

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

THE EFFECTS OF INTEGRATION OF NEW ZEALAND'S
ROMAN CATHOLIC SCHOOLS

by

E. ANNE ATKINS, B.A.(HONS), DIP ED.

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of
Master of Arts in Sociology, Massey University, New Zealand (1984).



UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
LIBRARY

FOR
Reference Only
NOT TO BE REMOVED FROM THE LIBRARY

1084029323



CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES	ii
LIST OF FIGURES	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vi
ABSTRACT	vii
PREFACE	ix
CHAPTER ONE : THE INTEGRATION OF NEW ZEALAND'S ROMAN CATHOLIC SCHOOLS	1
CHAPTER TWO : THE COST OF INTEGRATION OF NEW ZEALAND'S ROMAN CATHOLIC SCHOOLS	24
CHAPTER THREE : THE SPECIAL CHARACTER OF NEW ZEALAND'S ROMAN CATHOLIC SCHOOLS	64
CHAPTER FOUR : STATE SCHOOL/ROMAN CATHOLIC SCHOOL CATHOLICS : A COMPARATIVE RESEARCH	89
CHAPTER FIVE : WAS IT WORTH IT?	125
FOOTNOTES	147
APPENDICES : A - INTRODUCTORY LETTER TO SCHOOL PRINCIPALS AND PARENTS OF STATE SCHOOL CATHOLICS IN RESEARCH	148
B - SAMPLE DESIGN AND FIELD WORK	149
C - STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE	150
D - HOUSING LOAN APPLICATION SAMPLE	152
E - DEED OF AGREEMENT SAMPLE FOR INTEGRATION	154
F - LETTER MINISTER OF EDUCATION TO EAA (15 MARCH 1984) - HOUSING CORPORATION LOANS TO CATHOLIC SCHOOLS	169
BIBLIOGRAPHY	170

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. 1 Pupils in New Zealand Schools	10
1. 2 Lay Teachers in New Zealand Catholic Schools (Per cent)	10
1. 3 Teacher-Pupil Ratio in New Zealand Catholic Schools	11
1. 4 Primary School Rolls 1977/82	22
2. 1 Catholic Numbers (1981)	28
2. 2 Hamilton Diocese Primary Schools: Existing Debts and Estimated Costs of Integration (November 1982)	33
2. 3 Hamilton Diocese Secondary Schools: Existing Debts and Estimated Costs of Integration (November 1982)	34
2. 4 Palmerston North Diocese Total Cost for Primary Schools Integration (September 1983)	39
2. 5 Palmerston North Diocese Total Cost for Secondary Schools Integration (September 1983)	40
2. 6 Hawkes Bay Deanery Parish Levies (September 1983)	41
2. 7 Wanganui Deanery Parish Levies (September 1983)	41
2. 8 Palmerston North Diocese Pre-Integration Debt (1982)	42
2. 9 Dunedin Diocese Catholic Primary School Rolls (1962/66/82)	44
2.10 Christchurch Diocese Integration Budget (April 1983)	45
2.11 Wellington Diocese Total Cost for Primary Schools Integration (September 1983)	46
2.12 Wellington Diocese Total Cost for Secondary Colleges Integration (September 1983)	47
2.13 National Cost of Integration to Catholic Church	49
2.14 Government Grants to Catholic Schools 1977-1981	53
2.15 Cost of Integration to the Government 1977-1983	53
2.16 Church Costs by Dioceses Summary for Integration	61
2.17 State Costs (to date) for Integration	62
2.18 Housing Corporation Loans for Integration 1970-1984	62
3. 1 Staffing in Catholic Primary Schools 1975-1983	70
3. 2 Staffing in Catholic Secondary Schools 1975-1983	70

Table		Page
4.20	Belief in Jesus in Tabernacle by Type of School (Percentage)	108
4.21	Belief in Jesus in Tabernacle (Yes) by Type of School by Class/Form (Percentage)	109
4.22	Belief in the Holy Spirit by Type of School (Percentage)	109
4.23	Belief in the Holy Spirit (Yes) by Type of School by Class/Form (Percentage)	110
4.24	Summary: Catholic Practice by Type of School	111
4.25	Catholic Belief by Type of School	116

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure		Page
4. 1	Catholic Practice by Type of School (Summary)	123
4. 2	Catholic Belief by Type of School (Summary)	124

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Numerous people have contributed to the success of this research project, and the author would like to thank them for their valuable time and interest. Special thanks are due to a few, who prefer to remain anonymous, who supplied vital data, contacts and much appreciated support to me throughout this study.

To the Members of Parliament, Government Departments and Catholic Authorities who patiently answered queries - thank you. To all those who left queries unanswered and data unsupplied - thank you for increasing the author's determination to seek the truth.

To the Sociology Department of Massey University - thank you for arranging the computerizing of the data.

The author gratefully acknowledges the co-operation of the Principals, staff and pupils of the four Catholic research schools. In particular she would like to thank the many parents of State school Catholics for their overwhelming support and consent to the research questionnaire. Without them the comparative research would have been impossible.

Words cannot express my gratitude to my two supervisors Professor Graeme Fraser and Professor Ivan Snook for their untiring patience, encouragement and personal attention to detail.

Finally to Denise Martin, who so ably typed the final draft, many thanks.

ABSTRACT

The principle aim of this thesis was to investigate Integration, in particular the integration of Roman Catholic Schools in New Zealand. By March 1983 every Roman Catholic School had integrated (258).¹

Historically, in the 1960's and early 1970's, 252 teaching Religious left their schools, many left religious life. Their defection created a spiritual problem, disillusioned youth left the Church. At this point, the Catholic Authorities missed an opportunity: to investigate causes of the spiritual malaise and to ask serious questions about whether Catholic schools were the best solution to it. Instead they turned a spiritual problem into a financial one by replacing the religious with paid lay staff. In turn, this financial problem became a political one, with the Catholic Authorities seeking increased Government assistance to their schools. In 1973, the Labour Party, in Government, called a State Aid Conference from which a Steering Committee drafted the concept of Integration, in 1975, to become a Bill (Act?).

This controversial Private Schools Conditional Integration Act, termed the 'shotgun wedding', steamrolled through the dying session of Parliament amidst continual protest from the National Party, in Opposition. The Act provided for the conditional and voluntary integration of private schools into the State system on a basis in which their special character is preserved and safeguarded. Special character is the Trojan Horse inserted into a Bill that has had the effect of jeopardising the goodwill hard won by many Catholics in New Zealand regarding their schools.

With Integration, the Roman Catholic Bishops agreed to meet the up-grading costs of all New Zealand Catholic Schools before the State is

prepared to take over their future maintenance. Few non-Catholic Private Schools went ahead with this upgrading integration condition having got what they wanted: a continuance of State Aid. This serious financial commitment signed for all Roman Catholic schools has caused a financial crisis within the Catholic Church diverting money and energy from other Church projects and neglecting Catholic children in State schools.

Besides the enormous cost to the Catholic Church, millions of dollars of Housing Corporation money is loaned to Roman Catholic schools for two-thirds² of their cost at a time of loan cut-backs. Whilst State schools are drastically cut back financially there appears to be no cut back financially of Government money to integrated schools. Bitterness and ill-feeling is mounting in the State sector. What a cost to the Catholic Church for it seems their spiritual problem that became a financial problem, then a political one is boomeranging back as a spiritual problem. A questionnaire on Faith (taken from the Baptismal questions) and on practice (from Canon Law) was given, as part of this thesis, to Catholic children in State schools and in Roman Catholic schools, under exactly the same conditions [State school Catholics score higher in Faith]. Was it worth it to pour millions of dollars into a system, from which 600 religious had left since Integration, and which still claims to have a special character belonging to the Roman Catholic church, with half its lay-staff non-Catholics?

PREFACE

This thesis arose from a probing into why youth who had been educated at Roman Catholic schools were leaving the Church. From many interviews, the blame often seemed levied at their education. Therefore, the starting point was Catholic schools. Contact was made with every university in New Zealand for research on Roman Catholic schooling. None was found. At this stage Catholic Authorities had agreed to integrate all schools at a cost of over \$60million. It was assumed that before facing such a cost their product would have been tested. Requests for research studies into the effectiveness of Roman Catholic schools was made to those involved only to find there was no such research done on their New Zealand schools. It just seemed to be taken for granted that they were effective despite the drop-out rate of youth from the Church after years of Catholic schooling.

The author sought overseas studies on Catholic Education. From this began a correspondence with Michael Hornsby-Smith who, as a Catholic Sociologist and lecturer at the University of Surrey, undertook research into the religious outcomes from Catholic schools in England and Wales. He realised that the Catholic community in England and Wales had devoted much of its energy and resources to the establishment and maintenance of schools, yet vital questions concerning their academic and religious outcomes remained unanswered because the necessary research had not been undertaken.

Through corresponding with Professor William McCready, sociologist at Loyola University of Chicago, who had also studied Catholic schools, contacts were given for Australian research workers which the author followed through. Fahy had undertaken a research into the effectiveness of some Australian Catholic schools.

With this background knowledge, obtained from all available books on Catholic Education, including recent Vatican findings, the author concentrated next on Integration. Whilst most private religious schools judged that integration was not in their best interests the Bishops of New Zealand chose integration for all their schools.

Maureen Wilson's thesis on State Aid to Private Schools proved valuable introductory material, followed by the blue book of the Steering Committee for integration. John Joliff, Integration Officer, Department of Education, supplied valuable background material together with a copy of an integration agreement. Personal contact through telephone and letters with Joliff, formed the primary source of this introductory section. The Honourable Merv Wellington, Minister of Education, kindly supplied further initial background material. Colin McGeorge and Ivan Snook's book Church, State and New Zealand Education, provided useful background information.

Early in the thesis it was decided that a back-up study was needed on the outcomes of Catholic schooling. The product must measure the cost. So a questionnaire was planned which would test the faith and practice of Catholic children of both Catholic schools and State schools. Two prominent priests, one an educationist, the other a theologian, approved the questionnaire as a suitable gauge of faith and practice.

The next step involved access to Catholic schools. This proved difficult. At first strong opposition seemed to halt the research. Then, after the approval of one school Principal, the others agreed but on condition that their schools would not be identified in the thesis. To safeguard this confidentiality it was imperative that no differentiation by sex should be given in the Tables of Chapter Four.

Once the Catholic schools questionnaires were completed, the next step spanned three months of personal interviewing by the author of State school Catholics in their homes, with their parent's prior approval. It was essential that the author administer all questionnaires so that there be perfect uniformity for comparative research.

All questionnaires were then forwarded to the Computer Centre at Massey University for processing of data.

Because Integration is a controversial issue it has received considerable attention by the press, especially the two Catholic Weeklies: The Tablet and Zealandia. The newspaper study provided continual amounts of information for this thesis.

Added to these were private interviews with Pat Hault, 9 May 1983, at his Executive Office for Catholic Education in Wellington; with Father O'Neill, SM, one of the original negotiators for Integration; with Marshall, Labour MP (by phone); Jack Mulheron, Society for the Protection of Public Education (by phone), and with some involved in Private religious schools in New Zealand, which chose against integration.

Numerous letters sought information from Catholic Diocesan Education Offices, regarding cost of Integration. Unfortunately the author met with unexpected secrecy, especially in the Auckland Diocese. Though the Bishop recommended this information be made available for thesis purposes, it was still withheld. Right up to the eleventh hour the author tried to obtain this data. Bishop Gaines, Hamilton, strongly recommended that the finance data presented to Government of all Diocese cost be made available to bring the thesis up to date, but this too was refused. The data was kept secret. During the negotiations (late 1983) with Government the author sought this

information from the Minister of Education three times, and finally tried under the Information Act but no Diocesan figures were given. Letters remained unanswered, costs remained secret. The Labour Education spokesman Marshall MP, in an interview by telephone, admitted knowing nothing of the Catholic submission to Government which in January of 1984 secured for Catholic schools a further \$6.6million of Housing Corporation money at 7.5 per cent.

Apart from the Minister's refusal to provide finance data, it was only within the Catholic sector that information was withheld. Government Offices, such as Housing Corporation and Department of Education untiringly answered queries. Executive members of the New Zealand Educational Institute for State Primary teachers and the Post Primary Teachers Association readily made all requested data available. This thesis is a result of such data. It was carried out for the good of the Roman Catholic Church. The author hopes it to be a stimulus to further sociological research.