Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
GANGIN UNDERGROUND

Grant Hazelwood Collie

School of Humanities

College of Humanities and Social Sciences

Massey University

Palmerston North

Student ID 05104300

MA (History) Thesis

Title: GANGIN UNDERGROUND

Scottish Born Soldiers in the New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1916/19

Supervisor: Professor Glyn Harper

The night shift of the New Zealand Tunnelling Company in their bunks below ground

(unknown, The night shift of the New Zealand Tunnelling Company in their bunks below ground., (Auckland: Auckland War Memorial Museum, 1916).
# Scottish Born Soldiers in the New Zealand Tunnelling Company

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................... 3

INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................ 5  
   Literature Review ................................................................................................. 9

CHAPTER 1 – LIFE BACK HAME ................................................................................. 1

CHAPTER 2 – A STRANGE NEW WORLD, BUT VERY FAMILIAR .............................. 1  
   Miners again in New Zealand? ............................................................................... 4

CHAPTER 3 – THE DECISION TO GO TO WAR ....................................................... 10

CHAPTER 4 – JUST ANOTHER DAY UNDERGROUND ............................................ 1

CHAPTER 5 – LIFE, DEATH AND GLORY ON A VARIETY OF ‘FOREIGN’ SOILS... 1

CHAPTER 7 – WAS AOTEAROA STILL HOME? ..................................................... 19  
   Back in the United Kingdom ................................................................................. 21  
   Off to Australia .................................................................................................. 23  
   Canada Bound ..................................................................................................... 23

CHAPTER 9 – CONCLUSION .................................................................................... 26  
   Appendix 1 - Table of Scots-Born members of the NZETC. ................................. 1
Abstract

In early 1915, the call went out to the British Empire for groups of experienced miners, tunnellers and other associated skilled manual workers to form up into tunnelling companies to assist Allied forces to combat German tunnellers primarily on the Western Front in France and Belgium. By the end of the First World War, the New Zealand Tunnelling Company numbered 500 individuals and their efforts in the tunnels and caverns around Arras entered the common history of both the French and New Zealand Great War experience.

Some 62 of these individuals who chose to serve in the New Zealand Tunnelling Company were born in Scotland\(^2\). The vast majority of this focus group were career coalminers who are clearly shown to have left Scotland for better lives in New Zealand, or a least finding themselves in New Zealand for financial benefit. This thesis looks at a snapshot of some of the lives in Scotland to help identify some of the reasons for making the long journey to New Zealand. It also tries to investigate the reasons for enlisting and their experiences during war. Finally it tries to answer the question what happened next, looking at the psychological impact of war and also why did these men choose to return to, or remain in New Zealand long-term as the majority did.

The research for this thesis incorporated an expanded focus on the role of the New Zealand Tunneling Company in the Battle of Arras, the relationships with the Scots in the British Army and also their work with the Maori Pioneer Battalion during their time at the front. This thesis has identified that there is scope for additional research in this area by future researchers and hopefully it will be useful starting point for others.
Introduction

Family historian and genealogist Christine Clements detailed database of First World War soldiers highlighted around 1600 members of the New Zealand Expeditionary Force (NZEF) who fought in World War I and had included Scottish addresses in the next of kin section of their enlistment papers³. Early research on this thesis has identified several more soldiers that are not in the Clements database and are included in the resources investigated. Once completed this updated database will be shared with Clements and other researchers. This thesis focuses on a particular area of these soldiers service, the sappers of the NZEF and in particular those in the NZ Tunnelling Company (NZETC). Whilst the focus is on the individuals and not the war per se, the research is set in the context of the military and civilian historical timelines. Early reading has indicated that many of these individuals, as was the case in the United Kingdom, were recruited as specialists directly from the mining sector. This may answer one of the key questions as it may be seen as a missed opportunity for recruits from a hard occupation such as mining who might have been expected to want a ‘softer’ option on the great adventure?

---

³ Clements, "MEMBERS OF THE NZEF 1914 - 1918 WITH A NEXT-OF-KIN ADDRESS IN SCOTLAND A-L."
Historians including James Belich, Tanja Bueltmann, Tom Brooking, Jennie Coleman and Rebecca Lenihan amongst others have, to date, mainly focused on the subject of Scottish immigration to New Zealand from the periods 1840 to 1900 and again from 1918 to 1930\textsuperscript{4, 5, 6, 7}. This thesis looks at a select group of men, mainly from a mining background, who arrived in New Zealand in the early years of the 20\textsuperscript{th} Century. It seeks to answer four key questions. These are:

a) Who were the Scots-born Tunnellers in the NZETC?

b) What were their reasons for coming to New Zealand?

c) Why did they enlist?

d) What lasting impact did the War have on them?

An investigation of the geographical, socio political, and personal reasons for initial immigration, initial geographical location and employment in New Zealand supports the preliminary expectation that communities of Scottish and other emigrant miners led to groups of young men enlisting together. Official New Zealand Defence Force (NZDF) Service Records and other resources were used to investigate the personal histories of those who returned to lives in New Zealand or returned to Scotland.

Early discussions, emails and a meeting with Sue Baker Wilson in Waihi, who has been collating the NZETC Memorial website and acting as a general facilitator on research


\textsuperscript{6} Tom Brooking and Jennie Coleman, \textit{The heather and the fern: Scottish migration & New Zealand settlement} (University of Otago Press, 2003).

\textsuperscript{7} Rebecca Lenihan, \textit{From Alba to Aotearoa : profiling New Zealand's Scots migrants, 1840-1920} (Dunedin: Otago University Press, 2015).
into New Zealand's Tunnellers has been extremely useful. However, her focus has been, quite rightly, on the gold miners of the Waihi area and therefore her information on specific miners in this study has been limited at this early stage. This study has been promoted through her project website and Facebook group and that will hopefully develop positive contacts on an ongoing basis.

To aid in this research, an initial request for information was sent to the New Zealand Society of Genealogists (NZSG) in April/May 2015. There was a strong early response, and several family historians have shown interest in assisting with the ongoing research. Reference will be made to academic research at Edinburgh University's Centre for Scottish Diaspora and also the work of historians at the Scottish War Memorial in Edinburgh who looked at Scots serving at Gallipoli in Commonwealth armies.

There were approximately, according to Clements, 1600 individuals who have given a next of kin in Scotland on their enlistment paperwork. To make this a workable study, a decision was made to focus on the individuals identified in the NZETC Company Roll as Scottish. The total size of the NZETC deployment was 937 and the overall sample size is 62 individuals from Deployment 1 through to Reinforcement Deployment 7. Twenty-seven of these are also in Clements’ database and another 36 are Scottish-born. However, 35 of these individuals were not on the Clement database and this could, perhaps suggest that there are substantially more that the original 1600 identified who could be considered as Scottish born and served in the NZEF. This

---

9 Clements, "MEMBERS OF THE NZEF 1914 - 1918 WITH A NEXT-OF-KIN ADDRESS IN SCOTLAND A-L."
study though will not include any investigation in that area. A much larger database compiled by Doctor Rebecca Lenihan and the New Zealand Society of Genealogists (NZSG) has also been accessed and connected data has been extracted to support this research. A match has been found for six individuals across the two databases\textsuperscript{10}.

The Central Belt of Scotland, from Ayrshire to Fife was the core region for coal mining in Scotland. A starting expectation was that many of the individuals identified were involved in the mining industry in Scotland prior to emigration and the data supports this hypothesis. A research trip to Scotland in April 2017 allowed research of archives at the National Library of Scotland, the National Mining Museum, Fife regional archives and the National Army Museum. One thing that was clear from a study of mining resources was that there was a geographical shift from mining communities in the West of Scotland as coal reserves diminished and two more abundant coal seams were discovered in the central Lowlands and coastal Fife\textsuperscript{11}. As key timeline for this was between 1880 and 1910 can be assumed that this dislocation of communities would also be a catalyst for emigration.

Much has been written about World War 1 and the Anzacs by New Zealand historians such as Chris Pugsley and Glyn Harper, but there is very little focused on the stories of immigrant’s decisions to fight on behalf of their new country\textsuperscript{12, 13}. Even less has been written about the Scots who enlisted to serve in World War One and this is despite a

\textsuperscript{10} Rebecca Lenihan, 2017; Lenihan.
substantial body of work including that by Patterson, Brooking, McAloon, Bueltmann, and Lenihan in works including *Unpacking the Kists* on Scottish emigration and in particular emigration to New Zealand\(^{14}\). The following literature review will utilize some of the existing research and statistical data to support hypothesis in this thesis.

**Literature Review**

In *Unpacking the Kists*, Brad Patterson, Tom Brooking and Jim McAloon brought a series of contributions together following a 2002 conference on Scottish and Irish diaspora in Australia and New Zealand in Wellington\(^{15}\). This conference showed that while there was considerable academic research on the Irish immigration, the Scottish experience was under researched. *Unpacking the Kists* was the outcome of a five-year project between researchers in New Zealand and Scotland to begin to fill in some of these gaps.

Indeed, they point out that prior to James Belich’s assertion in *Paradise Reforged* that New Zealand was ‘the neo-Scotland’ in the 1920’s\(^{16}\), most New Zealand histories failed to even acknowledge that around 25% of immigrants at the time from the British Isles were Scots. The three-core hypothesis in *Unpacking the Kists* helped to focus some of this research. It showed that there were clearly defined Scottish Communities in New Zealand from an early stage in the settlement timeline. While the focus of the book is mainly on the communities in Waipu and Dunedin and the individuals in my study are in the Waikato and West Coast mining areas, the statistical analysis and research data in

---

\(^{14}\) Brad Patterson et al., *Unpacking the kists: the Scots in New Zealand*, McGill-Queen’s studies in ethnic history. Series two ; 34. (Dunedin, New Zealand: Otago University Press, 2013).

\(^{15}\) Patterson et al., *Unpacking the kists: the Scots in New Zealand*.

\(^{16}\) Belich, *Paradise reforged: a history of the New Zealanders from the 1880s to the year 2000*, pp.316
the book helped to focus the investigation into key geographical communities in Scotland and New Zealand\(^{17}\).

New Zealand’s place in the Scottish Diaspora shows that the Scottish communities here, whilst still passionately Scottish, were more inclusive and less likely to reject those with ‘non-Scottish heritage’ from participating in their activities. This was very different in North America where it was (and perhaps still is) seen as an exclusive ‘club’\(^{18}\). It is interesting that in New Zealand there was no particular attempt to add a Scottish dimension to the military units that fought in 1914-18\(^{19}\). Despite a proliferation of Scottish Pipe Bands and Caledonian Societies in New Zealand at the time there was no demand, unlike in Canada and South Africa for example, to for ‘Scottish’ Regiments in the NZEF. This is described as an attempt to integrate into the new society and perhaps this helps to explain the enthusiasm to enlist as a part of the process to be accepted as part of this new society?

Whilst not solely focused on Scottish Settlers in this timeframe, Jock Phillips and T.J Hearn, *Settlers: New Zealand Immigrants from England, Ireland and Scotland 1800-1945*, provides a similar rich set of data to aid the research\(^{20}\). It does, however, begin to shed some light on the possible reasons for New Zealand-born Scots to volunteer, namely that they took the opportunity to visit relatives in Scotland whilst on leave. They note that ‘There is hardly a soldier’s diary that does not record his efforts to find Mum’s

\(^{17}\) Brad Patterson et al., *Unpacking the Kists: The Scots in New Zealand* (McGill-Queen’s Press-MQUP, 2013); Patterson et al., *Unpacking the Kists: The Scots in New Zealand*. p.21-55

\(^{18}\) Authors observation


cousin or Dad’s aunt”, but this does not provide a satisfactory reason for new immigrants to do the same unless it is a form of homesickness?21

Assisted passage, especially in the decade prior to 1914, and again following the end of World War 1 is covered in Settlers and provides a starting point in the shipping records to initially separate out the soldiers who arrived between the focus dates of 1900-191422. It also indicates that the study needs to be aware of the Scots who arrived via an extended stay in Australia. Settlers does however provide a snapshot of Scottish society, community and ongoing connections with their Scottish homeland and this will give both a statistical and contextual basis for the thesis.

James Belich gives Scots and those of Scottish descent a high profile in the development of the colonial state. Perhaps this is not too excessive given, for example, the presence of five Scots in Ward’s 10-man cabinet in 190823. These included Ayrshire born George Fowlds, who rose from an impoverished handloom weaver in his native Scotland to Minister of Education and Public Health in New Zealand and accompanied in the Cabinet by Attorney General and Otago Scot John Findlay and Invercargill’s Minister of Agriculture Robert McNab, Roderick McKenzie “a product of oatmeal and mountain air”, and fluent Gaelic speaker A.W. Hogg from Masterton, Scottish influence must have been at a high level24. McNab would have a personal connection to the War, with his younger brother Angus, a Harley Street doctor being an early casualty while serving with the London Scottish25. This also identifies an obligation to serve their

25 A McNab, “Angus McNab (1875-1914),” (Archives New Zealand, 1875-1914).
new country amongst the new migrants given the highly developed sense of 
Scottishness imbued by the existence in settler society of the Caledonian clubs, 
Highland games and similar cultural activities. Belich does go too far in his description 
of the Scots being ‘ghettoised’ in their communities in New Zealand26. Scots perhaps 
had a penchant for using family and ethnic connections to settle on arrival in New 
Zealand, but there is no evidence that this was a permanent situation for all and this is 
a normal situation for any ethnic or culturally connected group arriving as migrants if for 
no other reason that a perception of safety.

Baker, in his King and Country Call is a much more useful reference as it gives useful 
background information on the overall reasons for volunteering prior to the introduction 
of Conscription in 191627. Whilst there is no focus on immigrants serving other than an 
appendix which show the volunteers by place of birth which lumps all immigrants from 
Great Britain together, it allows the opportunity to suggest why new immigrants may 
have felt pressured to serve, especially young men looking to marry and settle down as 
they wanted to assimilate into their new communities28.

Perhaps the enthusiasm and even jingoism of the time, with a suggestion by Steven 
Loveridge that young women would only see soldiers as masculine enough to bother 
with.

In relation to masculine chivalry, the conventions taught that a lady should aspire 
to be a worthy recipient of masculine gallantry – she should inspire bravery, 
sustain spirits and provide that classic object of the chivalric narrative:

University Press, 1988).
something worth dying for. This ideal also extended into war work to support soldiers, encourage enlistment and shape masculine behaviour through encouragement and shame. The giving of white feathers represents a particularly spiteful (and controversial) manifestation of the philosophy.

John Crawford and Ian McGibbon in *New Zealand's Great War* help to set some of the aspects of the engagement of Scottish immigrants in the NZEF in a timeline and historiography of the War. *New Zealand's Great War* has not focused in particular on the Scots who served in Australian forces in the same way Scots served in the NZEF, but Peter Dennis and Jeffrey Grey note that there are some 13,000 Scottish-born Australian soldiers on the AIF database and this thesis may encourage others to focus in on these individuals as some point in the future.

Jock Phillips notes, in *A Man's Country* that the preparation for war in New Zealand began in earnest around 1909 with the instigation of the Compulsory Service Bill to replace an ineffective volunteer recruitment system that had previously supported militias at home and the self funded Boer War service. This led to the setting up of a structured volunteer service, including compulsory Cadet service in schools as per the English Public School system. This, along with Rugby, was designed to prepare students to serve the British Empire. Young Scottish immigrants settled into communities into which had been drummed the lesson that “fighting for Empire was essential to manhood”, Phillips gives some of the clues to begin to investigate the

---

31 Crawford and McGibbon, "New Zealand's Great War : New Zealand, the Allies and the First World War." p.400
concept of mateship and how it may have influenced Scots to enlist in such a high proportion of their numbers\textsuperscript{33}.

In \textit{Letters from Gallipoli}, Glyn Harper gives a possible template and some key guidelines for both researching and presenting findings\textsuperscript{34}. Personalised storylines featuring individual soldiers is a practical device that gives a biographical coverage of an individual’s social history in context to their role as a serving soldier.

Harper continues in \textit{Johnny Enzed} offering an insight into the camaraderie of the Scots in the front line\textsuperscript{35}. For example, the comments by Eric Hames on the intolerable \textit{Dregs of Dunedin}, whose behaviour perhaps shows that mateship was perhaps a key driver in young Scottish migrants decisions to enlist, especially if they were going to serve with their friends. Eric Hames records an unfavourable impression:

> Here I had the least congenial companions I found at any time in the army. They were very Scots, very foul-mouthed, interested in nothing but getting drunk if drink could be obtained when they would be sick all over the tent floor. The dregs of Dunedin\textsuperscript{36}.

\textit{A History of the Scottish Miners} has been a vital instrument in providing contextual information on the status of mining families in Scotland that might have impacted on the decision of the individuals in the study group to emigrate to New Zealand\textsuperscript{37}. It has been possible to identify the particular private coalmines that several of the individuals were

\textsuperscript{35} Harper, \textit{Johnny Enzed : the New Zealand soldier in the First World War 1914-1918}.
\textsuperscript{36} Hames as cited in Harper, \textit{Johnny Enzed : the New Zealand soldier in the First World War 1914-1918}. P. 455
\textsuperscript{37} Arnot, \textit{A history of the Scottish miners from the earliest times}, 104.
working in prior to their date of departure. Arnot also provides some clear evidence of the working, wage and living conditions of the individuals set in the context of a move towards collectivism and trade union developments38.

The current literature, whilst proving valuable in providing both context and background data and supporting source material has shown clearly that the focus of this thesis has not been covered in detail to date and that validates the decision to approach research on a tightly focused data set. There is a virtual absence of any personal correspondence, diaries or official documentation on any of the target group in the study to support detailed analysis of their lives before, during and post service in World War One. In particular, none of the individuals in the target group are referred to in any of the current literature; indeed outside the limited information available in the service records they would appear to be fairly unremarkable characters.

This thesis is a social history of the individuals involved and therefore requires a detailed genealogical approach to the topic to identify initially who they were and where did they come from. The thesis is arranged chronologically, with Chapter 1 attempting to, as much as is possible given the distances involved, offer some suggestions as to the social, familial and economic backgrounds to the individuals. It indicates the ‘push and pull’ indicators that encouraged them to emigrate from everything they knew back in Scotland to come and settle in the ‘Better Britain’ as noted by Belich.39

Chapters 2 and 3 attempt to set the experience of the new migrants in context and begin to analyse what may have led to the decision to enlist in the NZEF when, in fact,

38 Arnot, A history of the Scottish miners from the earliest times, 104.
39 Belich, Paradise reforged : a history of the New Zealanders from the 1880s to the year 2000. P. 27-118
they were mostly in a protected occupation as coal miners that did not require them to volunteer and indeed actually discouraged them in doing so until later in the war.

Chapters 4 and 5 describe the conditions met by the study group, primarily in the Western Front around Arras and Messines with a focus on those injured or killed in action. The camaraderie and lack of respect for military discipline set many of these men apart from their fellow soldiers, but clearly also ensured that they would be a highly effective tunnellers under extremely stressful conditions. Bravery was expected, and the Distinguished Conduct Medal for gallantry and distinguished service awarded to Sapper Kenneth Bruce McLean (4/1376), is also studied.

Chapter 6 asks the question “what happened next?” with around 14% of the ‘new’ New Zealanders deciding to either return to Scotland or move elsewhere. Australia and Canada appear to be regular destinations for many of these individuals and the thesis looks at some indicative reasons for this. The experience of Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) is identified in this chapter as a cause of deaths a decade of so after the end of hostilities.

This thesis focuses on a small group of men, who chose to serve their new country utilising their specialist skills as miners. They make up approximately 10% of the New Zealand Tunnelling Company in World War I, and a tiny percentage of the approximate 1 million combatants in the central focused Battle of Arras where the Tunnellers are best remembered for, both in written historical works and in the memories of the people of Arras. Scots are clearly identified cultural group in New Zealand and the research completed for this thesis attempts to show an aspect of this group as it created its New Zealand identity. The thesis attempts to answer four key questions. They seek to
examine the Scottish miners’ origins and to focus on their war experiences. The thesis is structured to address these questions and sequence.

From the current literature highlighting the impact of Scots migrants to New Zealand in the political, economic and social development of the colony in the mid to late 1800s, and as New Zealand developed its own identity in the early years of the 20th century. Whilst the thesis is not investigating the roles of community and industrial leaders it does attempt to show the short and long-term impact of this small group of Scots who are not necessarily identified by historians as important people in the story of modern New Zealand.
Chapter 1 – Life back Hame

Sapper Robert Donnelly (4/1469) According to 1901 Scottish Census, at age 14 was a Colliery Labourer, staying with Uncle, Thomas Smith 37 Old Rows Cambuslang.  

Mining in the late 1800’s in Scotland was a perilous occupation with a private mining industry, which operated on a supply and demand basis. This meant that many miners and their families were unsure about the number of days worked in a week and the level of wage offered. A six-day week at the average wage of 4 shillings a day was, according to an article in The Spectator, around the bare minimum for survival of a labouring family in 1896. Scottish economist Sir Robert Giffen is reported as stating that “Though 24s.7d. a week is the average wage per man, 24 percent of the labouring class have earnings below £1 a week. But for a man with a family to have less than £1 a week means that he is hardly within the region of civilisation”. As there was no hope of ‘betterment’ for the miners and their families on such barely subsistent incomes, it is understandable that these workers were looking for a way to improve things and therefore not surprising that the trade unions and the wider labour movement would begin to grow.

This was the decade that James Keir Hardie began to come to prominence in the Trade Union movement. With his election in 1886 as secretary of the fledgling Scottish Miners National Federation and its estimated 25,000 members, Keir Hardie was launched into the forefront of the Labour movement and this led to his central role in

---

the formation of the Independent Labour Party in 1893\textsuperscript{42}. By 1894 discontent amongst miners, primarily around wage reductions of between 15-25\%, led to the Executive Committee of the Scottish Miner’s National Federation supporting industrial action as part of a nationwide action. It claimed that there were around 30,000 miners striking in Scotland alone\textsuperscript{43}. Miners with young families to support were nevertheless clearly supportive of the aims of collective action led by the National Federation. But this may have been the last straw for those struggling in a poorly paid and unsafe industry who began to hear of opportunities overseas that would give them a better life. It is also at this time changes in the way mining was undertaken in Scotland, and traditional communities were beginning to be fragmented.

As coal reserves were used up in Lanarkshire and Argyll areas, there was a gradual move of focus towards the coalmines in Stirlingshire and Fife. This also led to families beginning to move eastward and by the late 1880s, for example, there were 53 pits operating in the coastal area between Methil and Kirkcaldy, an indication of which are identified in the following map.

\textsuperscript{42} Arnot, \textit{A history of the Scottish miners from the earliest times}, 104.
\textsuperscript{43} Arnot, \textit{A history of the Scottish miners from the earliest times}, 104.a reduction of around 1 shilling a day.
Map of East Fife Coalmines, courtesy of http://www.fifepits.co.uk/

44 Martin. Michael, "East Fife Coalmines."
This also meant that the mine owners had an abundance of labour and therefore had little reason to improve wages and conditions for them. The following entries in the diary from John Smith in 1894 gives some indication of the desperation for work as conditions deteriorated. In these three entries, Smith tells us that the employers are refusing to negotiate guaranteed payments and guaranteed days of work. In the first entry is noted that despite wanting to work the failure to agree with the employers led to the temporary closure of the mines.

12 June 1884

I have been idle today. The miners asked an advance of wages from their masters some time since and the masters has not complied with the request, and the miners thought that rather than stop work altogether they would restrict there labours to 18 days per fortnight until the masters would give at least 15 per cent on the present rate of wages the men gave the masters notice to that effect. The masters on the other hand has posted up a notice to the effect that no such restriction would be regarded and any man continuing in or excepting work at the collieries must work in compliance with the general laws, and one of then is to the affect effect that the men must work at least 11 full days per fortnight. On the 10th of June the men were asked to work the 11 days or they would not go down the pit. So most of the men went home and the pit has been idle these last three days.

Within a few days the miners realised that they had to negotiate with the mine owners on a sliding scale of payments. At this time the miners return to work but without a fixed agreement.
16th June 1884

There was a mass meeting held in Dunfermline of the miners held in Dunfermline on the 12th and it was agreed on for the men to work and to enter into negotiations with the master with a view to establish a sliding scale so the men have returned to work.

In this final entry, Smith notes that despite working following 16 June meeting he had not been paid his full entitlement and had therefore decided to move to another pit to get a slightly better is still inadequate daily income.

1st July

I started work yesterday in No. 2 pit Leven having left No. 3 on Saturday where I had not been earning 3/- per day for about 8 weeks. I have got a job on the repairing and am to get 3/4½ per shift. May God lead me and guide me.45

By 1909, average wages for coalface workers had only reached 6 shillings per day based on production (and sales) targets and the 1908 Eight Hours Act for Mines was in place46. This rate did not change for another 30 months, despite an increase in production and coal price to the owners. This inequity led to calls from the mining Unions, an ineffective Labour Opposition and even via a Gladstone government Board of Trade recommendation for a minimum rate of 6s per day, regardless of production and also called for fixed percentages of the set rate for those under 12 and under 14. The 6s rate asked for in Scotland was actually a very conservative demand, with

45 Methil Heritage Centre, "The life and times of an old miner."
46 Arnot, A history of the Scottish miners from the earliest times, 104.p.112
English and Welsh miners demanding between 7s and 8s per day but the mine owners refused and in May 1912 a national strike was called which ceased all coal production. For young men such as Robert Donnelly undertaking such dangerous and backbreaking work, the future would not have been very bright and looking further afield for work was probably an important driver for Robert and his contemporaries.

The 1900 weekly wage comparison in the following table could be considered as showing that miners (hewers) at the coalface were seen as very important, with the wage rate rising to eventually exceed that of specialist engineers and shipwrights.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1854</th>
<th>1866</th>
<th>1873</th>
<th>1883</th>
<th>1890</th>
<th>1900</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hewers</td>
<td>19/2</td>
<td>25/10</td>
<td>32/9</td>
<td>24/5</td>
<td>32/2</td>
<td>38/7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering (fitters, piece-rate)</td>
<td>28/-</td>
<td>27/3</td>
<td>30/3</td>
<td>31/6</td>
<td>32/2</td>
<td>34/8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shipwrights (piece-rate)</td>
<td>32/3</td>
<td>31/6</td>
<td>33/10</td>
<td>34/3</td>
<td>36/8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textiles (dyers)</td>
<td>18/-</td>
<td>20/-</td>
<td>21/6</td>
<td>24/-</td>
<td>24/-</td>
<td>24/-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clothing (boot and shoe operatives)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>26/-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Printing (compositors)</td>
<td>24/-</td>
<td>25/-</td>
<td>27/9</td>
<td>30/-</td>
<td>29/-</td>
<td>32/-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seamen (highest UK rates)</td>
<td>22/6</td>
<td>18/9</td>
<td>22/9</td>
<td>22/9</td>
<td>22/6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural labourers: Board of Trade</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunt</td>
<td>10/8</td>
<td>11/6</td>
<td>13/4</td>
<td>13/3</td>
<td>15/3</td>
<td>14/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14/3\</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17/2\</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


This figure needs to be accepted with care as it is based around UK figures and not just Scotland where poverty and an almost servile operation operated by managers and coal owners will have had an impact on both wages and quality of life. Manual work in Scotland did not match the figures offered here and whilst miners often moved between Scottish and Northern English pits the upheaval for a family relocating to Yorkshire may

---

47 Arnot, A history of the Scottish miners from the earliest times, 104. p.575
have had a similar negative impact on families and communities as did overseas migration.

Whilst there is no documentary evidence to support the hypothesis that the demand for miners in the wider empire will have had an impact, increased wages in the UK were matched or even exceeded in many of the former colonies. It is one of the hypothesis of this thesis that wages and opportunities offered in New Zealand as well as other colonies clearly outweigh the extended familial ties binding these young men and in some cases their families to the Scottish homeland.

Whilst the general database and genealogical evidence to support the previous Scottish domicile area is quite clear, internal migration in Scotland is complicated by the industrialisation of Central Scotland in the early to mid 1800’s. This brought families from rural Scotland and especially the Highlands and Islands\(^{48}\). It is fortunate for this study that genealogical evidence gives a high number of intergenerational lowland mining families being represented. Therefore next of kin location is a rough but a reasonably accurate tool when taken in conjunction with supporting research.

Rebecca Lenihan does note that on the NZSG Database of 6612 individuals, 11.6% had lived in at least one other country other than Scotland before coming to New Zealand\(^{49}\). As the table below shows, 70% of these spent some time in Australia before making the economic decision to cross the Tasman. Mining opportunities in Australia, the United States and to a lesser extent South Africa were often the first point of call for

\(^{48}\) Lenihan, *From Alba to Aotearoa: profiling New Zealand’s Scots migrants, 1840-1920*, p.54-55

\(^{49}\) Lenihan, *From Alba to Aotearoa: profiling New Zealand’s Scots migrants, 1840-1920*, p.56-59
many ships sailing from the United Kingdom with working class migrants. The economic decision made by those choosing to move to New Zealand from these initial destinations could simply be to follow the minerals and resources as they were discovered as a preference to being late arrivals in alias with the resources had already been somewhat depleted. This makes following the story of a particular individual somewhat complex and Ancestry.com has been a vital tool in filling some of the gaps.

Table: Proportions of Scots living in one country other than Scotland before migrating to New Zealand.50

The target group of migrants in this study arrived in New Zealand between 1891 and 1914 and it can be a fair assumption that the insecurity of life in the mines in Scotland was a driver for emigration to New Zealand at that time. Safety was also a driver as there were regular threats to miners in Scotland’s private mines. Experiences such as the Blantyre explosion of 1877 (illustrated below from Illustrated London News) must

50 Lenihan, From Alba to Aotearoa: profiling New Zealand’s Scots migrants, 1840-1920, p. 57
have impacted on younger miners when the opportunities in the gold and coalmines of Australia, South Africa and New Zealand were on offer.

Caption reads: The Blantyre Colliery Explosion, Near Glasgow

51 http://freepages.genealogy.rootsweb.ancestry.com/~cmhrc/096.jpg
The Blantyre mine explosion occurred at 9am on the 22\textsuperscript{nd} October 1877. Estimates of those killed varied between 207 and 218. This discrepancy seems to be caused by a bit of confusion between those who had signed in for the fatal shift and those returning from the prior one. Additionally some of the young boys were only acknowledged as being there if they were officially working and records of children in the mines were not necessarily very accurate. The Reverend Stuart Wright, writing in the annals of Blantyre in 1885 reported the explosion as follows:

> What a gloomy morning that October Monday was. How indelibly it is engraven on our memory. We were dressing at the time. The window of our room looked over against the pits. A sudden flash darted up from the most distant shaft, accompanied by debris, and a report not very loud; then forthwith there arose from the shaft nearest to us a dense volume of smoke, "the blackness of darkness," which spread itself, a terrible funeral pall, over the surrounding plain. We were soon at the scene of the disaster, whither hundreds of eager and terrified creatures were hurrying, and there for hours we remained, a stricken shepherd amongst a stricken flock.\textsuperscript{52}

According to Reverend Stewart, it took almost three weeks for the rescuers to find and retrieve all bodies it was possible to find. The subsequent report by Inspectors of Mines on the disaster identified several flaws in the health and safety management of the mine most of which were actually general practice in a working mine at the time to maximise productivity rather than worker safety\textsuperscript{53}.

\textsuperscript{52} Lenihan, \textit{From Alba to Aotearoa : profiling New Zealand's Scots migrants, 1840-1920.}
The explosion was caused by the ignition of methane or firedamp by either naked flames or the detonation of gunpowder and also many of the dead were not killed in the initial explosion but from suffocation from foul air or chokedamp. The inspectors noted that:

As before stated, the men who were working at or near the "stoops" were supplied with safety gauze lamps. Shot-firing was stated as being prohibited, but there seems to be no doubt that gunpowder was used at the stoops, and it seems also to have been freely used in other parts of the pits where naked lights were used. The shots were fired by the miners, instead of by a competent person appointed for the purpose, and the powder was taken into the mine in cannisters instead of in cartridges, as directed by the Act. Both from our inspections, and from the evidence given at the public inquiry, we are of opinion that gas was always present at the "stoops" and we consider that shot firing there, under such circumstances, was most dangerous, and ought not for one moment to have been allowed. Upon the whole, the discipline of the mine was loose, and the orders which the manager says he gave, as to shot firing in particular, seem to have been neglected altogether.54

An indication of the lack of interest in both the welfare of their workers and also those left behind after the disaster is evident in the report in The Scotsman newspaper of 17 May 1878, where the mine owners took legal action to evict the widows of some of the men who died in the disaster.

Hamilton – Ejection of the Blantyre Widows - Yesterday, in the Hamilton Sheriff Court - Sheriff Birnie presiding - thirty-four summonses at the instance of William Dixon (Limited) Blantyre collieries against the widows of several of the men killed in the explosion of October last, to eject them from their houses, were disposed of. A large number of them appeared, and pleaded that the amount they were receiving from the Relief Fund was insufficient to enable them to support their families and to pay their rent as well. The Sheriff gave them till the fifth to leave the houses.55

The Blantyre explosion despite having the largest loss of life in a Scottish mine, was not unique in both the devastating impact on communities and showing a complete disregard for worker safety amongst private mine owners at the time. Miners throughout the country as well as the general public understood that mining was exceptionally dangerous in Scotland and despite not having any written evidence to support the hypothesis, it is clear that the opportunity for young men to continue the trade somewhere other than the minds of central Scotland would have been a clear driver for emigration.

55 Moore et al., "Inspector of Mines Report: Explosion of Fire-damp at Blantyre Colliery".
Indeed it was an incident in 1908 that brought Stephen Peggie (picture below) to New Zealand. Whilst he is not one of the study group, his story will be typical of many. He was one of five badly burned survivors of the 1908 of the explosion at the Fife Coal Company’s Mary Pit, at Lochore, which killed another three of his workmates. After a long inquiry authorities, Peggie was awarded the sum of £300 which may have assisted in his emigration to New Zealand a couple of years later56.

Prior to World War One there was an economic boom in some areas of Scotland. Historian, Professor Tom Devine has noted that it is,

Still astonishing to think that in 1901, a decade or so before the First World War, the River Clyde down there launched two fifths of all commercial vessels in the world - that did not include war ships. The North British Locomotive Company, ‘the titan of its trade’ as it was called, again with a worldwide array of exportation and particularly linked into the Empire because the Empire is very much relevant to this particular special set of developments in Scotland. So we have an overwhelmingly heavy industry economy of ship-building, steel, iron-making, engineering activity which, of course, is partially founded on the great coal mining industries of Scotland in that period.57

This economic renaissance in Scotland was not shared equally between the industrialists and mine owners and the workers, with working conditions and health and

56 Court Reporter, "Ejection of the Blantyre Widows," The Scotsman, 17/5/1878 1878.
57 Michael; Martin Martin, Colin; Sparling, Chric, “The Fife Miners,” http://www.fifepits.co.uk/.
safety issues identified earlier in this chapter. For young men, some with young families, with very little hope of improved conditions, the option to emigrate from Scotland to a perceived better life in Aotearoa is understandable.

By the time that many of the study group had decided to emigrate from Scotland, the country had passed its peak as the “Workshop of the World”; a term coined by W.W. Knox in his recent *A History of the Scottish People* was between 1850 and 1890. He suggests that between 1890 and the start of the First World War Scotland was moving into an industrial decline. Knox notes that shipbuilding on the River Clyde was employing 23% of the total shipbuilding labour force in Britain even in 1871. By 1913 shipbuilding on the Clyde's launch of more shipping tonnage than Germany and the USA put together. Output of coal in Scotland rose from 7.4 million tonnes in 1854, to a peak of almost 43 million tonnes in 1913.

Despite extensive online and archival research, both in New Zealand and then Scottish mining communities in April 2017, it has proved to be virtually impossible to obtain personal communications such as diaries, letters or similar resources from any of my target group. This has therefore made it impossible to identify specific pits or even communities where these men came from prior to emigration to New Zealand. Families, local museums and heritage societies, RSA and British Legion (Scotland) have all been contacted with no success and this leads to a perhaps erroneous belief that these men had little interest in remembering the traumas of battle.

For the most part though they did have long and productive lives in New Zealand before and after World War 1 and that can perhaps be explained to some extent by the fact that they were engaged in a work and community environment not unfamiliar to

---

59 Knox, "SUMMARY of ECONOMY AND SOCIETY IN SCOTLAND 1840-1940." p.8
them from their earlier lives in Scotland. The evidence of the economic and social challenges faced by workers in Scotland, in particular manual labourers such as miners and farmworkers, would clearly make the promise of better conditions in the new country a very interesting proposition for the men in the target group and their families and, of course, they traveled to New Zealand with little thought of returning so soon to be part of a war representing their new country.
Chapter 2 – A strange new world, but very familiar.

By 1900, there were around 163 mines in New Zealand producing 1 million tonnes of coal per year and by 1914 this had increased to around 2.25 million tonnes, primarily in the Waikato and Otago regions. This increase, as noted in the following graphs, also coincided with the opening of State Coal Mines under Richard Seddon. It should be noted that the conditions in the State Coal mines was no better than the private operated ones until the nationalization of coal mining by the Savage led Labour Government of the 1940’s. The graphs show a significant drop in production in the West Coast and Otago/Southland as conscription started in 1916, but no significant drop in the North Island. Indeed throughout the First World War production exponentially increased in the North and that would seem to match with the limited number of coal miners that enlisted in the Tunnelling Company from these areas. North Island based NZETC recruits were, in the early groups primarily from the Waihi gold mines. Indeed these men are the focus of much of the memorialization of NZETC, as evidenced in the content of the New Zealand Tunnelling Company Memorial website and the dedication of the physical memorial in the township of Waihi.

---

60 Knox, "SUMMARY of ECONOMY AND SOCIETY IN SCOTLAND 1840-1940."
The graphs show the war years there was differing impact on the three main mining regions. Otago/Southland remained pretty constant at around 1/2 million tonnes per

---

annum between 1900 and 1970 with no overall drop in production during the First World War. The west coast of New Zealand was producing in the region of 1.2 million tonnes of coal at the start of the war and this plummeted to approximately 3/4 million tonnes by 1920 and took another decade for this output to recover only to return to the post-war output in the 1930s. Output did recover during the Second World War has been on the decline since the 1950s. The North Island, in particular the Waikato coalfields, had not been a major producer of coal in New Zealand in the 1800s. By 1900 the output of the North Island coalfields began to climb and during the war years bypass the output of Otago/Southland and by the start of the Second World War began to match and exceed the West Coast.

The second graph also shows the emergence of state coalmines in the early 1900s, but as less than 10% of the total output of coal prior to nationalisation it cannot be seen as a major reason for Scottish miners relocating to New Zealand.

Single men such as 2nd Sergeant Samuel Eaton (4/1611), from an intergenerational Lanarkshire mining family arrived in New Zealand in 1910 with his brother on the Assisted Passage Scheme to earn higher rates than could have been possible in Scotland. It is safe to assume that key drivers for Eaton and those like him in coming to New Zealand was to escape the poor conditions and near servitude felt by their fellow miners back in Scotland. This followed the drift of miners and their families from West to East of Scotland’s Central Belt as described in the previous chapter. There is however, no evidence that Samuel Eaton was involved in industrial action in Scotland, but clearly the strike of 1909 would have been a significant incentive to move.
Miners again in New Zealand?

It is easy to hypothesise that many of the Scottish miners could be expected to be coming to New Zealand for a “better life” and therefore would not be going underground in the new country. Whilst there are a few cases of individuals in new trades, the majority seems to have actually continued in their previous occupation. In informal discussions with mining families in Scotland, along with personal recollections from family discussions, community was a major reason for immigrant miners moving to areas such as the West Coast and central Otago. Clearly they could find “their ain folk” in these communities and perhaps this helped them to settle in this new country. Indeed, Brian Wood quotes Leonard Richardson in saying “occupational identity and union Solidarity’ is the key to the Scots identity within the mining communities of the West Coast and Blackball in particular. He also notes that by 1908, Scots had formed a substantial and growing ethnic group in the Blackball community reaching and by some estimation reached 40% of the total population in the area.

Family was clearly a driver for some of the men, with evidence on the Passenger Lists that is identified elsewhere in this thesis that entire family groups often made the journey. There are also several instances of siblings being the other ones coming out to New Zealand, usually a brother who was also a miner or a sister, perhaps agreeing to come to New Zealand to ‘keep house’ for their brother or to enter service. This is often suggested from entries on the enlistment records.

---

64 Collie,G, 2017.p71
65 Brian Wood, The great ‘08 Blackball coal miners’ strike, 27 February-13 May 1908 (Greymouth, New Zealand: Brian Wood, 2008), p70
West Coast

The mines of Central Otago, Blackball and Westport provided a living for nineteen of the subject group and for their families. Whilst the expectation from this study was that the newly arriving Scots miners would be card carrying socialists, there is no correlation between the sample group and unrest across the Gold and Coal mining areas of New Zealand. Lists of Union Officials and identified members of the Union in either Brian Wood’s *The Great '08* or Len Richardson’s *The Denniston Miners Union - A Centennial History*, but this could also somewhat be explained by the destruction of many union records in fires and similar events over the years. The Denniston miners union (1894) and the Blackball miners union (1900) were formed to meet the requirements of the Industrial Conciliation and Arbitration Act (1894) despite misgivings about the compulsory arbitration processes in the system devised by Fabian leaning Minister of Labour William Pember Reeves.

Kaitangata

Unlike the West Coast mines, Kaitangata was not a centre of militant Union action. Indeed when a vote on the affiliation with the Federation of Labour over the cancellation of registration under the Arbitration Act was held across the Otago Mines in December 1911, Kaitangata was the only areas to remain Arbitrationists. By 1912, further attempts to align with the Federation of Labour had petered out and Kaitangata

---

68 Wood, *The great '08 Blackball coal miners' strike, 27 February-13 May 1908.*
miners had signed an exclusive deal with the employers that ensured the success of the Kaitangata Coal Miners Union\textsuperscript{70}.

\begin{center}
\textit{A picture of miners from the Kaitangata Coal Company 1914 (Hocken Library)}\textsuperscript{71}
\end{center}

Thirteen of the subject group are associated with Kaitangata, with the majority arriving in New Zealand between 1907 and 1913\textsuperscript{72}. This included Glaswegian brothers Walter and Alexander Wilson who arrived in Wellington on the \textit{Orvieto} in September 1913.

\textsuperscript{70} Irene Sutton and Bill Proctor, \textit{History of Kaitangata} (University of Otago - Printing Department, 2006).
\textsuperscript{71} Sutton and Proctor, \textit{History of Kaitangata}.
\textsuperscript{72} Unknown, "Kaitangata Coal mine employees 1914," ed. Hocken Library (1914).
BY TELEGRAPH.
MONTREAL, 7th September.

Sailed—Tokomaru, for Melbourne, Sydney, and New Zealand ports.

MELBOURNE, 8th September.


Notice of the arrival of the Wilson Brothers on the Orvieto in Sept 1913.73.

Both enlisted in October 1915 and were in the first group heading over to Europe74.

This suggests that their reasons were primarily for the adventure rather than any nationalistic pride given their short time actually in New Zealand. Other reasons could reasonably be an attempt to be seen as a member of the community they had settled into as immigrants trying to fit in as new New Zealanders. Alternatively, the conditions they found in Kaitangata were little better than those they left in Scotland and the trip back to Europe that might allow them to visit family could have also been a pull factor.

Life on the Otago coalfields for a young immigrant miner would have been reminiscent of the lives back in Scotland and clearly there was still an emotional connection to

---

Great Britain as war started in 1914. Many of them would have considered or even attempted enlisting at the start of the war, but the importance of coal production meant that there was a delay before specialist recruitment was encouraged.

Brian Wood in his book *The Great ’08*, a history of the Blackball miner’s strike of 1908 identifies the Scots or those of Scottish descent as being a major grouping amongst the miners of the West Coast. Whilst he does not give exact figures he does note that the number of Scots miners and families were increasing whereas those with English heritage were decreasing by 1890. By 1908 approximately 40% of those identifying their heritage as not New Zealand, were Scottish.

Wood also notes that although several of the miners involved in the 1908 strike came directly from Scotland, the vast majority had previously been working in the New South Wales coalfields around Newcastle. Although not identified in those Scots who served in the New Zealand Tunnelling Company, Scots miners were heavily involved in 1908 Blackball strike. For those moving to New Zealand from New South Wales the hope was that they would see improved conditions. They had escaped the very poor situation in the Scottish coalfields, simply to find similar substandard working conditions, housing and new ‘colonial’ capitalists. Scottish miners had a historical reputation for the determination to improve conditions and with what was described as a pragmatic and opportunistic approach to doing this is therefore not surprising that Scots did have a major role in the 1908 strike.

---

Individuals such as Lanarkshire miner Edward Hunter, more commonly known as Billy Banjo, were already well versed in trade union activity and when he arrived on the West Coast in 1906 his writings as an acknowledged prominent Socialist focus on the traditions of miners, on past misdeeds of mine owners and the development of a class conscious community and of course trade union solidarity. Banjo clearly identified the 1908 strike as a continuation of the struggle of the working classes\textsuperscript{76}. Given the strength of feeling within the Blackball and other West Coast mining communities and in particular anti-English and anti-establishment feeling it may be somewhat surprising that many of these young men chose to enlist at the first opportunity to fight for King and country.

\textsuperscript{76} Wood, \textit{The great '08 Blackball coal miners' strike, 27 February-13 May 1908}. p 77
Chapter 3 – The decision to go to War.

Edinburgh born Sapper Archibald Hector Macrae (4/1664) was the first Scot recorded as enlisting in the NZETC on the 23rd August 1915.\(^{77}\)

In the middle of 1915 the War Office in London, noting the developing underground actions on the Western Front made a call to the Dominions for reinforcements and almost immediately Canada, Australia and New Zealand responded.

.. with the assistance of the governments of Canada, Australia, New Zealand, and South Africa, would be greatly appreciated in the matter of increasing the number of Tunnelling Companies, Royal Engineers, now employed with the forces of the continent. The present situation is, that the number of qualified miners likely to become available within the United Kingdom is insufficient to form the number of additional companies required, and also insufficient to admit of those which it is intended to form being constituted exclusively of expert men.\(^{78}\)

By September of the year the New Zealand Ministry of Defense put out the call for experienced miners and tunnel men and offered commissions for qualified mining and civil engineers\(^{79}\).

\(^{77}\) Wood, The great '08 Blackball coal miners' strike, 27 February-13 May 1908.

\(^{78}\) Archives New Zealand, "Archibald Hector McRae service record," in Archway (Wellington, New Zealand: Archives New Zealand, 2017). AD1 Box 1348 62/23

\(^{79}\) Archives New Zealand, "Request to Commonwealth Governments for additional Tunnelling Companies.," (1915).p.33
The call went out in New Zealand in April 1915 for miners to join the new Tunnelling Company as seen in the following advertisement from the Otago Daily Times.

*Otago Daily Times* - 15th April 1916 p.8

Six Scots seem to have heeded the call for the 2nd Reinforcement in the *Otago Daily Times* advertisement. Sappers Andrew Bennie (21388), John Irvine (21391), Archibald Johnston (21399), John Nicol (21393), John Samson (21424) and Sergeant John Finney (21435) - all North Island Miners enlisted between the 1st and 5th May 1916. There were 23 Scots in the initial embarkation, 6 in the 2nd reinforcement, 14 in the 3rd, 5 in the 4th, 11 in the 5th, only one in the 6th and 3 in the 7th and final reinforcement. This was despite there being a restriction on coal miners enlisting due to their jobs being designated as *work of national interest*. Those working in the gold and other extraction sectors were seen as not a vital industry of national interest and therefore made the bulk of the early volunteers. According to J.C. O’Neill in the 1922 history of the New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1915-1919, the inspector of mines interviewed each candidate and there was a strict quota across the different mining districts to ensure production was maintained.81

---

These men were expert miners, but not ideal soldiers when it came to military discipline. In the official report, week ending 30th October 1915, discipline received a special entry.

The men settled down to discipline much better than had been anticipated, considering that on arrival a great many of them had to be carried from the Railway Station into the Camp, being in a helpless drunken condition.\(^{82}\)


In fact even the media, who were conservative in their opinions and supportive of the Government actions against the Red Feds managed to show concern about some of the new recruits.

The 26 November *Poverty Bay Herald* reported:

The Tunnelling Company, at present in camp at Avondale, Auckland, is reported to have earned the name of the "Red Feds". There are at present in camp with this company eleven members who were formerly secretaries of various trade

unions, whilst there are over forty who are erstwhile members of trade union committees. Most of the men in the company are miners who have learned their business in a hard school, and are very efficient in their own special line. They have learned to fight their own battles and are one and all serenely confident of giving a more than good account of themselves should they pitted in hand-to-hand conflict against Mr Turk.\textsuperscript{84}.

J.C Neill notes that:

> Of discipline in the army sense they knew nothing, but they had been trained in many a camp and mine to obey orders promptly and intelligently and that training never failed through their years of service.\textsuperscript{85}

He also observes that the decision to place a training camp for enlisted men and officers, none of whom had in his words “the slightest of military training” in clear view of New Zealand’s largest city\textsuperscript{86}.

For hard men such as the miners in the Tunnelling Company, being encamped in a district that had been “dry” since 1908 must have been a challenge. There were no legal sales of alcohol in the area, which is probably why Avondale was chosen, but the \textit{Sly Groggers} did a roaring trade with the Tunnellers until they were caught and imprisoned. It is not hard to imagine individuals from our study group spending time in

\textsuperscript{84} Lisa Truttman, “The Tunnelling Company of Engineers, over 400 strong, on parade at the Avondale Camp, October 1915,” Area 360, https://discover.stqry.com/v/avondale-racecourse/s/423837cc7cd845c34dd1c8c6a5361ea2.


\textsuperscript{86} Ibid. p.6
Mr. Turnbull’s “Fish and Chip Shop” which was a front for an illegal bar\(^\text{87}\). The lights of central Auckland could be seen clearly from Avondale and that would have been another great temptation for these ‘new’ soldiers who were used to following their own wishes when not working.

Neill is not correct about the lack of military experience as the service records of several of the target group do show prior military service in Scotland, but generally the opinion of an unruly band of bushmen was well deserved and probably contributed to the comment that “the only enthusiasm the citizens (of Auckland) showed to the company was when they bade it farewell.”\(^\text{88}\)

Perhaps it was the impact of drink on the recruits that led to the perception of the citizens of Auckland of unruly men that led to Neill’s previous comment and the arrest on their final leave before embarkation of Tunnellers William Page and Herbert Mackersey who “made themselves objectionable to women” They also assaulted a Police Sergeant Rutledge, who commented that “there is a tendency among these fellows to interfere with women in town”\(^\text{89}\). The magistrate, Mr. E.C.Cuttan did show some understanding as he decided not to put them in the cells but did fine them the princely sum of 20/- each. Were the Scots in the Tunnelling Company any better than their comrades? Searches of police reports of the time have shown no matches with the study group of 62 Scots born Tunnellers.

\(^{87}\) Auckland Star, 22nd October 1915. p.2
\(^{88}\) Auckland Star, 22nd October 1915. p.6
\(^{89}\) Auckland Star, 15th November 1915. p.4
The fact that a Salvation Army chaplain had been appointed to the company but “owing to some squabble he was left behind, never to be replaced” would also support the understanding of a group that relied on each other more than offices or a higher power in their work.91

One of the apparent benefits to enlistment was the medical and dental checkup offered to all recruits and it was reported in the New Zealand Herald on 25th November 1915 that:

It was found during a preliminary inspection of the men by the appointed Dental Surgeon Captain E.C. Winstone that very few had teeth in good enough condition to chew the hard army food they would find served to them in France … Captain Winstone and Lieutenant Phillips are in charge of this important work, and the records showed that (to 4th November 1915) there have been 624 fillings, 411 extractions, and other cases. Over 90 plates are now being made for men in the camp92.

90 “Civic Reception for the New Zealand Engineer and Tunnelling Company, Auckland Town Hall, December 1915.”
92 New Zealand Herald, 25th November 1915. p.8
This is more than many of these men would have been able to avail themselves of either in Scotland or in the mining communities of New Zealand and may have had some influence on their decision to enlist, but there is no documented evidence of this. Glyn Harper notes, “In 1914 the state of dental health in New Zealand was appalling. Without emergency dental treatment some 30,000 Johnny Enzed’s would not have been fit for military service.”\(^93\) And even by 1916, when the tunnellers were in training less than 50% of some volunteer intakes were declared fit for service but dental issues were one of the few medical conditions that could be treated reasonably easily.

The history of Scots emigrants around the world is often associated with a membership of particular groups such as Caledonian societies, clan societies and other ‘Scottish themed’ organisations. In military terms this often led to kilt wearing regiments such as the Toronto Scottish and the Cameron Highlanders of Ottawa, but this was not the case in New Zealand\(^94\). It can therefore be suggested that, in the absence of branded Scottish regiments in New Zealand, until the formation of the Armoured Car Regiment (NZ Scottish) in 1941, enlistment in a trade based unit would have to satisfy a need for mutual support. Cultural and emotional connections may also give some context to the relationship between the tunnellers and the 51st Highland Division once they arrived in the ‘Labyrinth’ trenches in Arras as their first front line role.

Training had prepared these hard-working manual labourers for some of the challenges they were going to face on the Western front, but it may not have provided them with the skills to become front-line soldiers. After a less than eventful ocean voyage from New Zealand to England, it was perhaps comforting for these men to be able to head

---


\(^94\) Patterson et al., *Unpacking the Kists: The Scots in New Zealand*. p272
back underground to a world that they could understand even when surrounded by
death and devastation. Unfortunately, there are very few personal accounts of this time
by the core group in the study to substantiate a hypothesis that the miners were able to
distance themselves from the alien environment above ground by doing what came
naturally to them.
Chapter 4 – Just another day underground.

The first Anzac experience of tunnelling was actually at Gallipoli. Indeed Christopher Pugsley notes that the driving of mineshafts by miners co-opted from regular units by Lieutenant-Colonel William Malone in the August Gallipoli Offensive in 1915 to intercept Turkish tunnels was a key action that led to the securing of Monash Gully.95 Despite this specialist divisions were not sought from the colonial forces until the impact of German tunnellers was fully felt on the Western Front.96 The New Zealand Tunnelling Company was actually the first New Zealand unit heading for the Western Front on 10th March 1916. By the 16th May the company had taken over from the 7/1 French Territorial Engineers, three miles south of Arras at La Sabliere.97 This section of the line was known as the Labyrinth, one of the networks of trenches below Vimy Ridge and was a cold, wet introduction to the war for them. The Labyrinth provided time for the company to learn the ropes and upskill in listening and rescue techniques before heading to their home for the next two years, the Chanticleer Front on the eastern outskirts of Arras.

For some of the Scots in the company it would have been comforting to know that they were sharing their first engagement with their kinsmen, the 51st Division Highland Territorials, who were the British Army unit in the Labyrinth and who helped them settle into life in the Trenches98. Indeed in the diary of A.E Wrench, noted in Craig French’s Thesis The 51st (Highland) Division During the First World War. With the New

97 Jones, Underground Warfare 1914-1918.p23
Zealanders, the 51st Division seemed to find much in common. On relieving a New Zealand unit in the line the ‘kiwis’ are referred to as a ‘gay and gallant crowd’99. Perhaps the camaraderie between the Scots in the Tunnelling Company and those in other units can be explained in their shared working class background and also the need to be seen as Scots rather than English Kiwi’s, however there is no evidence of any overt nationalism in Tunnelling Company records. Nigel Cave and Phillip Robinson do note an incident in *The Underground War: Vimy Ridge to Arras* that perhaps shows some of the feelings that may have surfaced in the heat of conflict.

On 31st March another mine was fired by the Germans on the front of the 153rd Brigade, with the loss of one officer wounded, six other ranks killed and three wounded. The explosion of this mine was also followed by an intense bombardment by weapons of all natures. A party of Germans then entered a sap. Of these one approached a Jock who had survived the explosion and, pointing his rifle at him, said, ‘Hands up, Englishman!’ The infuriated Jock threw a Mills bomb at the German, having failed to remove the safety pin, and shouted, ‘Scotsman, you fucking bastard’. The bomb struck the German full on the forehead and felled him. He was captured, and subsequently died in the Casualty Clearing Station from a fractured skull. 100

Also, the relationship between the Tunnellers, the Scots and the Maori members of the New Zealand Pioneer Battalion created a dynamic on the battlefield that was somewhat unique. Cave and Robinson add that,

99 Craig F. French, "The 51st (Highland) Division During the First World War" (University of Glasgow, 2006). p194
100 French, "The 51st (Highland) Division During the First World War." Ch7
It is evident from the records that the Scots from the 9th and 15th (Scottish) Divisions enjoyed a special place in the esteem of the tunnellers\textsuperscript{101}. But those who imposed their personality most were a small detachment of forty-three Maori Pioneers, who seemed to have developed an especial rapport with the Jocks and with them devised subtle means of ‘liberating’ temporarily abandoned wine cellars, leading to some very jovial parties – much to the chagrin of the military police. The Pioneers were said to be great favourites with everybody, splendid toilers, always willing and cheerful; they supplied an inexhaustible fund of drollery and laughter that was sadly missed when they were recalled at the end of February. The Maori Pioneers also developed effective means of raiding Royal Engineer dumps for timber and, if caught in the act, affected ignorance of the English language. There are many other stories attributed to them\textsuperscript{102}.

Clearly the Tunnellers were a useful addition to the frontline strength. Not only were they tunnelling underground the German trenches but indeed became members of trench raiding parties, both for intelligence gathering on German tunnelling activities but also as experts in explosives. The following report in the \textit{Otago Daily Times} in December 1916 gives some indication of their activities,

\textbf{A Fearless Attack}

\ldots We have had different incidents resulting in injuries to some of our men. The most important occurred on the night of September 14. At 8 o’clock that night for mines were sprung on the enemy and his galleries, with working parties were

\textsuperscript{101} Nigel Cave and Philip Robinson, The Underground War: Vimy Ridge to Arras, (Pen and Sword, 2011), http://books.google.co.nz/books/about/The_Underground_War.html?hl=&id=egLSAwAAQBAJ. p 27

\textsuperscript{102} J.C.Neill, The New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1915-1919. Ch.8
smashing in. Simultaneously with this bombing raid was planned and carried out. Ninety bombers of the British infantry accompanied by 11 members of the New Zealand engineer tunnelling company, took part in a raid. The names of the men in our company were Lieutenant Durant, Sergeant Pownceby, Sergeant Leedon, Sappers Amsley, Brook, Milne, Cornwall (of Dunedin), Pennei, Ormiston, Williamson and Edwards. The New Zealander sappers had to perform was to smash in with high explosives the enemies sap heads, thus impeding operations and at the same time letting of gas bombs in the enemies mine. Each man carried a very heavy load. Only 16 of the bombers succeeded in reaching the enemies trenches. They never returned, but the explosions from the bombs showed that they had fought to the end these men had to crawl over no man's land at a time a terrific bombardment swept the place. The remaining bombers were met with terrific machine-gun fire, and the enemy trenches were lined with German soldiers who emptied their rifles on the bombers. They were forced to take refuge in shell holes all the time sausages and other deadly missiles burst around them while shrapnel burst overhead. Once the Germans rushed from the trenches towards the bombers in the hundreds but machine guns from our trenches being so accurate stop them. At the same time our bombers let fly with bombs and that also helped to keep them back. The order was given to retreat, as the continuance of our bombing in such circumstances was futile. Our losses were Lieutenant Durant, Sergeant Powncenby and Sapper Edwards killed, and Sapper Pennei slightly wounded. When last seen from our trenches Lieutenant Durant and Sergeant Powncenby were carrying a long tube loaded with high explosives for smashing up barbed wire. The flash of an explosion was witnessed amongst the wire, and it is surmise that Lieutenant Durant rushed through the smoke and
onwards for it is alleged by the returned readers that some officer was seen rushing into the German trenches with the bombers who got through the barbed wire. Brave and fearless, he led the way and proved that sons of Otago - for he was educated in the Otago University - can live up to the great traditions of the British Army. With them went Sergeant Powncenby. They were brave men and not afraid to die\textsuperscript{103}.

This account is also supported by J.C. Neill in \textit{The New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1915-1919} where the account also adds that they were supporting the Cheshire Regiment in the action and remarkably when the next major advance was over almost a year later, Durant’s grave was found, well tended behind German lines with the inscription “To the Memory of three brave Englishmen, Lieutenant Durant NZ Tunnelling Company and two NCO’s”\textsuperscript{104}. Clearly Tunnellers were becoming soldiers by any description.

Glyn Harper also notes that Sapper Williamson when writing in his journal after the war slams the operation, as despite the risk involved will be little chance of much damage being caused to the Germans\textsuperscript{105}. He was clearly correct about that but he is a good example of a primary source that needs to be read with care as he is very keen to maximise the importance of his own involvement in the Tunnelling Company, not always giving others the credit they may be due\textsuperscript{106}.

\textsuperscript{103}Cave and Robinson, \textit{The Underground War: Vimy Ridge to Arras}.
\textsuperscript{105}J.C.Neill, \textit{The New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1915-1919}. pp 584-585
\textsuperscript{106}Harper, \textit{Johnny Enzed : the New Zealand soldier in the First World War 1914-1918}. 
As the Tunnelling Company settled in to its activities on the frontline, that they took every opportunity to limit the stress by engaging with the infantry fighting above and in front of them. There are indications that the tunnellers took every opportunity to participate in attacks on enemy trenches, but again there are no specific details about Scots in the focus group discussed in this thesis. It is important to see the work of the New Zealand Tunnelling Company in the context of the Battle of Arras and therefore a look at the historiography of the battle and the participants involved at a command and operational level that follows may help in setting this context.

Outside of New Zealand, Australia, the Battle of Arras is largely a forgotten battle. From a British Point of view, the battle from 9 April to 17 May 1917 was a major engagement that cost some 159,000 British and Allied casualties. The battle marked an important stage in the tactical development of the Allied Command. On 9 April, for instance, two British divisions, 4th and 9th (Scottish), achieved the longest advance to that time by a British unit under conditions of trench warfare—some 5.5 kilometres. The importance of the Arras campaign therefore has been somewhat ignored by popular military historians outwith the Commonwealth countries. For example, prior to the raised profile around the centenary commemorations, in the UK a discussion on the Battle of Arras would undoubtably bring up mention of a minor tank skirmish in 1940 because of the involvement of Erwin Rommel and his Panzer Division\textsuperscript{107}. In Canada, Vimy Ridge is considered the Canadian Gallipoli, meaning that it has the same nation building status in the Canadian psyche that Gallipoli has for New Zealand and Australian historians.

Field Marshal Sir Douglas Haig, had not planned to fight at Arras and Vimy in April-May 1917. Indeed it is clear that he had intended to restart the stalled Somme campaign and then swing towards the Belgian coast to neutralise much of the U-boat threat to Allied shipping by capturing the ports. Unfortunately for Haig, his plans were usurped by General Robert Nivelle who wanted to use similar tactics to those that brought limited success earlier at Verdun to achieve a decisive breakthrough after a ‘prolonged battle’. Arras was seen as a way of holding up German reserves while Nivelle made a major push at Champagne. The British Government and the overall allied command supported Nivelle, despite Haig’s objections. Haig clearly felt that there was a chance of another stalemate situation as he had suffered on the Somme in 1916 but he reluctantly agreed with the plan.

The Infantry plan of attack, Battle of Arras 9/4/1917.

It is in this background that the New Zealand Tunnellers were involved in what was seen as their major action of the war. After their initial work in the Labyrinth the Tunnellers moved to the outskirts of Arras, which would be their home as they began to tunnel under the German trenches and eventually expanding the chalk caverns and connecting tunnels in preparation for the offensive in April 1917. The tunnels and

111 Harris, Douglas Haig and the First World War. p 308
existing caverns or *carrieres* (quarries) were expanded by the New Zealanders and less notably by the Canadians, French and British tunnellers. Harris notes that:

> Eventually a network of 10,901 yards of tunnels were used to accommodate about 24,500 men prior to the attack\(^{112}\).

It was the New Zealand tunnellers that rediscovered the the scope of these caverns and their potential use as strategic advantages.

The quarrying of chalk had begun in Roman times and *boves* or cellars are still a feature of Arras. Residents used these as shops, workshops, taverns or even accommodation but these were very small in comparison with the quarries that has been excavated for building materials and were used ‘for storage and refuge’ over many centuries\(^ {113}\). In September to November 1916, the New Zealand Tunnellers were tasked with preparing a single cave for an attack on the German trenches, but as the extent of the subterranean system became apparent a new plan was devised to link two series of these caves and quarries stretching towards enemy lines\(^ {114}\).

Between November 1916 and March 1917, the New Zealand Tunnellers toiled to link the tunnels and caverns, as well as installing a whole variety of utilities such as electricity, communications and toilet facilities. This was designed to be a home for approximately 20,000 soldiers either resting or preparing for the assault on 9 April.

For the tunnellers, life underground was normal or as normal as tunnelling in wartime could be, but for the soldiers expected to spend some time as near troglodytes this

\(^{112}\) Harris, *Douglas Haig and the First World War*, p 305

\(^{113}\) Harris, *Douglas Haig and the First World War*, Ch 8

\(^{114}\) Cave and Robinson, *The Underground War: Vimy Ridge to Arras*, pp 64-65.
would have been quite a scary place to be had it not been for the tunnellers installing lighting, bunks and other 'luxuries' for their infantry compatriots. For those working underground who were not used to navigation, the New Zealand tunnels and caves were named after places in New Zealand and those dug by the British, Australian and Canadian tunnellers had place names from United Kingdom. The map below shows the position of these tunnels and caves in relation to the City of Arras and the frontline.

Main caves and connecting Tunnels, as of April 1917. (Robinson)

The facilities were so well developed that Brigade and Divisional headquarters were both accommodated in the network to act as communication hubs for the forthcoming battle and there was even a fully equipped dressing station in an isolated cave between the two cave systems and close to the front line\footnote{Cave and Robinson, \textit{The Underground War: Vimy Ridge to Arras}, pp 65-69}.

Such was the importance of this endeavour that New Zealand Prime Minister Massey along with General Richardson visited the tunnels to see what they were doing and to celebrate the incredible progress these men were making. For example, in the week ending 6 December 1916 a total distance of tunnels dug was 1742 feet for that week, far in excess of results achieved in both other Allied and German tunnels\footnote{J.C.Neill, \textit{The New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1915-1919}, p 69}. These men were working long shifts and were clearly very relieved when the end of December 1916 reinforcements arrived from New Zealand.

Importantly this was also the time a detachment of 43 Maori Pioneers arrived to support the tunnellers. Wood to reinforce diggings was becoming more difficult to find and the \textit{Forgotten 43} showed the great aptitude for finding the perfect timber for the job\footnote{The Kia Maumahara Maori Pioneers, or the Forgotten 43 were a mixture of Maori and Cook Island enlistees in the Pioneer Battalion who eventually gained their own identity as Maori Pioneers. They were named the Forgotten 43 by their descendants who have now been recognised as a key part of the New Zealand Expeditionary Force and many of the descendants attended and participated in the Centenary commemorations of the Battle of Arras in April 2017.}.

Neal notes:

\begin{quote}
Mining timber was very strictly rationed and with our numerous works and especially the problem of catching up the caves the company was in chronically short supply, while adjacent Royal engineer dumps could be piled with most desirable sticks. The pioneers had a most effective way of reading these tempting
\end{quote}
piles, affecting blank ignorance of the English language is caught in the act by an infuriated Royal Engineer officer or Sergeant. One such officer commented: “we had collected a beautiful lot of timber for a special job, loaded with key down one of the shafts into the caves, but going down to collect phone not one stick. Some pioneers had seen the timber coming down and had carried every scrap along to that on particular work.”

With the reinforcements along with the Maori pioneers and soldiers seconded from the New Zealand infantry companies, the tunnellers were now tasked with preparing the caverns and advanced tunnels towards the German lines in advance of the attack commenced on 9 April 1917. In particular they had the delicate task of extending tunnels with experts only a few feet beneath the earth and the development of bases to hold advanced machine-gun positions. All of these would be revealed at the start of the battle to allow up to 20,000 allied infantry to surprise those in the German trenches. The success of the battle was completely dependent on the element of surprise and therefore the 500 members of the New Zealand Tunnelling Company had a huge impact on an engagement that included almost 1,000,000 participants.
Chapter 5 – Life, Death and Glory on a variety of ‘Foreign’ Soils.

Scots in the NZETC were somewhat more fortunate than their compatriots in other units when it came to death and serious injury. In fact there were only three deaths in action, two who died from their injuries after their return and two suicides a decade after returning that can be attributed to war trauma. These will be looked at in detail in this chapter.

The conditions in the Arras tunnels are well described in this article, reprinted in the *Otago Daily Times* on 5th December 1916 by a Sapper McManus. It is reproduced in full as it discusses the death of one of the group covered in this thesis.

DANGEROUS WORK AND HIGH PRAISE.

Sapper J. E. MacManus, well known in Labour circles in Dunedin, writes interestingly from France, Under the date September 20, concerning the work of the New Zealand Engineer Tunnelling Corps, of which he is a member. We make the following extracts from his letter.

Otago has just reason to feel proud that in the great achievements performed by the tunnelling company that brave men from their have shared the glory and lustre on her fair soil when called on they have never been found wanting. The company, though menaced by a network of galleries run out from the German saps everywhere, have succeeded in making a name for themselves for the work done. They are headed the list one month for footage done. At other times they
have held an honoured place. I can safely say from my own experience that the work compares with anything ever performed under civic auspices. This opinion is backed up by many here, whom have held positions of responsibility in tunnelling and mining operations. But perhaps the most gratifying feature of all our work is the lavish praise is restored by the British general officer commanding any division operating in the sector, where our company is located, as shown on different occasions in the regimental orders.

**Explosion of a gallery**

On August 14 *(actually August 4th)* at 10pm the Germans succeeded in blowing in one of four galleries. Sergeant Leedon, who was one of the Sergeants in charge at this time, was just entering the sap. The gigantic force of the concussion blew him of the sap and momentarily dazed him. Quickly recovering he immediately seized a pro tem set and descended the mine in the work of rescue, followed by Corporal Johnson and the Lieutenant Metcalfe. They found a trucker, Sapper Leech who had just come out from a gallery, which was smashed in with a truckload of dirt just prior to the explosion, and got him out of the mine. Sapper Leech, though in the main drive, was very badly knocked about. He is well known in Kaitangata. The gallery smashed in was entered, and two men working on the face must have been killed instantaneously. For two shifts, following each other, the work of rescue proceeded, and finally, on the authority of the controller of mind, the work was abandoned, though the sufferers would have liked to give their comrades a decent burial. The men who were killed were Sapper King, of Waimate, who leaves a wife and family to mourn his loss, and Sapper J McCallum, from the West Coast. It was well known by these
brave men that the enemy had been working nearby. It was known that he had
loaded, but nevertheless these heroic men remained at the post and worked
hard in the hope that they would be able to complete the work and blow in the
enemy. The work was being carried out near one of the old craters and therefore
the only chance we had of blowing the enemy was to get further away from the
creator into the solid. Hence in this work the element of chance favoured the
enemy. Being in the solid, he succeeded in blowing out our gallery, but as the
explosion followed the line of least resistance, throughout volumes of duct over
the soldiers on the surface who were entrenched in the crater. In the work of
rescuing the soldiers, some who had 30 foot of the Earth over them, it was find
that the practical knowledge of miners was required.

Therefore Sergeant McGee, number four section, of Kaitangata with Sergeant
Roberts, of number three section was placed in charge of the operation on the
surface. They worked with men of number three section, a fine not file and body
of miners, and succeeding in saving the lives of three men who were entombed.
It seems that four men were in a machine gun emplacement in a trench, which
was covered over with iron girders as a protection against shrapnel. These
girders, twisted with the weight of 30 feet of dirt, saved the lives of the men. The
work of rescue was dangerous and required skill to prevent the men being
completely smothered. The danger to unskilled men in attempting the work of
rescue was that they would bury themselves as well as the imprisoned men.
One of the rescued man, who was covered up to his neck through dirt track went
through, was wet with perspiration, as if he had been dipped in water. This work
was performed by a company and was warmly praised by the general officer
commanding the British division, who stated that it showed a company could be
relied on under adverse circumstances, as well as under favourable circumstances.\textsuperscript{119}

The description above matches the information in both Neill’s history of the New Zealand Tunnelling Company and from McCallum’s service record noted below.

Sapper Joseph McCallum (4/1526), born in 1893 in Leven, Fife\textsuperscript{121}. He was killed along with a Sapper King as the result of enemy action, with a mine collapsing 40 foot of Tunnel J1.2-11 at Arras in August 1916\textsuperscript{122}. McCallum arrived in New Zealand in 1912.

\textsuperscript{119} J.C. Neill, \textit{The New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1915-1919}.
\textsuperscript{120} MacManus, “Dangerous Work and High Praise.”
\textsuperscript{122} Auckland War Memorial Museum, “Joseph McCallum.”
with his family and was working alongside his father Andrew for the Westport Coal Company when he enlisted in October 1915\textsuperscript{123}. He is buried in Roclincourt Valley Cemetery; symbolically his plot was possibly in a mine crater\textsuperscript{124, 125}. Attempts to track down further information on McCallum and/or his family in Scotland has been unsuccessful despite the assistance of mining historians and associated websites such as *The Scottish Mining* website\textsuperscript{126}. This does, however, offer potential deeper study in any future research.

Sapper John Drysdale (37462) was another Scottish born tunneller killed in action\textsuperscript{127}. He was injured in an explosion in an explosives dump at Arras on the 5th May 1917 and died the following day\textsuperscript{128}. The War Diary at the time notes that the tunnellers were working on a cave to house infantry divisions. Born in 1893 in Linlithgowshire, He had been a miner in Scotland beside his father according to the Passenger List from the RMS *Tongariro*\textsuperscript{129}. Drysdale arrived in New Zealand in 1913 with his parents and settled in Dunedin. Unusually for the study group, he was not a miner prior to the war in New Zealand but was a driver for a Mr. Napier\textsuperscript{130}. It should be noted that Sappers McCallum and Drysdale were the only two members of the focus group to be killed as the result of enemy action.

\textsuperscript{123} Family had moved to Huntly by the time of Joseph’s death.
\textsuperscript{124} Manchester, “Casualty Details.”
\textsuperscript{125} https://www.cwgc.org/find-war-dead/casualty/190252/mccallum,-joseph/
\textsuperscript{126} http://www.scottishmining.co.uk/index.html
Dumfries born Sapper James Robson (4/1542\textsuperscript{131}) was Killed in Action on 25/6/1917 France, but a study of the New Zealand Tunnelling Company War Diary at that time does not note his death\textsuperscript{132}. His service record notes that he was \textit{“killed by multiple gunshot wounds”} and it can therefore be surmised that he was above ground at this time\textsuperscript{133}. He had been a Christchurch based miner for W.J Courtney. This W.J. Courtney would appear to be a William James Courtney who was an Auckland Councillor from 1892 to 1900 and had extensive gold and diamond mining enterprises in both Africa and New Zealand\textsuperscript{134}. An argument here could be that Drysdale and other young men like him left working conditions in Scotland under private mine ownership that were perhaps being emulated by mine owners such as Courtney and this may have been an additional incentive to enlist.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{Dumfries-born-Sapper-James-Robson.jpg}
\caption{Dumfries born Sapper James Robson (4/1542).}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{131} Auckland War Memorial Museum, "John Drysdale." in Online Cenotaph (2017).
\textsuperscript{132} Auckland War Memorial Museum, "James Robson," in Online Cenotaph (2017).
\textsuperscript{133} Harper, "Letters from Gallipoli : New Zealand soldiers write home."
\textsuperscript{134} Archives New Zealand, "James Robson," in Archway (Wellington2017).
Born in Forth, Lanarkshire to a mining family, 2nd Corporal William Duncan Donaldson Caldwell (4/1643) was wounded by shell May 30 1916 and died at home in Balclutha 21/12/1918. His only mention in the Tunnelling Company War Diaries is when his disabling incident is described as a “very serious injury by a whiz bang”

His medical records note that a shell wounded him on 30 May 1916 and that the wound was a large excavated one large enough to easily insert one's fist. He was operated upon to ensure there were no shrapnel pieces remaining and no internal injuries were found other than his sacrum was fractured. He was moved to England for further treatment and convalescence at military hospitals in the Hornchurch and Codford. Three months after the injury, William was still unable to walk or stand for more than a few minutes and is bodily functions caused pain and discomfort.

Caldwell was discharged as permanently disabled and returned home to Otago. He recovered sufficiently to return to work in the colliery, but there is no record as to whether he was able to undertake his pre war role as a well-paid coalface worker. It was not, however, his injuries which prematurely ended his life in 1918. It was in fact the Influenza epidemic that was sweeping the country at the time. The *Clutha Leader* of 3 December 1918 notes:

> The death occurred at the Oddfellows Hall Hospital on Sunday morning of Mr. William Caldwell from pneumonia, supervening on influenza. Deceased had been a patient for 10 days. He came from Scotland, and for a number of years

---

137 "New Zealand Tunnelling Company - War Diary, 31 May - 4 September 1916."
worked at the Benhar colliery. He enlisted in the Tunnelling Corps, and while in France was severely wounded in the groin, but after returning to New Zealand sufficiently recovered to resume his old occupation. He was married about four years ago to Miss Ellen Gregg Henderson, daughter of Robert Henderson, Benhar. The late Mr. Caldwell was a prominent member of the Stirling Football Club a few years ago, and was a keen bowler on the Benhar green. He was also a member of the Loyal Dalton Lodge. The deepest sympathy is felt for the widow, who is left with one child a few months old. The funeral, a military one, was held yesterday and several members of the Clutha returned soldiers Association were present.

Edinburgh born Sapper Archibald Hector MacRae (4/1664) lost his left leg from a shell injury at Arras on 6th January 1917 whilst underground resting in his bunk. Mining engineer MacRae was one of the earlier enlistees in the Tunnelling Company, signing up in August 1915. He worked for the Westport Coal Company on the Denniston Plateau and was most likely allowed to enlist as he was an engineer rather than a coalface worker. His service record shows very little remarkable about McRae other than his very unfortunate injury, which led to his death shortly after his return to New Zealand in 1918. The War Diary reports that he was actually injured “by a 70mm dud shell whilst in bed in a forward cellarat billet.”

140 Zealand, “Archibald Hector McRae service record.”
Sapper Kenneth Bruce McLean (4/1376), was awarded the Distinguished Conduct Medal for gallantry and distinguished service. An extract from the London Gazette of 2nd September 1919 notes why McLean was awarded the DCM

*For courageous devotion to duty and initiative in execution of his work.*

*On 10th of March last he was detailed to a battery as an instruction in dugout construction. At the commencement of a hostile attack on 22 March, the message to recall him having miscarried, he stayed with the battery for five days and assisted in both working the gun and establishing a new position when the battery withdrew. On his own initiative he opened up a partly demolished dugout, and so provided cover for the gun crew during a period of intense hostile shelling*\(^{141}\).

He returned to the Waikato after the War and continued to work as a miner, dying in Auckland on the 9th April 1946 approximately 60 years of age and was buried in Waikumete Cemetery.

\(^{141}\) Sutherland, D. "War diary of the Fifth Seaforth Highlanders, 51st (Highland) Division : Sutherland, D : Free Download & Streaming : Internet Archive." p12
PTSD

Now known more commonly as Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD), there are several cases of identified mental illness amongst this target group that led to their taking of their own lives, attributable to the effects of their wartime experience.

Sergeant John Sinclair (4/1544), committed suicide by gunshot in Huntly on the 12th June 1929.

The Coroners report reproduced above notes that he died “from the effects of a gunshot wound, Self inflicted whilst in a state of mental depression - probably aggravated by the result of war injuries”\(^\text{142}\)

Sapper William Stewart (37530) died on 11/9/1928, and was buried in Karori Cemetery, Wellington. The Coroner's Inquest recorded that he died from self-inflicted Lysol poisoning.¹⁴³ Lysol and similar common poisons were a common agent used in suicide between 1900 and 1930 and was a painful method. John Weaver, in *Sorrows of a Century* notes that the “fluid burned the throat, oesophagus and stomach and did not kill quickly.”¹⁴⁴
Chemical means of suicide 1900-2000

The chart above highlights that by the interwar period suicide with easily accessed household chemicals was on a decline, but still the most used non-mechanical method. Overdosing of prescription medication was beginning to become an issue at the end of this period, but there is no evidence of this being relevant to the target group in this study.

Weaver, Sorrows of a century: interpreting suicide in New Zealand, 1900-2000, 40. p.55
In the attached testimony presented to the Coroners Inquest, William Lockart from the Pensions Department notes that William Stewart was invalided out of the Army in 1919 and had been in an out of hospital ever since. Additional evidence noted that he was a long term alcoholic.

146 "Coroners Inquests - Case Files - Wellington - Stewart, William [Use Copy MICRO U 5539] (R23714274)."
Whether it was his PTSD, his alcoholism or deeper seated psychological issues that led William Stewart to taking his own life, clearly his experience in the trenches and tunnels of the Western Front impacted on him and others who were tough men in the mines but who had experienced nothing like the daily threat of death or debilitation.

John Weaver in *Sorrows of a Century* extrapolates that the suicide rate for returned servicemen relative to civilian males at the same time saw a substantial jump in the servicemen percentage in the decade following the end of the War.147 The following table shows, for example that the rate for non-serving civilians in 1920 was around 8.7 per 100,000 the rate for returned servicemen was more in the region of 40 per 100,000. There was closer parity between 1924 and 1930, which could be associated with a struggling economy and the worldwide 1929 economic depression. Glyn Harper also notes that Sue Baker Wilson has identified some 11 members of the NZETC committing suicide in the post-war years148. Those noted previously are part of this group, and the overall timeline seems to suggest that it took almost a decade for the impact of war to become unbearable for these men. A lack of ongoing support, the impact of a global downturn in exports in the decade from 1926 onwards, and perhaps even a perception of a lack of value being placed on their service by the New Zealand public will have had a detrimental impact on men with deep psychological damage.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Approx. n of surviving returned servicemen</th>
<th>Approx. rate of suicide of returned servicemen per 100,000</th>
<th>Min. n of suicides by returned servicemen</th>
<th>Est. of men in age cohort who never served</th>
<th>Suicides of men in service age in service</th>
<th>Approx. rate of suicide of men in service age in service</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>79,500</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>11.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1922</td>
<td>79,100</td>
<td>26.5</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>14.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1924</td>
<td>78,700</td>
<td>29.0</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>15.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1926</td>
<td>78,300</td>
<td>23.0</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>18.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1928</td>
<td>77,900</td>
<td>21.2</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>18.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td>77,400</td>
<td>22.6</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>22.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[149\] Weaver, Sorrows of a century: interpreting suicide in New Zealand, 1900-2000, 40.
The previous table above shows the difference between suicides in the general population of a similar age with the number of suicides in returned servicemen. It clearly indicates a greater proportion of returned service personnel taking their own lives.

Not all post-war service related deaths were linked to suicide or complications from wounds received. Young men, away from the constriction of a conservative society back in New Zealand were open to the ‘challenges’ of the easy availability of alcohol and prostitutes, especially while on leave in France. Sapper Archibald Johnstone (21399) was amongst many of these men who were affected by Syphilis to a greater or lesser extent. His medical record shows that he was discharged with a Permanent disability, Tabes dorsalis (Syphilis). He died in 1924 while a patient at Porirua Mental Hospital\textsuperscript{150}. Glyn Harper talks about a figure of 1500 returned servicemen who were in institutional confinement after the war, in New Zealand\textsuperscript{151}. In addition to individuals such as Sapper Johnston, syphilis did affect some of these individuals. Harper details the experience of Jim Muldoon, father of former Prime Minister Robert Muldoon, who by 1928 was both physically and mentally disabled and spent almost twenty years in the Psychiatric Hospital in Point Chevalier, Auckland\textsuperscript{152}.

Many of those members of the Tunnelling Company either injured or incapacitated were, after initial assessment and treatment at field hospitals, spent time undergoing further treatment and rehabilitation in New Zealand military hospitals in southern England. By October 1916, there were 4740 New Zealand sick and wounded in

\textsuperscript{150} Harper, Johnny Enzed : the New Zealand soldier in the First World War 1914-1918.
\textsuperscript{151} Archives New Zealand, “JOHNSTONE, Archibald WW1 21399 Army,” in Archway (Wellington New Zealand: Archives New Zealand, 2017). p 612
\textsuperscript{152} Harper, Johnny Enzed : the New Zealand soldier in the First World War 1914-1918. pp 611-612
England and by the end of the year there were some 12,000 of the New Zealand Expeditionary Force in England with some 7000 of those in hospitals in the neighbouring Codford and Sling camps in the Chilterns.

According to Romy Wyeth, in her local history of the Codford Camp “Warriors for the Working Day’ Codford formed a Venereal Disease Section. Venereal Diseases such as Syphilis and Gonorrhea were seen as disciplinary misdemeanours as they were preventable and therefore this part of the camp was enclosed in barbed wire and had a permanent guard at the entrance. Wyeth reports that an unnamed New Zealand soldier, who had arrived at Codford to undergo hardening up training prior to returning to France commented:

On the top of the hill is another New Zealand camp which is out of bounds and ringed by a high powered wire fence. This is both a hospital (3NZGH) and a prison combined for both whose relations with the civil population were of undue familiarity. Apparently Venus deprives Mars of many warriors.

Whilst Archie Johnston’s medical file in his service record does not specifically mention Codford it does mention him being marched to Sling. Given his eventual debilitating illness and his long confinement in Porirua it can be surmised that he will have been treated and probably incarcerated in a facility such as the venereal disease unit at Codford prior to his return to New Zealand on the RS Ruahine in early 1918 when he was then discharged to the soldiers hostel on the terrace in Wellington. There is no available record to show when he ended up in the Porirua Mental Hospital.

---

155 Archives New Wyeth, Warriors for the Working Day.
Overall, the Scots in the Tunnelling Company were quite fortunate to be statistically insignificant in relation to the casualties suffered by other members of the New Zealand Expeditionary Force. This said, clearly the individual deaths in action and more particularly those who died after the war from both physical and mental injuries had an impact on their families and communities. It is probably only the tip of the iceberg when it comes to psychological issues for return miners, but those who were able to return to work underground perhaps able to deal with these issues based around the camaraderie and the fact they were still doing high-risk work which perhaps covered up the impact from their war service. There is no evidence of ongoing impacts on our target group after the start of World War II and we may therefore extrapolate that the understanding of PTSD and other psychological issues faced by soldiers was perhaps better understood by this time.
Chapter 7 – Was Aotearoa still home?

The majority of the Scots in the Tunnelling Company returned to lives in New Zealand and several of them took up the offer of land reserved for returning servicemen under the 1915 Discharged Soldiers Settlement Act (Amended 1916). One of these was Jack Samson.

The image above, provided by the family of Sapper Sampson shows him (bottom left inset) with a group of his colleagues.

---

156 Zealand, “JOHNSTONE, Archibald WW1 21399 Army.”
157 Image of J Sampson and other tunnellers came courtesy of the Sampson family and there is no identification of the publication it was originally reproduced in.
A letter to his family back in Scotland in 1934 was critical of the New Zealand Government on his return to the country on demobilisation in July 1919. In hindsight he wishes that he had remained in Scotland after demobilisation after the war but clearly pressure was put on him to either return to New Zealand or decline disability support if not.

I had no idea of coming back to NZ when I left at that time but when I got back to camp they wanted me to sign that I was a fit man before I could get my discharge letter, and I wouldn’t do it so I was included in the next draft for New Zealand. I never fully recovered from the war, but I might as well have stayed in Scotland for all the help I got from the New Zealand government. However I never applied for any. I was thankful to be still alive.

I haven’t got onto well since I came back. I wasn’t fit for mining so I took a farm to lift the part of the country I knew and understood and came here because of land seemed to be cheaper, but some of it is dear at any price. I spent my money on it before I realised how well the land was and I was to pigheaded to let the first loss being the last, and no prices for produce are below production costs. However I am still alive and fairly healthy so why worry. Things might have been worse.  

158

158 Personal Correspondence, Samson to Samson, August 4, 1934. Provided to the Author by the family.
Back in the United Kingdom

Not all emigrant miners in the Tunnelling Company from Scotland decided to return to New Zealand after the war. Several, in fact, decided to demobilise at the end of the service period and return home to family and their old lives. How much of this can be attributed to the horrors observed by these men above and below the battlefields of the Western front or simply that they didn't find what they were looking for a New Zealand after all is purely speculation given the lack of written commentary from them.

Glaswegian, Sapper Allan Cameron (4/1606), was demobilised in the United Kingdom in March 1919. According to his service records, Cameron had been a Territorial member of the Cameron Highlanders prior to coming to New Zealand. During his service in France he was transferred for a few months in 1917 to No.38 Field Ambulance but served most of the time with the Tunnelling Company159.

2nd Corporal Samuel Eaton (4/1611) was born in October 1882 to Ulster Protestant Irish immigrant parents in Larkhall, Lanarkshire and returned there soon after the end of the war160. It is probable that he returned to his former employment as a Coal miner, but there is no evidence to support this hypothesis.

Sapper John Connolly (37501), originally from Dumbarton was hospitalised in England at the end of the War and deserted from his hospital bed. He was reported as returning to Scotland and there was no further mention of him in New Zealand where he had worked as a riveter with the Public Works department in Taranaki. He is noted in the

159 Discharged Soldiers Settlement Amendment, 21/6/1921, dssab19162395.
Evening Post as considering returning to New Zealand but there is no evidence of this happening.

Mr. John Connolly (37501) is at Dumbarton, where he is taking a course of study with regard to ship building. He is thinking of going back to New Zealand some time next year¹⁶¹.

Sapper Daniel Curran (37642) - Daniel was born in Shotts and his next of kin came from nearby Cleland¹⁶². In 1911, when Daniel was 26 years old there were around 16 working mines in that area of Lanarkshire. These mines were becoming less productive as geology made mining more and more difficulty and many of his contemporaries moved east. Perhaps he decided to try his luck further afield in New Zealand, but clearly the War convinced him to return to his ain folk.

Fifer, Sapper Erskine Farmes (37645) had been in the more militant mining areas of New Zealand, specifically Blackball, where the NZ Labour Party sees its roots on arrival in 1914 and was one of the later arrivals in France, enlisting in 1917. He was medically discharged in 1919 from Codford Hospital, which coincidentally was the New Zealand, and Australian hospital that dealt primarily with sexually transmitted disease cases, but there is no record that this was the cause of his discharge. He demobilized to New Zealand, but eventually returned to Scotland and died there in 1946¹⁶³.

Off to Australia

Sapper Archibald Hector MacRae (4/1664) was born in Edinburgh in 1884 and was working for the Westport Coal Company as an engineer when he enlisted in August 1915 and was part of the first group of tunnellers heading overseas. As noted earlier, MacRae suffered the loss of leg at Arras in 1917 and was finally demobilised on a pension of 32/-. After continued treatment in Europe and New Zealand, both as in and out patient he was then trained as a motor mechanic and by 1921 he had moved to Hobart in Tasmania. Archie died in February 1959 in Newtown, Sydney NSW.\textsuperscript{164}

Sergeant James Brown (37555) from Glasgow was a sawmill engine driver at the Flett Sawmill, Awahuri near Palmerston North. He arrived in New Zealand in mid 1915 and enlisted 18 months later in December 1916. On demobilization in mid-1919 he moved to Manly in New South Wales.\textsuperscript{165} There is no further information available about James Smith at this time.

Canada Bound

Corporal Alexander Valentine (4/1318) has been a bit of an enigma in this study, arriving in New Zealand in 1915 from Canada to enlist, and then returning to Canada via Sydney in 1919 where he died in 1952. Correspondence with the Canadian War Museum,\textsuperscript{166} and the Revelstone Museum in British Columbia has allowed some educated guesswork as to his reasons for enlisting in New Zealand and not either in

\textsuperscript{164} Archives New Zealand, "MacRae, Archibald Hector- WW1 4/1664 - Army," in Archway (Wellington New Zealand: Archives New Zealand, 1917).
\textsuperscript{165} Archives New Zealand, "Curran, Daniel WW1 37642," in Archway (Wellington: Archives New Zealand, 2017).
\textsuperscript{166} Peter McLeod, 16/11/2017 2017.
Canada or the UK, which would have been more logical. He had been working on the Connaught Tunnel in Glacier, on the Canadian Pacific Railway, not as a tunneller but in fact as a saddler providing support for wagons supply the railway workers.

Valentine was born in Montrose, in the North East of Scotland in 1881 into a family of Stonemasons. There is some indication that his father was already in New Zealand and that may have been his reason for enlisting here but otherwise there seems to be no logical reason for his long journey to New Zealand.

Sergeant Robert Waugh (37492), from Carluke in Lanarkshire, enlisted in October 1916 whilst a coal miner in Huntly. He had only been in New Zealand for a couple of years and had no familial connections with New Zealand. He had arrived in Canada with his brother in 1909 and travelled to New Zealand in 1914 to work in Huntly as a miner with Extended Mines Ltd. After serving in the Tunnelling Company between 1916 and 1919 he returned to the Waikato and continued his employment, rising to the role of Mine Deputy. Familial pull seems to have been the impetus for Robert returning to Canada in 1923. His brother James was living in Vancouver and Robert noted on his immigration documents that he was only passing through en-route to study in the United States it seems that Canada was his final destination, dying in Vancouver in 1960.

Out of the target group of sixty-two in the study, only nine decided not to make New Zealand their permanent home. For several of these men clearly New Zealand was only a transient home whilst working as miners, but for others it would appear that the

rigours of war and no family support in New Zealand encouraged them to return to the Scottish homeland or to places with family and friends were now located. Mining, whether for coal or gold, historically led to short-term migrations. Nevertheless, whether it can be put down to distance, better conditions or some other unspecified cause, the majority of the Scots born tunnellers decided the New Zealand was now home.
Chapter 9 – Conclusion

Scots are traditionally travellers and explorers as well as providing much of the military support for the British Empire. It is therefore not surprising that when times are hard back in Scotland young men would take the opportunity to look for better lives overseas. It does perhaps also give some indication as to why these young men would welcome the adventure of serving in a war as perhaps their fathers and grandfathers had done before them. Indeed several of the older recruits show prior military experience, either as reserves or enlisted soldiers.

They were however, first and foremost miners and the issues around behaviour, discipline and lack of respect for officers ensured that they retained the perspective around the role they were sent to Europe to undertake.

Was this thesis able to answer the four focus questions posed in the introduction?

a) Who were the Scots-born Tunnellers in the NZETC?,

As there is very little written account of the lives of the target group, either in Scotland, New Zealand or during active service it has only been possible to do a superficial investigation around the individuals. It is possible however to make some clear generalisations about them. In most cases they had been involved in the mining industry in Scotland before coming to New Zealand and it is mainly because of their involvement in that industry that they were chosen to serve in the tunnelling company. They were skilled manual workers who took both the work and union support ethic with them to the front and that did make them important part of the New Zealand expeditionary force during World War I.
b) What were their reasons for coming to New Zealand?,

This thesis identifies in mining sector in Scotland that was poorly paid, had no security of work and had poor health and safety mechanisms in place. In many cases the workers were little more than indentured slaves given the control over wages, housing costs and anti union feeling by the private owners of the mines. It is important to understand this as it will have been a major aspect of the decision for single young men, and in some cases their young families, to make their lives so far away from their families.

Not all of their reasons for emigrating were negative. There are instances of entire families travelling to New Zealand, making the most of a promise of work, assisted passage and reports from friends and relatives who had already made the journey. Heavy promotion of emigration in local newspapers in Scotland would also have been a substantial pull factor, with regular features in the same newspapers identifying the benefits of life in New Zealand.

c) Why did they enlist?

Adventure is also a possible driver for immigration from Scotland, and of course the thesis has noted that adventure is also one of the drivers for enlistment despite there being very little reason for patriotic fervour regarding New Zealand for the target group. Was it mainly mateship, as identified by Jock Phillips, or a need to be seen as being a patriotic member of the New Zealand community their chosen to join? Was it perhaps still a feeling of duty towards the ‘old country’?
Without the personal commentary from the majority of our target group it is impossible to be definitive with an answer, but clearly when the call for volunteers went out there was no evidence of any reticence amongst the group to sign up. This thesis has identified multiple reasons for enlistment and as there are no surviving members of the NZETC there was no-one to interview. The Jack Sampson letter is the only correspondence from the focus group and only shows his irritation with the country and the government post his service.

d) What lasting impact did the War have on them?

The thesis has identified the link between service of the Western Front and both physical and mental trauma. The fact that even a decade after the end of the war, tunnellers were susceptible to suicidal thoughts and in some cases actions did mean that there was an impact on them from the horrors they experienced and observed. It may also explain why there’s so little written recollection from this group as writing it down could be seen as perpetuating the pain.

Overall, the Scots in the tunnelling company, despite being around 12% of the total serving during World War I were fairly anonymous in the actions. This thesis has identified a limited number whose lives before, during and after the war could be said to be significant either on a personal basis or an overall historiography of New Zealanders at war. The aim of the thesis was to attempt to give a cradle to grave view offers many of these men as possible, highlighting three distinct aspects of the lives.

Unfortunately for researchers these men left very little written trace of the lives, but what the research has shown is that miners and associated manual labourers remain so even when fully involved in the battles of the Western Front. Was this simply
because that was all they really knew, or was it a more complex strategy for coping with the horrors of war? This thesis has been unable to be definitive in answering this additional question, but perhaps it provides some guidance for future researchers working in this area.
### Appendix 1 - Table of Scots-Born members of the NZETC.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name and</th>
<th>Rank and Service Number</th>
<th>Date of Birth</th>
<th>Place of Birth</th>
<th>NZ address at departure</th>
<th>Home area (Scotland)</th>
<th>Next of Kin NZ</th>
<th>NZ address at departure</th>
<th>Occupation NZ</th>
<th>Occupation Scotland</th>
<th>Date of Enlistment/Discharge</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sergeant</td>
<td>James BROWN 37555</td>
<td>10/3/1884</td>
<td>Airdrie, Lanarkshire</td>
<td>Awahuri Hotel, Palmerston North</td>
<td>Longcroft Glasgow Scotland</td>
<td>Engine Driver,1914/15 Flett Sawmill Awahuri</td>
<td>E 5/1/1917 moved to NSW D 22/5/1919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lance Corporal</td>
<td>William Duncan CALDuell 4/1643</td>
<td>25/3/1887</td>
<td>Forth, South Lanarkshire</td>
<td>Bannockburn, Central Otago</td>
<td>Ellen Caldwell (W) Benhar, Bruce, Otago</td>
<td>Miner (skilled Face Worker) Benhar</td>
<td>E 9/10/1915 Wounded by shell D 20/1/1917 May 30 1916, Died in Balclutha 21/12/1919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>John CONNOLLY 37501</td>
<td>15/5/1890</td>
<td>Dunbarton</td>
<td>Te Roti, Taranaki</td>
<td>4 Church Place none Dunbarton</td>
<td>Riveter, Public Works Dept</td>
<td>E 4/10/1916 noted as returning to scotland after war. Deserted while in hospital in UK.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>John CUMMACK 37717</td>
<td>15/11/1881</td>
<td>Blantyre, Lanarkshire</td>
<td>Extended St, Huntly</td>
<td>Mrs Jane Cummack (M) Huntly</td>
<td>Miner, Taupiri1909 Coal Co Huntly</td>
<td>Coal Miner</td>
<td>E 25/3/1917 D 22/5/1919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>Robert CUNNINGHAM 4/1700</td>
<td>24/8/1873</td>
<td>Leith, Edinburgh</td>
<td>Empire Hotel, Victoria St, Auckland</td>
<td>Robert Cunningham (F), Wellington,</td>
<td>tin smith</td>
<td></td>
<td>E 12/11/1915 D 19/3/1918</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>Daniel CURRAN 37642</td>
<td>2/2/1885</td>
<td>Omoa, Shotts Lanarkshire</td>
<td>Blackhall, West 65h Coats St Coast</td>
<td>Coal Miner, Blackball Coal Mine</td>
<td>1912/13</td>
<td></td>
<td>E 19/3/1917 Died June 1972, D 14/5/1919 London England</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>James Reid DICK 30666</td>
<td>11/3/1808</td>
<td>Ayrshire</td>
<td>Eltham, Taranaki</td>
<td>Mrs H Dick (S) New Cumnock Ayrshire</td>
<td>Farm Hand, George Turner Eltham Taranaki</td>
<td>E 21/0/1916 Died 1/2/1962 - D 14/2/1916 Hawera</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>Samuel DICKEY 56261</td>
<td>22/5/1895</td>
<td>Glasgow</td>
<td>St Elmer House, Nelson St Auckland</td>
<td>Mrs Agnes Dickey (M), 11 Nelson Street, Auckland</td>
<td>Seaman, Capt.Laing</td>
<td>1899</td>
<td>E 31/5/1917 Died 14/7/1967 D 22/5/1919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>John DRYSDALE 37462</td>
<td>27/2/1893</td>
<td>Linlithgowshire</td>
<td>49 Helena St Dunedin</td>
<td>John Drysdale (F) South Dunedin</td>
<td>Driver, Dunedin</td>
<td>1913 with parents</td>
<td>E 2/9/1916 Kia 5/5/1917 France</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>Date of Birth</td>
<td>NZ address at departure</td>
<td>Home area (Scotland)</td>
<td>Next of Kin NZ</td>
<td>Occupation NZ</td>
<td>Arrival in NZ</td>
<td>Occupation Scotland</td>
<td>Date of Enlistment/Discharge</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>Thomas FINNIE</td>
<td>6/9/1889</td>
<td>Lanarkshire</td>
<td>Samuel FINNIE (F) Candlerdyke Head Lanarkshire</td>
<td>coal miner - shag point coal company</td>
<td>1910</td>
<td>E 21/2/1917</td>
<td>D 24/5/1919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>William Maxwell FULTON</td>
<td>21/12/88</td>
<td>Stirling</td>
<td>Mrs FULTON (M) Camelon Stirlingshire</td>
<td>miner - Kaitangata Coal Co</td>
<td>1912</td>
<td>E 5/10/1916</td>
<td>D 24/5/1919 1968</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>Alexander HANTON</td>
<td>15/4/1887</td>
<td>Forfarshire</td>
<td>Alexander HANTON (F) Rossie Montrose Forfarshire</td>
<td>Miner, NZ Oil and Coal co, Kaitangata</td>
<td>1907</td>
<td>E 5/1/1917</td>
<td>D 26/11/1919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>Hugh Jackson</td>
<td>4/11/1874</td>
<td>Cambusnethan, Lanark</td>
<td>Mrs Andrew Bell (S), Duntroon, North Otago</td>
<td>Miner - Kaitangata Coal Co.</td>
<td>1902</td>
<td>E 5/10/1916</td>
<td>D 9/2/1919 Dunedin 20/6/1961</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sergeant</td>
<td>John JOHNSTONE</td>
<td>31/12/1884</td>
<td>Lanarkshire</td>
<td>W JOHNSTONE (F) Hamilton Lanarkshire</td>
<td>Miner - Westport Coal Company</td>
<td>1905</td>
<td>E 6/10/1915</td>
<td>D24/5/1919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporal</td>
<td>Michael KEANE</td>
<td>13/7/1888</td>
<td>Glasgow</td>
<td>Mrs A E Keane (W) Essex ENGLAND</td>
<td>Labourer, Colonial Sugar Refining Co, Auckland</td>
<td>1902</td>
<td>E 21/9/1915</td>
<td>D 24/8/1919 Liverpool Volunteers (3 years) Manchester Militia (8 years)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>Service Number</td>
<td>Date of Birth</td>
<td>Place of Birth</td>
<td>Home area (Scotland)</td>
<td>Next of Kin NZ</td>
<td>Occupation NZ</td>
<td>Date of Arrival in NZ</td>
<td>Occupation in Scotland</td>
<td>Date of Enlistment/Discharge</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Driver Alexander Davis MITCHELL</td>
<td>5/892</td>
<td>7/8/1893</td>
<td>not known</td>
<td>Oaria Ave, Auckland</td>
<td>Mrs A McDougall (W), Epsom Auckland</td>
<td>Driver, Mr. Borgue and sons, Devonport Auckland</td>
<td>E 11/12/1915</td>
<td>31/12/1967 Auckl and.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper Thomas Watton MORRIS</td>
<td>37680</td>
<td>1875</td>
<td>19 Ardmore Rd, Mrs Margaret Ponsonby, Auckland</td>
<td>Mr E NICOL, 31 Valley Rd Hikurangi</td>
<td>Miner - NN Ladey, Aria</td>
<td>E 5/3/1917</td>
<td>Died 1951 D 29/9/1919 1951/2775</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>Service Number</td>
<td>Date of Birth</td>
<td>Place of Birth</td>
<td>NZ address at departure</td>
<td>Home area (Scotland)</td>
<td>Next of Kin NZ</td>
<td>NZ address at departure</td>
<td>Home area (Scotland)</td>
<td>Occupation NZ</td>
<td>NZ address at departure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>William</td>
<td>PATERSON 37712</td>
<td>24/11/1879</td>
<td>Lanarkshire</td>
<td>Pukemiro via Ngaruawhia</td>
<td>James Paterson (B), Patetonga, nr Morrisville Waikato</td>
<td>Miner, Pukemiro Coal Co, Pukemiro</td>
<td>1909</td>
<td>Miner (as per shipping record)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>Samuel</td>
<td>RENNIE 55362</td>
<td>31/4/1886</td>
<td></td>
<td>c/o McIndoe, Purewa West Tamaki</td>
<td>James Rennie (F), Rangitoto Rd, Papatoetoetoe, New Zealand</td>
<td>Miner, Diocesan Trust Board, Auckland</td>
<td>1907</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>James</td>
<td>ROBISON 4/1542</td>
<td>25/12/1893</td>
<td>Dumfries (probably)</td>
<td>16 Onslow Street, Christchurch</td>
<td>Jane Robson (m), 64 Friars Vennel, Dumfries,</td>
<td>Miner, W J Courtney</td>
<td>1910</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>James</td>
<td>ROURKE 37611</td>
<td>20/12/1872</td>
<td>Baillieston, Glasgow</td>
<td>Bridge Hotel, Kaitangata</td>
<td>Miss Mary Rourke (niece), Baillieston, Glasgow</td>
<td>miner - NZ coal and oil co.</td>
<td>Kaitangata.</td>
<td>1911</td>
<td>Boiler Maker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper</td>
<td>William</td>
<td>SINCLAIR 4/1545</td>
<td>18/9/1886</td>
<td>Blackball</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mrs Jessie Sinclair (W), Blackball,</td>
<td>Miner - Blackball Coal Co</td>
<td>1910</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name Rank and Service Number</td>
<td>Date of Birth</td>
<td>Place of Birth</td>
<td>NZ address at departure</td>
<td>Home area (Scotland)</td>
<td>Next of Kin NZ</td>
<td>Occupation NZ</td>
<td>arrival in NZ</td>
<td>Occupatio n Scotland</td>
<td>Date of Enlistment/ Discharge</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lance Corporal John SMITH 37558</td>
<td>26/12/1885</td>
<td>Lanarkshire</td>
<td>c/o morrison, market st, Kaitangata.</td>
<td>William Smith (F), Baillieston, Glasgow.</td>
<td>Mr. J Smith (S) Prawl St, Kaitangata.</td>
<td>miner - NZ coal and oil co. Kaitangata.</td>
<td>1911</td>
<td>E 2/1/1917 D 29/5/1919</td>
<td>Kaitangata</td>
<td>17/6/1961 died</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper James SMITH 37655</td>
<td>22/9/1877</td>
<td>Arthurs Pass</td>
<td>Miss Phyllis Josephine Smith Manchester St, Christchurch.</td>
<td>Tunnel foreman Public Works Dept Arthurs Pass</td>
<td>1898</td>
<td>E 20/3/1917 D 24/5/1919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper William STRUTHERS 37547</td>
<td>9/7/1886</td>
<td>Newbattle, Midlothian</td>
<td>Miss Amelia DRUMMOND (C) Bridgend Perth</td>
<td>Miner, NZ Government Otira Railway Tunnel.</td>
<td>1910/11</td>
<td>E 2/10/1916 died 4/12/1962 D 24/5/1919 Wellington</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd Corporal Alexander VALENTINE 4/1318</td>
<td>16/8/1887</td>
<td>Montrose</td>
<td>W H VALENTINE (B) Montrose</td>
<td>CANADA Harness Saddler, Foley Brothers, Glacier BC Canada</td>
<td>1910</td>
<td>E 2/10/1915 died 4-6-1952 Canada Arrived Quebec Canada from Glasgow in 1907 on the Corinthian.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sapper James YOUNG 37585</td>
<td>12/12/1875</td>
<td>Moffat (Possibly)</td>
<td>Thomas YOUNG (F) Moffat</td>
<td>Tunnel Worker, Public Works Dept. Wairere. Tararua</td>
<td>1908</td>
<td>E 2.1.1917 D 5/8/1919 Napier</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2 – Discharged Soldiers Settlement Amendment 1916

An Act to amend the Discharged Soldiers Settlement Act, 1915.

[8th July, 1915.

BE IT ENACTED by the General Assembly of New Zealand in Parliament assembled, and by the authority of the same, as follows:

1. This Act may be cited as the Discharged Soldiers Settlement Amendment Act, 1916, and shall be read together with and deemed part of the Discharged Soldiers Settlement Act, 1915 (hereinafter referred to as the principal Act).

2. References in the principal Act to the discharge from service of a member of an Expeditionary Force shall, in the case of an officer of any such Force, be deemed to be references to the termination of his appointment.

3. (1) The Board may, with the approval of the Minister of Lands, dispose of any land under the principal Act to any person not being a discharged soldier within the meaning of that Act as if he were such a discharged soldier, if the Board is satisfied as to the following matters, namely:—

(a) That the applicant for the land is, and was immediately prior to the commencement of the present war, a bona fide resident of New Zealand; and

(b) That the applicant has served during the present war with some portion of His Majesty’s Naval or Military Forces (not being Forces raised in New Zealand), and that his appointment to such Forces has been terminated, or that he has received his discharge therefrom.
Bibliography

Primary Sources


Manchester, Reading Room. "Casualty Details."

McNab, A. "Angus Mcnab (1875-1914)." Archives New Zealand, 1875-1914.


G Collie – MA History Thesis  Scottish Born Soldiers in the New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1916/19

Pathé, British. "15,000 Miles to Serve." (1878).


———. "By Telegraph Montreal 7th Sept." Evening Post, 1913.


———. "Request to Commonwealth Governments for Additional Tunnelling Companies.", 1915.

G Collie – MA History Thesis  Scottish Born Soldiers in the New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1916/19


Secondary Sources


G Collie – MA History Thesis Scottich Born Soldiers in the New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1916/19


French, Craig F. "The 51st (Highland) Division During the First World War." University of Glasgow, 2006.


https://www.scran.ac.uk/scotland/pdf/SP2_10Economy.pdf.


Martin, Michael; Martin, Colin; Sparling, Chric. "The Fife Miners." http://www.fifepits.co.uk/.


McLeod, Peter. 16/11/2017 2017.

Michael, Martin. "East Fife Coalmines."


G Collie – MA History Thesis  Scottish Born Soldiers in the New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1916/19


Sutherland D. "War Diary of the Fifth Seaforth Highlanders, 51st (Highland) Division: Sutherland, D: Free Download & Streaming : Internet Archive." (1920).


G Collie – MA History Thesis  Scottish Born Soldiers in the New Zealand Tunnelling Company 1916/19

Wright, Matthew. *Coal; the Rise and Fall of King Coal in New Zealand*. Auckland: David Bateman Ltd, 2014.