

© Ariadne Menzel-Bruhin 2016

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. The thesis may not be reproduced in any form in whole, or in part, elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Making Meaning through Movement:
Hiking the Cathar Trail in the South of France**

**A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of**

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Social Anthropology

**at Massey University, Albany,
New Zealand.**

Ariadne Menzel-Bruhin

2016

ABSTRACT

This thesis explores how meaning is formed through movement. It argues that the way in which hikers perceive, experience and make sense of their environment is contingent on their movement. Specifically, it explores walkers' lived experiences and perceptions of their environments on a long-distance hiking trail. The thesis is based on participant observation on the Cathar Trail in the south of France in 2013 and on archival research. The Cathar Trail lends itself to such an investigation because it invites visitors who are intent on hiking and on the history of the Cathars, a persecuted thirteenth-century religious minority. To interrelate processes of interpretation and interaction in an anthropological perspective, I adopt a phenomenological approach and Ingold's (2000a) ecological approach to human-environment interaction in combination with interdisciplinary and interpretative approaches.

The thesis situates hikers' journeys in socio-political and geographical contexts by deconstructing the twentieth-century historical narratives, heritage discourses and sites (ruined fortresses) which are the basis of the Trail. I then show that hikers came to know the Trail through their physical engagement with their environments. To highlight that walkers' environment-related movement was constitutive of their sense of place, I propose the holistic concept of *terroir* as an alternative to 'landscape'. My discussion of wayfinding demonstrates that hikers made their own way, shaped by movement, topography, sensory perception, technologies and other hikers. I show that walking the Cathar Trail produces a knowledge particular to people's bodily movement along a path and to histories.

Crucially, I develop the theory of a hiking spatiality which is generated by, and specific to, hikers' movement along the Trail. Locally specific but encompassing in its scope, the thesis seeks a common ground in movement. Throughout, I use photographs to engage the reader through intimated and intuited bodily experience. Interweaving epistemology and methodology, the thesis is at one and the same time about meaning-making in movement and is in itself a form of knowledge formed from movement (in particular through the employed 'walking-with' method) according to a research agenda.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful to the walkers and residents along the Cathar Trail and to tourism agents and Cathar enthusiasts in the urban centres connected to the Trail for sharing their journey, their knowledge, accommodation, food and networks with me. Thank you for your inspiration and encouragement! En particulier, merci aux Apôtres et au groupe belge!

I thank my supervisors Prof Kathryn Rountree and Dr Graeme Macrae for their support. Thank you Kathryn for your enthusiasm, trust and patience and the advice to ‘tell it as it is’ and not to silence my thesis journey in an effort to appear more scholarly. Thank you Graeme for giving me more to think with and reminding me of the reader.

I think back and marvel at how and where things can take us and here I am deeply grateful to Anthropology and Cultural History staff at the University of Aberdeen, and to Prof Tim Ingold in particular, for introducing me to social anthropology, for fuelling my interest and for fostering my development in the discipline. For their stimulating suggestions and new perspectives, I am grateful to participants at the ASAA/NZ and CEAD conferences in New Zealand and the *Movements, Narratives & Landscapes* conference in Zadar (Croatia) in 2015.

I also wish to acknowledge the assistance of the New Zealand Government in funding my research through a New Zealand International Doctoral Research Scholarship and Massey University’s Doctoral Scholarship and Graduate Research Fund. The Massey University Ethics Committee gave me permission to conduct field research. In the context of everyday life, I appreciated the Massey Albany librarians who reminded me to ‘eat’ not just books when once again I had a pile of requested books waiting for me.

I am grateful to Margaret for always being there and for her trust even though I managed to get us lost on Waiheke Island. Regarding my writing, I am also grateful to James for his interest and perspicacity and to Debora for her encouragement and advice. Thank you also to the PhD office ladies for the chats and laughter we shared and to my Iranian family away from home for their nourishing care.

In particular, I owe my brother who facilitated my return from the field and covered my back throughout these years. And my mother who helped me to regain ground in the not-as-yet-field, when I was adrift in the streets of Port-la-Nouvelle with my luggage amiss and the phone to my ear. When my thinking became too thesis-bound in the following years, she would remind me of the importance and freedom of the imagination: do not forget to dream.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT.....	iii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	v
LIST OF FIGURES.....	ix
GLOSSARY.....	xiii
CHAPTER 1: Introduction.....	1
Travelling through space and time? Project(ed) aims.....	3
Stepping out: methods.....	11
Devising a thesis from hiking perceptions and experiences.....	15
Conclusion.....	19
CHAPTER 2: Setting things up: many 'histories' and one trail.....	21
Cathar 'histories': a historiography.....	22
Where are the Cathars? History on the ground.....	23
Who are the Cathars (and their historians)?.....	29
Why the Cathars? Shadow and light.....	37
The making of the Cathar Trail.....	41
The Cathar Trail project: origins.....	42
Belonging: the Cathar Trail network.....	45
A trail with a cultural theme: hiking with history.....	48
Conclusion: hiking histories.....	53
CHAPTER 3: Coming to know the Cathar Country.....	57
The Cathar Country project.....	58
Medieval monuments and more.....	68
Cathar representations.....	78
Conclusion: a trail <i>in</i> and castles <i>of</i> the Cathar <i>Country</i>	84
CHAPTER 4: A trail with(out) castles, a hiking sense of place.....	87
To walk in nature: motivations.....	89
Time out ..., time in ..., no time: performing authenticity.....	97
<i>Terroir</i> : a sense of place.....	111
Conclusion: Trail-making.....	120

CHAPTER 5: Maps and markers: going off Trail	123
The lost place of maps	126
Waymarkings: between place and map	135
Transition: between interpretation and experience.....	142
CHAPTER 6: Finding and making the way.....	147
A way through the senses	148
Making the way together.....	159
Conclusion: many ways but one in experience.....	169
CHAPTER 7: Movement and meaning: walking the land with the Cathars.....	171
Conscious walking on and off the Trail	172
The spirituality of self and environment	183
‘Découverte profonde des Terres Cathares’: movement, places, histories	189
Conclusion: moving as a way of knowing	202
CHAPTER 8: Hiking spatiality: body-movement-space	205
‘I’ve been over there’: outlining the journey	206
‘I am going there’: hiking spatiality	221
‘I am here’: lived experience	238
Conclusion: experience and perception	251
CHAPTER 9: Methodology: thinking-moving-writing.....	253
Researching in movement.....	253
No stepping back: embodied field experience.....	262
The issue of representation	273
Conclusion: in retrospect	281
CHAPTER 10: Conclusion.....	283
Moving through meaning: chapter recapitulation	284
Hiking is not a metaphor: contribution to knowledge.....	286
Reflecting on the research process.....	288
Practice and theory: difficulties and possibilities	289
And a continuing learning process	291
BIBLIOGRAPHY	293
APPENDICES.....	331
APPENDIX 1: Information Sheets and Consent Forms	331
APPENDIX 2: Interview Guides.....	337
APPENDIX 3: Lyrics	343

LIST OF FIGURES

All photographs in this thesis were taken by the author during fieldwork unless otherwise indicated.

Figure 1.1. The geographical location of the Cathar Trail	2
Figure 1.2. This map shows relevant travel routes	3
Figure 2.1. Juxtaposition of the two religions.....	24
Figure 2.2. Two sequences in one mural on the wall of an abbey	25
Figure 2.3. The mystical Cathar aura	31
Figure 2.4. Staged joust with Carcassonne as a backdrop	37
Figure 2.5. Inside the Museum of Catharism in Mazamet.....	41
Figure 2.6. The Cathar Trail itinerary from the sea to the town of Foix.....	42
Figure 2.7. Looking out from the Archives départementales.....	45
Figure 2.8. Reunion of history and nature in the Cathar Country	48
Figure 2.9. 1997 – 2001 – 2011: The evolution of a guidebook.....	50
Figure 2.10. Poster on the window of the tourist office in Foix	54
Figure 3.1. The Cathar Country: a network of sites.....	62
Figure 3.2. Signs advertising the castles as historic sites and the Cathar Country	63
Figure 3.3. Forbidden to climb the stairs or onto the wall	70
Figure 3.4. This information panel at the gate to Puilaurens outlines the history.....	73
Figure 3.5. Audio guide advertised on a panel before entering Peyrepertuse.....	76
Figure 3.6. Visitors sitting with handset at Quéribus.....	77
Figure 3.7. Travelling within the <i>Pays Cathare</i> network.....	81
Figure 3.8. The Occitan cross twice.....	83
Figure 3.9. The flag with the Occitan cross, symbol for Occitania.....	86
Figure 4.1. Peyrepertuse is one of the tourist sites named ‘citadelles du vertige’	91
Figure 4.2. The first tourist office on the Trail	97

Figure 4.3. ‘History is at the castle, life at the village’?	102
Figure 4.4. Taking the time for every step at Montségur?	104
Figure 4.5. The Apostles walking together towards the next village	109
Figure 4.6. Enchanting and arduous Quéribus	111
Figure 4.7. ‘Attention: Nature is fragile’	117
Figure 4.8. Vines with Aguilar castle at the back	119
Figure 5.1. Schematic map of the Cathar Trail route	123
Figure 5.2. Cathar Trail guidebook	129
Figure 5.3. Cathar Trail map extract	130
Figure 5.4. Where the Australian couple sits	132
Figure 5.5. The Apostles	134
Figure 5.6. The complete Cathar Trail signage	137
Figure 5.7. Many ways lead to Galamus	140
Figure 5.8. Three markers on a rock by the wayside	140
Figure 6.1. A rocky path from a village to its castle	147
Figure 6.2. The path through the Gorges de la Frau	153
Figure 6.3. View into the gorge from the previous stage	154
Figure 6.4. Enjoying the tranquillity in the morning at a hostel	158
Figure 6.5. The Apostles walking into the gorge	164
Figure 6.6. Interlude in Carcassonne	168
Figure 6.7. Cattle, clouds and a continuing track	170
Figure 7.1. The weight and density of the rock face and vegetation	176
Figure 7.2. The Belgian group walking consciously	178
Figure 7.3. Butterfly, flowers and curiously shaped branches	182
Figure 7.4. Slanting movement	188
Figure 7.5. The ruin participates in our ‘hiking field’	193
Figure 7.6. Rixende with her staff on the way to Montségur	197
Figure 8.1. Approaching each other through the mountain meadow	207

Figure 8.2. Topographic trajectories of movement.....	211
Figure 8.3. About to walk into the next valley in the Corbières	212
Figure 8.4. A tilted hiking horizon on the Trail	219
Figure 8.5. Benches and castle walls orient our perspective.....	229
Figure 8.6. On Peyreperouse.....	233
Figure 8.7. ‘Inside’ Peyreperouse	238
Figure 8.8. In the process of unpacking at the hostel in Duilhac	241
Figure 8.9. A different place	244
Figure 8.10. The first place	244
Figure 8.11. Spatial plasticity in light and dark	248
Figure 8.12. A densely textured and integrated relief of hills, valleys and clouds	249
Figure 8.13. A place for resting in the shade of trees	250
Figure 9.1. Self-reflection	263
Figure 9.2. Reflection by and through others.....	264
Figure 9.3. ‘Hungry as a wolf’ in the village of Cucugnan.....	266
Figure 9.4. Climbing the rough track on the first morning on the Trail.....	268
Figure 9.5. Shut in for the day	273
Figure 9.6. The first evening in the field.....	277
Appendix 3. A ‘colchique’ seen from the Trail	343

GLOSSARY

Association des Sites du Pays Cathare The Association of the Sites of the Cathar Country. A collective organised around central sites (*sites pôles*) of the Cathar Country.

CDR *Comité Départemental de Randonnées* The County Hiking Committee, designer of the Cathar Trail. Later integrated into the FFRP.

CDT *Comité Départemental du Tourisme* The tourism committee of the county.

Conseil Général de l'Aude The General Council of Aude.

Département A smaller administrative division of France than 'region', comparable to a 'county'.

FFRP *Fédération Française de la Randonnée Pédestre* The national French Hiking Federation.

GR *Grande Randonnée* A hiking trail which belongs to the national network of long-distance footpaths owned and run by the FFRP.

A note on translation: Throughout the thesis I have translated into English direct quotes from participants as well as all passages from archival material and from sources listed in another language than English in the Bibliography.

