Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN FOREIGN DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE AND HUMAN RIGHTS PERFORMANCE - A CASE STUDY OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, CANADA, THE NETHERLANDS AND INDONESIA

A Research Project Presented in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master in Philosophy in Development Studies at Massey University

DIONISIO DA COSTA BABO SOARES
1995
Dedicated to:

My grandfather, parents, brothers & sisters, uncles, aunts, cousins, and the one I really love.
This dissertation examines the degree to which donor countries have attempted to suspend or discontinue foreign aid to the recipients on human rights grounds.

Contemporary approaches to human rights in development are represented by both the theory of "Natural Rights" and the theory of "Cultural Relativism". Donors and most of the Western countries, advocate the former and give emphasis to civil and political rights. Whereas most of the recipient countries uphold the theory of "Cultural Relativism" and put emphasis on economic, social and cultural rights. One of the common facets of cultural relativism is the postponement of civil and political rights for the sake of economic development. The basic tenet of this position is that, if economic development has been achieved then civil and political rights will be exercised naturally. Indeed, this is the common conviction in some Third World nations where stability is regarded as the key to successful economic development. Poor treatment of human rights are therefore often a consequence of this conviction in these countries. The advocacy of prevention of abuses of these rights, through the suspension of foreign aid, emerges from this consequence. Another consequence is that, opposition to the "link between aid and human rights" grows largely in the recipient nations.

This thesis, acknowledging the complexity of the issue, sets out to assess the case study of three donor countries; the USA, Canada and the Netherlands. All were, and still are, strong advocates of "giving aid on human rights grounds". The foreign aid flow of these donor countries, each dealing independently with Indonesia as the recipient, is
assessed. The results suggest that, despite the fact that the legitimacy of cutting aid on human rights grounds is emphasized, practical moves in this direction by the USA, Canada and the Netherlands from 1980 until 1995, remain the exception rather than the rule. Though Indonesia's record on human rights has remained deplorable, Foreign Development Assistance (ODA) has continued on the ground. This thesis, finally, suggests possibilities for future improvements of human rights in the recipient countries, particularly in Indonesia, in its recommendations.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my Lord and His Mother for the extraordinary gift of grace that I have received for reasons only Heaven can fathom. When I started compiling information, I never believed I would find such a treasure of rich vein of knowledge, which have allowed me to formulate within this piece of writing.

I would also like to thank my supervisor, Dr Katharine Davidson, for her support and considered advice and her peculiar touch of motherhood. This project would have been hard to unfold without her tireless support.

I am grateful to Assoc. Prof. Dr. Crosbie and his wife Vijaya Walsh, Ms Diana Te Nana (secretary), Dr Brian Ponter and all the staff of Development Studies for their valuable assistance during my years of study at this institute. I am particularly indebted to Dr Hadi Soesastro and staff members of the Centre for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS) - Jakarta, for their support during my field research from the early December 1993 until the late January 1994.

I am thankful to John McDougall (editor for Apakabar list - USA), Dr Djisman Simanjuntak (Prasetia Mulya), Dr George Aditjondro and Dr Arief Budiman (UKSW), Goenawan Moehamad (TEMPO), Dr T. M. Lubis (YLBHI), Dr Dewi Fortuna Anwar (LIPI), Mr Firmansyah (Bapenas), Mrs Saodah B.A. Syahruddin. M.A.(Foreign Affairs Ministry) and Prof. Paul Gordon Lauren (Montana University - USA) for their useful insights and assistance during the early draft of this thesis.
My special thanks also go to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT) in general for the financial support it provided me throughout my study, and to Rachel Gundessen, Charles Chua and Bruce Graham, Student Support Officers for Massey University in particular.

Finally, to all my friends and those whose names could not be mentioned here, I would like to extend my gratitude for the brotherhood and friendly atmosphere we have created and, for the cooperation and support throughout my years of study at this beloved Institute of Development Studies. May God Bless you all.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract i
Acknowledgements ii
Table of Contents v
List of Tables viii

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION 1

1. Background 1

1.1. Definition 1
1.2. Brief History of Human Rights 2
1.3. The Concept of Aid 6
1.4. The Linking of Aid to Human Rights 9
1.5. The Intellectual Debate 15

2. Objectives 17

2.1. The Relevance of the Study to Indonesia 17
2.2. The Focus of the Study 20
2.3. The Purpose of the Assessment 22

3. Methodology 23

3.1. Theoretical Approach 23
3.2. Data Source 23
3.3. Approach (es) of the Enquiry 23
3.4. Organisation of the Thesis 25

4. Notes 28

CHAPTER TWO: THE REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE 30

1. The Foreign Aid Debates 30

1.1. The Moral Aspect 31
1.2. Critics of the Moral Aspect 35
1.3. The Historical and Theoretical Debates on Aid
   1.3.1. Historical Debates
   1.3.2. Theoretical Debates
1.4. Critics of Aid

2. The Human Rights Debates
   2.1. The Natural Rights Theory
   2.2. Critics of the Natural Rights Theory
   2.3. The Cultural Relativism Theory
   2.4. Critics of the Cultural Relativism Theory

3. The Notion of Intervention
   3.1. The State Autonomy Perspective
   3.2. The Cosmopolitan Perspective
   3.3. Retaking The Middle Ground

4. Conclusion

5. Notes

CHAPTER THREE: THE NATURE OF FOREIGN AID IN PRACTICE

1. Interest of Donor Countries
2. Interest of Recipient Countries
3. Assessing Aid Effectiveness
4. Notes

CHAPTER FOUR: DONOR FOREIGN AID POLICIES, THE HUMAN RIGHTS DEBATE IN INDONESIA AND THE ROLE OF NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANISATIONS (NGOs)

1. Donor Foreign Aid Policies
   1.1. The United States of America
   1.2. Canada
   1.3. The Netherlands
2. The Debate on Aid and Human Rights in Indonesia
   2.1. Government View
   2.2. Non-Government View
3. The Role of Non-Governmental Organisation (NGOs)
4. Assessing the Effectiveness of Human Rights Criteria
5. Notes

CHAPTER FIVE: ASSESSING THE HUMAN RIGHTS PERFORMANCE AND THE FOREIGN AID FLOW TO INDONESIA
1. Legal Procedures on Human Rights
   1.1. The National Procedures
   1.2. Indonesia and International Conventions
2. Brief Account on Indonesia's Human Rights Performance
3. Donor's Aid Performance to Indonesia from 1980 to 1995
   3.1. The United States of America
   3.2. Canada
   3.3. The Netherlands
4. Indonesia's Response to Donor Countries' Reaction
5. Notes

CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION
1. Introduction
2. Overall Conclusion
3. Comments and Recommendation
### LIST OF TABLES

- **Table 1**: Chronology of Human Rights Instruments  
  - Page 113
- **Table 2**: Assessment of Human Rights in Indonesia  
  - Page 117
- **Table 3**: Assessment of Human Rights in Indonesia  
  - Page 118
- **Table 4**: Assessment of Human Rights in Indonesia  
  - Page 119
- **Table 5**: Assessment of Human Rights in Indonesia  
  - Page 120
- **Table 6**: Assessment of Human Rights in Indonesia  
  - Page 120
- **Table 7**: The ODA Net (US 000') To Indonesia  
  - Page 131