BRING YOUR OWN DEVICES CLASSROOM: ISSUES OF DIGITAL DIVIDES IN TEACHING AND LEARNING CONTEXTS

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in Information Technology at Massey University, Albany campus, New Zealand

Janak Adhikari
2018
Bring Your Own Devices Classroom: Issues of Digital Divides in Teaching and Learning Contexts

Abstract

Since the late 1990s, digital divide has gathered much attention from the research community and government organizations. The education sector has been an important area of inquiry for many researchers, as they strive to inform government initiatives on strategies to address digital divide issues prevalent here. This study reports on how existing and new digital divides have evolved with increased penetration of digital learning technologies into teaching and learning practices and the wide usage of enabling technologies by students across formal and informal learning spaces (i.e. both in- and out-of-school), within the context of a BYOD (bring your own device) classroom initiative. A five-year longitudinal investigation of a BYOD classroom initiative by a New Zealand school helped to gain insights into different nature of digital divides in the learning process. First, the BYOD classroom initiative did not end up accentuating existing gaps in access to digital devices and information, despite initial results indicating towards a potentially digitally divided classroom. Second, the study strongly indicated the presence of gaps in terms of information literacy and critical thinking ability, which was eventually bridged in the later stage, as students slowly adjusted to the classroom curricular structures in the BYOD classroom. Third, learner self-efficacy has been identified as the most influential determinant of learning outcomes among students. In earlier phases of investigation of BYOD classrooms initiative, learner self-efficacy was found to be influenced by digital capability, in combination with information literacy, critical thinking ability, and positive motivation. However subsequently, self-efficacy influences affordances in
various aspects of social cognitive abilities related to individual’s learning activities affecting how learners engage and apply technology to shape their learning outcomes. The study findings will inform policy makers and education government agencies, in their ongoing quest for bringing about inclusive digital transformation and overall improvement in learning outcomes.
Acknowledgements

During my PhD study, I have received support from many people who have contributed through their time, knowledge and continuous support.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor and mentor, Dr Anuradha Mathrani for her time, enthusiasm, constructive feedback, continuous motivation and encouragement, which enabled me to progress in my study. I am also very grateful to my co-supervisor Associate Professor Chris Scogings for his support and encouragement, which helped me to focus on my work.

I would like to thank the school for providing me an opportunity to conduct this study, including members of the management, teaching staff, students, and parents who provided valuable contributions to this dissertation project.

Most importantly, I wish to thank my parents, my wife Jyoti, and my son Abhinav for their encouragement and constant support. Without their patience and understanding, this thesis would not have been possible.
Table of Contents

Abstract........................................................................................................................................... i

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................... iii

Table of Contents...................................................................................................................... v

List of Tables .................................................................................................................................. xiv

Table of Figures ............................................................................................................................ xvi

Chapter 1: Introduction ................................................................................................................. 1

1.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 1

1.2 Digital divide phenomenon.................................................................................................. 4

1.3 Bring your own devices (BYOD) classrooms ................................................................. 8

1.4 The meaning of equity in teaching and learning........................................................... 10

1.5 Background to the research problem................................................................................. 14

1.6 Research questions ............................................................................................................. 15

1.7 Theoretical framework....................................................................................................... 16

1.8 Contribution of the thesis ............................................................................................... 17

1.9 Roadmap of study ............................................................................................................. 20

1.10 Thesis outline ................................................................................................................... 22
Chapter 2: Literature Review

2.1 Introduction

2.2 Digital divides in the education

2.3 Studies on digital initiatives in education

2.4 Technology-mediated educational initiatives in New Zealand

2.5 Methodology

2.6 Analysis of digital divide literature

2.7 Relevant literature on digital divide in learning

2.7.1 Access to digital technologies

2.7.2 Digital/information literacy

2.7.3 Learner self-efficacy

2.7.4 Nature of the technology usage by learners

2.7.5 Motivation/belief

2.8 Contextualization of literature

2.8.1 Three level digital divide framework

2.8.2 Analysis of the three level digital divide framework

2.8.2.1 Antecedents of the three level digital divide framework
2.8.2.2 Propriety of the three-level digital divide framework for study of digital divide in learning .......................................................... 51

2.8.3 Contextualization of three level digital divide framework into the study .......................................................... 53

2.8.4 Socio cultural ecological frame for mobile learning as an analytical framework .................................................................................................. 55

2.9 Conclusion ........................................................................................................................................................................... 57

**Chapter 3: Research Methodology** ........................................................................................................................................ 60

3.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................................................................................... 60

3.2 Research questions .................................................................................................................................................................. 61

3.3 Researchers role ........................................................................................................................................................................ 62

3.4 Research philosophy .............................................................................................................................................................. 64

3.5 Rationale for case study method ........................................................................................................................................ 66

3.6 Relevance and rigour .............................................................................................................................................................. 70

3.7 Research framework used in this study ........................................................................................................................................ 72

3.8 Research design ........................................................................................................................................................................ 73

3.8.1 Unit of analysis .................................................................................................................................................................. 75

3.8.2 Quality of research design .................................................................................................................................................... 76

3.8.2.1 Construct validity ...................................................................................................................................................... 76

3.8.2.2 Internal validity ...................................................................................................................................................... 77
Chapter 4: Baseline Data Analysis ................................................................. 106

4.1 Introduction ................................................................................................. 106

4.2 Preliminary analysis of the case study ......................................................... 107

4.3 Collection of baseline data .......................................................................... 110

4.4 Results and findings ..................................................................................... 114

4.4.1 Variations in the level of access ............................................................. 114

4.4.2 Variations in the level of digital skills .................................................... 116

4.4.3 Analysis towards aspects beyond access and digital skills .................... 118

4.4.3.1 Differences in the learning practices between classroom and everyday life 120

4.4.3.2 Traditional vs technology-mediated teaching methodology ................. 125

4.4.3.3 Convergent digital media applications within the method of instruction 129

4.5 Conclusion .................................................................................................. 132

Chapter 5: Follow-up Data Analysis ............................................................... 134

5.1 Introduction .................................................................................................. 134

5.2 Data Collection and analysis ....................................................................... 135
6.2 Data and analysis framework ................................................................. 174

6.3 Case analysis and findings ........................................................................ 176

6.3.1 Skills development .............................................................................. 178

6.3.2 Changes to personal, motivational and behavioral factors .................. 182

6.3.3 Knowledge acquisition ......................................................................... 188

6.3.4 Summarizing the analysis in the context of learning outcomes .......... 192

6.4 Conclusion ............................................................................................... 195

Chapter 7: Closing Discussion ....................................................................... 198

7.1 Introduction ............................................................................................. 198

7.2 Discussion on the research questions ...................................................... 201

7.2.1 How has the digital access divide evolved because of the BYOD classrooms? 202

7.2.2 How have the digital capabilities divide evolved because of the BYOD classrooms? 205

7.2.3 How have the learning outcomes (knowledge acquisition, skills development, and progression of attitudes and motivation) evolved because of the BYOD classroom? 207

7.3 Comparison with results from other studies ............................................. 210

7.4 Conclusions ............................................................................................ 212
Chapter 8: Conclusions and Future Research .......................................................... 216

8.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................... 216

8.2 Key findings and contributions ........................................................................ 217

8.2.1 Findings related to digital access divide ................................................... 218

8.2.2 Findings related to digital capabilities divide .......................................... 219

8.2.3 Findings related to digital outcomes divide ............................................. 220

8.3 Implications of the study ................................................................................. 221

8.3.1 Implications for theory ............................................................................ 221

8.3.2 Implications for practice .......................................................................... 223

8.4 Limitations ....................................................................................................... 225

8.5 Future research ................................................................................................ 227

References ............................................................................................................. 229

Appendix A : Ethics Approval Letters........................................................................ 242

Appendix B: Study Information Sheet ..................................................................... 244

Appendix C: Participant Consent Form ..................................................................... 245

Appendix D: Baseline Survey Questions ................................................................ 246

Appendix E: Followup Interview and Survey Questions ........................................... 252

Appendix F: Summative Interview Questions (Teachers)......................................... 264
List of Tables

Table 2.1: Evaluation of categories, factors and analysis of findings in the digital opportunities pilot project ................................................................. 34

Table 2.2: Criteria for the search of relevant literature ................................................. 36

Table 3.1: Comparisons between Interpretivist and Positivist ........................................ 65

Table 3.2: Selection criteria for single case designs (Yin, 2003) ............................... 80

Table 3.3: Timeline of data collections ...................................................................... 85

Table 3.4: Attributes used to assess research design in positivist case studies (Dubé & Paré, 2003) ................................................................................................. 86

Table 3.5: Attributes used to assess data collection in exploratory case study (Dubé & Paré, 2003) ........................................................................................................ 95

Table 3.6: Attributes to assess data analysis in case study research (Dubé & Paré, 2003) .99

Table 3.7: Methodological model of this research study .............................................. 103

Table 4.1: Stages of data collection (1st stage) ............................................................ 106

Table 4.2: Information about the sources of information collected for initial analysis. .... 108

Table 4.3: Survey responses in baseline data collection .............................................. 111

Table 4.4: Didactic parameters for systematic analysis of learning with mobile devices (Pachler, Bachmair, & Cook, 2010) ................................................................. 119

Table 5.1: Stages of data collection (2nd stage) ............................................................ 134

Table 5.2: Numbers of respondents to each survey .................................................... 136
Table 5.3: Coding of the interview, classroom observation and online surveys .......... 137

Table 5.4: Constructs and themes by stakeholder role from the qualitative data analysis ................................................................. 153

Table 5.5: Themes and repeated ideas from the 'structures' construct ................ 155

Table 5.6: Themes and repeated ideas from the 'agency' construct ..................... 159

Table 5.7: Themes and repeated ideas from the 'cultural practices' construct ............ 166

Table 6.1: Stages of data collection (3rd stage) .................................................. 174

Table 6.2: Qualitative coding of teacher interview data ........................................ 177
# Table of Figures

*Figure 1.1* three level digital divide framework (Wei et al., 2011) ......................................................... 17

*Figure 1.2 Roadmap of the research study* ........................................................................................................... 21

*Figure 2.1: Three level digital divide framework (Wei et al., 2011)* ................................................................. 47

*Figure 2.2: Three levels of the digital divide in learning (three level digital divide framework applied to the context of our study).* ........................................................................................................... 54

*Figure 2.3: The sociocultural framework used in our analysis (adapted from Pachler et al, 2010)* ................................................................. 56

*Figure 3.1: Five components in research design. Adapted from (Yin, 2003)* .................................................... 74

*Figure 4.1: Notable concerns raised by the decision of BYOD classroom* .................................................... 109

*Figure 4.2: Variations in the level of access to ICTs among students* ......................................................... 115

*Figure 4.3: Variations in the level of digital skills among students* ......................................................... 117

*Figure 4.4: Students nature of digital technology usage* ................................................................. 121

*Figure 4.5: Variations of digital skills among teachers* ................................................................. 128

*Figure 5.1: Staff skill levels in digital technologies* ............................................................................... 141

*Figure 5.2: Student skill levels in making meaningful use of digital devices in learning activities* ......................................................................................... 141

*Figure 5.3: Student’s nature of technology usage in school and at home (self-reported)* .. 143

*Figure 5.4: Student support for digital devices in learning measured by self-reported percentages* ........................................................................................................... 148
Figure 5.5: The sociocultural framework used in our analysis adapted from (Pachler, Bachmair, Cook, et al., 2010).

Figure 5.6: Staff skill levels in digital devices and computer technology measured by self-reported percentages.

Figure 5.7: Student skill levels in making meaningful use of digital devices in learning (bottom) measured by self-reported percentages.