

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Maori at Work:  
the Shaping of a Maori Workforce  
within the New Zealand State 1935 - 1975**

**Richard Beresford Nightingale**

**A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the  
degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Social and Cultural Studies, Massey  
University, 2007**

## ABSTRACT

This thesis examines the dynamics of the shaping of a Maori workforce within the New Zealand nation 1935 - 1975 as a significant outcome of colonial and postcolonial engagements under the introduced capitalist system. It is argued that this was part of a larger process of acculturation and assimilation of Maori.

That Maori labour formed a second stage in the incorporation of three indigenous components into the New Zealand domain of a global capitalist market system is accepted conditionally with some modification. Essentially, the first stage (from about 1840) was the need for land for the production of farm commodities; the second stage (from about 1935) was the need for industrial labour power for manufacturing production; and the third stage (from about 1975) was the appropriation of socio-cultural values as instruments to be utilized in social and economic administration by the State.

The focus is on the second stage of this process. The central objective is to assess the outcomes of this process on Maori, socially, economically and culturally. Two broad assumptions are interrogated: first, that pools of surplus Maori labour were created as an outcome of the expansion of capitalism on pre-capitalist economies; second, that the incorporation of this surplus labour via migration from about 1935 arose from patterns of capital accumulation that created excess labour demand in urban secondary industries.

Successive government policies of racial amalgamation, assimilation, adaptation and integration from 1840 through to the early 1970s, assumed that civilisation and integration were one-way processes. Government policies were predicated on concepts of assimilation and individualisation in a plethora of government initiatives in health, education, housing and social welfare, most of which were unilaterally justified on the grounds of progress and modernisation. These policies, which came to be called 'integration' in the decade of the 1960s, were perceived by government to be for the benefit of Maori and the whole nation, Pakeha and

Maori. Arguably, the *Hunn Report* of 1960/61 marked the high point of this post-colonial ideology.

The narrative of the key developments in government policies is inter-woven with an account of race relations and Maori affairs. It is emphasised that these policies were instituted during a period of enormous change in Maori society and in the configuration of relationships between Maori and Pakeha. The focus is shifted in the last section of the thesis to the response by Maori to government policies. The retreat by Maori from issues of class deprivation to the promotion of issues that centred on loss of land, language and culture is traced. It is noted that the concern with class that marked the rhetoric of many similar global protest movements was remarkably mild in the Maori protest litany. This thesis marks a first attempt to discuss the shaping of a Maori workforce by taking an approach which recognises that the separation between culture and political economy is itself culturally constructed by the dominant actor in the nation-state.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am indebted to a large number of people who in their various ways have been supportive in the shaping of this thesis. Foremost I owe much to my chief supervisor Michael Belgrave. In the discursive process of formulating many of the ideas on which this thesis is predicated I am grateful for Michael's robust signposting, erudite scholarship and laconic humour. Also, I am grateful for the quiet masterful guidance of my co-supervisor Peter Lineham whose knowledge and experience of the historical and bibliographical domain I was privileged to be able to tap into.

The following persons shared important insights with me in formal interviews over the past six years: Graham Butterworth, the late Anituatua Delamere, Angus Fletcher, Syd Jackson, the late Hugh Kawharu, Ngatata Love, the late Dennis Nathan, the late Ani Pihema, Heta Tamahori, Eriapa Uruamo and the late Noel Woods.

I extend my heartfelt aroha to many tangata whenua who provided essential insights to a tauivi novice: among them, Rangi Dansey, Edward Te Kohu Macpherson Douglas, George and the late Tauhia Hill, Witi Ihimaera, Moana Jackson, Syd Jackson, Margaret Kawharu, Merata Kawharu, Georgina Kirby, Ralph Ngatata Love, Heta and Miria Tamahori, Paul Tapsell and Eriapa Maru Uruamo. Mihi whakamoemiti kia koutou katoa.

At the University of Auckland the following gave expert guidance on request: David Bedggood (Sociology Department), Aroha Harris (History Department), Ngapare Hopa (Maori Studies Department), Hazel Petrie (Mira Szaszy Research Centre), Judith Simon, Graeme Hingangaroa Smith (Education Department), Ranginui Walker (Maori Studies) and Steve Webster (Anthropology Department). Academics at Victoria University of Wellington, who provided helpful encouragement and direction included Peter Addis, John Barrington, Richard Hill, and Charlotte Williams. Key statistical information was provided by Ian Shirley at the Auckland University of Technology. I am enormously grateful to the very

experienced staff of the Historical Branch, Department of Culture and Heritage, most particularly to Malcolm McKinnon, John Martin, Claudia Orange and Mere Whaanga who were enormously generous with their time and their knowledge.

At the Auckland War Memorial Museum Library, Paul Tapsell provided a scholarly overview and update of many of the documents held by them. I am appreciative of the permission granted by Rangi Dansey to cite from his father's papers archived at that Library.

A score or more librarians, archivists and scholars warrant my sincere appreciation. Among them I need to mention Ian Grant (Auckland City Libraries: Special Collections), John Laurie (University of Auckland Library), Honiana Love (Archives NZ, Wellington), Valerie Morse (Alexander Turnbull Library), Dorothy Neilson (Fletcher Challenge Ltd Archives), Georgia Prince (Auckland City Libraries: Special Collections), Lauri Tapsell (Australian Provincial Newspapers: *New Zealand Herald*) and David Verran (Auckland City Libraries: Auckland Research Centre).

I am humbled by many robust critiques of some of the earlier draft chapters from Richard Hill, Wynne Spring-Rice, David Verran and Marilyn Woolford. The responsibility for the final product however remains firmly in my court.

To my cousin Tony Nightingale my heartfelt thanks for his hospitality during my document gathering expeditions in Wellington, combing through the paper records of government at Archives NZ, the General Assembly Library and the Turnbull Library. I am also mindful of the useful information on searching these enormous archives that was freely given on request by two distinguished experts of (and on) the political world, Barry Gustafson and Michael Bassett.

Finally and most fulsomely to my dear friends – Caril and Brian, Marilyn and Graham, my dear brother Peter and his children and my mate, Dave for their unconditional aroha in this labour of love.

## ABBREVIATIONS

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| ACC           | Auckland City Council   |
| ACL           | Auckland City Libraries   |
| ACLSC         | Auckland City Libraries Special Collections                       |
| AFFCO         | Auckland Farmers Freezing Company                                 |
| <i>AJHR</i>   | <i>Appendices to the Journals of the House of Representatives</i> |
| a.k.a.        | also known as (alias)   |
| ANZ           | Archives New Zealand  |
| <i>AJPP</i>   | <i>Australian Journal of Psychology and Philosophy.</i>           |
| <i>ANZJS</i>  | <i>Australia &amp; New Zealand Journal of Sociology</i>           |
| app, apps     | appendix, appendices  |
| <i>AS</i>     | <i>Auckland Star</i>  |
| assoc.        | association   |
| Assn          | Association   |
| ATL           | Alexander Turnbull Library  |
| ATLET         | Alexander Turnbull Library Endowment Trust                        |
| AUC           | Auckland University College                                       |
| AUP           | Auckland University Press   |
| A & U         | Allen & Unwin   |
| AWMML         | Auckland War Memorial Museum Library                              |
| B.I.A.        | Bureau of Indian Affairs (USA)                                    |
| BJP           | Blackwood and Janet Paul  |
| BWB           | Bridget Williams Books  |
| ca.           | circa (Latin) = about   |
| Calif.        | California (state of USA)   |
| Canterbury UP | Canterbury University Press                                       |
| CARE          | Citizens Against Racial Exploitation                              |
| CFRT          | Crown Forestry Rental Trust                                       |
| ch, chs       | chapter, chapters   |
| Co/co(s)      | C/company (companies)   |
| Columbia UP   | Columbia University Press   |
| Cornell UP    | Cornell University Press  |
| <i>CSM</i>    | <i>Christian Science Monitor</i>                                  |
| Ct.           | Connecticut (state of USA)  |
| CUP           | Cambridge University Press  |
| Dept.         | Department  |
| DI            | Deeds Index   |
| <i>DNB</i>    | <i>Dictionary of National Biography.</i>                          |
| <i>DNZB</i>   | <i>Dictionary of New Zealand Biography.</i>                       |
| doc, docs     | document, documents   |
| Dom           | Dominion  |
| doc, docs     | document, documents   |
| <i>DSC</i>    | <i>Daily Southern Cross</i>                                       |
| DUP           | Duke University Press   |
| ed            | edition, editor   |
| EEC           | European Economic Community                                       |
| encl          | enclosure   |
| <i>EP</i>     | <i>Evening Post.</i>  |

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| ESCAP         | Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific  |
| EU            | European Union   |
| FCLA          | Fletcher Challenge Limited Archives  |
| ff            | following  |
| fol, fols     | folio, folios  |
| GA & U        | George Allen & Unwin   |
| GP            | Government Printer   |
| HER           | <i>Harvard Educational Review</i>  |
| HT            | <i>History &amp; Theory.</i>   |
| HP            | Heinemann Publishers   |
| HR            | Heinemann Reed   |
| HRC           | Human Rights Commission  |
| HS            | Hodder & Stoughton   |
| HR & W        | Holt, Rinehart and Winston   |
| HUP           | Harvard University Press   |
| ibid.         | in the same book, chapter or passage, etc., already cited above.                                       |
| Ill.          | Illinois (state of USA)  |
| ILO           | International Labour Organisation  |
| Int. Aff.     | Dept. of Internal Affairs (New Zealand).   |
| IRI           | International Research Institute for Maori and Indigenous Education<br>(at the University of Auckland) |
| IRC           | Industrial Relations Centre (at Victoria University of Wellington)                                     |
| IRR           | Institute of Race Relations (London, UK)   |
| JAWHS         | <i>Journal of Auckland &amp; Waikato Historical Society.</i>   |
| JCS           | <i>Journal of Curriculum Studies</i>   |
| JE.           | <i>Journal of Ethnohistory.</i>  |
| JHUP          | John Hopkins University Press.   |
| JPacH.        | <i>Journal of Pacific History.</i>   |
| JPS.          | <i>Journal of the Polynesian Society.</i>  |
| JPSt.         | <i>Journal of Political Studies.</i>   |
| JSA           | <i>Journal of Social Archaeology</i>   |
| LEG           | <i>Labour and Employment Gazette</i>   |
| LINZ          | Land Information New Zealand   |
| LP            | Longman Paul   |
| Ma.           | Maine (state of USA)   |
| MA            | Master of Arts   |
| MA            | Maori Affairs series (National Archives)   |
| Manchester UP | Manchester University Press  |
| Mass.         | Massachusetts (state of USA)   |
| MEEC          | Maori Education and Employment Committee   |
| Memo          | memorandum/a   |
| MHR           | Member of the House of Representatives   |
| MOOHR         | Maori Organisation on Human Rights   |
| MOW           | Ministry of Works (New Zealand)  |
| MPhil         | Master of Philosophy   |
| Ms, Mss       | Manuscript, Manuscripts  |
| MSocSc        | Master of Social Science   |
| MU            | Massey University  |
| MUP           | Melbourne University Press   |
| MWEO          | Maori War Effort Organisation  |



|             |   |
|-------------|---|
| NALTO       | North Auckland Land Titles Office                             |
| Nat Lib     | National Library of New Zealand/Te Puna Matauranga o Aotearoa |
| NC          | North Carolina (state of USA)                                 |
| NCC         | National Council of Churches                                  |
| nd          | no date   |
| no, nos     | number, numbers   |
| NZCER       | New Zealand Council for Educational Research                  |
| NZF         | <i>New Zealand Farmer.</i>                                    |
| NZG         | <i>New Zealand Gazette.</i>                                   |
| NGO         | Non-government Organisation/s                                 |
| NZH         | <i>New Zealand Herald.</i>                                    |
| NZHPT       | New Zealand Historic Places Trust                             |
| NI          | North Island  |
| NJ          | New Jersey (State of USA)                                     |
| NY          | New York (City and/or State of USA)                           |
| NZ / N.Z.   | New Zealand   |
| NZIIA       | New Zealand Institute of International Affairs                |
| NZIPA       | New Zealand Institute of Public Administration                |
| NZIPR       | New Zealand Institute of Pacific Relations                    |
| NZJES       | <i>New Zealand Journal of Educational Studies</i>             |
| NZJH        | <i>New Zealand Journal of History.</i>                        |
| NZJP        | <i>New Zealand Journal of Psychology</i>                      |
| NZJIR       | <i>New Zealand Journal of Industrial Relations.</i>           |
| NZLR        | <i>New Zealand Law Reports.</i>                               |
| NZJPA       | <i>New Zealand Journal of Public Administration</i>           |
| NZMJ        | <i>New Zealand Medical Journal</i>                            |
| NZPC        | New Zealand Planning Council                                  |
| NZPD        |   |
| (Hansard)   | <i>New Zealand Parliamentary Debates.</i>                     |
| NZPR        | <i>New Zealand Population Review</i>                          |
| NZR         | New Zealand Railways  |
| NZULR       | <i>New Zealand Universities Law Review.</i>                   |
| NZUP        | New Zealand University Press                                  |
| ODNB        | <i>Oxford Dictionary of National Biography</i>                |
| op. cit.    | in the work already quoted/cited.                             |
| o'rs        | others  |
| Ords        | Ordinances  |
| OUP         | Oxford University Press                                       |
| p, pp       | page, pages   |
| Pa          | Pennsylvania (state of USA)                                   |
| PANZ        | Population Association of New Zealand                         |
| passim      | throughout  |
| PB          | Penguin Books   |
| PhD         | Doctor of Philosophy  |
| P/pub       | P/publishing  |
| PUP         | Princeton University Press                                    |
| P.W.D./ PWD | Public Works Department                                       |
| qv/qqv      | which see (refer to)  |
| RCSP        | Royal Commission on Social Policy                             |
| rev. ed.    | revised edition   |

|                   |  |
|-------------------|--|
| RKP               | Routledge and Kegan Paul                                       |
| RRC               | Race Relations Conciliator                                     |
| RUP               | Rutgers University Press                                       |
| s, ss             | section, sections (of an Act)                                  |
| sec, secs         | section, sections (of an article, book, report, etc.)          |
| sess              | session (of House of Representatives; or Legislative Council)  |
| SI                | South Island   |
| s.n.              | without name   |
| SNZ               | <i>Statutes of New Zealand.</i>                                |
| SP                | Smithsonian Press  |
| SSC               | State Services Commission                                      |
| SRCNZS            | Stout Research Centre for New Zealand Studies (at VUW)         |
| SUP               | Sydney University Press  |
| TCP               | The Christchurch Press   |
| TPK               | Te Puni Kokiri (Ministry of Maori Development)                 |
| TUHP              | Trade Union History Project                                    |
| TUP               | Temple University Press  |
| TWRU              | Treaty of Waitangi Research Unit (at SRCNZS at VUW)            |
| UA                | University of Auckland   |
| UALA              | University of Auckland Library Archives                        |
| UAr               | University of Arizona  |
| UC                | University of Canterbury                                       |
| UCP               | University of California Press                                 |
| UGP               | University of Georgia Press                                    |
| UK                | United Kingdom   |
| UL                | University of London   |
| UMP               | University of Minnesota Press                                  |
| UN                | United Nations   |
| UNESCO/<br>Unesco | United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organisation |
| UNP               | University of Nebraska Press                                   |
| UNZ               | University of New Zealand                                      |
| UO                | University of Otago  |
| UOP               | University of Otago Press                                      |
| UP                | University Press   |
| <i>UTQ</i>        | <i>University of Toronto Quarterly</i>                         |
| UW                | University of Waikato  |
| UWP               | University of Wisconsin Press                                  |
| USA               | United States of America                                       |
| Vic               | Victoria (State of Australia)                                  |
| VUC               | Victoria University College (of the University of New Zealand) |
| VUP               | Victoria University Press                                      |
| VUW               | Victoria University of Wellington                              |
| <i>VUWLR</i>      | <i>Victoria University of Wellington Law Review.</i>           |
| Vol/vol, vols     | V/volume, volumes  |
| WAI               | Waitangi Tribunal claim  |
| <i>WHR</i>        | <i>Women's History Review</i>                                  |
| Wis               | Wisconsin (State of USA)                                       |
| W & T             | Whitcombe & Tombs  |
| WWI               | World War I  |

WWII  
YUP

World War II  
Yale University Press.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>Abstract</b>  | ii  |
| <b>Acknowledgements</b>  | iv  |
| <b>Abbreviations</b>   | vi  |
| <b>Table of Contents</b>   | x   |
| <b>Chapter One: Introduction</b>   | 1   |
| <b>Chapter Two: Literature Review</b>  | 16  |
| 2.01. Introduction   |     |
| 2.02. Overview   |     |
| 2.03. Elsdon Best and his peers  |     |
| 2.04. Firth as Colossus  |     |
| 2.05. Ngata's Practical (and Political) Stance   |     |
| 2.06. The Politicisation of Maori: Labour and Ratana   |     |
| 2.07. The Politicisation of Academia from the 1940s: Beagleholes, Ritchies and others  |     |
| 2.08. Assimilation and its aftermath   |     |
| 2.09. Left-wing Political Economy.   |     |
| 2.10. The State's Role in Structuring the Labour Market  |     |
| 2.20. Government Policies: Historical interpretations: Introduction & Overview   |     |
| 2.21. Literature on Land for the Production of Farm Commodities  |     |
| 2.22. Assimilation, Integration and the Hunn Report  |     |
| 2.23. The Modern Era: Challenge, Confrontation & Contestation (1974 - 2000)  |     |
| 2.24. 4 <sup>th</sup> Labour Government 1984-90 and the 4 <sup>th</sup> National Government 1990-99                                      |     |
| 2.25. The Paradigms Proliferate: Colonialism, Post-Colonialism, Race or Class: Some Structural, Situational and Subjective Perspectives. |     |
| 2.26. Other Academic Viewpoints  |     |
| 2.27. Conclusion   |     |
| <b>Chapter Three: Theoretical Perspectives</b>   | 51  |
| 3.01. Introduction   |     |
| 3.02. The Nature of History  |     |
| 3.03. Two Paradigms  |     |
| 3.04. Dependency Theory  |     |
| 3.05. The Native American Model  |     |
| 3.06. Other Critical Tools.  |     |
| 3.07. Can the Subaltern Speak? The Place of Maori in Postcolonial Studies: Debates and Discourses.                                       |     |
| 3.08. The Notion of Agency.  |     |
| 3.09. Decolonisation: Further Postcolonial Discourse.  |     |
| 3.10. Conclusion   |     |
| <b>Chapter Four: A Rural Proletariat: the Opening of the Narrative</b>   | 77  |
| 4.01. Introduction: Overview and the Introduction of Capitalist Work Systems   |     |
| 4.02. The Entrepreneurial Battle   |     |
| 4.03. Amalgamation on a Firmer Footing   |     |
| 4.04. Labour in the Settlers' Pastoral Economy   |     |
| 4.05. Ngata's Views  |     |
| 4.06. Ratana versus Kingitanga   |     |
| 4.07. Schooling the Maori in Practical Matters: Learning the 'Dignity of Labour'   |     |
| 4.08. Creating an Elite: Denominational Schools for Maori Boys and Girls   |     |
| 4.09. The Success of the Native/Maori Schools?   |     |
| 4.10. Other Native Labour Engagements: the Kauri Timber and Kauri Gum Industries   |     |
| 4.11. Kauri Timber Industry  |     |
| 4.12. Kauri Gum Industry   |     |
| 4.13. A Family's Story   |     |
| 4.14. A Snapshot prior to Modernisation, about 1910-1920   |     |
| 4.15. The Modernisation of Maori   |     |
| 4.16. Conclusion   |     |
| <b>Chapter Five: The Welfare State: Full Employment and Beyond</b>   | 119 |
| 5.01. Introduction   |     |
| 5.02. Political Overview 1935 - 49   |     |
| 5.03. Economic Salvation in Land? Or Work?   |     |
| 5.04. The Transition to Urban Labour   |     |
| 5.05. Benign Segregation?  |     |
| 5.06. The Impact of Global War   |     |
| 5.07. Rehabilitation   |     |
| 5.08. Government Direction in Employment Matters?  |     |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 5.09. Inter-Departmental Liaison   |            |
| 5.10. Internal or Overseas Immigrants?   |            |
| 5.11. Full Employment  |            |
| 5.12. Industry in the Country?   |            |
| 5.13. Key Features of Post-War Industrial Development.   |            |
| 5.14. The First National Government 1949 - 1957  |            |
| 5.15. 'Hand in hand: a roof and a job'   |            |
| 5.16. The Impact of Urbanisation in the Provinces  |            |
| 5.17. Social Issues  |            |
| 5.18. The East Coast Situation   |            |
| 5.19. The Employment Situation Elsewhere   |            |
| 5.20. Longer Academic Perspectives   |            |
| 5.21. Prosperity for Maori in Forestry Industry?   |            |
| 5.22. Industrial Distribution of the Maori Workforce   |            |
| 5.23. Maori Distinctiveness: Racial Segmentation of the Labour Market?                           |            |
| 5.24. Worker Organisation / Trade Unions.  |            |
| 5.25. The Position of Maori at the End of the 1950s  |            |
| 5.26. Conclusion   |            |
| <b>Chapter Six: From Integration to Biculturalism</b>  | <b>166</b> |
| 6.01. Introduction   |            |
| 6.02. Race Relations I: Overview   |            |
| 6.03. Race Relations II: Prelude - NZ as Utopia - 1960   |            |
| 6.04. Race Relations III: The 1960s: The End of the Golden Weather                               |            |
| 6.05. The <i>Hunn Report</i> : its origins and production  |            |
| 6.06. The <i>Hunn Report</i> as political intervention in Maori socio-economic issues            |            |
| 6.07. J.K. Hunn's Policy Intentions  |            |
| 6.08. The <i>Hunn Report</i> : the Text: focussing on Race, Class, Culture, Ethnicity Issues     |            |
| 6.09. The <i>Hunn Report</i> : Reactions and Responses   |            |
| 6.10. <i>Hunn Report</i> Outcomes  |            |
| 6.11. An Employment Transformation?  |            |
| 6.12. Unemployment Emerges   |            |
| 6.13. A Semantic Trope: Integration or Assimilation: Which is which?                             |            |
| <b>Chapter Seven: The Unravelling of Paternalism</b>   | <b>218</b> |
| 7.01. Race Relations IV: The 1970s: The Renaissance of Te Ao Maori: Ka whawhai tonu matou        |            |
| 7.02. The Shift to Biculturalism   |            |
| 7.03. Biculturalism  |            |
| 7.04. Race Relations V: The 1980s: the Pakeha Majority takes Notice: 'We are all New Zealanders' |            |
| <b>Chapter Eight: Conclusion</b>   | <b>246</b> |
| <b>Bibliography</b>  | <b>261</b> |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>List of Tables</b>  |            |
| Numbers Engaged in Gum Industry 1874 – 1926  | 103        |
| Occupations of the 485 men of the First Maori Contingent, ca. 1918                               | 114-5      |
| Percentage of Homes with Household Amenities 1956  | 164        |
| Maori by Occupation Group 1956-81.   | 206-7      |
| Maori Males in Unskilled & Semi-Skilled Occupations 1961 & 1966.                                 | 207-8      |