Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
DISSOLUTION OF MARRIAGE: PUBLIC POLICY AND "THE FAMILY-APART"

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts

Gaye Annette Greenwood
The School of Social Policy and Social Work
Massey University at Albany
1999
ABSTRACT

Policy making is a process which involves negotiation and reconciliation of the economic interests and well-being of citizens. Similarly dissolution of marriage is a process of negotiation and conciliation. At the level of the family, economic resources and the social and emotional needs of adults and children are negotiated. This thesis applies Considine's value-critical model of the policy process to the laws which have governed dissolution of marriage for families in Aotearoa New Zealand since 1840.

The study has a dual purpose. One purpose is to illuminate the values which underpin dissolution policies and the second purpose is to explore the impact that contemporary policies have on family members. This qualitative study examines the policies in the context of the experiences of seven mid-life Pakeha women from long term marriages with dependent children. Legal professionals, judges and political actors share their respective professional experiences of implementing and making dissolution policy.

Literature is analysed within a policy framework that includes policy actors, the policy culture, the political economy and policy institutions. Policy documents, statutes, court cases, parliamentary debates and research studies are examined and integrated with themes that have emerged, in chronological order.

In this study the participants experiences and professional observations identify two important policy principles, gender equality and economic independence following dissolution. Those two principles are reconciled by policy makers at the level of the law and family members at the level of daily life. Some women from long term traditional marriages find that economic outcomes are not equal on dissolution when they have foregone employment to provide primary care giving for the children of the marriage. During the study it emerged that some men find custody and care arrangements difficult when they have foregone parenting for paid employment during marriage. The equal sharing of these advantages and disadvantages of marriage are at the heart of disagreement during the transition from a nuclear family to a family-apart.

Drawing from the literature and the findings seven key areas for the consideration of families and policy makers emerge. They include the interests of the children, equality, economic independence, property, maintenance, conflict, and the legal process.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My warm thanks go to:

* The women who shared their experiences with me.

* The Judges who patiently explained and taught me about policy making and implementation through the courts.

* The legal practitioners who shared their valuable time and expertise with me.

* The policy makers and policy advisors who were prepared to be politically transparent about the policy making process.

* My supervisors Dr Grant Duncan who challenged me about my ideas and Dr Ann Dupuis who challenged me about my writing.

* My Children Mandy, Abby and Sam and friends Louise, Sharon and Lee who provided space and support throughout the process.

* Lorna Haslam my mother who was encouraging, understanding and helpful when I needed practical or emotional support.

* Sam for drawing the figures.

* Annette Barker who provided her time and skill to format and type the bibliography when time was running short.

* Most especially Marilyn who has played the role of motherish for the children and taken over my share of the household duties, when her own busy life could ill afford the time. Her unpaid work in our home and property has been invaluable.
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
<th>ii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONTENTS</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 1 AN INTRODUCTION

## CHAPTER 2 ENGAGING VALUE CRITICAL THEORY

- * A Theoretical Framework 7
- * Theories of Public Policy 9
- * Values 15
- * Systems Theory and Public Policy 16
- * Synthesis of the Theoretical Framework 18

## CHAPTER 3 THE METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

- * Qualitative research 21
- * Feminist Ethics 23
- * Reflection 26
- * Voluntary Participation/Informed Consent 30
- * Confidentiality/Anonymity 30
- * Avoidance of harm 31
- * Research Design 32
- * Multi Method Fieldwork 34
- * Interviews : Women Participants 36
- * Interviews : Legal Professionals and Judges 36
- * Interviews : Policy Advisors : Politicians 37
- * Data Collection and Gender Analysis 38
- * Recording and Managing the Data 39
- * Triangulation of the Data 42

## CHAPTER 4 EVOLUTION OF DISSOLUTION POLICY LAW 1840-1963

### POLITICAL /ECONOMIC PERSPECTIVE 45

- * Dissolution: The Past 46
- * Colonial New Zealand: Marriage and Dissolution 47
- * Formal Dissolution : The First Legislation 50
- * Women’s Property 54
- * Women and the State 55
- * Gendered Reforms 57
- * Early Twentieth Century 58
* The First Labour Government 60
* Post World War Two Generation 61
* The 1963 Reforms of Dissolution Legislation 63

CHAPTER 5 THE POLICY CULTURE 1963-1980 MALE
POLITICIANS LEGISLATE FORMAL EQUALITY 68
* The Policy Culture Preceding Reform 69
* Injustice in the Courts 70
* Policy Themes 71
* Privy Council Confirmed Need for Reform 72
* Social Change 74
* Parliament Led the 1976 Reforms 75
* Matrimonial Property: Partnership of Equals 79
* Fault 82
* Balance of Matrimonial Property 84
* Separate Property 87

THAT IMPLEMENTS POLICY 90
* Policy Objectives of the Family Court 92
* The Dissolution Process 94
* Counselling 94
* Mediation 94
* Private Agreements 99
* Delays and Other Tactics 100
* Financial and Emotional Costs 102
* No Choice but to Battle 104
* Court Hearings 106
* Spousal Maintenance 108
* The Clean Break: A Policy Gap 115

CHAPTER 7 THE INTERESTS OF THE CHILDREN 119
* Background 120
* Care and Contact 122
* Torn Loyalties 124
* Motherhood/Fatherhood: Care and Contact 127
* Conflict 132
* Domestic violence 134
* Parenting the Process 135
* Economic Resources 137
* Child Support 140
CHAPTER 8  POLICY ACTORS: CURRENT DEBATES: 1980-1999 145
* Political Economy Echoes of the Past 146
* Values 152
* Policy Institutions 154
* Cabinet 158
* Select Committee 161
* The Courts: Future Earnings 162
* Judges as Policy Actors 163
* Human Rights in Domestic Litigation 166
* Formal Equality 168
* Substantive Equality 169
* International Conventions in Domestic Law 170
* Substantive Equality and Dissolution Law 171
* Application in the New Zealand Context 172

CHAPTER 9  POLICY RESEARCH AND POSSIBILITIES:
SUBMISSION TO THE SELECT COMMITTEE 175
* General Submission 176
* Equal Division/Unequal Outcomes 176
* Disadvantage due to Functions of Marriage 177
* Earning Capacity/Division of Property 178
* The Clean Break Principle 179
* Flexible, Timely, Low Cost, Conciliation 180
* Domestic Violence, Conduct and Fault 181
* Equal Parenting/Equal Economic Outcomes 182
* Children of Dissolution 183
* Dissolution Education 185
* Dissolution Language 186
* International Conventions 187
* Specific Clauses 187
* Valuing the Family Home 187
* Compensation for contribution 187
* Debts 187
* Deferring Settlement 188
* Maintenance Orders 189
* Trusts and Limited Liability Companies 190
* Disclosure of Assets 190
* Substantive Equality and Human Rights 191

APPENDICES
* Information Sheet 192
* Your Role If You Decide To Participate 193
APPENDICES

*Your Rights If You Decide To Participate 194
* Consent Form 195
* Population Data for Prompts 196
* Transcribers Contract 199
* Semi- Structured Interviews 201
* Feedback Letter 202

BIBLIOGRAPHY

203

FIGURES

* Considine's Diamond Model 20
* The Dissolution Process 118