Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Blogs, Political Discussion and the 2005 New Zealand General Election

Kane Hopkins

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of PhD in Communication at Massey University

February 2009
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This whole thing was Susan Fountaine’s idea – for that, along with her wisdom and kindness, I will be eternally grateful – I think.

I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr Nikki Hessell and Dr Donald Matheson, for their support throughout the research project. Their competence and insights were important and they have both shown themselves to be almost saintly by their ability to put up with my frustrations and confusion, and somehow turn that into a structure to work from.

Kudos goes to all my colleagues and friends at Massey University, Palmerston North, notably Robyn Mason, Elspeth Tilley, Doug Ashwell, Elizabeth Gray, Nigel Lowe and Marianne Tremaine, for your support, assistance, and especially your understanding. A special mention needs to go to Sharon Benson and Christine Morrison for their support and keeping me sane.

I need to thank my parents Jenny and Doug Elliott for their support and my friends for enduring my long periods of social absence and regular irritability.

Extra special thanks need to go to Anna, my understanding wife, who has supported me all the way through. For all the kind words, cups of tea and shoulder rubs, I thank you. It wouldn’t have been possible without you. You are my hero.

Much of this thesis would not have been possible without the input from all of the bloggers who took the time to share their experiences with me. And finally, my thanks go to Russell Brown, Aaron Bhatnagar, Adolf Fiinkensein, Whale Oil, Tim Selwyn, Tze Ming Mok, Idiot/Savant, ZenTiger, Keith Ng, Jordan Carter, David Farrar and Rodney Hide for your time and sharing your experiences with me.
ABSTRACT

Communication technologies have altered the way people engage in political discourse. In recent years the internet has played a significant role in changing the way people receive political information, news and opinion. Perhaps the most significant difference as a result of advancements in communication and internet technology is how people participate in discussions and deliberate issues that are important to them. The 2005 New Zealand General Election fell at a time when functionality and access to fast and affordable internet allowed people to develop their own information channels and also determine how, where and to what level they participated in debate and commentary on election issues.

The aim of this thesis is to examine how blogs were used to discuss political issues during the 2005 New Zealand General Election campaign period through the use of three inter-related methodologies. The methodologies used in the research are content analysis, interviews and a case study. Four blogs and the comments sections are analysed by way of content analysis for adherence to the rules of communicative interaction within the public sphere. Interviews were conducted with a number of people who blogged during the 2005 election campaign, to develop an understanding of their experiences and perceptions of the role blogging played in the election. A case study of politician and blogger Rodney Hide examines the role blogs play as a communication tool for politicians and the how they change the relationship between politician and voter.

An explosion of academic literature in recent years has looked at the participative and deliberative nature of the internet and blogs as having opened new spaces and what implications that may have for democracy. Jurgen Habermas’ seminal book, The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere, provides the theoretical basis for this thesis and the foundation for academic writing in this area. Habermas developed the normative notion of the public sphere as a part of social life where citizens exchanged views and opinions on matters of importance to the common good, so that wider public opinion can be formed.
Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .......................................................................................................................... i
ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................................................. ii
Table of Contents .......................................................................................................................................... iii
List of Tables .................................................................................................................................................. vi
List of Figures ................................................................................................................................................ vii

Chapter One - The Scope of this Research ............................................................................................... 1
1.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................... 1
1.2 Public Sphere Theory, Internet and Communication Technology......................................................... 2
1.3 Research Strategy and Selection of Methods ........................................................................................... 3
1.4 Research Questions ................................................................................................................................... 5
1.5 Structure of Thesis ................................................................................................................................... 6

Chapter Two - Discussions of Politics: The Relationship between Communication Technologies and Political Discussions ............................................................................................................. 7
2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................... 7
2.2 Significant Advancements in Communication Technology and their Role in Political Discussion ......... 10
2.2.1 Printing Press ....................................................................................................................................... 11
2.2.2 The Pamphleteers ................................................................................................................................. 12
2.2.3 Radio .................................................................................................................................................. 14
2.2.3.1 Talkback Radio ................................................................................................................................. 16
2.2.4 Television .......................................................................................................................................... 19
2.2.5 The Internet ....................................................................................................................................... 20
2.3 Communication and Models of Democracy ............................................................................................ 24
2.3.1.1 Procedural and Competitive Democracy ....................................................................................... 26
2.3.1.2 Participatory Democracy ................................................................................................................ 27
2.3.1.3 Deliberative Democracy ................................................................................................................ 29
2.3.1.3.1 Deliberative Democracy in this Thesis ....................................................................................... 33
2.4 The use of the Internet in Politics and Political Debate ............................................................................ 33
2.4.1 The Digital Divide .................................................................................................................................. 36
2.5 Blogs ....................................................................................................................................................... 37
2.5.1 Blogs as a Forum for Political Discussion ......................................................................................... 43
2.5.2 Blogs as Deliberative Democracy ...................................................................................................... 48
2.5.3 Blogs as Journalism ............................................................................................................................ 50
2.6 Conclusion ............................................................................................................................................... 55

Chapter Three - Public Sphere Theory ...................................................................................................... 59
3.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................... 59
3.2 Origins of the Public Sphere .................................................................................................................. 60
3.3 The Disintegration of the Bourgeois Public Sphere ................................................................................ 66
3.4 Criticisms of the Public Sphere Concept ............................................................................................... 70
3.5 Public Sphere Theory as a Critique of the Media ................................................................................... 71
3.6 Participation within the Public Sphere .................................................................................................... 75
3.7 An Evaluation of the Critique of Habermas .............................................................................................. 79
3.8 The Public Sphere, the Internet and Deliberative Democracy ............................................................... 80
3.9 Conclusion ............................................................................................................................................... 85

Chapter Four - Content Analysis Methodology ......................................................................................... 87
4.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................... 87
4.2 What is Content Analysis? ..................................................................................................................... 87
4.1 Why Content Analysis? ...................................................... 89
4.2 Problems and Limitations of Content Analysis ...................... 90
4.3 The Use of Content Analysis on Internet-based material .......... 91
4.4 The Content Analysis Process ........................................... 95
4.5 Definition of the Research Problem ..................................... 96
4.6 Selection and Sample of Media ......................................... 96
4.7 Sample Dates .................................................................... 99
4.8 Research during Election Campaigns .................................. 101
4.9 Selecting the Unit of Analysis ............................................ 102
4.10 Category Construction and Development of Coding Schedule ... 104
4.11 The Post ...................................................................... 105
4.11.1 The Comments Section .............................................. 107
4.11.2 Rational Debate ....................................................... 108
4.11.2.1 Universal Access ............................................... 109
4.11.2.2 Disregard of Rank ................................................ 111
4.12 The Coding Schedule and Checking Reliability ................... 112
4.13 Data Preparation and Analysis .......................................... 113
4.14 Conclusion ..................................................................... 113

Chapter Five - Content Analysis Results ........................................ 115
5.1 Introduction ..................................................................... 115
5.2 The Post ...................................................................... 116
5.2.1 Rodney Hide ............................................................ 117
5.2.2 David Farrar ............................................................ 118
5.2.3 Russell Brown ............................................................ 120
5.2.4 Jordan Carter ............................................................ 122
5.3 The Origins of the Posts .................................................. 123
5.4 The Focus of the Post ..................................................... 124
5.5 Topics That Were Raised Within the Posts ......................... 126
5.6 Blogs and the Mainstream Media ....................................... 130
5.7 Use of Links to Sources .................................................. 133
5.8 Comments Section .......................................................... 139
5.8.1 Where the Comments Came From .............................. 140
5.8.1.1 Comments Made That Related to the Election .......... 143
5.8.1.2 What the Comments were About ......................... 144
5.9 Conclusion ..................................................................... 152

Chapter Six - Content Analysis Discussion ...................................... 155
6.1 Introduction ..................................................................... 155
6.2 The Role of Blogs in the 2005 New Zealand General Election .... 155
6.2.1 Blogging Styles and Political Discussion in the 2005 New Zealand General Election 157
6.3 Blogs and Mainstream Journalism ....................................... 161
6.3.1 Blogs as an Echo Chamber ........................................ 163
6.4 Blogs' Influence on the Discussion of Issues ........................ 165
6.5 Blogs as a Space for Deliberative Discussion ....................... 167
6.6 Conclusion ..................................................................... 173

Chapter Seven - Interviews with New Zealand Political Bloggers .......... 175
7.1 Introduction ..................................................................... 175
7.2 Interviews as a Data Collection Method .............................. 176
7.3 Previous Interview-Based Blogger Research ....................... 178
7.4 Interpreting Interview Data and Findings Categories ............. 178
7.5 Background to Interview Participants ............................... 180
7.6 Bloggers’ Views on Deliberative Democracy ....................... 185
List of Tables

Table 1: The Three Industrial Revolutions ........................................................................ 7
Table 2: Four models of democracy – a comparison .......................................................... 25
Table 3: Sample Information .......................................................................................... 98
Table 4: Sample Dates for the 2005 New Zealand General Election .............................. 100
Table 5: Total Number of Posts on Sample Dates .......................................................... 101
Table 6: Rodney Hide .................................................................................................... 117
Table 7: David Farrar ...................................................................................................... 118
Table 8: Russell Brown ................................................................................................... 120
Table 9: Jordan Carter ................................................................................................... 123
Table 10: Frequency of Posts ........................................................................................ 123
Table 11: All Bloggers .................................................................................................... 125
Table 12: A Comparison of the Focus of the Post ........................................................... 126
Table 13: Topics Covered in Post: All Bloggers .............................................................. 128
Table 14: Topics Covered in Post: Individual Bloggers ................................................... 129
Table 15: Post Based on a Story in the Media – All Bloggers ......................................... 131
Table 16: Post Based on a Story in the Media – Individual Bloggers .............................. 131
Table 17: The Medium from where the Post was Sourced ................................................ 132
Table 18: Was There A Link to the Story in the Post? .................................................... 134
Table 19: Non-Media Sources of the Post ...................................................................... 135
Table 20: Was there a Link Provided to the Non-Media Source? .................................... 136
Table 21: Individual Bloggers’ Non-Media Sources ........................................................ 137
Table 22: Individual Bloggers Linking to Non-Media Sources ....................................... 138
Table 23: Types of Multimedia Files Used ..................................................................... 138
Table 24: The Frequency of the Number of Comments Made ......................................... 140
Table 25: Top 35 Most Frequent Commenter IDs ............................................................ 141
Table 26: Crosstab of Commenter to Individual Bloggers ................................................. 142
Table 27: Length of the Comment ................................................................................... 143
Table 28: Primary Concern of Comment ......................................................................... 145
Table 29: Commenter Tries To Establish Expertise or Authority on the Issue ............... 146
Table 30: Commenter Establishing Level of Expertise or Authority on an Issue ............. 146
Table 31: Comment Contains Ad Hominem Argument .................................................... 147
Table 32: Individuals Who Used Ad Hominem Attacks ................................................... 148
Table 33: Comment Contains Emotionally Heightened Language ................................... 149
Table 34: Use of Emotional Language ............................................................................ 150
Table 35: Comment Contains ......................................................................................... 151
List of Figures

Figure 1: Types of Blogs .................................................................................. 39
Figure 2: Weblogs on a continuum between standard Web pages and CMC .......... 40
Figure 3: Blogs along the Political Continuum.................................................. 98
Figure 4: Main blog page containing a number of posts .................................... 103
Figure 5: Blog Page containing the post and comments ..................................... 104