Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Marine Protected Area: A Case Study in North-Eastern Iloilo, Philippines

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Management in Economics

Massey University
Palmerston North, New Zealand

Cheryl Joy Jardiolin Fernandez
2010
ABSTRACT

Marine Protected Area (MPA), as a fisheries management tool has been promoted by both national and local conservationists and has provided de facto illustrations of integrated coastal management (ICM) in the Philippines. However, conflict is inevitable in the implementation of public policy such as the MPA because of contrasting objectives and expectations from various stakeholders. Coupled with non-human (e.g. MPA size) and human (e.g. mismanagement) threats, conflict becomes a hindrance to MPA effectiveness. In the Philippines alone, only 10-20% of the 500 MPAs are attaining their objectives. This study presents an overview of MPA management and examines the interaction between the civil society and market forces of institutional arrangements in the case of North-Eastern Iloilo (NI) in the Philippines. It discusses overall scenarios that resemble conflict between various national, local and international sectors, assessing MPA success factors and the expected implications from such implementation.

Results from key informant, focus-group discussion and social survey show that there are problems on MPA management in the region. Using data and strategic analyses, it presents that minimisation of conflicts amongst actors should be the primary goal of the NI municipalities. In addition, MPA size and membership to organisations are also significant factors of success. Moreover, the analysis from a simple correlation to complex Principal Component Analysis (PCA) and Canonical Correlation Analysis (CCA) conclude that information on MPA regulation does not directly contribute to the improvement in MPA management. It implies that a focus on informing stakeholders about the benefits of having an MPA and its regulations is ineffective. The focus should be on the reduction of conflict between economic actors - for free riding problems are currently occurring, thus minimising conflict by conflict resolution and
proper incentives. However, there are still remaining challenges on MPA management, for not all factors are incorporated on this study. The challenge now is on how to identify the remaining factors and integrate them into policies and implementations to improve the overall condition of coastal communities.
DEDICATION and ACKNOWLEDGMENT

I dedicate this piece of work to my family: Mama, Papa, and Perry - for whom I owe my achievements.

My thanks and appreciation to Dr. Kim Hang Pham Do and Prof. Anton Meister for persevering with me as my advisors through out the time it took me to complete this study. Thank you for encouraging me to take further steps forward and for supporting me on whatever decision I made on my entire work. For that, I humbly thank you two for believing in me.

I am grateful to all the people who shared their expertise, time, and effort in providing necessary information, especially to the people and government officials of the municipalities of Ajuy, Balasan, Batad, Carles, Concepcion and Estancia. To the Bureau of Protected Areas of the Department of Environment and Natural Resources Regional Office VI (DENR-VI) and to the Iloilo Provincial Capitol, a big thank you for endlessly accommodating my inquiries and requests.

To Dr. Pepito Fernandez Jr. of the University of the Philippines Visayas (UP Visayas), I express my utmost respect and gratitude, for his valuable advices and insights on my study.

I am also thankful to the College of Management in UP Visayas, especially to Dr. Joy C. Lizada for her support on my professional development at the Department of Management.

I want to extend my gratitude to all my colleagues in the Department of Economics and Finance especially to Nilesh Prakash and Zhongwei Xing.
To members of the International Student Support at Massey University, especially to Sylvia Hooker, Olive Pimentel, Sue Flynn and Dianne Riley, who have given their full guidance and humble support on my welfare while studying, I give my appreciation.

I would also like to acknowledge my friends outside the department, especially to, Kunsik Park, Iyah and Stephanie Pimentel, Andree Wallace, Bernadette Haru, Joshua Roldan, Ralph Kaule, Sunema Simati, Lala Komalawati, Jessica Tan, Yen Tesoro, Bandeth Ros, Deepika Naidu, and Reynald Castaneda. I survived and enjoyed my stay in New Zealand, because of the exciting memories they have all shared. My special thank you goes to Marissa Isidro-Sohoo, for her unending friendship and statistical tutorials – I treasure our gaganess together.

I would like to express my thanks to my Asia-NZ Young Leaders Network family, especially to Melanie Crawford, Muhammad Aman Allah, Agus Setwayan, Danaasuren Vandangombo, Nguyen Ba Cuong, for the fun and relationships you all shared with me before and after the forum. To the Asia-NZ Foundation for giving me the opportunity to present my initial works to the International Institute for Fisheries Economics and Trade (IIFET) in Vietnam last July 2008.

My gratitude also goes to Olive Pimentel and family, Jojo, Rey and Alyssa Roldan, Josephine and Bong Flores, Angel and Myrna Carambas, Gina, Dan and Danelle Corpuz, Marissa and Naldo Roldan - for accepting me as a part of your family and for sharing your blessings – I will treasure your true friendships with me.

I also want to express my deep appreciation to my friends back in the Philippines namely, Evelyn Jugado, Paul Erwen Parreño, Amour Mae Co, Jan Eilene Monteclaro, Luth Edmund Apresto, Christine Gavasan, Michelle Tamonan, Marite Borres, Steven Tronco, and
Ahyo. Thank you for your support during my ups and downs. Your constant communications made me feel less homesick!

My appreciation to a lady who made my stay in New Zealand and at Massey University, fun and exciting – Mimi Dogimb. For her unselfishness, advices support, and memories of friendship, I humbly thank her. She is the older sister, I never had.

My gratitude to the New Zealand Development Agency (NZAID) for giving me an opportunity to pursue my higher education as well as in fulfilling my dreams. It is indeed a privilege, on my part, to study and experience New Zealand at its best! 😊
# TABLE of CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION AND ACKNOWLEDGMENT</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>VIII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>XII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF NOTATIONS</td>
<td>XIII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER ONE ~ INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Objectives of the Study</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Outline of the Study</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER TWO ~ FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AND THE CASE STUDY OF NORTH-EASTERN ILOILO, PHILIPPINES</strong></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 The Philippine Macroeconomy, Environment and Natural Resources</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1. The Philippine macroeconomy</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 The Philippine environment and natural resources</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The Philippine Fisheries Management and the Community Resource Management Programme (CRMP)</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 The case study in North-Eastern Iloilo (NI), Philippines</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER THREE ~ MARINE PROTECTED AREA: RELATED LITERATURES</strong></td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 MPAs Involve Human and Ecological Dimensions</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 MPAs in the Philippines: Are they achieving their objectives?</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 MPA and the Role of its Location</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 MPA and the Role of Social Factors</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Conflict as a Disadvantage of MPA Implementation</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Social Survey, Stakeholders’ Perception, and Success Proxies</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER FOUR ~ METHODOLOGY AND DATA COLLECTION</strong></td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 MPA and Human Well-being</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Theoretical and Empirical Analysis of MPA</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Market failure and government intervention</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Three MPA management regimes</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Data Collection</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Survey interview (SI) and social survey questionnaire</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX D: COASTAL MAPS OF NORTH-EASTERN ILOILO

Municipalities ......................................................................................... 127

Appendix D.1: Municipality of Carles, Iloilo, Philippines ............... 127
Appendix D.2: Municipalities of Concepcion and San Dionisio, Iloilo, Philippines ................................................................. 128
Appendix D.3: Municipalities of Batad, Balasan and Estancia, Iloilo, Philippines ................................................................. 129
Appendix D.4: Municipality of Ajuy, Iloilo, Philippines ............... 130

BIBLIOGRAPHY ................................................................................................. 131
LIST of TABLES

Table 1: Percentage Distribution of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of the Philippines .............................................................. 12
Table 2: Study Area: Demographic Profile (NI Municipalities, Philippines) ............................................................................ 30
Table 3: Phases and activities for MPA establishment and management within local government jurisdiction .................... 31
Table 4: Conflict in different Management Regimes in North-Eastern Iloilo, Philippines .......................................................... 62
Table 5: Summary and description of variables for LOGIT regression ......................................................................................... 63
Table 6: Correlation Matrix of Selected Variables ................................................................................................................. 75
Table 7: Behaviour of Fishermen in NI, Philippines ....................... 78
Table 8: Descriptive statistics of selected variables (n=213) ......... 79
Table 9: Eigenvalues of Correlation Matrix ....................................................... 81
Table 10: Correlation (Structure) for Principal Components ........ 82
Table 11: Principal Component Analysis (PCA) Summary Statistics 83
Table 12: Goodness of Fit Tests - General Logit for Conflict Variables ...................................................................................... 90
Table 13: Benefits for Fishermen and Public Sectors in NI, Philippines (PhP, per year) ................................................................. 94
Table 14: Logit model to determine factors associated with MPA SUCCESS1 ........................................................................... 96
Table 15: Logit model to determine factors associated to MPA SUCCESS2 ............................................................................ 97
Table 16: Multivariate tests of significance and approximates F-tests .......................................................... 98
Table 17: Eigenvalues and canonical correlations ......................... 99
Table 18: Canonical Likelihood Ratio and F Values ....................... 99
Table 19: Total-Sample Standardised Canonical Coefficients ...... 100
Table 20: Frequencies of benefits and disbenefits of MPA when complying or not complying ............................................... 105
LIST of FIGURES

Figure 1: Map of North-Eastern Iloilo, Philippines........................................7
Figure 2: Per capita income from 1960-2005 (US$, constant) ............11
Figure 3: Philippine Gross Domestic Product (GDP), 2003-2008 in Million PhP ........................................................................15
Figure 4: Philippine Fish Production from 1996-2005, by Fishing Operations ...............................................................16
Figure 5: Consumptive and Non-consumptive Values of Marine Resource ........................................................................34
Figure 6: Relationships between marine protected areas, coral reef health and human well-being, Adapted from Gjertsen ............52
Figure 7: Score Plots for Principal Component 1 (PC1) and Principal Component 2 (PC2) .........................................................86
Figure 8: Score Plots for Principal Component 1 (PC1) and Principal Component 3 (PC3) .........................................................87
LIST of NOTATIONS

BFAR – Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources
CDA – Canonical Discriminant Analysis
CCA – Canonical Correlation Analysis
CRMP – Coastal Resource Management Programme
DENR – Department of Environment and Natural Resources
DILG – Department of Interior and Local Government
FARMC – Fisheries and Aquatic Resources Management Council
FGD – Focus Group Discussion
GDP/GNP – Gross Domestic Product/Gross National Product
ICM – Integrated Coastal Management
IUCN – International Union for the Conservation of Nature
JICA – Japan International Cooperation Agency
KI Interview – Key Informant Interview
LGU – Local Government Unit
LOGIT function – logistic function
MAO – Municipal Agriculture Officer
MPA – Marine Protected Area
NEDA – National Economic and Development Authority
NSCB – National Statistics Coordination Board
NGO – Non-government Organisation
NI – North-Eastern Iloilo
NIACDEV - Northern Iloilo Alliance for Coastal Development
NSO – National Statistics Office
NZD – New Zealand Dollar
PCA – Principal Component Analysis
PCG – Philippine Coast Guard
PHP – Philippine Peso
PNP – Philippine National Police
PO – People’s Organisation
PAMB – Protected Area Management Board