

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

# **Evolutionary interactions of brood parasites and their hosts**

## **Recognition, communication and breeding biology**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Ecology

at Massey University, Auckland,  
New Zealand.

Michael Gareth Anderson

2009

---

## Frontispiece



Photo by Tomáš Grim

---

## Abstract

Obligate brood parasites lay their eggs in nests of other species, relying on these host parents to care for their offspring. This phenomenon has been a curiosity amongst researchers since its first description and has become a model study system for testing such ideas as coevolution and species recognition. This thesis examines a few of the many questions that arise from this breeding system. The New Zealand Grey Warbler (*Gerygone igata*) and its brood parasite, the Shining Cuckoo (*Chrysococcyx lucidus*) are used as the main study species, although research on the eviction behaviour of Common Cuckoos (*Cuculus canorus*) has also been conducted. First, the current state of knowledge and recent discoveries regarding nestling rejection abilities of hosts is reviewed in chapter one. Second, a comparative study of New Zealand passerine begging calls has been conducted to test for begging call similarity between a brood parasite and its host, as well as developing a new technique for detecting the mode of coevolution that may be occurring in the parasite – host relationship. Parent-offspring communication in Grey Warblers is also examined to test for both parental and nestlings. Parents use both alarm calls to warn offspring of potential danger, and also parental feeding calls to elicit a begging response from nestlings. By contrast, nestlings are able to signal both age and short term levels of need to parents through the acoustic structure of the begging call. The evolutionary costs and benefits of egg eviction behaviour in the Common Cuckoo are also tested. An experimental approach showed that egg eviction had a growth cost, but this cost was temporary and restricted to during and immediately after the egg eviction phase. A pattern of compensatory growth was observed after the eviction period, so that during the later nestling stages there was no difference in mass,

---

and no difference in fledging age. Finally, variation in the Grey Warbler breeding biology and Shining Cuckoo parasitism rates are examined through both time and across latitudes. This research has shown a counterintuitive pattern of breeding phenology across latitudes. These patterns have implications for Shining Cuckoos both in terms of timing of available nests and host selection.

*Keywords:* Begging call, breeding phenology, brood parasitism, coevolution, Common Cuckoo, eviction, Grey Warbler, parent-offspring communication, Shining Cuckoo.

---

## Preface

This study focuses on the evolution and maintenance of key traits that are involved in brood parasitism. Most of the research was conducted within New Zealand on the Grey Warbler (*Gerygone igata*) and its brood parasite, the Shining Cuckoo (*Chrysococcyx lucidus*), although one of the chapters uses the Common Cuckoo (*Cuculus canorus*) and its host the Great Reed Warbler (*Acrocephalus arundinaceus*). Although brood parasitism is the common theme of this thesis, each chapter (chapters 1 – 6) has been modified from manuscripts that have been written as scientific papers, and can therefore be viewed as independent studies. Due to the thesis being in this format, some repetition amongst chapters inevitably occurs. References, acknowledgements and appendices are therefore at the end of each chapter. Supervisors Mark Hauber and Dianne Brunton are co-authors of most manuscripts, as stated at the start of each chapter, and have been important with assistance in experimental design, writing the thesis and advice on statistical analysis procedures. Input from other co-authors is stated specifically below. Chapter one has previously been published as a research focus paper within the journal *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, of which Mark Hauber is a co-author. This introduces some of the key ideas involved with recognition of brood parasite offspring by host species. Chapter two is in press with the *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, and uses comparative and bioinformatic procedures as a new technique of detecting co-evolution within brood parasites. Assistance with the bioinformatic analyses was provided by Howard Ross. Chapter three has been submitted to the journal *Animal Behaviour* and uses an experimental approach to investigate the parent-offspring communication used by the Grey Warbler. Chapter four is research that has been

---

conducted in Hungary on the Common Cuckoo testing the cost of egg eviction behaviour to cuckoo nestlings' growth rates. For this research, Csaba Moskát and Miklós Bán assisted with fieldwork in Hungary, Tomáš Grim assisted with data analysis and Phillip Cassey provided funding. This research has been submitted to the journal *American Naturalist*. Chapter five investigates the honest information content of begging calls of the Grey Warbler and is being submitted to the journal *Ethology*. Chapter six uses four different data sets on the breeding biology of the Grey Warbler to investigate the changes in breeding phenology with latitude and through time and the ways that this can affect the Shining Cuckoo. Brian Gill and Jim Briskie are both co-authors on this research, as they have provided data on Grey Warbler breeding biology from Kaikoura.

---

## Acknowledgements

When, I completed my Masters thesis, I started off the acknowledgements with a few statistics. Once again, this feels appropriate. At that time, my masters thesis had taken up 822 days, or 8.7% of my life. By contrast, my PhD thesis has taken up (approximately) 1620 days, or 15.04% of my life thus far. Obviously, anyone that has experience such an undertaking knows that it is not possible to spend so much time trying to complete a task, without the help of many people. These people are mentioned below, all of whom I am greatly indebted to for their assistance and support during this time.

First and foremost, my supervisors deserve the biggest thanks, as this work would not have been possible without them. Dianne Brunton, who took me under her wing when I did my masters thesis with her as well, has been supportive, inspirational and a huge help throughout this research. She has been everything from a lab matriarch, counsellor and statistical guru, while also giving me the opportunity to visit extraordinary places and do incredible things. Mark Hauber has been incredibly supportive and involved in this project as well as an amazing supervisor, despite being based at another university. He has done everything from answering emails after midnight, texting advice from Israel and sending me to do research in Hungary. You have both taught me a lot academically and personally as well being fantastic role models. I am greatly indebted to you both.

---

As with most ecological studies, there have been many aspects of this research that have been impossible to complete without some much appreciated help from others. The following people have helped in various ways, such as mist netting, nest finding and general fieldwork tasks. So a big thanks to Gavin Anderson, Alana Alexander, Shauna Baillie, Marleen Baling, Manuela Barry, Dianne Brunton, Taneal Cope, Mark Delany, Barbara Evans, Brian Gill, Tomas Grim, Charlotte Hardy, Malcolm Harrison, Mark Hauber, Weihong Ji, Mark Low, Luis Ortiz Catedral, Jo Peace, Mark Seabrook-Davidson, John Steemson, Chris Wedding and Birgit Ziesemann. A special thanks is needed for my three field assistants Charlotte Hardy, Alana Alexander and Mark Delaney, all of whom spent many hours in the field looking for nests in what was frequently difficult conditions.

The second chapter of this thesis investigates the begging call similarity of the Grey Warbler and Shining Cuckoo through the use of a comparative framework. In order to do this kind of research, I required begging calls of all New Zealand passerines, which was certainly not an easy task. Many dedicated volunteers, researchers and conservation staff assisted with locating nests of various species from throughout the country. So I am very grateful for the assistance of Alana Alexander, Gavin Anderson, Shauna Baillie, Marleen Baling, Jake Bapty, Manuela Barry, James Briskie, Emily Brugge, Taneal Cope, Mark Delany, Graeme Elliot, Barbara Evans, Morag Fordham, Brian Gill, Tomas Grim, Charlotte Hardy, Malcolm Harrison, Weihong Ji, Stacey Hill, Todd Landers, Barry Lawrence, Nora Leuschner, Tim Lovegrove, Eric Marsden, Luis Ortiz Catedral, Kevin Parker, Jo Peace, Marion Rhodes, Peter Samas, Hazel Speed, Rose Thorogood, Megan Willans (and field assistants) and Sarah Withers.

---

During the course of this thesis, I was fortunate enough to visit Hungary and do work on the common cuckoo. This trip was facilitated by Mark Hauber and was made possible by the generous assistance of Csaba Moskát who allowed me to work within his study system. Miklós Bán was also very helpful with this research, and taught me a lot about Hungarian culture and the joy of jazz. Rim Lucassen, Lotte van Boheemen and Nicoletta Geltsch were helpful with fieldwork.

Any biology thesis requires a lot of statistical analysis, which is often one of the biggest challenges, so a huge thank you to Marti-Jane Anderson, Allen Rodrigo, Howard Ross, Dianne Brunton, and Mark Hauber for help and discussions.

I have also been lucky enough to have colleagues from several disciplines and countries who have been kind enough to spare their precious time by giving advice, feedback and discussions on research. They are each mentioned within the acknowledgement of specific chapters for clarity of where they have given input. A big debt of gratitude is owed to Marti-Jane Anderson, Dianne Brunton, Brian Gill, Phillip Cassey, Nick Davies, Tomas Grim, Uri Grodzinski, Greg Holwell, Rebecca Kilner, Naomi Langmore, Arnon Lotem, Csaba Moskát, Luis Ortiz Catedral, Kevin Parker, Jo Peace, Allen Rodrigo, Rebecca Safran, Justin Schuetz, Rose Thorogood, David Winkler.

Fieldwork for this research was primarily conducted at Tawharanui Regional Park, with permission of Auckland Regional Council (ARC) and the Department of Conservation. ARC also allowed me to stay at Tawharanui while doing research. The rangers at Tawharanui, particularly Maurice Puckett, Colin Ward and Malcolm Harrison always made it an awesome place to do research.

---

This research was made possible by funding from a Massey University Doctoral Scholarship, Tertiary Education Commission's Top Achiever Doctoral Scholarship (part of the Bright Futures Scheme) and Massey University. Dianne Brunton also provided funding from a New Zealand Marsden Fund Grant (jointly with Howard Ross) and Massey University. Mark Hauber provided funding from the School of Biological Sciences (University of Auckland), National Geographic Society the New Zealand Marsden Fund Grants and a Human Frontiers Science Program Grant (jointly with Phillip Cassey and Tomas Grim).

The Ecology and Conservation Group in Massey University has always been an interesting and fun group of people to work with. Slowly but steadily we have expanded over the years. A huge thanks for all the laughs and good times are needed for the entire group who are or have been part of this group (sorry if I forget anyone): Shauna Baillie, Marleen Baling, Ben Barr, Rosemary Barraclough, Manuela Barry, Nicolas de la Brosse Dianne Brunton, Taneal Cope, Mark Delany, Barbara Evans, Anna Gsell, David Gudex-Cross, Marta Guemes, Jacqueline Guerts, Jurgen Kolb, Brigit Kreigenhofer, Weihong Ji, Mark Low, Emmanuelle Martinez-Smagghe, Luis Ortiz Cathedral, Kevin Parker, Jo Peace, Vincenzo Petrella, David Raubenheimer, Jennifer Ricket, Mark Seabrook-Davidson, Uri Shanas, Idan Shapira, Jodi Smith, Karen Stockin, Monique Van Rensberg, Dylan Van Winkel, Kirsty Verrill, Andy Warneford, Chris Wedding, Sarah Wells, Sarah Whitwell, Cheeho Wong and Birgit Ziesemann.

Last but not least, my family and friends deserve a huge thank you for putting up with my nonsense and gallivanting about doing birdy things. My high school friends, Steve Duval, Steve Ogilvie, Scott Wallace, Bruce Birks, Regan O'Malley and Kit Mollier

---

have helped to keep me sane (mostly) with much mirth and hilarity. Josh Guilbert and Luis Ortiz Catedral have been incredibly supportive and have helped me through many obstacles and hard times. What more can one ask for? A huge thanks to my lovely Julia, who has brought me a new sense of purpose, and has been incredibly supportive. Finally, a big thanks for my family, my sister, Cushla and my parents, Gavin and Cathy, who have been with me through my thesis experience who have been incredibly supportive throughout my (not so short) time at university.

---

## Table of contents

<b>FRONTISPIECE .....</b>	<b>II</b>
<b>ABSTRACT.....</b>	<b>III</b>
<b>PREFACE .....</b>	<b>V</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....</b>	<b>VII</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS .....</b>	<b>XII</b>
<b>LIST OF FIGURES .....</b>	<b>XV</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES .....</b>	<b>XVIII</b>
<b>LIST OF SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS.....</b>	<b>XX</b>
<b>1 A RECOGNITION-FREE MECHANISM FOR RELIABLE REJECTION OF BROOD PARASITES.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 ABSTRACT .....	2
1.2 INTRODUCTION .....	3
1.3 DARWINIAN ALGORITHMS TO REJECT PARASITES .....	3
1.4 NESTLING DISCRIMINATION WITHOUT RECOGNITION .....	4
1.5 IMPLICATIONS FOR HOST–PARASITE COEVOLUTIONARY PROCESSES.....	9
1.6 CONCLUSION .....	11
1.7 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....	12
1.8 REFERENCES.....	12
<b>2 BEGGING CALL MATCHING BETWEEN A SPECIALIST BROOD PARASITE AND ITS HOST: A COMPARATIVE APPROACH TO DETECT CO-EVOLUTION. ....</b>	<b>14</b>
2.1 ABSTRACT .....	15
2.2 INTRODUCTION .....	16
2.3 MATERIAL AND METHODS .....	19
2.3.1 <i>Begging call recordings</i> .....	19
2.3.2 <i>Phylogeny of New Zealand passerines</i> .....	21
2.3.3 <i>Data Analysis</i> .....	21
2.4 RESULTS .....	24
2.4.1 <i>Host-parasite begging call similarity</i> .....	24
2.4.2 <i>Similarity between begging call and phylogenetic trees</i> .....	25
2.4.3 <i>The effect of parasite and host on the phylogenetic signal of the begging call similarity tree</i> .....	27
2.5 DISCUSSION.....	29
2.6 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	33
2.7 REFERENCES .....	34
2.8 SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL.....	40
<b>3 SPECIES-SPECIFIC MODULATION AND ONTOGENETIC SHIFT OF THE RESPONSES OF GREY WARBLER (<i>GERYGONE IGATA</i>) NESTLINGS TO PARENTAL FEEDING AND ALARM CALLS .....</b>	<b>45</b>
3.1 ABSTRACT .....	46
3.2 INTRODUCTION.....	48

3.3	METHODS.....	53
3.3.1	<i>Study Species and Site</i> .....	53
3.3.2	<i>Collection of acoustic stimuli</i> .....	58
3.3.3	<i>Preparation of playback sequences</i> .....	59
3.3.4	<i>Conducting the playbacks</i> .....	59
3.3.5	<i>Statistical Analysis</i> .....	61
3.3.6	<i>Ethical note</i> .....	63
3.4	RESULTS.....	64
3.4.1	<i>Begging Solicitation Calls</i> .....	64
3.4.2	<i>Alarm call playbacks</i> .....	67
3.5	DISCUSSION.....	71
3.6	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	76
3.7	REFERENCES.....	77
<b>4</b>	<b>EGG EVICTION IMPOSES A RECOVERABLE COST OF VIRULENCE IN CHICKS OF THE COMMON CUCKOO.....</b>	<b>83</b>
	ABSTRACT.....	84
4.1	INTRODUCTION.....	85
4.2	METHODS.....	89
4.2.1	<i>Field Procedures</i> .....	89
4.2.2	<i>Sample Sizes</i> .....	90
4.2.3	<i>Data Analyses</i> .....	91
4.3	RESULTS.....	93
4.4	DISCUSSION.....	97
4.5	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	101
	LITERATURE CITED.....	102
<b>5</b>	<b>HONEST INFORMATION CONTENT OF NESTLING BEGGING CALLS IN THE GREY WARBLER.....</b>	<b>107</b>
5.1	ABSTRACT.....	108
5.2	INTRODUCTION.....	109
5.3	METHODS.....	111
5.3.1	<i>Study Site and Species</i> .....	111
5.3.2	<i>Playback experiment</i> .....	112
5.3.3	<i>Statistical methods</i> .....	115
5.4	RESULTS.....	116
5.4.1	<i>Call rate</i> .....	116
5.4.2	<i>Call structure</i> .....	116
5.5	DISCUSSION.....	122
5.6	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	125
5.7	REFERENCES.....	126
<b>6</b>	<b>COUNTERINTUITIVE PATTERNS OF BREEDING PHENOLOGY VARIATION WITH LATITUDE IN THE GREY WARBLER (<i>GERYGONE IGATA</i>) AND IMPLICATIONS FOR ITS BROOD PARASITE, THE SHINING CUCKOO (<i>CHRYSOCOCCYX LUCIDUS</i>). .....</b>	<b>131</b>
6.1	ABSTRACT.....	132
6.2	INTRODUCTION.....	133
6.3	METHODS.....	137
6.3.1	<i>Historical nesting records</i> .....	137
6.3.2	<i>Study Sites and Species</i> .....	137
6.4	DATA ANALYSIS.....	140
6.5	RESULTS.....	141
6.5.1	<i>Clutch Size</i> .....	141
6.5.2	<i>Frequency of broods and timing of breeding</i> .....	144
6.5.3	<i>Brood parasitism rates</i> .....	145
6.5.4	<i>Adult Mass</i> .....	145
6.5.5	<i>Nestling Growth</i> .....	145
6.6	DISCUSSION.....	151
6.7	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	156
6.8	REFERENCES.....	157

---

<b>7</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS .....</b>	<b>163</b>
7.1	BROOD PARASITISM RESEARCH .....	164
7.2	PARENT-OFFSPRING COMMUNICATION .....	166
7.3	CONSERVATION .....	168
7.4	REFERENCES.....	170
<b>8</b>	<b>APPENDICES .....</b>	<b>176</b>
8.1	CHAPTER 1: PUBLISHED VERSION .....	176
8.2	CHAPTER 2: PUBLISHED VERSION .....	180

---

---

## List of Figures

- Figure 1. A typical brood of reed warbler chicks (depicted) demands much parental care. Broods of one or four reed warblers or a single common cuckoo chick that remain in the nest beyond the typical nestling period of the host, face abandonment by parents (Grim, 2007, Grim *et al.*, 2003). Reproduced with permission from T. Grim. .... 6
- Figure 2: Dendrograms of begging call similarities created by cluster analysis based on acoustic features. Three New Zealand native species sets were used; a) all passerines and out groups, b) passerines and c) oscines. The host and brood parasite species are highlighted in bold. .... 26
- Figure 3: The stimuli used in the playback experiment. The two main types of adult conspecific vocalizations that are used for parent-offspring communication, a) begging solicitation call and b) parental alarm call and c) the heterospecific begging solicitation call and d) alarm call, and the e) heterospecific song used as a control. .... 57
- Figure 4: Mean discrimination scores ( $\pm 1$  standard error) of the begging response for nestlings when presented with each of the five different acoustic stimuli. The five stimuli are fantail alarm call (HA), fantail song (C), grey warbler alarm call (CA), grey warbler begging solicitation call (CB), and the welcome swallow begging solicitation call (HB). Age groups were combined due to no significant difference. .... 65
- Figure 5: Alterations in calling rate of 12 (■) and 16 (□) days grey warbler nestlings for a) begging solicitation calls and b) alarm calls. .... 68
-

---

Figure 6: Alterations in the a) frequency, b) duration and c) amplitude of nestling begging calls of 12 (■) and 16 (□) day old grey warbler nestlings in response to the three different begging solicitation calls.....	69
Figure 7: Alterations in the a) frequency, b) duration and c) amplitude of nestling begging calls of 12 (■) and 16 (□) day old grey warbler nestlings in response to the three different alarm stimuli. ....	70
Figure 8: Hatchling common cuckoos in the process of evicting host chicks and eggs [inset] from great reed warbler nests. Photo credit: C. Moskát and M. Honza (inset photo).....	88
Figure 9: Growth of common cuckoo chicks in great reed warbler nests with host eggs left that had to be evicted by cuckoo chicks (black circles: control/evictor group) or where host eggs were removed (open circles: experimental/non-evictor treatment) for a) mass, b) tarsus, c) gape length, d) gape width, e) gape area. Values are means $\pm$ SE....	96
Figure 10: The two typical types of vocalisations given by Grey Warbler nestlings; a) a longer begging call following the parental feeding call and b) the shorter non-begging call.....	118
Figure 11: The relationship between the time since nestlings heard their parental feeding call and a) frequency ( $r = -0.34, p < 0.001$ ), b) frequency range ( $r = -0.06, p = 0.06$ ), c) duration ( $r = -0.27, p < 0.001$ ) and d) amplitude ( $r = -0.14, p < 0.001$ ) of nestling vocalisations. Lowess smoothing is used to give lines of best fit for all graphs. ....	119
Figure 12: Mean ( $\pm$ SE) begging call rate (number of begging calls per second given after parental feeding call) given by Grey Warbler nestlings across three food deprivation periods (i.e. hunger levels) at 12 ( ) and 16 ( ) days. ....	120

---

---

Figure 13: Mean ( $\pm$ SE) of (a) amplitude, (b) centre frequency, (c) frequency range, and (d) duration of begging calls for Grey Warbler nestlings across three food deprivation periods (i.e. hunger levels) at 12 (▣) and 16 (◻) days. ....	121
Figure 14: Average Grey Warbler clutch sizes (eggs) from the two sites in New Zealand, Tawharanui and Kaikoura. Kaikoura is shown as two separate columns for the two studies conducted at the same site. Bars are means $\pm$ standard error. ....	142
Figure 15: The effect of latitude on clutch size for Grey Warblers throughout the range of New Zealand. Data is from OSNZ nest records. ....	142
Figure 16: The relationship between lay date (5 <sup>th</sup> of September = Day 1) and clutch size for a) Kaikoura study 2, b) Tawharanui, and c) OSNZ nest record data (25 <sup>th</sup> of June = Day 1). ....	143
Figure 17: Seasonal patterns of egg laying in the Grey Warbler in a) Tawharanui and b) Kaikoura study 1(1976-1979), c) Kaikoura study 2 (2001-2007), d) OSNZ records. The number of eggs laid are grouped into weekly intervals. ....	148
Figure 18: Differences in adult Grey Warbler mass between Kaikoura and Tawharanui. Adults were caught by mist netting birds from May to July at each site. Bars are means $\pm$ standard error. ....	149
Figure 19: Growth rates of a) mass and b) tarsus of nestlings at Tawharanui (○) and Kaikoura (●). Lines of best fit are logistic curves for mass and a third degree polynomial fit for tarsus (see Methods for equations). Lines of best fit are denoted as solid lines for Kaikoura and dashed lines for Tawharanui data. ....	150

---

---

## List of Tables

Table 1. Suggested mechanisms of brood abandonment in evicting brood parasites.....	5
Table 2: Empirical probability that two designated taxa form a species pair on a tree of random topology, or when the leaves are randomised on the observed topology of begging call similarity. In each case, $10^4$ randomizations were performed. ....	28
Table 3: The congruence of the topology of the call similarity cluster diagram with respect to the phylogeny. The underlying null distribution of each metric was obtained by randomizing the topology of the cluster diagram and then comparing it with the known phylogeny. The “randomness” of the observed cluster diagram is indicated by the percentile at which it fell on the null distribution. Low percentiles are indicative of non-randomness. In each case, $10^6$ randomizations were performed. ....	28
Table 4: Differences in growth parameters between experimental (chicks raised alone, host eggs removed) and control (host eggs left and evicted) cuckoo chicks in great reed warbler nests. Data from <i>a priori</i> defined phases of development were analyzed separately. Growth was estimated as deviations from growth patterns of control chicks randomly sampled in the study population (see Methods). Effect size (mean $\pm$ SE) is the difference between the growth parameter of experimental and control groups (i.e., positive effect = greater growth of experimental chicks). Sample sizes for respective periods are given as number of nests/chicks and measurements and df refers to denominator degrees of freedom from GLMM models controlling for chick identity and age.....	95

---

Table 5: The effect of the number of eggs evicted by cuckoo nestlings on growth parameters within the control group (nestlings that evicted eggs). Sample sizes for respective periods are given as number of nests/chicks (N) and measurements (n), and df refers to denominator degrees of freedom from the LMM model controlling for chick identity and age.....	97
Table 6: A summary of the factors that are known to affect various breeding parameters for birds and the change caused by each effect. ....	136