

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Te Huanga o te Ao Māori**

**Cognitive Behavioural Therapy for Māori  
clients with depression - Development and  
evaluation of a culturally adapted  
treatment programme.**

**A dissertation presented in partial fulfilment of the  
requirements for the degree of**

**Doctor of Philosophy**

**in**

**Psychology**

**at Massey University, Wellington,  
New Zealand**

**Simon Te Manihi Bennett**

**2009**



This doctoral thesis is dedicated to the memory of a wonderful nana. The values that she has instilled in her whanau will benefit many generations to follow. Nga mihi aroha kia koe te whaea.

***Elaine Jocelyn Bennett***  
***June 4<sup>th</sup> 1926 – April 12<sup>th</sup> 2008***



## **ABSTRACT**

A manualised cognitive behavioural therapy (CBT) programme was culturally adapted for use with adult Māori clients with depression who were receiving treatment from Te Whare Marie, a Māori Mental Health service that covers the greater Wellington region. The manual was developed in consultation with local and international literature pertaining to CBT with minority groups and the recommendations of an advisory team. The treatment programme integrated significant Māori concepts with the traditional strategies associated with CBT. The intervention was trialled with 16 Māori clients from Te Whare Marie with a primary diagnosis of depression. Case study and group analysis indicated that the adapted intervention was effective in reducing depressive symptomatology and negative cognition, and increasing general wellbeing in four culturally relevant dimensions. Differences between pre- and post- treatment scores were statistically significant in each of these areas. The intervention did not have a significant impact on the construct of cultural identity. Participants expressed high levels of satisfaction with the treatment, and in general the adaptations were positively received. Treatment was characterised by particularly low dropout rates with 15 of the 16 participants attending seven or more sessions. These results were discussed with reference to their implications for effective delivery of clinical service delivery to Māori consumers of mental health services in New Zealand.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

Over the course of the last four years numerous individuals and groups have contributed to this piece of research. I would firstly like to acknowledge Health Research Council of New Zealand. Without their generous support this piece of research would not have taken place.

I'm immensely grateful for the exemplary supervisory support I've received from my first supervisor Dr Ross Flett and second supervisor Dr Duncan Babbage. I am one of numerous students at Massey University who have benefitted from Ross's pragmatic, common sense and refreshing approach to supervision. This was perfectly complimented with Duncan's clinical and technical expertise. I will always reflect very positively on the experience of my doctoral research thanks to you both and I am hopeful that this will not be the last time we work together.

I would also like to acknowledge the support of Professor Mason Durie and Professor Ian Evans who provided crucial input at various stages of this project and supported my fellowship application. Special thanks also to Professor Janet Leathem who has been a supportive influence in my career since my days as a Clinical Intern and indeed throughout this project.

A number of brilliant Māori psychologists have had input into this project but I would like to make special mention of Dr Averil Herbert, Clive Banks and Maynard Gilgen who have been both mentors and friends over the past 10 years. Each of you has influenced my development as a Māori clinical psychologist in a significant way and I thank you for going above and beyond the call of duty in supporting this project and my career in general.

I could not have asked for better role models in life than my parents Bruce and Tui, who along with my brothers Hamish and Maika gave me a childhood full of

fun, adventure and love. To my three beautiful daughters Elena, Grace and Piata, you've have had to put up with your Dad being absorbed in the often selfish pursuit of writing a doctoral dissertation for the best part of four years, thanks for being such an inspiration and such awesome girls. And to my wonderful wife Emma, you've been my biggest supporter; your unwavering faith in my ability to complete this project has been a great source of motivation. You've sacrificed many hours of time together, which I intend making up for in the coming years. Words couldn't do justice to my appreciation for everything you've done but my heartfelt thanks go to you for your friendship and love.

To the wonderfully talented management and staff of Te Whare Marie whose clinical and cultural expertise has benefitted the lives of so many, thank you for your enthusiastic support of this project. And finally to the sixteen participants and their whanau, your resilience in the face of adversity is a source of great inspiration. This thesis documents a small part of your respective journeys and I thank you for the courage you've shown in sharing your experiences 'for the good of science'. I hope that you all take reflective satisfaction that your willingness to share is likely to benefit other Māori experiencing the debilitating effects of depression in the future. Nga mihi nunui kia koutou.



## Table of Contents

<b>Dedication</b> .....	i
<b>Abstract</b> .....	iii
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	iv
<b>Table of Contents</b> .....	vi
<b>List of Tables</b> .....	xiii
<b>List of Figures</b> .....	xiv
<b>List of Appendices</b> .....	xvi
<b>Chapter 1 - Introduction</b> .....	1
<b>Chapter 2 – Depression: The Māori Experience</b> .....	8
<b>2.1. Outline and Aims</b> .....	8
<b>2.2. Diagnostic Issues</b> .....	8
<b>2.3. Individual and Social Impact</b> .....	9
<b>2.4. Aetiology</b> .....	11
<b>2.5. Prevalence</b> .....	12
<b>2.5.1. Prevalence and Ethnicity</b> .....	12
<b>2.6. Treatment of Depression</b> .....	14
<b>2.7. Depression in New Zealand</b> .....	14
<b>2.8. Depression and Māori</b> .....	16
<b>2.8.1. Māori Perspectives on Mental Health</b> .....	16
<b>2.8.2. Prevalence</b> .....	18
<b>2.8.3. Service Utilisation</b> .....	19
<b>2.8.4. Perspectives on Treatment</b> .....	20
<b>2.8.5. The Value of Identity</b> .....	22
<b>2.9. Summary</b> .....	23

<b>Chapter 3 – Cognitive Behaviour Therapy in Aotearoa.....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>3.1. Outline and Aims.....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>3.2. Cognitive Behavioural Theory.....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>3.3. Empirical Validation of CBT.....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>3.4. CBT and Minority Groups.....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>3.4.1. Evidence for Adaptation.....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>3.4.2. Methodological Issues.....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>3.4.3. Summary.....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>3.5. Adaptation of CBT.....</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>3.5.1. From Individual to Collective.....</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>3.5.2. From Science to Spirituality.....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>3.5.3. The Therapeutic Alliance.....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>3.5.4. Emotional Expression.....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>3.5.5. Shifting Ideologies.....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>3.6. Cognitive Behavioural Therapy in Aotearoa.....</b>	<b>38</b>
<b>3.7. Summary.....</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>Chapter 4 – The Current Research.....</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>4.1. Outline and Aims.....</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>4.2. The Research Questions.....</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>4.3. Rationale for selection of Māori</b>	
<b>as client population.....</b>	<b>44</b>
<b>4.4. Rationale for Focus on Depression.....</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>4.5. Rationale for Focus on Cognitive</b>	
<b>Behavioural Therapy.....</b>	<b>47</b>
<b>4.6. Methodology and Design.....</b>	<b>48</b>
<b>4.7. Summary.....</b>	<b>53</b>

<b>Chapter 5 – Protocol Development</b> .....	55
<b>5.1. Outline and Aims</b> .....	55
<b>5.2. Manualised Treatment</b> .....	55
<b>5.3. Adapting CBT: Advisory Group Consultation</b> .....	56
<b>5.3.1. Whakawhānaungatanga:</b>	
The domain of connectedness.....	58
<b>5.3.2. Te taha wairua:</b>	
The domain of spirituality.....	60
<b>5.3.3. Te taha whānau:</b>	
The domain of extended family.....	62
<b>5.3.4. Whaikorero:</b>	
The domain of metaphor.....	64
<b>5.3.5. General Issues</b> .....	66
5.3.5.1. <i>Collectivism/Importance of whānau</i> .....	66
5.3.5.2. <i>Spirituality</i> .....	66
5.3.5.3. <i>Whakama</i> .....	66
5.3.5.4. <i>Cultural Responsivity</i> .....	67
5.3.5.5. <i>Te Reo Māori</i> .....	67
<b>5.4. Summary</b> .....	68
<b>Chapter 6 – Piloting of Protocol</b> .....	69
<b>6.1. Outline and Aims</b> .....	69
<b>6.2. Initial Consultation</b> .....	69
<b>6.3. Participant Population</b> .....	70
<b>6.4. Psychometrics</b> .....	72
<b>6.4.1. Clinical Outcome Measures</b> .....	72
6.4.1.1. <i>Beck Depression Inventory – 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition (BDI-II)</i> ....	72
6.4.1.2. <i>Attributional Style Questionnaire (ASQ)</i> .....	73
6.4.1.3. <i>Automatic Thought Questionnaire (ATQ-30)</i> .....	74

6.4.1.4. <i>Hua Oranga (HO)</i> .....	74
<b>6.4.2. Measures of Cultural Identity</b> .....	75
6.4.2.1. <i>Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure (MEIM)</i> .....	75
6.4.2.2. <i>Cultural Identity Visual Analogue Scale (VAS)</i> .....	76
<b>6.4.3 Measure of Client Satisfaction</b> .....	76
6.4.3.1 <i>Satisfaction with Therapy and Therapist Scale</i> .....	76
<b>6.5. Procedure</b> .....	77
<b>6.5.1. Therapist</b> .....	77
<b>6.5.2. Study Settings</b> .....	77
<b>6.5.3. Recruitment</b> .....	77
<b>6.5.4. Informed Consent</b> .....	78
<b>6.5.5. Baseline Phase</b> .....	78
<b>6.5.6. Treatment Phase</b> .....	79
6.5.6.1. <i>Phase One: Whakawhānaungatanga:</i>	
<i>Building the Relationship</i> .....	81
6.5.6.2. <i>Phase Two: Nga Maramatanga:</i>	
<i>Building Insights</i> .....	81
6.5.6.3. <i>Phase Three: Whanonga Pai:</i>	
<i>Increasing Positive Behaviour</i> .....	81
6.5.6.4. <i>Phase Four: Whakaaro Pai:</i>	
<i>Increasing Positive Thinking</i> .....	82
6.5.6.5. <i>Phase Five: Ora Pai:</i>	
<i>Staying Well</i> .....	82
<b>6.5.7. Post-Treatment Assessment</b> .....	82
<b>6.6. Summary</b> .....	83
<b>Chapter 7 – Single Case Analysis</b> .....	84
<b>7.1. Outline and Aims</b> .....	84
<b>7.2. Grouping of cases</b> .....	84

<b>7.3. Group One - Those who experienced 90-100% Reduction</b> .....	85
<b>7.3.1. Individual Results: BDI-II</b> .....	86
7.3.1.1. <i>Baseline</i> .....	86
7.3.1.2. <i>Treatment</i> .....	87
7.3.1.3. <i>Post-treatment</i> .....	88
<b>7.3.2. Individual Results: ATQ-30</b> .....	88
<b>7.3.3. Individual Results: Hua Oranga</b> .....	89
<b>7.4. Group Two - 80-90% Reduction</b> .....	90
<b>7.4.1. Individual Results: BDI-II</b> .....	91
7.4.1.1. <i>Baseline</i> .....	91
7.4.1.2. <i>Treatment</i> .....	91
7.4.1.3. <i>Post-treatment</i> .....	94
<b>7.4.2. Individual Results: ATQ-30</b> .....	94
<b>7.4.3. Individual Results: Hua Oranga</b> .....	95
<b>7.5. Group Three - 40-60% Reduction</b> .....	96
<b>7.5.1. Individual Results: BDI-II</b> .....	96
7.5.1.1. <i>Baseline</i> .....	98
7.5.1.2. <i>Treatment</i> .....	98
7.5.1.3. <i>Post-treatment</i> .....	98
<b>7.5.2. Individual Results: ATQ-30</b> .....	98
<b>7.5.3. Individual Results: Hua Oranga</b> .....	99
<b>7.6. Group Four - Less than 30% Reduction</b> .....	100
<b>7.6.1. Individual Results: BDI-II</b> .....	101
7.6.1.1. <i>Baseline</i> .....	101
7.6.1.2. <i>Treatment</i> .....	101
7.6.1.3. <i>Post-treatment</i> .....	103
<b>7.6.2. Individual Results: ATQ-30</b> .....	104
<b>7.6.3. Individual Results: Hua Oranga</b> .....	104
<b>7.7. Summary</b> .....	105

<b>Chapter 8: Group Analysis</b> .....	107
<b>8.1. Outline and Aims</b> .....	107
<b>8.2. Intent to Treat</b> .....	107
<b>8.3. Clinical Impact of the Intervention</b> .....	108
8.3.1. BDI-II.....	109
8.3.2. ATQ.....	110
8.3.3. Hua Oranga.....	110
8.3.4. Wilcoxon Signed Rank.....	111
8.3.5. Treatment Effects.....	112
<b>8.4 Cultural Impact of the Intervention</b> .....	115
<b>8.5. Participant Response to Adapted Therapy</b> .....	116
8.5.1. Satisfaction with Therapy and Therapist Scale.....	116
8.5.2. Qualitative Feedback.....	118
8.5.3. Response to Adaptations.....	120
8.5.3.1. <i>Whakawhānaungatanga</i> .....	120
8.5.3.2. <i>Te Taha Wairua</i> .....	121
8.5.3.3. <i>Te Taha Whānau</i> .....	122
8.5.4.4. <i>Whaikorero</i> .....	123
<b>8.6 Summary</b> .....	124
<b>Chapter 9: Discussion</b> .....	126
<b>9.1. Outline and Aims</b> .....	126
<b>9.2. Major Outcomes and Findings</b> .....	126
<b>9.3. Implications of Findings</b> .....	128
9.3.1. Implications for the Adaptation of CBT.....	128
9.3.2. Implications for efficacy and impact .....	133
9.3.3. Cultural Implications.....	137
<b>9.4. Limitations of the Current Research</b> .....	139
9.4.1. Threats to Internal Validity.....	139
9.4.2. Threats to External Validity.....	141

<b>9.5. Directions for Future Research</b> .....	141
<b>9.6. Conclusions</b> .....	142
<b>References</b> .....	144
<b>Appendixes</b> .....	164

## List of Tables

<b>Table 1.</b> Participant Characteristics and Clinical Presentation at Assessment.....	71
<b>Table 2.</b> Group One - Participant Characteristics.....	85
<b>Table 3.</b> Group Two - Participant Characteristics.....	91
<b>Table 4.</b> Group Three – Participant Characteristics.....	96
<b>Table 5.</b> Group Four – Participant Characteristics.....	101
<b>Table 6.</b> Mean Scores in clinical outcome measures across assessment points.....	108
<b>Table 7.</b> Paired sample t-test comparing mean pre-treatment and post-treatment Hua Oranga scores.....	111
<b>Table 8.</b> Wilcoxon Statistics comparing pre-treatment means with post-treatment and follow-up data.....	112
<b>Table 9.</b> Effect size statistics for clinical outcome measures using three different standardisers.....	114
<b>Table 10.</b> Means and standard deviations for factors of the Satisfaction with Therapy and Therapist scale.....	117
<b>Table 11.</b> Mean item score for participants in each of the two factors measured by the Satisfaction with Therapy and Therapist Scale.....	118



## List of Figures

<b>Figure 1.</b> Diagram depicting 3 converging themes of the current research project .....	6
<b>Figure 2.</b> Diagram depicting progressive phases of the current research project .....	49
<b>Figure 3.</b> Pyramid diagram illustrating the phases of treatment involved in the culturally adapted treatment manual .....	80
<b>Figure 4.</b> Bar-graph displaying the reduction in BDI-II scores for each participant comparing baseline and post-treatment.....	84
<b>Figure 5.</b> Figure showing depressive symptom change across assessment points for participants who experienced 90-100% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	87
<b>Figure 6.</b> Line graph showing changes in scores on the ATQ-30 for participants who experienced 90-100% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	89
<b>Figure 7.</b> Radar diagram showing pre-treatment and post-treatment scores on the four dimensions of Hua Oranga for participants who experienced 90-100% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	90
<b>Figure 8.</b> Figure showing depressive symptom change across assessment points for participants who experienced 80-90% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	93
<b>Figure 9.</b> Line graph showing changes in scores on the ATQ-30 for participants who experienced 80-90% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	94
<b>Figure 10.</b> Radar diagram showing pre-treatment and post-treatment scores on the four dimensions of Hua Oranga for participants who experienced 80-90% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	95
<b>Figure 11.</b> Figure showing depressive symptom change across assessment points for participants who experienced 40-60%	

reduction in mean depressive symptoms .....	97
<b>Figure 12.</b> Line graph showing changes in scores on the ATQ-30 for participants who experienced 40-60% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	99
<b>Figure 13.</b> Vector diagram showing pre-treatment and post-treatment scores on the four dimensions of Hua Oranga for participants who experienced 40-60% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	100
<b>Figure 14.</b> Figure showing depressive symptom change across assessment points for participants who experienced less than 30% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	103
<b>Figure 15.</b> Line graph showing changes in scores on the ATQ-30 for participants who experienced less than 30% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	104
<b>Figure 16.</b> Vector diagram showing pre-treatment and post-treatment scores on the four dimensions of Hua Oranga for participants who experienced less than 30% reduction in depressive symptoms .....	105
<b>Figure 17.</b> Value of <i>Change ES</i> effect sizes for clinical outcome measures.....	115

## List of Appendices

Appendix A: Glossary of Māori Words and Phrases.....	164
Appendix B: The Treaty of Waitangi, 1840.....	166
Appendix C: DSM-IV-TR criteria for Major Depressive Episode.....	169
Appendix D: Tohunga Suppression Act, 1907.....	171
Appendix E: Question Format for Advisory Group Interviews.....	172
Appendix F: Example of Genogram as used in this research for Client A.....	173
Appendix G: Selected whakatauki used in the adapted CBT and their English translations.....	174
Appendix H: Applied examples of adapted Cognitive Conceptualisation Diagram and 5-Part Model – Hana.....	175
Appendix I: Te Whare Tapa Wha diagram provided to participants.....	177
Appendix J: Adapted thought records given to participants to complete.....	178
Appendix K: Hua Oranga – Adapted client version used in this research.....	180
Appendix L: Information Sheet and Consent Forms.....	182
Appendix M: Adapted activity schedule completed by participants.....	186