School Decline:

Predictors, Process and Intervention

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education at Massey University, Auckland, New Zealand

Kay Hawk
2008
Abstract

The ramifications of school decline are profoundly serious for the students, staff and community of a school. School decline is the steady downwards spiral that some schools experience when a complex set of influences interact with negative and unresolved outcomes. This study explored the largely unresearched area of school decline and developed a set of potential predictors of decline that could assist in understanding, preventing or dealing effectively with school decline in the future. Grounded theory, selected as a methodology appropriate for exploratory research, was used to guide the process of data collection and theory development. Three schools, labeled by agencies and the media as being in serious decline or “failing”, were selected for the study. Adults who were in significant roles in the schools during the decline periods were interviewed about their experiences. As part of the data analysis and interpretation a set of propositions was drafted and was sent to these interviewees and to fourteen educational advisors who work with schools at risk and in decline. The advisors’ feedback on the propositions, analysis of school related documents, Education Review Office reports and Ministry of Education file documents provided rich additional data. The factors associated with the lead up to school decline, and the process of decline, are multilayered, contextual and complex. Each study school’s experience of decline involved a unique combination and order of occurrence of common factors and influences. Many of the issues that predispose schools towards decline are associated with, and are exacerbated by, unethical or unprofessional attitudes or behaviour by individuals, and unprofessional practices within the schools and between neighbouring schools. Once decline begins it escalates and is difficult to stop. This thesis contributes towards the development of a theory of school decline by identifying potential predictors of school decline and by describing how decline begins and escalates. It also identifies factors that are associated with interventions being insufficient or ineffective. The theory of school decline provides insights for school leaders and educational agencies that may assist in the prediction and prevention of school decline in the future.
Acknowledgements

To my family: Richard, Sarah, Shaun, Mary, Matt, and David; for your faith in my ability and your pressure on me to complete when times were difficult.

My grateful acknowledgement to the study school participants: leaders, trustees, teachers and colleagues from the three schools. You have willingly shared very private thoughts and experiences in the interests of others in the future who might be spared some of the pain and difficulty of being involved in school decline. This thesis is the first of my commitments to you to use the knowledge I have gained through your participation to help schools to move from being at risk to being healthy organisations for all involved, and for their students especially. My thanks to the educational advisors for their time, wisdom and trust. Your motivation in contributing, and hopes for the research outcomes, are the same as mine; that we will be able to use the new insights to the benefit of the schools in which we work.

The members of the Albany Campus Massey University Human Ethics Committee, who approved the ethics application, were of great help in advising on the complex ethical issues associated with writing this thesis and my commitment to maintain confidentiality for the schools and people involved. I am extremely grateful for the support and wise and pragmatic advice.

To my Education Group partners, our PA Jane, Margaret Bendall, Massey University colleagues, fellow doctoral students, and Library staff who have been involved in a variety of helpful, supportive and advisory roles throughout my doctoral programme.

Thank you Richard, Stephen, Jacqueline and Matthew for proof reading; Nancy for editing and moral support; Sue for the wonderful diagrams and for your meticulous work in the formatting and production of the document; and to Ros for the lengthy transcriptions.

To my supervisors: Associate Professor Ann Dupuis and Professor Luanna Meyer. From the beginning you believed in the importance of this research and were supportive when I suspended for family reasons. I especially appreciated the expertise in grounded theory that Professor Wayne Edwards contributed and the advice in how to present the process of developing my theory.
Table of Contents

Abstract ii
Acknowledgements iii

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION 1
Research Rationale 3
The Aim of the Thesis 4
The New Zealand Context 5
Dealing with School Decline in New Zealand 7
Understanding the Concept of Decline in Relation to this Study 10
An Overview of the Research Process 11
Organisation of the Thesis 13

CHAPTER 2 RELATED LITERATURE AND CONCEPTS 15
The Role of Literature in this Project 15
Defining Decline 17
Defining Failure 18
School Effectiveness 21
Schooling Improvement 24
Educational and School Change 25
Schools “at risk” 26
Educational Failure 28
Education Review and Measurement 28
Organisational Decline and Failure 29
School Ineffectiveness, Decline and Failure 32
The “Failure” of Innovative Schools 33
Interventions 34
New Zealand Research on Decline and Interventions 36
A Related Study 38
Linkage of the Literature with the Thesis 39

CHAPTER 3 GROUNDED THEORY METHODOLOGY 45
Rationale for the Selection of Grounded Theory 47
The Genesis and Evolution of Grounded Theory 47
Tenets of the Grounded Theory Process 49
CHAPTER 4 DATA COLLECTION, ANALYSIS AND THEORY BUILDING 71

Predispositions 71
Mapping the Decline 72
Evolving Data Collection Process 72
Sampling changes 73
Document collection 73
Researcher reflection through memo writing 74
Literature 75
Data Analysis 76
Coding transcripts and generating categories 76
CHAPTER 5 POTENTIAL PREDICTORS OF SCHOOL DECLINE

PART ONE: MACRO (SOCIETAL) INFLUENCES
Inadequate Responses to International and Educational Trends
Socio-economic Status and Demographic and Economic Factors
Schisms over Societal Values, Norms and Social Movements
Inability to Respond to Policy Changes
Impact of Community Conflict

PART TWO: MESO (INSTITUTIONAL) INFLUENCES
Decline in Student Enrolments
Ineffective Internal Management of Systems
  Poor financial and asset management
  Ineffective management of poor staff performance
  Inadequate principal appraisal
  Poor appointments resulting in performance problems
  Ineffective school systems
Unresolved Issues and Problems
  Governance difficulties
  Loss of staff cohesion and morale
  Problems associated with staff longevity
  Familial and professional role conflict
  The consequences of a deputy principal not being appointed principal
External Influence, Power and Authority
  Ministry of Education support was difficult to achieve
School Decline: Predictors, Process and Intervention

Why external intervention is required 242
Seeking help 245
MOE intervention 247
ERO reviews and resultant publicity 251
Agency interactions 254
Independent review and support 255
School Closure 257
Discussion Summary 258

CHAPTER 8 CONCLUSION 259
Introduction 259
The Aims, Objectives and Contributions of the Thesis 259
Implications for Schools, Agencies and Policy Makers 261
Research Limitations 263
Areas for Future Research 264
Final Thoughts 266

BIBLIOGRAPHY 293

List of Figures:

Figure 1 Data strategies, collection and use. 46
Figure 2 The process of refining categories 79
Figure 3 Extract from the draft research propositions 82
Figure 4 Draft “at risk” indicators 83
Figure 5 Process of Building Theory from Case Study Research 88
Figure 6 Unresolved issues/problems 92
Figure 7 Potential predictors: Macro (Societal) 94
Figure 8 Potential predictors: Meso (Institutional) 107
Figure 9 Potential predictors: Micro (Personal) 151
Figure 10 Potential predictors 168
Figure 11 The decline process: Beginnings and escalation 171
Figure 12 Generalised decline timeline 172
Figure 13 The decline process: Competing forces 178
Figure 14 The decline process 211
Figure 15 Macro (Societal) influences/predictors 215

Kay Hawk
List of Appendices:

Appendix A  Glossary  267
Appendix B  Information Sheets  271
Appendix C: Consent forms  279
Appendix D  Guiding questions for interviews  281
Appendix E  Ethics Committee meeting discussion document  282
Appendix F  MOE file documents  284
Appendix G  Memo writing  285
Appendix H  Data analysis process: Sorting categories  286
Appendix I  Monitoring sheet  288
Appendix J  Data analysis process: Transcript page  289
Appendix K  Examples of responses to the propositions  290