Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
PAIN AS EMBODIED EXPERIENCE:
A PHENOMENOLOGICAL STUDY OF CLINICALLY INFLECTED PAIN
IN ADULT PATIENTS

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
in Nursing
at Massey University

Irena Madjar
November 1991
ABSTRACT

This phenomenological study describes the lived experience of pain inflicted in the context of medically prescribed treatment, explores the meanings of such pain for patients who endured it and for nurses whose actions contributed to its generation, and presents a thematic description of the phenomenon of clinically inflicted pain. The study is informed by phenomenology, both in terms of its premises and orientation, and its research design and method.

The participants in the study were 14 adult patients, admitted to hospital following burn injuries, or receiving intravenous chemotherapy upon diagnosis of cancer, and 20 nurses involved in their care. Data collection took place over a period of five months and included participant observation and compilation of field notes, and a total of 89 tape-recorded interviews (48 with patients and 41 with nurses). Through the process of hermeneutic interpretation a number of themes were identified and used to describe the phenomenon of clinically inflicted pain and the structure of the lived experience of the patients and nurses concerned.

The phenomenon of clinically inflicted pain is described in terms of four related themes: 1) the hurt and painfulness of inflicted pain; 2) handing one's body over to others; 3) the expectation and experience of being wounded, and 4) restraining the body and the voice. These themes point to the embodied nature of pain experience and the extent to which the person is involved not only in the enduring of pain but also in its generation. The broader lifeworld of clinically inflicted pain involves patients in the experience of constituting such pain, often as punishment and almost always as something unavoidable, and in turn being constituted by their experiences in terms of losing and seeking to regain a sense of embodied self and of personal situation, and by changed experiences of lived space and lived time.

Nurses who themselves helped to generate pain, frequently overlooked the patient's lived experience and thus the essential nature of inflicted pain as painful, wounding,
and demanding cooperation and composure from the patient. Instead, the pain frequently became *invisible* to nurses involved in its infliction, or when it could not be overlooked or ignored, it was perceived as *inevitable, non-harmful*, and even as *beneficial* to patients' recovery. The strategic responses that nurses adopted to pain infliction included *detachment* from the perceived impact and consequences of their own actions and *objectification* of the person in pain as a body-object on whom certain tasks had to be performed. An alternative to the strategy of *detachment and objectification* was *involvement in a therapeutic partnership* between the nurse and the patient, where shared control over pain infliction and relief helped to sustain trust in the relationship and preserve personal integrity of the patient and the nurse.

The study points to dangers for both patients and nurses when clinically inflicted pain is ignored, overlooked, or treated with detachment. It also points a way toward nursing practice that is guided by thoughtfulness and sensitivity to patients' lived experience, and awareness of freedom and responsibility inherent in nursing actions, including those involved in inflicting and relieving pain. The study raises questions about nurses' knowledge, attitudes, and actions in relation to clinically inflicted pain, and highlights the need for nursing education and practice to consider the contribution of a phenomenological perspective to the understanding of human experience of pain, and the nursing role in its generation, prevention, and relief.
This dissertation represents five years of challenging, exciting, sometimes frustrating and lonely, but always stimulating work. The work and its completion would not have been possible without the help and support of people who have, in different ways, contributed to the thesis and to my life during this period. It is with pleasure, and a sense of relief, that I express my gratitude to them.

As thesis supervisors, Professor Norma Chick and Dr Chris Wilkes deserve special praise. I shall always be grateful for the generous way in which they shared their time, knowledge, experience and wisdom, and provided me with intellectual challenges, guidance, and encouragement when I most needed them. They have lived with the 'highs and lows' of the thesis project, the unproductive periods, and the demanding times when I needed, and received, their immediate and thoughtful attention. Thank you both.

The preliminary ideas for the study were developed during a period of sabbatical leave at the University of California, San Francisco. As a faculty adviser, Professor Nancy Stotts encouraged me to explore the issue of clinically inflicted pain and listened sympathetically to my early critiques of the literature. Through her course on The Phenomenology of Merleau-Ponty, Professor Patricia Benner introduced me to a new perspective on nursing and nursing scholarship, and provided the inspiration and confidence I needed to consider the phenomenological approach in my research. I am grateful for these auspicious beginnings that have provided a strong basis for the subsequent work.

I am also grateful to those who have offered critical and insightful comments on the early drafts of the thesis and encouraged me to appreciate the value of reflection and rewriting in phenomenological research. My special thanks go to Professor Afaf Meleis from the University of California, San Francisco, and Professor Janice Morse from the University of Alberta, Edmonton, who, despite a busy schedule, found time during a visit to New Zealand to read and provide very helpful critiques on parts of the first draft of the thesis.

My thanks also go to my colleagues in the Department of Nursing Studies and in the Faculty of Social Sciences, Massey University, for their interest in the thesis and their support during the years of its development. I am particularly indebted to Julie Boddy for her patient listening and perceptive comments on the many occasions when I needed to talk through my clinical observations and developing ideas, and to Professor Andrew Trlin, a long-time friend and mentor, and Joanne Walton, a respected
colleague, for the careful reading of the final draft and their encouragement in the last few months of the project.

Throughout the period of research and writing I have been personally sustained, nourished, and encouraged by the love of family and friends. From near and far, they have been faithful in their understanding, tolerance, and acts of kindness, and for that I am very grateful. My parents, Mihajlo and Ana Madjar, deserve special mention. Without their trust, encouragement, and many practical expressions of support, the last five years would have been much more arduous and the accomplishment less enjoyable.

I wish to acknowledge the careful transcription of research interviews by Lil Wake, and the research grant from the New Zealand Nursing Education and Research Foundation which helped to meet part of the costs related to interview transcription.

Finally, and most of all, I am profoundly grateful to the patients and nurses who so willingly participated in the study, and whose openness and honesty in sharing their experiences have made the study possible. Some of the patients have died since the completion of data collection, but I hope that their experience and that of all the other participants will, through this thesis, make a positive difference to nursing practice.

[Signature]

Palmerston North
11 November 1991
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**ABSTRACT**  

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**  

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**  

**KEY TO TRANSCRIPTS**  

**INTRODUCTION**  
Background to the study  
Definition of clinically inflicted pain  
Purpose of the study  
Structure of the thesis  

**CHAPTER**  

1. **THE PROBLEM OF PAIN: REVIEW OF THE RELEVANT LITERATURE**  
   Historical review of the concept of pain  
   Recent advances in the study of pain  
   Pain-related issues in clinical practice  
   Clinical issues related to pain in patients with cancer  
   Clinical issues related to pain in patients with burn trauma  
   Undertreatment of pain  
   Inflicted pain in clinical practice  
   Nursing practice and pain management  
   Conclusion  

2. **PHENOMENOLOGICAL INQUIRY: REVIEW OF THE RELEVANT LITERATURE**  
   The case for phenomenology in the study of human pain  
   The nature of phenomenological inquiry  
   The phenomenological view of the person and the concept of embodiment  
   Phenomenological account of the lived-body  
   Embodiment and pain  
   Nursing and phenomenology  
   Conclusion
### 3. THE DESIGN, METHODS, AND CONTEXT OF THE STUDY

- Assumptions of phenomenological research ............................................. 70
- Aims of phenomenological research ....................................................... 71
- Turning to the phenomenon of inflicted pain in clinical practice ................. 74
  - Entering the field ........................................................................... 74
  - Assumptions and expectations ............................................................. 75
  - Selection of participants for the study ............................................... 77
  - Description of participants ................................................................. 80
  - Description of the two settings for the study ....................................... 88
  - Ethical considerations ...................................................................... 94

- Investigating the experience of inflicted pain as it is lived:
  - Methods of data collection .................................................................. 96
    - Participant observation and recording ............................................... 96
    - Patient interviews ......................................................................... 97
    - Nurse interviews ........................................................................... 99
    - Review of patients' records ............................................................. 100

- Reflecting on the essential themes that emerged from the investigation:
  - Methods of data analysis and interpretation ...................................... 101

- Describing the phenomenon and bringing it to speech:
  - Presentation of findings ..................................................................... 105

- Conclusion ............................................................................................ 108

### 4. PLACING THE EXPERIENCE OF INFLECTED PAIN IN CONTEXT:
THE IMPACT OF ILLNESS AND INJURY ON THE EMBODIED SELF .................. 110

- The significance of the context ............................................................. 111
- *Losing a sense of the habitual body* ..................................................... 115
  - Sensing that something is wrong ......................................................... 116
  - *Looking different to oneself and to the world* .................................... 119
  - *Feeling different and being different* ............................................... 124
  - *Feeling overwhelmed* .................................................................... 130
- *Regaining the habitual body and becoming oneself again* ..................... 134
  - *Resuming the interrupted flow of life* ............................................. 135
  - *Creating a new kind of future* .......................................................... 136
  - *Fighting to remain a person* ............................................................... 138
  - *Living through each round of treatment* ........................................... 139
  - *Living with persistent feeling of not being oneself* ............................ 141

- Review and summary ............................................................................. 143
5. THE PHENOMENON OF CLINICALLY INFLICTED PAIN:

ESSENTIAL THEMES ........................................ 146
The hurt and the painfulness of inflicted pain .......... 147
Handing one's body over to others ................... 155
Expectation and experience of being wounded .......... 159
Restraining the body and the voice .................. 165
Review and summary .................................. 171

6. THE LIFEWORLD OF CLINICALLY INFLICTED PAIN;

PATIENTS' PERCEPTIONS OF OTHERS, PAIN, AND SELF ........................................ 175

Patients' perceptions of those who inflict pain ........ 176
The quality of the tactile encounter .................. 177
The good nurses .................................. 179
The good-but nurses ................................ 182

Constituting the experience of inflicted pain and giving it
meaning .......................................... 187
Pain as punishment ................................ 188
Necessary procedures and unavoidable pain .......... 189

Being constituted by the experience of inflicted pain .... 193
Losing and regaining a sense of embodied self .......... 194

Losing and regaining a sense of personal situation .... 198

Pain and lived space ................................ 199
Pain and lived time ................................ 202

Review and summary .................................. 205

7. INFLECTING AND RELIEVING PAIN:

THE LIFEWORLD OF NURSING PRACTICE ........................................ 208

Nurses' embodied experience of painful procedures .... 209
The stress and the satisfaction in nurses' work .......... 210
Oncology clinic nurses ................................ 217

Nurses' perceptions of inflicted pain .................. 219
Visible and invisible pain ................................ 220
Inevitable pain .................................. 224
Non-harmful and beneficial pain ...................... 228

Oncology clinic nurses ................................ 230

Nurses' perceptions of pain relief ...................... 231
Minimizing the use of strong analgesic drugs .......... 231
Estimations of drug effectiveness ...................... 235

Strategic responses to pain infliction .................. 240
Involvement in a therapeutic partnership .............. 241
Detachment and objectification --------------------------------- 243
Review and summary ------------------------------------------ 246

8. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION ------------------------------- 249
Understanding the nature of inflicted pain --------------------- 250
The phenomenon of clinically inflict ed pain: The essential
themes -------------------------------------------------------- 251
The hurt and painfulness of inflicted pain ---------------------- 251
The wounding nature of inflicted pain ------------------------- 252
Handing one's body over to others ----------------------------- 253
Restraining the body and the voice ----------------------------- 255
A comment on the four essential themes ------------------------ 256
Understanding the experience of inflicting pain ---------------- 258
Tactile encounter and pain infliction ------------------------- 258
Caring and inflicting pain ----------------------------------- 259
Involvement in a therapeutic partnership ----------------------- 262
The problem of undermedication for pain ---------------------- 264
Limitations of the study -------------------------------------- 266
Implications of the study ------------------------------------- 269
Implications for nursing education --------------------------- 270
Implications for nursing practice ----------------------------- 276
Implications for further research ----------------------------- 281
Conclusion ------------------------------------------------------ 284

REFERENCES ---------------------------------------------------- 289

APPENDICES
Appendix A  Glossary of technical terms ------------------------ 307
Appendix B  Patient consent to participation in a research study ------ 314
Appendix C  Nurse consent to participation in a research study ------ 316
Appendix D  Examples of interpretive memos ---------------------- 318
Appendix E  Summary of analgesic medication received by the patients
in the Burn Care Unit ---------------------------------------- 319
KEY TO TRANSCRIPTS

In the presentation of research findings, and particularly in relation to excerpts from research interviews and field notes, the following abbreviations and conventions have been used:

- **BN**: burn nurse
- **B Pt**: burn patient
- **ChN**: chemotherapy nurse
- **ChPt**: chemotherapy patient
- **Int**: interview

*italics* conceptual categories and themes identified through textual analysis

*names* all names used to refer to study participants are pseudonyms

*p (pp)* page (pages)

(parentheses) researcher’s questions or comments contained in the original interviews or field notes;

[square brackets] researcher’s comments, added to provide clarity or explanation;

*underlining* unless otherwise indicated, words or phrases emphasized in the original material

.... pause, contained in the original material;

..//.. material edited out