered practical and valuable comments and suggestions which broadened my horizons and stimulated me to think and write critically and academically. Gerard and Glenn helped me from the very beginning with the research proposal, selection of research questions and conceptual framework, argumentation, language and analysis. Gerard helped me identify and conceptualise the research questions and methods, the analysis of focus groups and provided me detailed and operable comments for thesis drafts. Glenn helped with the ethical issues, methodology and governance issues and analysis of individual interviews, and assisted in seeking for every possible way to include some findings and the researcher’s opinions in the thesis which may play a role in consultancy of policy-making. Rosemary assisted with the translation of terminology and that of the transcripts of the 39 deputy interviews, setting up of the Annotated Glossary and Acronyms, the historical origins of China’s modernisation, the English expression and pertinent comments for the thesis.

As someone who has been away from formal education for many years, the biggest challenge for me was to find the academic authors who have focused his/her research on the specific fields from which I can learn and apply into my research in China. Very fortunately, I found Kevin J. O’Brien, Richard Peet and Elinor Ostrom. Here, I wish to express my sincere gratitude to all of them. As an American political scientist, Mr. O’Brien has endeavoured to research Chinese People’s Congresses since the early 1980s. His dichotomy of the roles of the deputies of Chinese People’s Congresses as agents of the state and the remonstrator formed the foundation of the two research questions in my thesis. My sincere thanks also go to Mr. Richard Peet and Mrs. Elinor Ostrom. Mr. Peet’s summary and analysis of grand theories in development studies enriched my knowledge about the complexity of
development issues and the diversity of development models in the world. Mrs. E. Ostrom’s
theory of polycentric governance enlightened, and enabled me to discover a structure of
polycentric governance which has existed in the field research area for a long time.

I’m very grateful to those individuals and organisations in Guizhou province in China where
the field research was done. I would like to thank the poverty-relief team which were led by
the team leader, Mr. Shaolun Du, the deputy team leader, Mr. Jincan Lan, and which was
composed of the team members, Mrs. Xiaoxia Li, Mr. Chongming Yu, Mr. Hua Liu and
myself. Our one-year team work of poverty-relief in 2009 in an ethnic poverty-stricken
township in Guizhou made me understand the significance and necessity of solving the
development issues of ethnic and rural areas in China. This participation in poverty-relief
stimulated me to conduct a Ph.D. study to focus on the development issues of the ethnic and
rural areas in China. And I would like to thank Professor Lu Xu of Guizhou University, and
Mrs. Xiaoping Wang and Mr. Chuan Huang for the support they offered me during my field
research in Leishan County.

I’m very grateful to the leaders and colleagues of the Foreign Affairs Offices of both Guizhou
province and Qiandongnan Miao and Dong Autonomous Prefecture who understand and
support my study and research. I would like to also present my sincere appreciation to
Leishan County People’s Congress (LCPC) and the deputies who participated in my field
research. The LCPC gave me the support to access the resources that it possesses. The two
liaison officers of the LCPC helped me make contact with the participants and helped with
other necessary coordinations such as the arrangement of meeting rooms and accommodation.
Many thanks go to those deputies who participated in the focus groups and/or individual
interviews. They spent many hours and their open-minded participation makes this research
meaningful.

I would also thank Massey University for offering me the necessary resources such as
funding for field research, language improvement and the remarkable library services. At last,
special thanks to Professor Regina Scheyvens and the team at Development Studies. Thanks
for all the support during the process of my application and study in the Institute of
Development Studies in Massey. Thanks again to Associate Professor Glenn Banks and
Doctor Gerard Prinsen who have tailor-made the topic of my Ph.D. study.

Sincerely

Yuanheng ZHENG
# Table of Contents

Abstract...................................................................................................................................... i  
Acknowledgements ................................................................. iii  
Table of Contents ........................................................................... v  
Annotated Glossary ................................................................. xi  
Acronyms ................................................................................... xiii  
Tables ......................................................................................... xv  
Figures ......................................................................................... xv  
Photos ........................................................................................ xvi  
Maps ........................................................................................... xvi  
Formulae ..................................................................................... xvi  
Diagrams ...................................................................................... xvii  
Boxes .......................................................................................... xvii  
Charts .......................................................................................... xvii  

## Chapter One: Introduction ................................................. 1  
1.1 Overview ............................................................................. 1  
1.2 An introduction to the Miao ethnic group and Miao people in Guizhou Province.............. 3  
1.3 Research questions .......................................................... 4  
1.4 Purpose and contribution of this research ............................................. 6  
1.5 Focus and Perspective ........................................................ 7  
1.6 Conceptual framework ....................................................... 8  
1.7 Outline of chapters ............................................................. 11  

## Chapter Two: Literature review: Governance and polycentric governance ........ 14  
2.1 Introduction .......................................................................... 14  
2.2 Governance ......................................................................... 15  
2.2.1 Governance: Definitions .................................................. 16  
2.2.2 Good governance ............................................................ 19  
2.3 Local governance ............................................................... 21  
2.4 Conceptual framework: Polycentric governance .................................................. 23  
2.4.1 Theoretical background of polycentric governance ...................... 23  
2.4.2 The development of thinking about polycentric governance .......... 25  
2.4.3 Polycentric governance as a theoretical tool of analysis ................ 28  
2.4.4 The significance of local governance in a polycentric system .......... 33  
2.5 Decentralisation and polycentric governance ....................................... 36
Chapter six: Achievements and challenges in representing the interests of the state towards the community

6.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 154

6.2 A general introduction of the four functions of the deputies in representing the interests of the state discovered in the focus groups ....................................................................................................... 155

6.3 Analysis of the achievements and challenges in representing the interests of the state ........................................ 156

6.3.1 Function 1: Promoting the strategy of the Party ........................................................... 156

6.3.2 Function 2: Enforcing laws and policies of the state ...................................................... 161

6.3.3 Function 3: Implementing livelihood projects ................................................................. 164

6.3.4 Function 4: Developing political representation ............................................................ 165

6.4 An analysis of the four functions from the individual interviews ...................................................... 172

6.4.1 A general introduction to the four functions in individual interviews ................................. 172

6.4.2 Analysis of the individual interviews .............................................................................. 173

6.4.3 The deputies’ views of the Ethnic Regional Autonomous System (ERAS) in representing the interests of the state ...................................................................................................................... 176

6.5 The roles that the deputies play in a structure of polycentric governance in cultural tourism in Xijiang village ...................................................................................................................... 177

6.6 Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 183

Chapter Seven: Achievements and challenges in representing the interests of the community towards the state

7.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 185

7.2 The functions in representing the interests of the community as revealed in the focus groups ................................................................................................................................................. 186

7.3 The deputies who are from and seconded to the community ............................................... 187

7.4 Analysis of the achievements and challenges in representing the interests of the community in focus groups ...................................................................................................................... 189

7.4.1 Function 1: Promoting the voice of community ............................................................... 189

7.4.2 Function 2: Localising policies of the state ..................................................................... 196

7.4.3 Function 3: Implementing livelihood projects ................................................................. 198

7.4.4 Function 4: Developing ethnic representation ............................................................... 201

7.5 An analysis of the four functions from the individual interviews ........................................... 202

7.5.1 A general introduction of the functions based on the points ........................................... 203

7.5.2 Analysis of the achievements and challenges in representing the state in individual interviews ............................................................................................................................... 203

7.5.3 The deputies’ views about Ethnic Regional Autonomous System (ERAS) in representing the interests of the community in individual interviews .................................................. 207

7.6 The roles that the deputies play in a polycentric governance structure in the cultural tourism of Upper Lande village ........................................................................................................... 208

7.7 Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 212
Chapter Eight: Discussion and conclusions: The dilemmas of the political and ethnic representation of deputies in the local governance system .................................................. 215

8.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................................................... 215

8.2 Political representation: The role that the deputies play in representing the interests of the state towards community .................................................................................. 217

8.2.1 Political representation with the dominance of the Party through its cadre management and responsibility system ..................................................................................................... 218

8.2.2 Political representation in the triangular relations between the Party, the County People’s Government, and the County People’s Congress ...................................................................................... 220

8.2.3 Political representation: Representing the interests of the state ...................................................................................................................................................................................... 222

8.3 Ethnic representation: The roles that the deputies play in representing the interests of the community towards the state ........................................................................................................ 224

8.3.1 Ethnic representation: Representing the interests of the community .................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 225

8.3.2 Ethnic representation: Extension of recognition of politics ...................................................................................................................................................................................... 228

8.3.3 Ethnic representation: Representative structure and universal representation ............................................................................................................................................................................. 230

8.4 Political and ethnic representation: A win-win situation? ........................................................................ 231

8.4.1 The role dilemmas of political and ethnic representation .................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 233

8.4.2 Interests of unanimity and conflicts ........................................................................................................ 237

8.5 Contribution: A better understanding of the evolution of local governance system through the structure of polycentric governance .............................................................................. 239

8.6 Contribution: Pairwise ranking in focus groups used in a real world research context 242

8.7 Conclusion .......................................................................................................................................... 244

Final words: Recommendations ................................................................................................................. 247

Part I: Institutional and governance systems that can assist the deputies play their roles better ................................................................................................................................................................................................... 247

1. The deputies can play their roles better in an institution based on cooperation ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 247

2. The deputies can play their roles better in a model of good governance ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 248

3. The deputies can play their roles better with the status of professionalisation ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 248

Part II: Institutional issues need to be considered in policy-making ........................................................................ 249

1. Central control ........................................................................................................................................ 249

2. Limited autonomy .................................................................................................................................... 249

3. Elite capture ............................................................................................................................................ 250

4. Insufficient representation of women deputies ...................................................................................... 250

5. Missing representation .......................................................................................................................... 251

Appendices ............................................................................................................................................... 252

Appendix 1: Low Risk Notification (PN 331) of Massey Human Ethics Chairs Committee ............................ 252

Appendix 2: Letter of Certificate for Field Research by Institute of Development Studies of Massey University ..................................................................................................................................................................................................... 253
Appendix 3: Photo of Letter of Recommendation ................................................................. 254
Appendix 4: Data summary of Focus Group 1 ................................................................. 255
Appendix 5: Data summary of Focus Group 2 ................................................................. 256
Appendix 6: Data summary of Focus Group 3 ................................................................. 257
Appendix 7: Data summary of Focus Group 4 ................................................................. 258
Appendix 8: Demographic information of the deputies who participated in the interviews ................................................................. 259

References .................................................................................................................................. 261
Annotated Glossary

**Biangan**

Village development model worker.

**Daitouren**

Pacesetter in area of village development.

**Ganbu**

Cadre; public employees who work in governmental organs, the army or people’s organisations and who play a leading role or conduct administrative work.

**Haozhaoli**

Charisma; the collective ability of a group such as deputies who possess the influential ability of a policy who/which can inspire and guide the people to follow.

**Livelihood Projects**

A series of projects implemented by the government such as poverty-relief, promotion of employment, education and aid, social security, economy housing, infrastructure, environmental improvement, medical care etc..

**Minimum Subsistence Security System (MSS)**

A national policy practiced over China to guarantee those aging, or disabled, or patients, or widows, or anyone who has no job, and who has no any source of income in both urban and rural areas, have the lowest income to live.

**Oversight**

The legal power executed by deputies in People’s Congress for the supervision of the work of government, court and procuratorate; to have oversight over (something).

**Paiban**

Clap the board; have the final say.

**Pufa**

Activities taken by deputies to educate people in awareness about legal issues; popularising the laws.
Renovation of unsafe housing

A national project practiced over Chinese rural areas to grant financial support to those farmers who haven’t the economic ability to improve their living houses which are in disrepair.

Sangnong issues

The issues related to agriculture, rural areas and farmers. In Chinese, the first character of each of the three words is the same as nong.

Spiritual work

Political consciousness raising; such work conducted by deputies to the villagers for specific political objectives.

The Party

Chinese Communist Party.

Xiadao

Second or to be seconded. It is used to describe those officials or future deputies who are transferred to work at a lower or grassroots level.

Yifuliangyuan

Government, court and procuratorate. The deputies of People’s Congresses at different levels often use this term to describe their oversight over the government, the court and the procuratorate.

Zhualuoshi

Carry through on a project.

Zuzhi

Organisation, such as governmental personnel department or unit within the Party; any Party or government institution.
Acronyms

CGB County Government Bureau
CGG Commission of Global Governance
CCP Chinese Communist Party
CPC County People’s Congress
CPG County People’s Government
CPPCC County People’s Political Consultative Conference
CPRs Common-pool resources
ERAS Ethnic Regional Autonomy System
FG Focus groups
GRP Government of the Republic Period
LCPC Leishan County People’s Congress
LPC Local People’s Congress, including People’s Congress at provincial, prefectural, county and township levels
LPG Local People’s Governments, including People’s Governments at provincial, prefectural, county and township levels
NPC National People’s Congress
NPM New public management
NRCMC New Rural Cooperative Medical Care
PC People’s Congresses at national and local levels
PCC Party Committee of the County
PCLC Party Committee of Leishan County
PG Prefectural Government
PPC Provincial People’s Congress
PPF Preferential policies for farmers
RCA Representing the community: averaged value
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RCTA</td>
<td>Representing the community: total averaged value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSA</td>
<td>Representing the state: averaged value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSTA</td>
<td>Representing the state: total averaged value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPG</td>
<td>Township People’s Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPC</td>
<td>Township People’s Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>Villagers’ Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VPB</td>
<td>Village Party Branch</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables

Table 1: Articles of polycentric governance in top ten disciplinary categories in China ........................................45
Table 2: Frequencies of key words in articles which appear 20 or more times ......................................................45
Table 3: Representing the interests of the state: Achievements .............................................................................98
Table 4: Representing the interests of the state: Challenges ..................................................................................99
Table 5: Representing the interests of the community: Achievements .................................................................100
Table 6: Representing the interests of the community: Challenges ..........................................................................100
Table 7: Average value of achievements in representing the interests of the state .............................................105
Table 8: Averaged value of normalised data of achievements and challenges ......................................................106
Table 9: Items from one part of the interview of Deputy 18 .................................................................................114
Table 10: Representative structure of the 153 deputies in the 16th LCPC ............................................................124
Table 11: Representative structure by age from the 13th to the 16th LCPC ..........................................................126
Table 12: Representative structure by gender from the 13th to the 16th LCPC ......................................................127
Table 13: Representative structure by ethnicity from the 13th to the 16th LCPC ..................................................131
Table 14: Representative structure of deputies by education from the 13th to the 16th LCPC ...........................133
Table 15: Party status of deputies from the 13th to the 16th LCPC .....................................................................136
Table 16: Representative structure of deputies by social class from the 13th to the 16th LCPC ...........................137
Table 17: Representative structure by regional representation from the 13th to the 16th LCPC ...........................140
Table 18: Motions submitted by the numbers of deputies from 2012 to 2014 ...................................................147
Table 19: Development projects in the motions by category submitted by the 16th LCPC deputies ................149
Table 20: Categories of motions submitted in 2013 and the government’s responses ............................................150
Table 21: Four functions in representing the state: Achievements and challenges ..............................................155
Table 22: Representing the interests of the state: Points of achievements and challenges ................................173
Table 23: Four functions in representing the community: Achievements and challenges ..................................186
Table 24: The proportion of the LCPC deputies from and seconded to the community ...................................187
Table 25: Representing the interests of the community: Points of achievements and challenges .................203

Figures

Figure 1: Organisational structure of Leishan County People’s Congress (LCPC) ..............................................76
Figure 2: Activities of the LCPC deputies ...........................................................................................................141
Figure 3: Total and averaged values of each function for representing the state .................................................156
Figure 4: Representing the interests of the state: Points of achievements .......................................................174
Figure 5: Representing the interests of the state: Points of challenges ............................................................175
Figure 6: The roles that the deputies play in the cultural tourism in Xijiang Village ......................................179
Figure 7: Total and Averaged values of each function for representing the community ......................................189
Figure 8: Representing the interests of the community: Points of achievements ..............................................204
Figure 9: Representing the interests of the community: Points of challenges ..................................................206
Figure 10: The roles that the LCPC deputies play in the cultural tourism in Langde Village ..........................211
Figure 11: Triangular relations between the PCC, the CPC and the CPG ..........................................................221
Photos

Photo 1: The research assistant is preparing the writing cards for FG 4 (left) .............................................93
Photo 2: The research assistant is delivering the writing cards and the participants are thinking (right) ....93
Photo 3: The participants of FG 4 keep thinking (left) .................................................................................94
Photo 4: The participants of FG 4 keep writing (right) ..................................................................................94
Photo 5: The achievements identified by the participants of FG 4 in representing the state (left) ..........94
Photo 6: The researcher facilitates the participants of FG 4 in categorising the achievements (right) ......94
Photo 7: The participants of FG 4 watch the words put on the wall and smile (left) .........................95
Photo 8: The participants of FG 4 watch and read the words put on the wall (right) ...............................95
Photo 9: The researcher writes down the items categorised by the participants in FG 4 (left) ..........95
Photo 10: The full categorised items with score and ranking in FG 4 (right) ............................................95
Photo 11: Scores and ranked achievements and challenges in representing the state in FG 4 (left) ....97
Photo 12: Scores and ranked achievements and challenges in representing the community in FG 4 (right) ..........................................................................................................................................97
Photo 13: The interview with the chairman of a TPC (left) ........................................................................110
Photo 14: The interview with one Miao female deputy (right) .................................................................110
Photo 15: The 12th meeting of the members of the LCPC 16th Permanent Committee (left) ..............116
Photo 16: The chairmen of township People’s Congresses (right) ........................................................116

Maps

Map 1: Location of Guizhou in China ............................................................................................................74
Map 2: Guizhou province and the location of Leishan County ...................................................................75

Formulae

Formula 1: Min-max normalisation ............................................................................................................103
Formula 2: Average Value ...........................................................................................................................105

Examples

Example 1: Achievements and challenges in representing the interests of the state in FG 4 ............103
Example 2: Diagram 2: Representing the interests of the state: Challenges in FG 4 .........................104
Example 3: Enforcing laws and policies of the state in the achievements of representing the state ......105
Example 4: References of “justice and fairness” in representing the community: Achievements (RCA) ...111
Example 5: References of “national policies” in representing the community: Challenges (RCC) .......111
Example 6: Multi-dimensional responses (Deputy 18) ...........................................................................113
Diagrams

Diagram 1: Representing the interests of the state: Achievements in FG 4 .................................................96
Diagram 2: Representing the interests of the state: Challenges in FG 4 ..........................................................96
Diagram 3: Representing the interests of the community: Achievements in FG 4 .........................................96
Diagram 4: Representing the interests of the community: Challenges in FG 4 ............................................97

Boxes

Box 1: Development of cultural tourism in Xijiang village ..........................................................................178
Box 2: Development of village governance/cultural tourism in Langde village ...........................................208

Charts

Chart 1: Deputies’ visits to the constituency per month ................................................................................190
Chart 2: Deputies’ visits to the government per month ................................................................................190