Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Holistic Professional Military Development

Growing strategic artists

Murray Simons

Education is the kindling of a flame, not the filling of a vessel.

-Socrates
Holistic Professional Military Development:
Growing strategic artists

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Education

at Massey University, Palmerston North,
New Zealand.

Murray Vaughan Simons

2009
Abstract

Professional military education is a well-established system in most modern militaries. Like all things though, incremental and ad hoc improvements to legacy approaches typically lead to reduced quality. It is therefore, essential to periodically review the entire system for holistic effectiveness. For military education, this need is particularly important when the global security environment is experiencing such rapid change. Added to this is the emerging understanding of the ‘new sciences’ that provides a unique opportunity to improve cognitive agility when confronting complex adaptive systems. There is also an urgent need to acknowledge and enhance the intangible dimension of professional military education beyond mere content-centric subject expertise. From the literature on hidden learning and constructivism, there are a number of opportunities available for modernizing the legacy paradigm of professional military education.

This study investigated the role of holistic learning (formal, non-formal, informal, self-directed, and incidental learning) in the professional development of 29 mid-career military officers. It involved detailed study of their participation on the seven-month staff course at the New Zealand Defence College from May to December 2008. Mixed methodology data collection included observations, interviews, questionnaires, focus groups, and document analysis. Analytic procedures ranged from statistical comparisons through to qualitative theme constructs. The study found a number of dimensions (sources and influences) contributing to holistic learning. It also identified a number of opportunities to improve the learning experience.

The findings identify a number of important factors in developing strategic artists. Of these, the greatest need is for a strategic plan to extend the current content-centric syllabus into a full curriculum with intangible traits clearly linked to formal and informal learning activities. Specific components required in this strategic plan include an academic philosophy and a cross-referencing matrix. The study also recommends reviewing time allocated to cross-discipline learning of the profession and cognitive agility focused on deep learning. There is also a need to re-examine the directing staff requirements, management of learner stress, and shaping practical-value motivation strategies through cultural artefacts. Collectively, the findings recommend shifting from the traditional vessel-filling paradigm of formal courses to a sociological approach of growing strategic leaders.
Acknowledgements

To my family, friends, and work colleagues who encouraged, supported, and tolerated my moments of distraction. To my supervisors, colleagues, reviewers, and commentators, who inspired me through the journey. But most of all, to the participants who welcomed me in to their lives and without whose help none of this would have been possible.

Ethics approval

This study was conducted in accordance with Massey University Human Ethics Committee approval 07/64. Additional approval to conduct the study was granted by the Assistant Chief of Defence (Personnel), New Zealand Defence Force in accordance with Defence Force Order 21/2002.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ..................................................................................................................................... i

Table of Contents .................................................................................................................. iii

List of Tables ......................................................................................................................... x

List of Figures ......................................................................................................................... x

Chapter 1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 1

Aim ........................................................................................................................................... 1

Research Question .................................................................................................................. 2

Holistic ..................................................................................................................................... 3

Professional Military Development ......................................................................................... 4

Complex Adaptive Systems .................................................................................................... 6

Strategic Art ............................................................................................................................. 11

Levels of Military Activity ..................................................................................................... 12

Strategic Artist ......................................................................................................................... 14

Professional Wisdom ............................................................................................................. 15

Growing Strategic Artists ....................................................................................................... 17

Increasing Cognitive Agility ................................................................................................. 21

The New Zealand Command and Staff Course ..................................................................... 22

Holistic Learning Initiatives ................................................................................................... 25

Researcher’s Background ........................................................................................................ 28

Thesis Structure ..................................................................................................................... 29

Chapter 2 Conceptual Frameworks ......................................................................................... 31

Conceptual Framework ........................................................................................................... 31

Learning ................................................................................................................................... 33

Types of Learning .................................................................................................................... 33

The Four Foci of Learning ....................................................................................................... 34
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning to Learn</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning the Game</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning to be an Expert</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning the Profession</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exchange and Practical Value Motivations</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Depth of Learning</strong></td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approaches to Learning</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depth of Learning to Learn and Learning the Game</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depth of Learning to be an Expert and Learning the Profession</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Improving Learning Depth</strong></td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inductive Learning</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limits to Learning Depth</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Holistic Learning Sources</strong></td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Learning</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hidden Learning</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Formal Learning</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum Shadow</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal Learning</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incidental Learning</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-directed Learning</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Hidden Curriculum</strong></td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hidden Curriculum Taxonomy</strong></td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Favourability</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deliberateness</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual differences</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impermanence</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summary</strong></td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Content Analysis of Journals

- Validating the Case Study .......................................................... 103
- Surveys ......................................................................................... 104
- Document analysis ......................................................................... 104
- Other quantitative data sources ...................................................... 104

**Summary** ...................................................................................... 105

## Chapter 5 Quantitative Results

- Learning Sources ........................................................................ 107
  - Course timetable by learning source .......................................... 108
  - Time allocation by learning source ........................................... 109
  - Comparison of learning source by module ................................. 110
  - OST Timetable Analysis ............................................................. 111
  - Comparison of Non-formal learning ........................................... 112

- Comparison of Sources by Reported Learning Value ..................... 114
  - Overseas Study Tour ................................................................. 114

- Non-formal Learning Activities ..................................................... 115
  - Overseas Study Tour ................................................................. 116
  - Journals ....................................................................................... 117
  - Reflections Sessions .................................................................... 120
  - Participant contribution by group size ....................................... 122

- The Four Learning Foci ................................................................. 125
  - Learning to Learn ....................................................................... 125
  - Learning the Game ..................................................................... 128
  - Learning to be an Expert ............................................................ 132
  - Learning the Profession .............................................................. 134

- Secondary Data Patterns ............................................................... 137
  - Comparison of nationality influences ....................................... 137
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comparison of Foci Attainment</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summary</strong></td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 6 Qualitative Results</strong></td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning Sources</strong></td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Formal Learning</strong></td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non Formal Learning</strong></td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field Trips</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflection Sessions</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical Reflective Journals</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Assessments</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self-directed Learning</strong></td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Informal Learning</strong></td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer learning and network building</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Optional elements</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travelling Time (Bus and Car Trips)</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing Rooms during Trips</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organised On-Campus Social Events</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meals</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Official Receptions</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OST Unofficial Social Events</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OST Free Time Excursions</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Incidental Learning</strong></td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet and Intranet based communication</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After-hours Activities</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning Foci</strong></td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning to Learn</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning the Game</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning to be an Expert</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Learning the Profession ................................................................. 189

Influences on Holistic Learning ................................................... 190
  Influence of Motivation Systems on Holistic Learning .............. 190
  Influence of Directing Staff on Holistic Learning ................... 192
  Influence of Student Stress on Holistic Learning ..................... 193
  Influence of Workload Intensity on Holistic Learning ............... 194

Deep Learning and Cognitive Agility ......................................... 196

Summary ..................................................................................... 200

Chapter 7 Discussion ................................................................. 201
  Holistic Learning’s Contribution to Professional Military Development .... 201
  The Complexity of Holistic Learning ........................................... 205
  Learner Empowerment Influences Holistic Learning ................. 206
  Motivation Systems Influenced Holistic Learning ..................... 207
  Student Stress Influenced Holistic Learning ............................. 207
  Workload Intensity Influenced Holistic Learning ...................... 209
  Learner Diversity Influenced Holistic Learning Experience ........ 209
  Staff Influenced the Holistic Learning Experience .................... 210
  Summary .................................................................................. 211

Chapter 8 Conclusion ................................................................. 213

Promote Holistic Learning ......................................................... 213
  Develop an Academic Philosophy ............................................. 214
  Develop an Assessment Philosophy ......................................... 214
  Develop a Holistic Learning Matrix .......................................... 216

Increase Cognitive Agility ......................................................... 218
  Encourage Deep Learning ...................................................... 221
  Empower Learners ................................................................. 222
  Embrace Learner Diversity ..................................................... 223
  Increase Time for Deep Learning ............................................ 224
Holistic PMD

Manage Student Stress ................................................................. 224
Focus Assessment on Learning Outcomes .................................. 225
Improve Academic Staff Competency ......................................... 226

Increase Holistic Awareness of the Profession ............................... 227

Reality Check ............................................................................ 228
The dilemmas of holistic learning .............................................. 228

Study Limitations ........................................................................ 229
Further Research ......................................................................... 230
Coup d’Grâce ............................................................................. 231

Appendix 1 Glossary ..................................................................... 233
Appendix 2 Related and alternate labels for hidden learning .......... 237
Appendix 3 Questionnaires .......................................................... 239
OST Questionnaire ...................................................................... 239
Graduand Questionnaire (includes consolidated results) ......... 240

Appendix 4 Case Study Validation ................................................ 243
Appendix 5 Course Timeline ........................................................ 247
Appendix 6 Extract from the psc Course Syllabus ......................... 249
Appendix 7 Extract from University IR Module Prescription .......... 251
Appendix 8 Ethics Approval Documentation ................................. 253

References .................................................................................. 259
List of Tables

Table 2 Data Collection Matrix ........................................................................................................ 105
Table 3 Formal, Non-formal, and Informal Learning Allocations .................................................. 108
Table 4 Breakdown of timetabled learning activities ........................................................................ 109
Table 5 OST Programme Comparison (2006, 2007, and 2008) ...................................................... 111
Table 6 Deliverables comparison between PGDipArts and psc ...................................................... 112
Table 7 OST Learning Sources ranked by self-reported learning value ........................................ 114
Table 8 OST Journal Content Comparison (Sources and Foci) ...................................................... 120
Table 9 Summarised key statistics of a large-group Course Reflection Session .......................... 122
Table 10 Summary of Data Themes and Associated Recommendations .................................... 212

List of Figures

Figure 1 Holistic Learning ............................................................................................................. 3
Figure 2 The Professional Military Development Continuum ....................................................... 5
Figure 3 Complex, Adaptive, and Complicated Dimensions ......................................................... 7
Figure 4 Systems Diagram (from Flood & Jackson, 1991a) .......................................................... 8
Figure 5 Levels of Military Thinking .......................................................................................... 13
Figure 6 The Professional Wisdom Taxonomy ............................................................................. 15
Figure 7 Conceptual Framework .............................................................................................. 32
Figure 8 Ausubel and Robinson’s (1966) Learning Grid ............................................................... 33
Figure 9 The Holistic Concept of the Profession of Arms (from Simons 2008b) ...................... 41
Figure 10 Inter-relationship of the Four Foci of Learning ............................................................. 43
Figure 11 Learning depth construct comparisons ........................................................................ 45
Figure 12 Conceptions of learning and levels (from Entwistle, 2000, p. 2) ................................. 52
Figure 13 Learning Matrix adapted from Mocker and Spear, (1982, p. 4) ............................... 55
Figure 14 The Learning Spectrum ............................................................................................... 57
Figure 15 Mixed-Methodology Research Design Framework ........................................ 92
Figure 16 The Taxonomy of Data Analysis ................................................................. 106
Figure 17 Module breakdown by Learning Source (allocated) ..................................... 110
Figure 18 Cluster graph of ranked learning sources .................................................. 115
Figure 19 OST value for consolidating first semester learning .................................. 116
Figure 20 OST Question 2: Journal Value .................................................................. 117
Figure 21 Reflection Session Group-size Preference .................................................. 121
Figure 22 Ranked contribution frequencies for a large-group Reflection Session ......... 122
Figure 23 Total verbal contributions by students during the OST ............................ 123
Figure 24 Percentage of discussion contributions by percentage of group size........ 124
Figure 25 Learning to learn (combined scores of nine learning to learn items) ......... 125
Figure 26 Staff Course helped me learn more from my classmates than the lecturers ................................................................. 126
Figure 27 Item 5: Staff Course helped me to consider things from other national perspectives ........................................................................................................ 126
Figure 28 Item 4: Staff Course helped me to tolerate stress and deadline pressure ................................................................. 127
Figure 29 Item 14: Staff course helped me to be more self-aware ............................... 128
Figure 30 Consolidated results of all items coded ‘learning the game’ ....................... 129
Figure 31 Item 6: Staff Course helped me to comply with university or staff college regulations .................................................................................................................................... 129
Figure 32 Item 8: Realization the Staff Course is more about university grades than psc work .................................................................................................................................... 130
Figure 33 Item 19: Ability to speak confidently without knowledge ............................ 131
Figure 34 Learning to be an expert by modules .......................................................... 132
Figure 35 Item 31: The Staff Course help me to link material from different topics into the bigger picture .................................................................................................................................... 134
Figure 36 Item 26: Staff Course helped me to regard lecturers as experts and not to be argued with .................................................................................................................................... 135
Figure 37 Item 27 Staff Course helped me realize academic expertise is far from real expertise................................................................. 136

Figure 38 Ranked Learning Sources by Nationality ................................................. 138

Figure 39 Nationality comparison for Item 25 (Challenge conventional wisdom)..... 138

Figure 40 Nationality comparison for Item 26: Self-efficacy by nationality grouping ................................................................. 139

Figure 41 Nationality differences in OST Question 1: Value of the OST .................. 140

Figure 42 Nationality differences in OST Question 2: Value of Journal .................... 140

Figure 43 Nationality differences in OST Question 5: Work Life Balance ................ 141

Figure 44 Nationality comparison for consolidated Graduand Questionnaire items .............................. 142

Figure 45 Nationality comparison of Item 11 (Appreciating joint acculturation) ....... 143

Figure 46 Nationality comparison for Item 20 (the value of socialisation) ............... 144

Figure 47 Overall attainment by learning foci.......................................................... 145

Figure 48 Holistic Learning Matrix........................................................................ 217

Figure 49 Graduand Questionnaire with percentage results.................................... 241

Figure 50 Overall combined averages by category .................................................. 242

Figure 51 Case Study Comparison with previous courses................................. 243