Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
The Nature of the Gaze: A conceptual discussion of societal privilege from an indigenous perspective

A thesis submitted for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

at Massey University, SHORE & Whāriki Research Centre
College of Health
Aotearoa New Zealand

Belinda Borell

2017
Abstract

This thesis explores how Kaupapa Māori paradigms can make important contributions to research topics that may not be of direct or immediate relevance to Māori communities. Insights gained from a Kaupapa Māori investigation of white privilege in Aotearoa New Zealand are discussed. I argue that cultural hegemony is maintained through structured forgetting, silence, and suppression of dissent that has dire consequences for dominant cultural groups as well as marginal. Structural racism and privilege are amenable to analyses utilising similar frameworks albeit from opposite sides that can provide valuable insights to understanding inequity more broadly. I also examine ways in which Kaupapa Māori analyses of white privilege can illuminate pathways of redress that will benefit all New Zealanders and provide more embracing perspectives of nationhood.
He Maimai Aroha

Reginald Borell  
15.05.1937 – 02.05.2015

Hori Pomana  
23.12.1954 – 01.01.2017

Alex Whaiapu  
23.03.1929 – 15.12.2015
Acknowledgements

To my parents, Reginald and Marlene Borell. Dad taught me the value of meeting ones commitments. Mum taught me how to keep your head up while you do it.

To the wider Borell/Hibbs/Puhipi whānau. We have been through a lot the last few years and I am so proud of how well we have come together and continue to support each other. Much love to Aunty Ebba and the TeTua/Cooper whanau. Special thanks to taku mahanga, Nigel Borell for all the laughs, challenging korero and deft inclusion in the visual arts and culture arena. Additionally to the Whaiapu and Pomana whānau, he mihi aroha.

To my supervisors Helen Moewaka Barnes and Tim McCreanor. Words cannot express how much I appreciate your support in helping me complete this work and the example your leadership provides for us all. To the broader Whāriki whānau especially Victoria Lesatele, Amanda Gregory, Rangimarie McDowell, Teah Carlson, Tuiloma Lina Samu, Emerald McPhee, Alex McConville, Angela Moewaka Barnes, Jodi Porter, Ken Taiapa, Verne McManus and Wendy Henwood. To Sally Casswell and the SHORE team, especially Lanuola Asiasiga, Penelope Carroll, Caroline Lowe, Lisa Morice and Jan Sheeran for your unwavering help and support. Nga mihi nui kia koutou.

To all the research participants involved in projects about privilege, thank you for sharing your time and thoughts so generously.

To those amazing scholars and activists involved in addressing structural racism and privilege in Aotearoa New Zealand, especially Raymond and Mitzi Nairn, Moana Jackson, Donna Cormack, Ricci Harris, Mahinarangi Maika, Mereana Ruri, Wai Ho, Rhys Jones, Margaret Wetherell, Tracey McIntosh, Ruth DeSouza, Bridget Robson, Papaarangi Reid, Jo Baxter, Martin Tobias, Elana Taipapaki Curtis, Tim Howard, Jenny
Rankine, Avril Bell, Neville Robertson, Rose Black, Ingrid Huygens, Adrian Field, Catherine Delahunty, Miriama Scott, Tanja Dreher, Nancy Krieger, Jane Kelsey and Sue Crengle. Special acknowledgement to Dr Irihapeti Ramsden.

Kura Te Waru Rewiri for her crucial input into this doctoral study. Thanks so much for your patience and continued support. To all the visual arts writers and creators for their inspirational scholarship, especially Nigel Borell, Ngataiharuru Taepa, Saffron Te Ratana, Aimee Ratana, Margaret Aull, Charlotte Graham, Donna Tupaea-Petero, Debbie Tupaea-Adams, Raewyn Tangira, Linda Munn, Peter Boyd, Ngahiraka Mason and Megan Tamati-Quennell. Thanks also to Imogen Greenfield and Tom Irwin from the Auckland Art Gallery Toi o Tamaki for your help with this research.
# Table of Contents

Whakatauāki ............................................................................................................ iii  
Abstract .................................................................................................................. iii  
He Maimai Aroha .................................................................................................... iv  
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................ v  
Introduction ........................................................................................................... 1  
Aims and Objectives: .............................................................................................. 1  
Background ............................................................................................................ 3  
The Nature of the Gaze ........................................................................................... 5  
Racism ................................................................................................................... 10  
Whiteness ............................................................................................................. 16  
The Chapters ......................................................................................................... 22  
Chapter 1: When the marginalised research the privileged: One Māori group’s experience ............................................................................................................... 29  
Abstract ................................................................................................................. 29  
Introduction ........................................................................................................... 29  
Indigenous controlled research ........................................................................... 32  
‘Ghettoised’ or ‘romanticised’ research ................................................................ 33  
Whāriki journey ................................................................................................... 35  
Challenging the ‘gaze’ ......................................................................................... 37  
Assessment/funding. .............................................................................................. 39  
Ethics ...................................................................................................................... 40  
Discussion .............................................................................................................. 43  
Conclusion .............................................................................................................. 44  
Chapter 2: Theorising the structural dynamics of ethnic privilege in Aotearoa: Unpacking “this breeze at my back” ................................................................................. 47
Chapter 4: Beyond the veil: Kaupapa Māori gaze on the non-Māori subject...87

Abstract ..................................................................................................................87
Introduction ...........................................................................................................87
Background ............................................................................................................88
Accounting for inequity ..........................................................................................88
Expanding our accounts .......................................................................................90
Māori Episteme ......................................................................................................91
Privilege project ......................................................................................................93
Kura Te Waru Rewiri – epistemology and painting practice ..............................94
Wāhi ngāro .............................................................................................................95
Privilege is wāhi ngāro to the privileged ...............................................................98
Conclusion .............................................................................................................101

Chapter 5: Conceptualising Historical Privilege: The flip side of historical trauma, a
brief examination .....................................................................................................104

Abstract: ...............................................................................................................104
Historical Privilege - Definition ..........................................................................107
Conclusion .............................................................................................................120

Discussion .............................................................................................................121
Where to with Kaupapa Māori theory .................................................................121
Where to with structures of hegemony .................................................................126
Where to with challenging hegemony .................................................................128

References ..........................................................................................................131

Appendices ..........................................................................................................164

Appendix 1: Statements of Contribution ...............................................................166
Appendix 2: Copies of papers as published .........................................................172
Glossary

Aotearoa: New Zealand
Hapū: sub tribe, kinship group of multiple whānau
Hui: a gathering or meeting
Iwi: nation, tribe
Kaitiaki: guardian
Kākahu: cloak, garments
Kaupapa: underlying base, general principles, topic, platform
Korowai: cloak with black fibre tassels
Mana: authority
Mātauranga: knowledge
Mihi: form of address, greeting
Mokopuna: grandchild, descendant
Pākehā: people of European origin
Rangatahi: youth, adolescent
Rūpū: team, group
Tangata whenua: indigenous people of the land
Te reo Māori: Māori language
Tikanga: Māori protocols, practices or processes
Wāhi ngaro: lost or hidden place; realm of the supernatural
Waka kōiwi: bone repository
Whakatauākī: significant saying, aphorism
Whānau: extended family groupings and structures
Whāriki: chiefly mat