

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**PARENTAL CHOICE AND EDUCATION: THE PRACTICE OF
HOMESCHOOLING
IN NEW ZEALAND**

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Education
at
Massey University
Palmerston North
New Zealand

Leo Ernest Roache

2009

ABSTRACT

This thesis reports an investigation into eight New Zealand homeschooling families. It also offers an opportunity, to these parents, to share and discuss the reasons why they chose to educate their children at home and how they went about doing so. The families interviewed were all volunteers and, with the exception of two families, all interviews took place in the family homes. The families, urban and rural, were distributed from Wellington to Northland. All families had an opportunity to review and revise their narratives and my reviews of the narratives which related to them. No attempt was made to verify the stories of why families chose homeschooling but there was good accord between their stated reasons for homeschooling, and the practices they adopted.

The reasons advanced for choosing to homeschool were found to be complex. They ranged from parental experiences and philosophical beliefs to concern about teacher behaviour and sustaining their culture. The variations in teaching/learning practices and curricula, which were largely parent designed in consultation with their children, were equally complex. The testimony and experiences of these families bear out the notion of “communities of learning practice”, with all families repeatedly emphasising the centrality of the family. It was evident that the families changed over time, in the reasons for their choice and their practices. One significant feature was that all families elected to teach their children the basic skills of language and mathematics, with the intention of facilitating independent learning.

Homeschooling was seen by the families studied as a way of gaining some control over the education of their children, and thereby strengthening the family unit, whilst providing opportunities to cater for individual needs and preferred approaches to learning. Comparisons with overseas studies thus demonstrated some commonalities and some significant differences regarding the New Zealand sample. The study suggested that further research is needed to provide an accurate picture of homeschooling in New Zealand.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In this research I have been assisted and supported by a great many people without whom this study would have been the poorer, and perhaps not been presentable at all. I must first acknowledge the families who welcomed me into their lives and who were so generous and unreserved in sharing their beliefs, accounts of their experiences, and their communities with me. This generosity, hospitality, and tolerance went beyond what I had expected and was a learning experience for me.

I wish to express my unreserved thanks to Associate Professor John Clark, Dr Judith Loveridge, Professor Roger Openshaw, and Professor Wayne Edwards for their advice, encouragement, and consistent insightfulness. They were all stimulating and challenging during our frequent meetings. I also wish to thank the staff of Hokowhitu Library for their guidance and unreserved assistance in my research, and the Massey University Graduate School of Education for the teaching and guidance I received from them, in countless ways.

I would especially like to thank my family and my friends for their encouragement and tolerance, even though many secretly thought I was crazy taking on such a task at my age. A special thanks to Philippa Butler whose suggestions were very much appreciated, even when we did not agree. Being in contact with someone who had not been involved with, and as close as I was to, the events and ideas experienced in the study was a very valuable opportunity for me.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	2
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	3
TABLE OF CONTENTS	4
LIST OF APPENDICES	6
LIST OF FIGURES	7
LIST OF TABLES	7
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY	9
The Central Problem	9
Definition of Homeschooling	12
Choosing to Homeschool	14
Chapter Outlines	16
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	18
The Need for Research	18
Why Some Parents Chose to Homeschool	24
How Homeschoolers Practice Teaching	30
The Place of the Family	34
The Opposing Viewpoints	37
Summary	41
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY AND METHOD	42
CHAPTER 4: HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF HOMESCHOOLING IN NEW ZEALAND	59
Factors Leading up to the 1877 Education Act	60
The 1877 Education Act	61
Criticism of Homeschooling	87
The Current Situation	90
The Ministry of Education's Reaction	91
Emerging Political Party Perspectives	95
CHAPTER 5: BACKGROUNDS OF THE FAMILIES AND WHY THEY CHOSE TO HOMESCHOOL	97
Family Backgrounds	97

Family Interviews	98
Using a Theme Approach	130
CHAPTER 6: THE TEACHING PRACTICES OF THE FAMILIES	131
Family Interviews	131
Using a Theme Approach	162
CHAPTER 7: HOME IS WHERE WE LEARN	163
Reasons for Choosing to Homeschool	164
Summary of the Reasons for Choosing to Homeschool	178
Teaching Practices	180
Summary of Practices	202
Propositions	202
CHAPTER 8: CONCLUSIONS	204
Why Some Parents Choose to Homeschool	205
How Parents go about the Practice of Homeschooling	230
State versus Individual Rights	214
Some Commonalities	217
Emergent Research Areas	218
Recommendations for Future Policy Development	220
Looking Ahead	222
Summary	223
BIBLIOGRAPHY	226
APPENDICES	252

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A:

Copies of Key Questions, Information Sheets, Expressions of Interest, Consent Forms	252
Appendix A1 Key questions	253
Appendix A2 Information sheet to support groups	255
Appendix A3 Information sheet to parents	257
Appendix A4 Information sheet to children	259
Appendix A5 Expression of interest	260
Appendix A6 Parent consent form	261
Appendix A7 Child consent form	262
Appendix A8 Confidentiality agreement	263

Appendix B:

Ministry of Education Application for Exemption form and other material	264
Appendix B1 Information letter to parents	264
Appendix B2 Making an application	268
Appendix B3 Application form	273
Appendix B4 At least as regularly and well	276
Appendix B5 Ethnic identity - notes for parents	278
Appendix B6 Checklist for homeschooling application	279
Appendix B7 Frequently asked questions	280

Appendix C: Transcription, and control factors **287**

Appendix C1 Transcript of revised original interview of one of the eight participant families	287
Appendix C2 Case by case progression of “control” theme	309

Appendix D: Glossary

310

LIST OF FIGURES **315**

Figure 1. Kerslake et al. (1998). Proportions of responses made to the question on the reasons why parents chose to home school	24
---	-----------

Figure 2. Jordan (2003). The continuum of teaching	194
---	------------

LIST OF TABLES **315**

Table 1. Number of homeschooled students in New Zealand 1998-2008	83
--	-----------

Table 2. Each family's response to questions on why they chose to homeschool	158
---	------------

Table 3. Families' response to questions on teaching practices	181
---	------------

The object of getting all school-aged children to school and keeping them there until they attain the minimum age defined in compulsory education is routinely used in the sector of education, but this objective does not necessarily conform to human rights requirements. In a country where all school-aged children are in school free of charge, for the full duration of compulsory education, the right to education may be denied or violated.

The core human rights standards for education include respect for freedom. The respect of parents' freedom to educate their children according to their vision of what education should be has been part of international human rights standards since their very emergence.

(United Nations Commission on Human Rights. Statement by Special Rapporteur on the Right to Education.)