Curriculum integration for early adolescent schooling in Aotearoa New Zealand: worthy of serious trial.

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Education

at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Richard Anthony (Tony) Dowden

2007
Abstract

The concept of curriculum integration has long held seductive appeal as a way to unite knowledge and meet the educational needs of young people. However, researchers have largely dismissed the concept as a romantic but unworkable idea. Nonetheless in the short history of education in Aotearoa New Zealand (NZ), notions of integration have persistently reappeared in the national curriculum. In the 1930s, innovative teachers implemented world-class examples of curriculum integration in rural schools. Later, the Freyberg Project (1986-1991) demonstrated that curriculum integration admirably meets the needs of young people. Recently, the Ministry of Education trialled curriculum integration in several schools but, since the literature indicates that curriculum integration is represented by a plethora of models, this raised an important question: which model is preferable?

This thesis combines historical and theoretical methodology to conduct an investigation of the concept of curriculum integration with respect to the needs of early adolescents in NZ. The historical investigation demonstrates that curriculum integration is best described by two broad traditions which stem from nineteenth century USA: the ‘student-centred’ approach based on Dewey’s ‘organic’ education and the ‘subject-centred’ approach based on the Herbartian notion of ‘correlation’. These two approaches are represented in current practice by the student-centred integrative model (Beane, 1990/1993) and the subject-centred multidisciplinary model (Jacobs, 1989). The theoretical investigation draws from American experience to examine the respective claims of the integrative and multidisciplinary models as the preferred model of curriculum integration for middle schooling. It finds that the ‘thick’ ethics associated with the politics of the integrative model ensures that it meets the needs of all early adolescents whereas the ‘thin’ ethics of the multidisciplinary model is indifferent to the needs of young people. The thesis concludes that the integrative model should be seriously considered in the middle years in NZ. It also concludes that historical understandings of curriculum integration are vital to further research, policy-making and teacher education. Moreover, attention to political and ethical issues would enhance implementation of the integrative model in NZ and would help avoid a set of problems which have impeded implementation of the model in the USA.
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my heartfelt appreciation to my supervisor Associate Professor Pat Nolan for his enthusiastic guidance, measured patience and endless encouragement: right from my earliest conceptualisations towards a research framework through to the completion of my thesis. I am also immensely grateful to my second supervisor Professor Roger Openshaw for his scholarly attention to detail, his succinct and accurate advice and, not least, his great kindness.
Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to my wife
Marina
and our children, Ben and Christina
with my love and gratitude
# Table of contents

## Preliminaries
- Abstract ........................................................................... ii
- Acknowledgements ............................................................ iii
- Dedication ........................................................................ iv
- Table of contents .............................................................. v
- List of tables ........................................................................ x
- List of figures ....................................................................... xi

## Chapter 1

### Introduction
- Preamble ........................................................................ 1
- Overview of the thesis .................................................... 5
- The thesis structure ......................................................... 6
- Conclusion ........................................................................ 10

## Chapter 2

### Recent understandings of curriculum integration in the literature ........... 11
- Recent understandings of curriculum integration in NZ: a case study ........... 11
- The recent literature of curriculum integration ........................................ 14
- Fragmented terminology ...................................................... 15
- New models ........................................................................ 18
- Lack of differentiation or discernment ............................................. 20
- The importance of the historical meanings of integration ....................... 21
- Conclusion ........................................................................ 23

## Chapter 3

### The American progressives and curriculum integration ....................... 24
- Section 1: Early progressive curricula and notions of integration ............... 24
- The progressive movement and its main factions .................................... 24
- Dewey’s organic community-centred curriculum .................................... 28
- Personal integration ................................................................ 29
- Social integration and democratic education ....................................... 30
Chapter 5
Progressive education and curriculum integration in New Zealand

Section 1: The leaders of progressive education in NZ
Hogben: reform attempts in the 19th century
Milner: towards a liberal curriculum for all
Beeby: architect of educational reform
The 1937 NEF Conference
Early adolescent schooling
Educational reform
The Thomas Report
Support in the Thomas Report for integration
The Thomas Report and social studies
The aftermath of the Thomas Report
The impact of the NZ progressives on the teaching profession

Section 2: Curriculum innovations in NZ during the 1930s and 1940s
Favourable conditions for innovation
Practical education in Māori schools
The model cottage
The school newspaper
Other noteworthy innovators
Self government
Towards an indigenous model of curriculum integration: the school farm
Curriculum integration: from the ‘school farm’ to the wider rural community
Understandings of curriculum integration in the 1940s
Understandings of curriculum integration after the 1940s
The Freyberg Integrated Studies Project
Conclusion

Chapter 6
The general theory of the multidisciplinary and integrative models

Section 1: The multidisciplinary model
Correlation as ‘horizontal integration’
Jacobs’ multidisciplinary model
Ackerman’s ‘criteria for excellence’
Chapter 9

Summary and conclusion ................................................................. 173
Section 1: The conceptual framework ............................................. 173
Section 2: The historical investigation ............................................. 173
Historical understandings of curriculum integration from the USA .... 178
Historical understandings of curriculum integration from Britain ... 179
Historical understandings of curriculum integration from New Zealand. 181
Section 3: The theoretical investigation ........................................... 184
Section 4: Implications of the historical and theoretical investigations ... 189
Section 5: Further research ............................................................. 194
Comparative research ................................................................. 195
Historical research: searching for lost meanings or understandings ...... 196
Teachers of the integrative model: can pedagogies remain independent? ..... 196
Who should select the subject matter of integrative curricula? ............ 197
Can the discourse of the integrative model coexist with other discourses? ... 197
Will other discourses compromise the integrative model? .................. 198
Final remarks ........................................................................... 201

Bibliography ............................................................................... 204
List of tables

Table 1: Recent terminology of curriculum integration ........................................ 15
Table 2: Terminology for the concept of curriculum integration .......................... 22
Table 3: Historic examples of curriculum integration in USA, Britain and NZ.. 183
Table 4: Comparison of models of curriculum integration ............................... 185
List of figures

Figure 1: Diagram of the integrative curriculum ................................................. 129
Figure 2: Recommended terminology for curriculum integration ...................... 176
Figure 3: The integrative model without its conceptual matrix ....................... 200