Copyright is owned by the author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the author.

Repoliticising Development: The Diaspora Knowledge Network (DKN) *ChileGlobal* and its contribution to development in Chile

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements

for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in

Development Studies

at Massey University, Manawatu

New Zealand

by Axel Malecki

2017

Abstract

Throughout the last fifteen years, developing countries have increasingly devised diaspora strategies to tap into their overseas migrant populations for the purpose of achieving national development objectives. Endorsed by multilateral donor organisations, the private sector, NGOs and supported by bilateral donor agencies, diaspora strategies tend to represent diasporic communities as development actors whose entrepreneurial expertise, business knowledge and access to resources can be usefully captured via social and monetary remittances.

However, critical scholarship cautions against simplistic assumptions that underpin the often elite-based attempts of governments to leverage their diasporic collectives via selective policies. Moreover, the so-called 'rise of the diaspora' as a development actor, has also generated concerns suggesting that the state-integration of diasporic groups for development rationalities signifies a process of de-politicisation and control. Building on multi-sited research, this thesis engages with the practices, shifting coalitions and their outcomes of the Chilean diaspora knowledge network *ChileGlobal*.

The *ChileGlobal* knowledge network initially emanated from the World Bank's Diaspora for Development programme in 2005 with the particular goal to foster innovation and economic development in Chile and, as such, was positioned as a distinct economic actor. Through the use of post-structurally informed concepts, and attending to the multiple sites of interaction within *ChileGlobal*, this thesis maps out how attempts to expand the scale and scope of *ChileGlobal* reconfigured and mobilised this knowledge network in unintended and far-reaching ways generating diasporic spaces of contestation and ambivalence.

By tracing the different sites and trajectory of *ChileGlobal*, as well as its politics of expansion that resulted in subsequent change of the constituency of *ChileGlobal* network, this thesis demonstrates how the partial transformation of this diaspora network from an economic to a political actor signifies a narrative that runs counter to broad claims about the depoliticising effects of contemporary development projects. Instead, the diaspora community assembled around *ChileGlobal* is indicative of the malleability and ambiguity of diaspora networks as development actors as well as their potential to challenge existing

public policy orthodoxy and dominant discourses of economic and calculative practices in contemporary Chile. Moreover, this thesis also highlights how simplistic outward focused diaspora strategies often fail to take into account how local, mundane, place based norms and cultures often shape and mediate the transfer of diasporic contributions.

Acknowledgements

This thesis was only made possible because of the goodwill and generosity of the Chilean people who agreed to share their time and insights with me. Most of all, I wish to thank the indomitable Molly Pollack who was immediately open to the idea of writing this thesis and who generously shared contacts, insights and time during a period that was characterised by very difficult professional circumstances for her.

I would also like to thank my supervisors Maria Borovnik and Matt Henry for their unwavering support, trust and belief in me, and whose patience was tested throughout my candidature more than once. In particular, I wish to thank Maria for her critical reading and incisive comments on numerous drafts and, most of all, for her unconditional encouragement. I would also like to extent a special gratitude to Matt for his judicious bibliographical knowledge and his inspiring conceptual, as well as theoretical understanding from which I benefitted tremendously, and of course, for the occasional squash game.

I would like to extend my appreciation to Massey's School of People, Environment and Planning, which provided a highly supportive, accommodating and deeply collegial research and learning environment. In their various capacities, I would like to thank Allanah Ryan, Robyn Andrews and Vicky Walters for their support and encouragement, and Nigel Parsons for trusting me enough to lecture his Politics course, which gave me the opportunity to 'test' and apply insights from this thesis. Within the programme of Development Studies, I am deeply grateful to have had the opportunity of working alongside Gerard Prinsen from whom I have learned a lot, mainly through his determined reluctance in trying to teach me anything and, what seemed to me, a religious trust in my capacity for looking after his course and students. Thank you Gerard! Regina Scheyvens' truly and relentless conviction in pushing for students' interests and development is exceptional, unparalleled and I, without doubt, have greatly benefitted from that. I also thank Emmanuelle Barozet from the Universidad de Chile for her general interest in this thesis' findings. Over the years I have met many postgraduate students and formed warm friendships with Vilayvanh, Dora, Andrew, Amaliah, Ross, Eka and many other NZ-Aid scholars, all of which I would like to thank for sharing not only the companionship and joys, but also the occasional moments of agony and profound despair of this journey.

Additionally, special thanks goes to the institutions that made this research realisable through their financial support, especially the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade through their last round of Ministry administered *Postgraduate Fieldwork Award*, the Massey University People, Environment and Planning *Graduate Research Fund*, and the Massey University Doctoral Scholarship Fund for awarding a *Doctoral Scholarship* and a *Thesis Completion Bursary*. The funding provided not only sustenance for conducting research, but also enabled me to attend conferences such as the IGU/UGI meeting in Santiago de Chile, the 'Highly Skilled Migration' conference at Middlesex University in London, the 'Global Diaspora' conference at Oxford University and the conference of the New Zealand Geographical Society in Napier. I would also like to thank the Scottish contingent at Massey University, Julia Rayner who is the General Manager of the GRS, and John Ross for their good natured encouragement and support throughout my time at Massey.

Lastly, moving to New Zealand in 2006 has not been a decision I made as a result of educational and calculative motivation, but a decision following the relocation of my partner Claudia. Writing this thesis, and the various work commitments that contributed to my sustained absence from home, surely impacted not only on her career as a scientist, but in particular on our evolving family life, and I humbly promise a more balanced and equal sharing of household and child care responsibilities for the years to come. Thank you to my two rascals Annemarie, and Jonah who was born three days prior to my first field trip, for providing the most joyful and imaginable distraction I could have asked for. Your ongoing and unwitting reminders about what really matters in life are a constant source of motivation, sincere happiness and gratitude. I also thank you for implicitly pointing out what seems to be a knowledge dearth about the emotional costs in the context of *fatherhood* and conducting doctoral research.

This thesis is dedicated to the memory of both my parents who instilled a sense of curiosity, and appreciation of autonomy and opportunity in me that was not available to them for the vast majority of their lives and that I do not take for granted.

Table of Contents

Abstract iii

Acknowledgements v

List of tables xii

List of figures xii

List of abbreviations xiii

Chapter One: Thesis Introduction 1

1.1. Introduction 1
1.2. Framing the problem 4
1.3. Thesis organisation 8

Chapter Two: Multiple and contested meanings of diaspora and development 11

2.1. Introduction 11
2.2. Diaspora and transnationalism – defining and clarifying key concepts 11
2.3. Migration and development 15
2.4. Development in, through, and by the diaspora 18
2.5. Re-discovering diasporic contributions 20
2.5.1. Financial remittances 21
2.5.2. Social remittances 24
2.6. Donors and diasporas 26
2.7. Interpreting the contemporary rise and spread of 'diaspora strategies' 27
2.8. Summary 30

Chapter Three: Analysing and conceptualising diaspora knowledge networks 33

3.1. Introduction 33
3.2. Analytical purchase of actor network theory for development research 34
3.2.1. Key insight translation and its significance for knowledge networks 37
3.2.2. Translating and aligning diaspora networks 41
3.3. Depoliticised diasporas 43
3.3.1 The (Anti)-politics of side effects 45
3.3.2. Revisiting the 'anti-politics machine' 47

3.3.3. Carving out a space for the 'political' 49
3.4. Summary 55

Chapter Four: Mapping the historical context around the emergence of *ChileGlobal* ... 57

4.1. Introduction 57
4.2. Transitioning into the knowledge economy 58
4.2.1. Institutionalisation of innovation and knowledge-based development 60
4.2.2. Inception of *ChileGlobal* 61
4.2.3. Institutional entanglement 64
4.2.4. (In)formal meetings and institutional links 69
4.3. Antecedents of policy networks and the rise of economic-technocratic consensus 72
4.3.1. Domestic policy networks 72
4.3.2. International policy networks 75
4.4. The distinct geographies of Chile and *ChileGlobal* 77
4.4.1. Mapping the *ChileGlobal* diaspora 79
4.4.2. Tracing depoliticisation and technocratisation 80
4.5. Summary 84

Chapter Five: Research Methodology 87

5.1. Introduction 87
5.2. Case study methodology 87
5.2.1. Five guiding principles 88
5.2.2. Addressing generalisability 90
5.3. Ethical implications 92
5.4. Fieldwork 95
5.4.1. Participant recruitment 96
5.4.2. Interviews 103
5.4.3. Language in the field 105
5.5. Invoking and navigating multiple positionalities 106
5.6. Online data 110
5.6.1. Trust and rapport online 113
5.6.2. The interview process 114
5.7. Data analysis 115

5.8. Summary 116

Chapter Six: A new institutional framework 119

6.1. Introduction 119
6.2. A new institutional framework and two policy initiatives 120
6.2.1. The effect of branding the country 120
6.2.2. The effect of an educational policy 124
6.3. The new collectives 128
6.3.1. Nexos Chile-USA: The revival of North bound transborder relations 129
6.3.2. Red de Investigadores y Estudiantes Chilenos en UK 135
6.4. Emerging dissent 138
6.4.1. Conditional support 139
6.5. Summary 146

Chapter Seven: Diasporic sites of repoliticisation and contestation 149

7.1. Introduction 149
7.2. The announcement of a proposal 150
7.3. The journey of a proposal 151
7.4. The rise of Encuentros 155
7.5. Becoming a space of contestation 158
7.5.1. Contextualising disputes 161
7.6. Contesting voting rights 166
7.7. Summary 170

Chapter Eight: Contributions, barriers and the complexities of generating change 173

8.1. Introduction 173
8.2. Tensions between the implementation of change and local working cultures 174
8.3. Mobilising knowledge 176
8.4. (De)valorisation of diasporic experience 182
8.5. Webs of relations and reciprocity networks 183
8.6. Institutional bias towards images, words and representation 186
8.7. Personal relationships 190
8.8. Summary 194

Chapter Nine: A discussion of the ambiguities and elusiveness of diasporic contributions to development 197

9.1. Introduction 197
9.2. Institutional changes 199
9.2.1. Understanding network changes 200
9.3. Making sense of, and building a case for repoliticisation 206
9.3.1. Reappraising side effects of 'failure' through unravelling the 'political' ... 208
9.3.2. 'Anti-politics machine' revisited 213
9.4. Socio-cultural norms, institutional bias and the flow of knowledge 217
9.4.1. Institutional bias 217
9.4.2. Invisible 'actors' and institutions 219
9.5. Summary 225

Chapter Ten: Conclusion 229

10.1. Introduction 229
10.2. Contextualising three distinctive thesis contributions 230
10.3. So what? 235
10.4. Final reflections 238

References 241

Appendix 1: Information Sheet (Spanish & English) 281

Appendix 2: Consent Form (Spanish & English) 284

List of tables

Table 1: World Bank funded innovation/knowledge related projects in Chile 66

Table 2: *ChileGlobal* funding 67

Table 3: Distribution of the Chilean diaspora and the *ChileGlobal* diaspora 79

Table 4: Research participants 94

Table 5: A selection of *ChileGlobal* affiliated networks 128

Table 6: Fundación Imagen de Chile 192

List of figures

Figure 1: Three layers of connections 68

Figure 2: 'Gatekeepers and keymasters' 100

Figure 3: Function at Fundación Imagen de Chile 104

Figure 4: Posters announcing *ChileGlobal* seminars China 126

Figure 5: Article "Jóvenes investigadores debaten cómo mejorar la ciencia en Chile . 133

Figure 6: Institutional relations 144

Figure 7: Encuentros conferences series 155

Figure 8: Screenshot of the campaign *Haz to voto volar* 168

Figure 9: Sketching competing translations 202

List of abbreviations

AIP-UChile	Asamblea (Coordinadora) de Estudiantes/Investigadores/as en Postgrado de la Universidad de Chile
ANT	Actor network theory
AoIR	Association of Internet Researchers
BPS	British Psychological Society
APEC	Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation
CBPC	Centro Nacional de la Productividad y la Calidad
CEPAL	Comisión Económica para América Latina y el Caribe
CESEC	Centro de Estudios Socio-Económicos
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CNIC	Consejo Nacional de Innovación para la competividad
CONICYT	Comisión Nacional de Investigación Científica y Tecnológica
CORFO	Corporación de Fomento de la Producción
DICOEX	Dirección para la Comunidad de Chilenos en el Exterior
DKN	Diaspora Knowledge Network
EC	European Commission
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FEES	El Fondo de Estabilización Económica y Social
FIC	Fondo de Innovación para la Competitividad
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
HTAP	High Technology Investment Programme
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
IGU	International Geographical Union
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IOM	International Organisation for Migration
IPD	Initiative for Policy Dialogue
ITT	International Telephone and Telegraph
K4D	Knowledge for Development
KEA	Kiwi Expat Association
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals

MERCOSUR	Mercado Común del Sur
MIT	Massachusetts Institute of Technology
MNC	Multi-National Corporation
MPI	Migration Policy Institute
NDB	New Development Bank
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
ODS	Official Development Assistance
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PBCT	Programa Bicentenario de Ciencia y Technólogica
R&D	Research and Development
RedTicotal	La Red de Talento Costarricense en el Extranjero
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SENCE	Servicio Nacional de Capacitación y Empleo de Chile
SOFOFA	Sociedad de Fomento Fabril
TOKTEN	Transfer of Knowledge Through Expatriate Nationals
UN	United Nations
WTO	World Trade Organisation