

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Massey University Library. Thesis Copyright Form

Title of thesis: Linear Programming and Consumers' Ideal Sensory Attributes in Product Optimization

- (1) (a) I give permission for my thesis to be made available to readers in the Massey University Library under conditions determined by the Librarian.
- (b) I do not wish my thesis to be made available to readers without my written consent for _____ months.
- (2) (a) I agree that my thesis, or a copy, may be sent to another institution under conditions determined by the Librarian.
- (b) I do not wish my thesis, or a copy, to be sent to another institution without my written consent for _____ months.
- (3) (a) I agree that my thesis may be copied for Library use.
- (b) I do not wish my thesis to be copied for Library use for _____ months.

Signed Hathairat Uaphithak

Date 28/02/91

The copyright of this thesis belongs to the author. Readers must sign their name in the space below to show that they recognise this. They are asked to add their permanent address.

NAME AND ADDRESS

DATE

BA3/73 Soi Yingammoui

28/2/91

Bangkoknoi Bangkok 10700

THAILAND

LINEAR PROGRAMMING
AND CONSUMERS' IDEAL SENSORY ATTRIBUTES
IN PRODUCT OPTIMIZATION

A Thesis
presented in partial fulfilment of
the requirements for the degree of
Master of Technology in Product Development
at Massey University

HATHAIRAT UAPHITHAK

1990

ABSTRACT

Sensory attribute/ingredient relationships and consumers' ideal product profile were used to develop constraints for linear programming in hand cream optimization using rice bran oil to replace mineral oil. At the beginning of the process, consumer testing was conducted in order to elicit the important attributes of the product as perceived by the consumers. Simultaneously, the strengths and weaknesses of hand creams on the market were identified, and an ideal product profile developed for hand creams.

A fractional factorial design, 2^{6-2} , was used to identify the main effects of the ingredients on the product attributes. A quantitative sensory profile technique and a trained sensory panel were employed in the product sensory evaluation of the samples. The mean scores of each sensory attribute were regressed against the levels of the ingredients in the formulations. Only the main effects of the ingredients were identified according to the design of the experiment. Most sensory attributes, consistency, spreadability, oiliness, shine and stickiness, had significant linear relationships with the ingredients. Moistness, softness and absorbability did not.

The linear relationships were then used to develop sensory constraints for the linear programming model. Upper and lower limits of these constraints were set from the consumers' ideal product profile, by adding and subtracting 1 from the ideal attribute levels. Other constraints were on ingredient levels based on formulation needs. LP88 computer program was used to solve this hand cream problem, the objective being minimum cost.

A hand cream was made using the optimum formulation from the linear programming and tested with the trained sensory panel. Ideal ratio scores (i.e. ratio of the sample mean score to the ideal score) of this hand cream's

attributes were not more than 0.3 away from the ideal. The product was then tested with a consumer panel of 20 hand cream users. In consumer testing, the optimum product was tested along with the leading commercial products in order to compare consumer acceptability on these products and to test if the optimum product could compete with the products already in the market. The results showed the consumers preferred the optimum product to the commercial products and the optimum product was closer to the ideal.

From the linear programming model used in this study, the attribute levels of the hand cream can be modified by adjusting the constraints and studies can be made of the effect of changes in ingredients on product attributes.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank my supervisor, Associate Professor Mary D. Earle, for her valuable guidance, time and encouragement, provided throughout the project.

This research study was financially sponsored by the Royal Thai Government Scholarship; I express my sincere appreciation for this assistance.

The research has been successfully completed by either the direct or indirect cooperation of many people. In particular I would like to thank:

- * The Thai students who were trained as sensory panelists.
- * The consumers who cooperated in product testing.
- * The staff of the Sub-Department of Product Development, Massey University, especially Mrs Joan M. Brookes and Mrs Carol J. Pound.
- * The staff of the Department of Food Technology, Massey University, especially, Mr Hank J. Van Til for his technical assistance.
- * The staff of the Library, Massey University
- * Mrs K.B.L. McDonald for her moral support and kindness given to me.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents, Mr Virat Uaphithak and Mrs Kosum Uaphithak, my sister, Thaveerat, and my friend, Burin, for their continual moral support during the course of my study.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	x
LIST OF APPENDICES	xi

CHAPTERS

1	INTRODUCTION	1
	1.1 Optimization Procedure	1
	1.2 An Initial Development Stage	2
	1.2.1 Find Information about Existing Products	2
	1.2.2 Product Design Specification	2
	1.2.3 Identifying the Variables	3
	1.3 Screening Product Formulation Development	3
	1.4 Optimization	4
	1.5 Using Optimization Procedures in Formulation of a New Hand Cream Product	7
	1.6 Aim of the Project	9
	1.6.1 Objectives	9
	1.6.2 Constraints	9
	1.6.2.1 Product Constraints	10
	1.6.2.2 Processing Constraints	10
2	REVIEW OF USING LINEAR PROGRAMMING IN PRODUCT OPTIMIZATION	11
	2.1 Introduction	11
	2.2 The Structure of LP Problems in Formulation	12
	2.2.1 Objective Function	12
	2.2.2 Decision Variables	12
	2.2.3 Constraints	12
	2.3 The General Linear Programming Model	13
	2.4 Application of Linear Programming in Product Optimization	16
	2.4.1 Meat Products	16
	2.4.2 Ice Cream	17
	2.4.3 English Style Crumpets	17
	2.4.4 Processed Cheese Products	17
	2.4.5 Paint and Resin	18
	2.4.6 Detergent Formulation	18
	2.5 LP88 Computer Program	18
	2.6 Discussion	20

3	QUANTITATIVE SENSORY PROFILING	21
	3.1 Introduction to Sensory Profiling	21
	3.2 Scaling Method Used in Quantitative Sensory Profiling	22
	3.3 Training of Panelists for Quantitative Sensory Profile	24
	3.3.1 Selection of the Panelists	24
	3.3.2 Training	25
	3.3.3 Development of Descriptive Terms	26
	3.3.4 The Quantitative Sensory Profile Test	27
	3.4 Application of Quantitative Sensory Profiling	28
	3.5 Ideal Product Profiling	30
	3.6 Use of Quantitative Sensory Profiling in Skin Care Products	30
	3.7 Conclusion	33
4	THE FORMULATION AND TESTING OF HAND CREAM FORMULATIONS	34
	4.1 Introduction	34
	4.2 Raw Materials	35
	4.2.1 Moisturizing Agents	35
	4.2.2 Emulsifying Agents	38
	4.2.3 Preservatives and Antioxidants	39
	4.3 Properties of Hand Cream	40
	4.3.1 Appearance and Feel	40
	4.3.2 Rheology of Hand Creams	40
	4.3.3 Stability	41
	4.4 Processing	41
	4.5 Equipment	42
	4.6 Method of Testing	43
	4.6.1 Physical testing	43
	4.6.2 Sensory testing	44
	4.7 Hand Cream Formulation and Selecting of Formulation	45
	4.8 Planning for Hand Cream Experiments	50
	4.8.1 Selection of Raw Materials	50
	4.8.2 Method	51
	4.8.3 Emulsifying Equipment	51
5	CONSUMER TESTING	52
	5.1 Aim	52
	5.2 Studying Weaknesses and Strengths of Competitive Products	52
	5.3 Important Attributes	53
	5.3.1 Direct Rating of Importance	54
	5.3.2 Correlation with Overall Liking	55
	5.3.3 Rate Change of Liking with a Sensory Attribute	56
	5.4 Method of Testing	57

5.5	Analysis of Results	62
5.5.1	Direct Rating of Importance of Product Attributes	62
5.5.2	Correlation of Attribute Rating with Overall Liking	66
5.5.3	Relative Importance by Linear Equation between Attribute Level and Overall Liking	68
5.5.4	Product Profile	70
5.6	Discussion and Conclusion	70
6	PANEL TRAINING	74
6.1	Panel Selection	74
6.1.1	Method of Selection	75
6.1.2	Sample Preparation	78
6.1.3	Test Procedure	80
6.1.4	Analysis of Results	80
6.2	Testing of Selected Panelists	81
6.2.1	Scale	82
6.2.2	Terms for Product Attributes	82
6.2.3	Sample Preparation	82
6.2.4	Testing Procedure	84
6.2.5	Analysis of Results	86
6.3	Training of Panelists	88
6.3.1	Scale	88
6.3.2	Terms for Product Attributes	88
6.3.3	Sample Preparation	90
6.3.4	Training Method	90
6.4	Results and Discussion	92
6.5	Conclusion	93
7	EXPERIMENTAL DESIGN	94
7.1	Introduction	94
7.2	Literature Review	94
7.2.1	Quarter-Replicate of a 2 ⁶ Experiment	95
7.2.2	Regression Analysis	95
7.3	Experimental Planning for Formulation Development	97
7.4	Establishing the Basic Formulation	98
7.5	Factorial Experiment	99
7.5.1	Fractional Factorial Design	100
7.5.2	Hand Cream Preparation and Testing	101
7.6	Analysis of the Sensory Testing and Physical Testing Results from the Fractional Factorial Experiment	102
7.6.1	Relationships between Sensory Attributes and Hand Cream Ingredients	104
7.6.2	Relationships between Physical Attribute Values and Ingredient Levels	106

7.6.3	Correlation between Sensory Attribute Mean Scores and Physical Attribute Values	107
7.7	Discussion and Conclusion	108
8.	OPTIMIZATION OF THE FORMULATION	109
8.1	Optimization Planning	109
8.2	Developing the Linear Programming Model	110
8.2.1	Objective Function	110
8.2.2	Decision Variables	111
8.2.3	Constraints	112
8.2.4	Initial Investigation of the Model	116
8.3	Linear Programming and Optimum Formulation	116
8.4	Preparation of Optimum Hand Cream	117
8.5	Optimum Product Testing	117
8.6	Consumer Testing	119
8.7	Discussion and Conclusion	122
9.	DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION	124
9.1	Introduction	124
9.2	The Use of Consumer Testing at the First Stages of Product Optimization	124
9.3	Use of Quantitative Sensory Profile and Trained Panel for Sensory Evaluation	125
9.4	Use of Experimental Design in Hand Cream Development	125
9.5	Use of Consumers' Ideal Product Profile, Sensory Attributes and Ingredients Relationships, in Linear Programming Model	126
9.6	Recommendation for Future Work	127
9.7	Conclusion	127

LIST OF TABLES

Table		
4.1	Physical Properties and Appearance of Hand Cream Made from Selected Formulae	48
4.2	Fractional Factorial Design for 5 Variables in Hand Cream Formulation	49
5.1	Presentation of Hand Creams Samples to the Consumers in Consumer Testing	58
5.2	Definitions of the Attributes Used in Hand Cream Consumer Testing	61
5.3	Consumers' Ranking of Relative Importance of Hand Cream Attributes	63
5.4	Correlation between Overall Liking and Each Hand Cream Sensory Attribute	66
5.5	Correlation Values between Sensory Attributes of Hand Creams	67
5.6	Linear Equations Relating Sensory Rating to Overall Liking	68
5.7	Summary of Order of Importance of Hand Cream Sensory Attributes Derived from Three Importance measurements	70
6.1	Accumulative Number of Correct Answers Obtained from Each Panel in Panel Selection by Triangle Test	81
6.2	Viscosities of Samples Used in Panelist Testing	84
6.3	Serving Order for Hand Cream Panel Testing	85
6.4	Summary of Analysis of Variance	86
7.1	Initial Hand Cream Base Formulation	98
7.2	Independent Variables for Study in Fractional Factorial Design	99
7.3	Fractional Factorial Design for Six Variables	101

7.4	Mean Scores of Sensory and Physical Testing from the Fractional Factorial Experiment	103
7.5	Regression Equations Showing Relationships between Sensory Attribute and Input Variables	105
7.6	Relationships between Physical Attribute Values and Ingredient Levels	106
7.7	Correlation Coefficients between Sensory Attribute Mean Scores and Physical Attribute Values	107
8.1	Costs of the Ingredients Used in Hand Cream Formulation	111
8.2	Decision Variables in Hand Cream Formulation	112
8.3	Constraints for Linear Programming Model	115
8.4	Optimum Formulation Obtained from Linear Programming	116
8.5	Mean Scores and Ideal Ratio Scores of Optimum Product and Commercial Product Obtained from Trained Panel Sensory Testing	118
8.6	Consumer Panelists' Mean Scores and Ideal Ratio Scores of Optimum Product and Two Commercial Products	121
8.7	Comparison between Ideal Ratio Scores Obtained from Two Consumer Testing	122

LIST OF FIGURES**Figure**

5.1	Questionnaire for Hand Cream Consumer Testing	59
5.2	Grouping of Sensory Attributes in Terms of Relative Importance	65
5.3	Interval Scale Derived from Thurstone Case V Scale for Importance of Hand Cream Attributes	65
5.4	Sensory Product Profiles of Product Samples and Ideal Product of Consumer Test	69
6.1	Sequential Approach for Selection of Panelists by Triangle Test	77
6.2	Worksheet for Sequential Triangle Test Used in Panel Selection	79
6.3	Scoresheet for Sequential Triangle Test	80
6.4	Questionnaire for Panel Testing	83
6.5	Questionnaire for Panel Training	89
8.1	Constraints for Hand Cream Linear Programming Model	114
8.2	Questionnaire for Consumer Testing	120

LIST OF APPENDICES**Appendix**

5.1	Brand Names of the Samples Used in the Consumer Testing	138
5.2	Thurstone Case V Comparison Results	139
5.3	Sensory Attribute Scores and Ideal Ratio Scores of Ten Commercial Products Obtained from Consumer Testing	140
6.1	Sensory Attribute Scores Obtained from Panel Testing	142
6.2	Sensory Attribute Scores Obtained from Panel Training	143

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Product optimization is one of the important stages in product development. It is defined as a comprehensive and efficient approach which develops a product highly acceptable to the consumer, in a short time, while minimizing the cost.

The goal of optimization is to maximize consumer acceptance of a product, from a fixed number of ingredients, and the outcome of the process should support key decisions evolving from company policy and strategy. Hence, a product optimization method will consider all these constraints and objectives, and will help the product developer to select formulation alternatives. When new products are developed, another goal of the optimization procedure is to provide the product developer with information regarding the effects of input variables on the output variables of the finished products. Thus, it is necessary to develop empirical equations that relate output to input variables for optimization process.

1.1 OPTIMIZATION PROCEDURE

Several optimization methods have been developed by many researchers (Fishken, 1983; Sidel and Stone, 1983; Giovani, 1983; Schutz, 1983; and Moskowitz, 1983 and 1987). Although these methods differ, they include:

- * An initial development study in which prototypes are developed; critical input variables are identified during this stage.
- * A screening product formulation development step which

includes the determination of the levels (or range) of ingredients and processing variables for the subsequent optimization study. Some authors conduct sensory evaluation tests at this stage.

- * A formal optimization study, with or without constraints, that includes consumer testing, data analysis, reformulation, and implementation.

1.2 AN INITIAL DEVELOPMENT STAGE

1.2.1 Find Information about Existing Products

The product developer has to find information about the strengths and weaknesses of competitors, and about changing costs of goods, then makes a decision about what to launch and how to support the product. It is important to understand the situation of the market place before making decisions regarding products. Product developers should always evaluate their own products against the single leading market competitor.

In order to measure consumer reactions to competing products in the market, it is important to obtain a comparative profile of the different products in the marketplace on a series of different product attributes (Moskowitz and Rabino, 1983). By comparing products on this profile it becomes possible to determine quickly which products perform well on which specific attributes.

1.2.2 Product Design Specification

After obtaining enough information about the product to be developed, the product developer has to develop a product design specification to get the clear description about the product. This is to interpret consumer needs or

wants into technical terms. A great deal of further information is needed to change the product idea concept into a product design specification including; raw materials, processing, product quality and target market.

1.2.3 Identifying the Variables

The variables are divided into input variables and output variables. For example, in hand cream products input variables are ingredients and output variables are physical and sensory attributes. In studying the variables in a product development process, the product developer has to firstly identify all the variables, then decide which are the most important variables.

It is important to limit the number of variables to be studied but choosing too few variables can limit the usefulness of the experiment. The important variables can often be determined from past experiments, from study of the literature, and from consumer research.

1.3 SCREENING PRODUCT FORMULATION DEVELOPMENT

From the initial development stage, the product developer obtains the direction of the target product. Now the decision has to be made on what prototype(s) should be developed.

Experimenters design experiments in order to answer specific questions and to build a mathematical model. The choice of a specific experimental design will depend upon the project's objectives. An experimental design should be straightforward to plan and execute and simple to analyze.

Traditionally back-and-forth techniques for testing and reformulation of products have been used. Those procedures could require months and were substantially more expensive than an optimization method which reduces

the trial and error experiments (Moskowitz, 1983). Giovanni (1983) also stated that these approaches are insufficient for three reasons. Firstly, a large number of experiments is required, which can be expensive and time consuming. Secondly, the optimum product might not be determined by these approaches because the experimenter must use educated guesses to specify the levels of the various ingredients to test. Thirdly, this approach does not establish an equation which describes the relationship between the input decision variables and output responses to these variables.

Most researchers agree that a multi-product procedure is more efficient than the traditional method of back-and-forth testing. The multi-product approach, which is common to most optimization methods, tests many prototypes and develops a model relating decision variables and objective measures. The process requires one to two cycles, and takes about 3 months (Moskowitz, 1983).

Experimental designs have been successfully used in product optimization planning to select a subset of all possible samples which could be tested. While covering the range of factor levels specified in the experiment, the experimental design emphasizes those samples closest to the midpoints of these ranges, thereby decreasing the total number of samples which must be tested (Giovanni, 1983).

Factorial designs, mixture designs and central composite designs are used by many product developers to optimize product formulation.

1.4 OPTIMIZATION

Optimization of a product can be considered in terms of the analogy of 'hill climbing' (Charalambous, 1984). By envisioning the product models as a 'hill', one must find the top of the hill to optimize a product.

To obtain the relationship between input variables and output variables, the data from the previous stage have to be analyzed. Data interpretation is naturally an important step of the optimization process. The experimenter must choose the method of analysis before starting the research because the choice of an experimental design depends upon the type of analysis conducted on the data.

Moskowitz (1987) used multiple regression analysis to develop equations relate sensory characteristics and input variables, as well as an equation relating consumer acceptance to ingredient levels. From these equations the values for the optimum product were substituted and consumer reaction to the product could be estimated. In this method it is possible to minimize cost of the product and maximize overall acceptance at the same time by using the computational algorithm as follows:

- * Try a new formula level obtained from the equations.
- * Establish whether the new trial formula generates an increased level of acceptance. If it does not, go back to a new trial formula before proceeding. If the new formula does achieve a higher acceptance level, continue.
- * Check the costs of the new formula. (If the cost of goods exceeds the maximum, then go back and try a new formula).

This method is not straightforward and the product developer has to try several combinations until the optimal product is obtained.

Linear programming is another important method which has been successfully used in product optimization by several researchers (Kavanagh, 1978; Chan and Kavanagh, 1988; Beausire et al., 1988). Linear programming, a mathematical optimization technique, is used in both the

food and non-food industries for resource allocation and product formulation problem solving. Linear programming was used in paint and resin formulation (Kavanagh, 1978) and light duty liquid detergent formulation (Chan and Kavanagh, 1988) in order to obtain a good, low cost formulation, which matched or exceeded the properties of a commercially available product, in a small number of experiments. In this method, a formulation of various components which the formulator, based on experience and knowledge, believed would meet the required specifications was produced and tested. Successive uses of multiple regression analysis and linear programming were applied at each step to obtain a formulation which met the required specifications at the lowest cost. If the tests showed that the formulation did not meet the required specifications, then the formulator adjusted the quantities of the components, added or deleted components to try to obtain a formulation which did meet the specifications.

Whereas the optimal formulation can be obtained in a small number of experiments from this method, formulator experience and knowledge are needed in choosing the input variables for the linear regression. Hence, it is not appropriate if the formulator has no experience about the product.

The sensory properties of a product are very important factors in a formulation problem. In linear programming optimization, sensory properties have been constrained by a combination of ingredient limits (upper and lower bounds), and the development of constraints based on quantitative models of functional properties of the ingredients (Hsu, et al., 1979). The studies by many researchers failed to take into account the relationship between the sensory properties and the consumer acceptance of the product.

Beausire et al. (1988) used linear programming in fresh turkey bratwurst formulation. In their study, an experimental design and in-house sensory

panel determined quantitative relationships between the product's textural attributes and the ingredients. Then the product toughness/ingredients relationship was utilized to develop three formulations with different levels of toughness. These formulations were market tested using the acceptor set size as the measure of market acceptability. A relationship between product toughness and acceptor set size was determined, into which was substituted the toughness/ingredient relationship. This model was added to the least cost linear programming model in the form of an acceptability constraint.

Although this method included acceptability constraints into the linear programming, it may not be possible to obtain a product which contains the acceptable levels for the important attributes, since only one sensory attribute is studied. Also in obtaining the model showing the relationship between the sensory attribute and acceptability only three samples were used to get the linear equation; this equation may not have represented the actual relationship.

1.5 USING OPTIMIZATION PROCEDURES IN FORMULATION OF A NEW HAND CREAM PRODUCT.

Consumers have now become aware of safety in product use, and they tend to prefer natural products which are produced from natural raw materials and which do not cause any side-effects.

Mineral oil is used as emolient in most hand creams. Its occlusive action aids in rehydration of the corneum when allowed to remain on the skin for an appreciable length of time. Because the solvent action of mineral oil tends to remove skin surface lipids when the cream is applied for a short period of time, partial replacement with a vegetable oil is needed (Grayson and Eckroth, 1979). It has also been found that mineral oils are a

carcinogenic risk to humans (Haas et al., 1987). Hence, vegetable oils have the potential to be used instead of mineral oil in skin care products.

Rice bran oil is obtained from rice bran by conventional expression and solvent extraction techniques using a variety of solvents such as hexane, and ether. The composition of rice bran oil suggests its use as a salad and cooking oil, and for making hydrogenated shortening (Bailey, 1964) . It has also been used as a leather tanning oil (replacing sperm oil), as a textile lubricant by textile mills to keep yarn from fibrillating, and as a rust inhibitor.

Rice bran oil has been used in cosmetic products especially skin care products: soap, bath oils and hand creams. It has been used in a sun screen product (Loo, 1976). It is non-toxic and non-irritating to the skin of all subjects tested, does not discolour, develop odour or otherwise deteriorate upon exposure to sunlight, so it is suitable to use in skin care products. Since rice bran oil contains natural antioxidants (tocopherols), it is not necessary to add any antioxidant in the product.

As rice is one of the major cereal crops in the world, there are several rice bran oil extracting factories; and now there are rice companies in many countries, such as U.S.A., India and Thailand, considering oil extraction so there will be plenty of rice bran oil available to be used. Production of formulated products using rice bran oil in cosmetics is also one way of value adding to this raw material.

In this study, an optimization procedure was used to develop a natural hand cream product. The product concept required the development of a hand cream using rice bran oil as a substitute for mineral oil.

Consumer testing was used to gain consumers' perception of the products already on the market. Important attributes were identified to guide the

formulator in developing a product which contained acceptable levels of these attributes. After the experimental study, multiple regression was used to generate linear relationships between input variables and sensory attributes, then consumer acceptance was maximized by inputting the sensory constraints in the linear programming model. The upper and lower bounds of the constraints were obtained from the consumers' ideal attributes.

1.6 AIM OF THE PROJECT

The aim of this project was to use consumers' ideal attributes and multiple regression to develop sensory constraints for a linear programming model in product formulation.

1.6.1 Objectives

- * To set up a consumers' ideal product profile for hand cream products.
- * To obtain empirical equations showed relationships between input variables (raw materials) and sensory attributes.
- * To use the empirical equations in linear programming to formulate a hand cream product.
- * To evaluate a prototype hand cream from linear programming with a trained panel and consumer panel.
- * To obtain an optimal product which is accepted by the consumers.

1.6.2 Constraints

1.6.2.1 Product constraints

- * The product should be formulated by using vegetable oil (rice bran oil) instead of mineral oil.

- * The product should have sensory attributes which is accepted by the consumer and can compete with the products in the marketplace.

1.6.2.2 Processing constraints

- * Only known technology is to be used and new processing techniques are not to be investigated.

- * Commercially available raw materials are to be used as much as possible.