Practising Fiercely: Fulfilment through Stance, Supports and Stamina

A participatory narrative inquiry of specialist teachers’ practice in Aotearoa New Zealand

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Ph.D.
in
Education

at Massey University, Albany, Aotearoa New Zealand

Wendy Holley-Boen

October, 2017
Abstract

Teachers work within a range of personal and contextual factors that serve as enablers and barriers to their professional identity, practice and wellbeing. There is a need to explore their perspectives of the current education context, and their roles within it, to better understand the ways teachers experience and position themselves within and against the tensions posed by an increasingly complex world. This research is timely as it investigates an emerging group of professionals, specialist teachers in Aotearoa New Zealand, who integrate postgraduate study with new professional roles and the other facets of their lives. Using a participatory narrative inquiry, steeped in positive psychology and biculturally responsive practice, the present study identifies connections across identity, practice and wellbeing as knowing oneself and conceptualizing practice as relational; ecological and contextualized; challenging and requiring lifelong learning. Alongside the enablers of trust and agency, the research foregrounds the tensions of working in a system straddling special and inclusive education and other unintended barriers to professional practice. Enablers, tensions and mediating variables are unpacked with a focus on the way agentic professionals navigate their personal and professional lives. Findings from the present study informed the development of a framework for the fulfilment of teachers through fierce practice comprised of stance, supports and stamina. This framework has utility at the individual level, supporting the fulfilment of individual teachers. At the systems level, the framework may be of interest to tertiary teachers and institutions wishing to help teachers to develop and sustain meaningful and satisfying lives.
Acknowledgements

_Ehara taku toa, he tikitahi, he toa tikitini_

My success should not be bestowed onto me alone; as it was not individual success but the success of a collective

I am so grateful to the family and friends who have supported this study. To my supervisors, formal and informal, thank you for giving me time you did not have and wisdom that you did. Jill Bevan-Brown, thank you for your aroha, inimitable approach to supervision and for staying with me long into your own retirement. Jude MacArthur, you taught me so much about gathering and treasuring other people’s stories. Michael Phillip, thank you for showing me how strengths-based approaches feel from the inside out. Tracy Riley, thank you for coming in to support the final leg of the journey. Mandia Mentis, every conversation stretches me – you have shaped this research and researcher more than you know. To Philippa Butler for Mondays, Alison Kearney for believing in me before you had proof, and Jayne and Graham Jackson for the magic that happened around your kitchen table.

Thank you to the women who shared their lives with me, who trusted me with their stories, and who taught me so much. This study is for every teacher who continues to fight the good fight: may you see yourself within these pages and be fortified by these narratives.

Thank you Grandma, for every single thing, and to James for being my person. Most of all, this study is for you, Ainsley. You do more for my stance and stamina than anyone in this world. Thank you for grounding me and inspiring me. Thank you for reminding me to keep going on most days, but on some days reminding me to stop. May you always live fiercely, sweet girl.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................ iii
List of Tables .......................................................................................................................... xi
List of Figures ........................................................................................................................ xiii

## Chapter 1 – Introduction ................................................................................................. 1
Context of the present study................................................................................................. 1
My own positioning .............................................................................................................. 3
The present study ................................................................................................................. 5
Thesis structure .................................................................................................................... 6
Choice of language .............................................................................................................. 9

## Chapter 2 – Literature Review ....................................................................................... 13
The Specialist Teaching programme – The shared context of the study ...................... 14
Education in Aotearoa New Zealand – Local and global considerations: A vision of four pillars ........................................................................................................................................... 16
Learning to do ...................................................................................................................... 17
How we frame “good teaching” ......................................................................................... 17
Learning to be ...................................................................................................................... 21
Intensification and agency ................................................................................................. 21
Supporting the person within the professional ................................................................... 23
Learning to know ................................................................................................................ 26
21st Century learning .......................................................................................................... 26
Learning in online and blended spaces ............................................................................ 28
Situated learning ................................................................................................................ 30
Self-directed learning and lifelong learning ...................................................................... 31
Evidence-based practice .................................................................................................... 34
Learning to live together ................................................................................................... 36
Bicultural and multicultural .............................................................................................. 36
Shifting from special to inclusive education .............................................. 39
Communities of practice ........................................................................... 42
Whānau support groups ........................................................................... 45
Professional identity .................................................................................. 46
Professional identity and ideas on ‘self’ .................................................... 49
Seminal research on professional identity in teacher education .................. 50
Considerations in scaffolding professional identity .................................... 52
Implications of professional identity development for teacher educators ....... 54
Authentic practice ....................................................................................... 55
A case for authentic practice ..................................................................... 58
Understandings of authentic practice ....................................................... 59
Constructivist approaches ........................................................................ 61
Navigating barriers to authentic practice in the field .................................. 62
Implications of authentic practice development for teacher educators ....... 63
Wellbeing .................................................................................................... 65
Historical understandings ........................................................................ 66
Contemporary understandings of wellbeing and the influence of positive
psychology .................................................................................................. 67
Teacher wellbeing and the links to learning .............................................. 70
Implications of wellbeing development for teacher educators .................... 72
Moving away from “wellbeing” ................................................................... 73
Research connecting professional identity, authentic practice and wellbeing .... 76

Chapter 3 – Methodology ............................................................................ 79
Context of the study ................................................................................... 80
Aotearoa New Zealand ................................................................................ 80
Specialist Teaching and my role within the programme ............................. 81
My approach to research ........................................................................... 83
Methodology ............................................................................................... 84
Situating the study – The significance for (re)emerging professionals ........ 84
Narrative inquiry interweaving biculturally responsive practices and positive
psychology .................................................................................................... 85
Understanding meaning................................................................. 85
Narrative inquiry.............................................................................. 87
Participatory approaches to narrative inquiry ................................. 89
Biculturally responsive research – Whakawhanaungatanga ............... 90
Positive psychology.......................................................................... 92
Methods .......................................................................................... 94
Ethical procedures and informed consent ........................................ 94
Finding participants.......................................................................... 97
Data collection methods................................................................. 99
Research interviews........................................................................ 103
Interviews as conversations......................................................... 103
Focus groups .................................................................................. 105
First focus whānau group session – October 2014 .......................... 107
Second focus whānau group session – October 2015 ....................... 112
Use of metaphor as a research method.......................................... 113
Matters of trustworthiness.............................................................. 115
Analysis of interview and focus group data ..................................... 118
Researcher’s diary .......................................................................... 123
Conclusion ...................................................................................... 124

Chapter 4 – Findings: Professional Identity, Authentic Practice and Wellbeing ..... 125
Introduction to the findings ............................................................... 125
Q1 – How do participants make sense of the constructs of professional identity, authentic practice and wellbeing? ......................................................... 126
  Professional identity.................................................................... 127
  Authentic practice ...................................................................... 130
  Wellbeing ............................................................................... 131
Q2 – What do participants see as the connections between these ideas? .......... 133
  Know thyself............................................................................ 136
    Know who they are (personal characteristics) .......................... 136
    Know the difference they want to make (mission and contribution) .... 137
    Know what they believe to be true, and that this is only ever true for them .. 139
Know their own needs, especially in terms of their wellbeing .................. 141
Practice as relational (authentic practice as valuable only to the extent it lifts others).......................................................... 143
Practice as ecological and contextualised ........................................... 146
Practice as collective: Drawing on collective wisdom ......................... 150
Practice as challenging........................................................................ 152
Learning from the most difficult........................................................... 152
Practice as lifelong learning................................................................. 155
Rejecting the expert model (shifting to ‘facilitator’, ‘connector’) ............... 156

Chapter 5 – Findings: Enablers, Tensions and Mediating Variables for Participants 161
Trust and agency.................................................................................. 162
Balancing/integrating work, study and life ........................................... 165
Tensions in the current education system, as it straddles inclusive and special education................................................................. 167
Time ...................................................................................................... 168
Attitudes and deficit discourses............................................................. 169
The way funding is allocated and framed.............................................. 170
Being framed as the gatekeeper............................................................. 172
Being framed as the expert................................................................... 174
Being framed as the ‘magic bullet’......................................................... 175
Unintended difficulties of ecological practice...................................... 177
Mediating variables............................................................................. 179
The need for a sense of agency............................................................ 179
The need for a sense of belonging ....................................................... 182

Chapter 6 – Findings and Discussion: The Ways Participants Positioned Themselves
Within and Against the Tensions of Their Roles.................................... 185
Fulfilment (WHY) ............................................................................. 189
Fulfilment as relational ...................................................................... 190
Fulfilment as ongoing and generative ............................................... 193
The most difficult work as the most fulfilling .................................... 196
Practising fiercely (HOW) ................................................................. 199
Practising fiercely as relational wellbeing ............................................. 199
Fighting the good fight ........................................................................... 202
Stance (WHAT) ....................................................................................... 205
Focused inward: Who participants understood themselves to be .......... 207
Stance as a deeper, more integrated, self-understanding ................. 207
Stance as genuine .................................................................................. 209
Focused outward: How participants enacted their self-understanding . 210
Stance as connectedness ........................................................................ 210
Stance as physical and dynamic ............................................................. 211
Supports (WHAT) .................................................................................. 214
Participants’ internal characteristics .................................................... 216
Other people as supports ....................................................................... 218
Supporting others .................................................................................. 220
Cultures of support ................................................................................ 221
Stamina (WHAT) .................................................................................... 223
Stamina as intentional in their lives ....................................................... 225
Stamina as continual recalibrating of practice .................................... 228
Getting out of balance to get back into balance .................................. 228
The reality and discourse of ‘busy-ness’ .............................................. 229
Learning from imbalance ..................................................................... 232
‘When I knew better, I did better’ ......................................................... 236
Conclusion .............................................................................................. 241

Chapter 7 – Findings and Discussion of the Framework “Practising Fiercely: Fulfilment through Stance, Supports and Stamina” ................................................................. 243
Revisiting the participants ..................................................................... 244
Understanding the framework of Practising Fiercely: Fulfilment through Stance, Supports and Stamina ................................................................. 245
Unpacking the framework of Practising Fiercely: Fulfilment through Stance, Supports and Stamina ................................................................. 247
Practising fiercely through stance, supports and stamina ................. 249
Practising fiercely ................................................................................. 249
List of Tables

Table 1. Teachers, specialist teachers and their contexts.................................................. 14
Table 2. Review of the literature on professional identity, authentic practice and wellbeing................................................................................................. 47
Table 3. Sections of methodology chapter........................................................................ 80
Table 4. Consideration and resolution of ethical issues..................................................... 95
Table 5. Research participants............................................................................................ 99
Table 6. Sources of interview and focus group data.............................................................. 100
Table 7. Ketso® legend for participants (2014).................................................................. 111
Table 8. Key cultural values, their alignment with principles of trustworthiness, and their enactment in the research ................................................................. 116
Table 9. Findings for Questions 1 and 2 ......................................................................... 127
Table 10. Enablers, tensions and mediating variables....................................................... 161
Table 11. Practising Fiercely: Fulfilment through Stance, Supports and Stamina............ 188
Table 12. Implications of a framework for Practising Fiercely: Fulfilment through Stance, Supports and Stamina............................................................... 243
List of Figures

Figure 1. Evidence-based practice as the integration of three circles of evidence ... 20
Figure 2. The onion: A model of levels of change ......................................................... 57
Figure 3. Depiction of methods and focus ................................................................. 102
Figure 4. Ketso® diagram ....................................................................................... 108
Figure 5. Participants engaging in one Ketso® activity .............................................. 110
Figure 6. Ketso® on Implications for the Specialist Teaching Programme ............. 111
Figure 7. Example of a teachers’ ecology ............................................................... 118
Figure 8. Practising Fiercely: Fulfilment through Stance, Supports and Stamina.... 187
Figure 9. Lola’s metaphor for fulfilment ................................................................. 191
Figure 10. Mia’s metaphor for fulfilment ............................................................... 192
Figure 11. Practising fiercely .................................................................................. 199
Figure 12. Stance .................................................................................................... 205
Figure 13. Supports ................................................................................................. 214
Figure 14. Stamina ................................................................................................. 223