Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Multi-level tensions in transport policy and planning: bus-rapid transit (BRT) in Indonesia

A dissertation presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in Planning at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Suryani Eka Wijaya

2017
Abstract

International development agencies, supporting climate change sensitive transport policies in Low-Income Asian (LIA) cities, promote Bus Rapid Transit (BRT). However, these policies create tensions at the local level. Using a multi-level governance lens (MLG), this research examines the relations between and distribution of power among actors in BRT investment decisions in the two medium-sized Indonesian cities of Bandung and Surabaya. Analysis of policy and planning documents, and interviews with key stakeholders at central, provincial and city government levels highlighted financial-institutional, socio-political and discursive tensions at multiple levels in BRT projects in these cities. The financial-institutional tensions resulted from city government funding dependency on central government and international development agencies that promoted BRT projects as low-cost ‘green’ solutions to traffic congestion and greenhouse gas emissions. Their “Go-green” campaign made it possible for Bandung and Surabaya governments to privilege BRT over traditional minibuses (angkot) and regular bus modes. The BRT projects were advanced through the low-cost, environmentally friendly and modern public transport discourses that did not get attention due to the absence of site-specific narrative. Open communication and proactive public participation were also missing when undertaking BRT projects in Bandung and Surabaya so that the projects were opposed by social and political actors in both cities. As a result, national and provincial policies were modified in Bandung limiting BRT to two peri-urban corridors that do not meet local needs. In contrast, Surabaya accepted a BRT project, but then turned it down due to political and social pressure that developed during the process. This research identified the importance horizontal and vertical relationships in the BRT projects’ planning and implementation. While vertical alignment is important for translating national transport policy to local transport planning, horizontal integration and communication is crucial for transport project implementation. The mismatch between horizontal and vertical actors resulted in delays and ultimately rejection of BRT project in Surabaya and distortion of the BRT project in Bandung. This research identifies a need for integrated policy packages to help develop site-specific BRT projects for LIA cities. The evidence suggests a refinement for MLG theory in the context of LIA countries by taking into account the role of power and communication within the emerging economic, social and political pressures at the local level and the need to take into account the vital role of individual actors, institutions and planning process as they respond to and shape policies imposed by higher levels. It also identifies the important role of international level non-government organisations play in setting, or at least, influencing national and local policy agenda.
Acknowledgements

Alhamdulilahi Rabbil Alamien, a PhD journey is a memorable experience that teaches me a lot about important things in life especially knowing my own ‘self’, to see who I am and what I like best in my life. I enjoyed my study life so much with all its ups and downs, it’s a privilege of being a student and doing an independent research. The feeling of isolation was also existed, but guidance and helps were always on the way whenever I need it the most.

I must first thank Imran Muhammad and Jeff McNeill, my supervisors at Massey University, who made it possible for me to undertake and complete this research project. I really appreciate their time, assistance, critical feedback and encouragement, as these have been crucial for the successful completion of my research project.

I would like to thank the New Zealand Government for providing me with the New Zealand Development Scholarships (NZDS) to study at Massey University where I was able to pursue my research interest in urban and regional planning. The international support office at Massey University, Sylvia Hooker and her team were also a great help with the administrative and wellbeing matters.

I would also like to thank Alannah Ryan, the former head of School, People, Environment and Planning at Massey, and Glenn Banks, the new head of the School, together with all the staff, Mary Roberts, Kevin Butler, Amy Tootell, Faye Sherriff and Rose McLean, for their great help with administration and logistics matters during my stay at Massey. I am really grateful to Caroline Miller, who helped in the early stage of my PhD journey. Special thanks to Paul Perry and his family and Bryan Ponter as well for their time spent listening to my confusing thoughts when I was writing this research project. You are part of my life too!

My PhD friends in Room 3.07, Waheed, Axel, Ross, Hina, Amelia, Andrew, and Camille, thank you so much for listening to my talks. My best friends, Nur Iskhamiati and Leny Maryouri in Jakarta, Asmad Kari in Malaysia and Sharini Shomasiri in Srilanka, thank you for your great supports. My friends from Indonesia (Nina, Lili, Norma, Erika, Muti, Hera, Darni, Bachtiar, Jatnika, Jermi, Yulfia, Yuni, Neneng, and others), Malaysia (Rai,
Shu, Khairul), especially 42 Ward Street girls (Fatin, Yana, Dayah, Wana, Sheril, Leeza), Pakistan (Sadia, Syma, Shazrah, Sofia, Rubab, Khadija), Africa (Pili, Fred, Moshi, Dorcas), PNG (Dora, Carol, Cynthia) and from other countries that I met in Palmy. Sister Amatullah from Whanganui, thank you so much.

I extend my warm thanks to all my research participants in Surabaya, Bandung, and Jakarta, who helped me to conduct my research by sharing their experience and knowledge about urban transport problems, which enriched the information that I obtained from the text books and articles. I enjoyed the fieldwork experiences and had the opportunity to meet people from diverse backgrounds in the process of learning more about my research topic. My classmate in Gadjah Mada University, Tory Damantoro has helped me with the contact persons and supported with his own experiences in dealing with urban transport policy and planning in Indonesia.

I would also like to thank Julia Rayner at the Graduate Research School (GRS), together with Fiona McKinsey for their very kind assistance. Lois Wilkinson, Julia Tanner and Tania Waitere at the Student Learning Centre (SLC) for improving my writing skill during the course of my PhD life at Massey. Also, I would like to acknowledge the help and assistance of my big brother from Pakistan, Dr. Abdul Rehman Cheema, who had spending his time reading my chapters and comments on my writing.

The Governor of NTB Province, Bapak Dr. TGB HM Zainul Majdi, the Provincial Secretary of NTB Province (Dr. H. Rosiady Sayuti), the Head of BAPPEDA of NTB Province, Bapak Ridwan Syah, Bapak Chairul Mahsul, Bapak H. Makchul and his family, my colleagues in the BAPPEDA NTB and my best friends in Lombok (Yuliati, Chandra, Nyimas, Rini Krisna), thank you so much for your prayers, support and trust in my ability to get my thesis done.

Lastly, to my parents (Ajie and Umie), my brothers and sister (Anton, Amie, Jefry, Ewie), my big family in Lombok, Dompu and Bima. I hope I can contribute more to the development of urban transport in Indonesia in the near future. Terima kasih banyak.

Palmerston North, December 2016
Eka
# Table of Contents

Abstract i
Acknowledgements ii
Table of Contents iv
List of Tables viii
List of Figures ix
List of Abbreviations x
Indonesian terms xii
Introduction 1

Chapter 1 Complexities of urban transport in low-income Asian cities 5
  1.1. Introduction 5
  1.2. Urban transport and climate change issues 5
  1.3. Features and characteristics of medium-sized low-incomes Asian cities 6
    1.3.1. Urbanisation in LIA cities 6
    1.3.2. Compact urban forms and travel characteristics 8
    1.3.3. Transport and environmental characteristics in LIA cities 9
    1.3.4. Solutions offered to urban transport problems in LIA cities 11
  1.4. The challenges of multi-level governance for LIA cities 11
  1.5. Multi-level planning policy issues and responses in Indonesia 16
    1.5.1. System for the development of planning and policies 17
    1.5.2. Spatial and sectoral planning 19
    1.5.3. Urban transport projects 20
  1.6. Summary 24

Chapter 2 Conceptualising policy tensions in LIA cities 25
  2.1. Introduction 25
  2.2. Governance and multi-level governance 25
    2.2.1. Governance 26
    2.2.2. Multi-level governance 30
  2.3. Power, communication, and participation 33
    2.3.1. Power in multi-level governance structure 33
    2.3.2. Legitimacy, communication, and participation 36
  2.4. Multi-level governance in Europe and LIA 38
2.4.1. Multi-level governance in the EU
2.4.2. Multi-level governance in the Low-Income Asia
2.4.3. Comparison of multi-level governance in Europe and LIA cities
2.5. Theoretical framework
2.6. Summary

Chapter 3 Research Design

3.1. Introduction
3.2. Qualitative research
3.3. Case study approach and selecting the case study
3.4. Research ethics
  3.4.1. Ethics and ethical behaviour
  3.4.2. Research permits in Indonesia
  3.4.3. Positionality and reflectivity
3.5. Data collection methods
  3.5.1. Policy and planning documents
  3.5.2. Semi-structured interviews
  3.5.3. Experts’ connections and views
  3.5.4. Media data
  3.5.5. Fieldwork reflections
3.6. Approaches to data analysis
  3.6.1. Policy document analysis
  3.6.2. Institutional analysis
  3.6.3. Stakeholder analysis
  3.6.4. Discourse analysis
3.7. Research limitations
3.8. Summary

Chapter 4 Transport planning and policies in Indonesia

4.1. Introduction
4.2. Transport and climate change decision-making in Indonesia
  4.2.1. Government organisations
  4.2.2. International organisations
  4.2.3. Non-government organisations
4.3. Transport and climate change policies in Indonesia
  4.3.1. Environment and climate change policy

v
4.3.2. National development planning system 98
4.3.3. Transport policy 102
4.3.4. Spatial planning policy 105
4.3.5. Energy policy 107
4.3.6. Economic policies 108
4.4. Summary 109

Chapter 5 Transport planning and policies in Bandung 111
5.1. Introduction 111
5.2. Personal experience of commuting in Bandung 111
5.3. Bandung urban transport challenges and emerging opportunities 115
  5.3.1. Economic growth, urbanization, and urban form 115
  5.3.2. Increasing road construction and motorization 117
  5.3.3. Air pollution problems 117
  5.3.4. Declining public transport patronage 118
5.4. Transport decision-making in Bandung 121
  5.4.1. Stakeholders in the decision-making 121
  5.4.2. BRT decision-making in Bandung 128
5.5. Bandung transport policy review 131
  5.5.1. Urban spatial planning policy 131
  5.5.2. Urban development planning policy 134
  5.5.3. Climate change policy 136
  5.5.4. Urban transport policy 136
  5.5.5. Bandung BRT studies 138
5.6. Policy tensions in the BRT project 140
  5.6.1. Institutional-financial power of higher level governments 140
  5.6.2. Socio-political power 146
  5.6.3. Discourses in advancing BRT in Bandung 151
  5.6.4. Communication and participation gaps 153
5.7. Summary 158

Chapter 6 Transport planning and policies in Surabaya 160
6.1. Introduction 160
6.2. Personal experience of commuting in Surabaya 160
6.3. Surabaya urban transport challenges and opportunities 161
  6.3.1. Economic role of Surabaya 161
List of Tables

Table 1.1 : Modal split in selected Asian cities 9
Table 2.1 : Contemporary MLG studies in different sectors 51
Table 4.1 : Government agencies and their responsibilities 87
Table 4.2 : Musrenbang at multi-level government 100
Table 4.3 : The hierarchy of development plans in Indonesia 101
Table 5.1 : Details of Corridor 1, 2 and 3 of the TMB project 121
Table 5.2 : The chronology of BRT in Bandung 130
Table 6.1 : Functions of central government organisations in transport policy 170
Table 6.2 : Comparison of rail-based and bus-based 186
List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Overview of population distribution in Asian cities 7
Figure 2.1: Theoretical frameworks for studying multi-level policy tensions in LIA cities, derived from the power cube model by Gaventa (2006) 60
Figure 4.1: The structure of government in Indonesia 86
Figure 4.2: Low carbon development strategy 99
Figure 4.3: Road length based on the type of surface materials during 1987-2012 (Km) 102
Figure 4.4: Motor vehicle ownership by type between 1987 and 2012 103
Figure 4.5: Planning and policy documents at central, provincial, and city level in Indonesia 106
Figure 5.1: Waiting passengers of *angkot* in Bandung 112
Figure 5.2: Trans Metro Bandung (TMB) bus in operation 113
Figure 5.3: TMB station in Jalan Sudirman, Bandung 114
Figure 5.4: Bandung’s existing city centre and new urban centres 116
Figure 5.5: Planned routes for Trans Metro Bandung (TMB) project 120
Figure 5.6: Provincial government organisations 124
Figure 5.7: City government organisations 125
Figure 5.8: BRT decision-making in Bandung 129
Figure 5.9: Bandung Transport Master Plan 137
Figure 5.10: The protest during the initial launch of Bandung’s BRT 150
Figure 6.1: Minibuses (*lyn*) and road use by public 161
Figure 6.2: Map of Surabaya 162
Figure 6.3: Maps of toll roads in Surabaya 164
Figure 6.4: Total numbers of cars and motorcycles during 2000 and 2011 166
Figure 6.5: Provincial government organisations 172
Figure 6.6: City government organisations 173
Figure 6.7: Proposed plan for BRT corridors in Surabaya 182
Figure 6.8: Local public demonstration to save Mayor Risma 199
# List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADB</td>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAPPENAS</td>
<td>Ministry of National Development Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPJT</td>
<td>Badan Pengatur Jalan Tol (Indonesian Toll-Road Authority)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRT</td>
<td>Bus Rapid Transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLU</td>
<td><em>Badan Layanan Umum</em>, Public Service Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BUMD</td>
<td><em>Badan Usaha Milik Daerah</em>, Local Government Owned Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMEA</td>
<td>Coordinating Ministry of Economic Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMSA</td>
<td>Coordinating Ministry of Social Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNG</td>
<td>Compresses Natural Gases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPS</td>
<td>Country Partnership Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAK</td>
<td>Special Allocation Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAMRI</td>
<td><em>Djawatan Angkoetan Motor Repoeblik Indoenesia</em>, the state-owned bus operator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAU</td>
<td><em>Dana Alokasi Umum</em>, General Allocation Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DED</td>
<td>Detail Engineering Design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>Germany Technical Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICLEI</td>
<td>International Council for Local Environment Initiatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IGES</td>
<td>Institute for Global Environmental Strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IndII</td>
<td>Indonesia Infrastructure Initiative, Australian Government funded project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITDP</td>
<td>Institute for Transportation and Development Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JICA</td>
<td>Japan International Cooperation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KAI</td>
<td><em>Kereta Api Indonesia</em>, Indonesian railway company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KITA</td>
<td>Kitakyushu International Techno-cooperative Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPU</td>
<td><em>Koordinator Pengawas Unit</em>, Unit Control Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIA</td>
<td>Low-income Asian cities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEMR</td>
<td>Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MERR</td>
<td>Middle Eastern Ring Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLG</td>
<td>Multi-level governance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoE</td>
<td>Ministry of Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoF</td>
<td>Ministry of Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoHA</td>
<td>Ministry of Home Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoT</td>
<td>Ministry of Transport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoPW</td>
<td>Ministry of Public Works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSOE</td>
<td>Ministry of State-Owned Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUHEC</td>
<td>Massey University Human Ethic Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Government Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORGANDA</td>
<td>Organisasi Pengusaha Angkutan Darat, Land Transport Owners Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paratransit</td>
<td>Transport service owned and operated by individuals and the private sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKN</td>
<td>Pusat Kegiatan Nasional, Centre of national activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>Public-Private Partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROPEDA</td>
<td>Pola Dasar Pembangunan Daerah, Local development fundamental patterns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REPETADA</td>
<td>Rencana Pembangunan Tahunan Daerah, Annual urban development plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RKP</td>
<td>Rencana Kerja Pemerintah, Annual national development work plan (1-year plan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RKPD</td>
<td>Rencana Kerja Pemerintah Daerah, Annual provincial/city development work plan (1-year plan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPJMD</td>
<td>Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Daerah, Provincial/City medium-term development plan (5-year plan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPJMN</td>
<td>Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional, National Medium-Term Development Plan (5-year plan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPJPD</td>
<td>Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Panjang Daerah, Provincial/City long-term development plan (20-year plan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPJPN</td>
<td>Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Panjang Nasional, National long-term development plan (20-year plan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTRW</td>
<td>Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah, Spatial development plan (30-year plan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SERR</td>
<td>Surabaya Eastern Ring Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUTIP</td>
<td>Sustainable Urban Transport Improvement Project</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Indonesian terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Angkot</em></td>
<td>A popular local transport service in Bandung that owned and operated by individuals and the private sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Becak</em></td>
<td>Non-motorised three-wheeler vehicles (cycle rickshaw)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kampung</em></td>
<td>Informal housing/settlements in urban and rural areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Lyn</em></td>
<td>Local minibuses in Surabaya own by individual and private with 9-12 passengers seat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Musrenbang</em></td>
<td><em>Musyawarah Perencanaan Pembangunan</em>, public consultation for development planning at village, sub-district, city, provincial and national government levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ojek</em></td>
<td>Motorcycle taxi uses as informal public transport services provided by individual owners</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>