

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Facilitating Development: An examination of partnerships and intentional development  
by cruise tourism in Vanuatu

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of  
Master's of International Development

Massey University,

Loren B H Rutherford

2018



## Abstract

Since the 2002 Johannesburg World Summit on Sustainable Development (WSSD), the private sector has been elevated as an equal partner for development, alongside the public and the non-governmental organisation (NGO) sectors. Consequently, corporate social responsibility (CSR) and public-private partnerships (PPP), both being examples of intentional development, have become increasingly important for international development.

Globally, cruise tourism is the fastest growing sector of tourism with a compounding increase of 8% year on year. In this Vanuatu based study, the development initiatives of Carnival Australia, a mass tourism cruise multinational, are examined to establish what extent cruise tourism can enhance development outcomes.

A qualitative approach consisting of non-participant observation, semi-structured interviews and a detailed literature review has resulted in the support of previous studies indicating that the private sector can be unreliable when considered a development actor. Carnival is, however, an enthusiastic and committed *facilitator of development* and should be viewed as such. A realignment of expectations is vitally important for the private sector's ability to meet expectations as a facilitating partner towards achieving sustainable development. This is reflective of Sustainable Development Goal #17 on Partnerships.

*Keywords:* Carnival, Cruise, Tourism, Corporate Social Responsibility, CSR, Public-Private Partnership, PPP, P3, DFAT, Community Development, Facilitation for Development, Development First, Vanuatu, Pacific, SDG

## **Acknowledgements**

This study would not have been possible without funding from New Zealand's Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT), Massey University's Graduate Research Fund and a generous postgraduate scholarship from Graduate Women Manawatū.

Massey's Institute of Development Studies (IDS) is an incredibly passionate and productive team. IDS host many high-achieving international students through MFAT's international scholarship program, and I was very lucky to study alongside a diverse group of very talented postgraduates. In addition to the other students, I thank the entire academic staff at IDS for being inspiring and friendly. Of course, a special thanks to my amazing supervisors, Dr Sharon McLennan and Professor Regina Scheyvens.

Special thanks to Kay Clarke whose valuable assistance has been of huge importance to this research. Huge appreciation is also expressed to Michael Mihajlov, Destination Director of Carnival Australia, who generously shared his time and enormous industry knowledge. Thank you.

## Table of Contents

<b>Abstract</b> .....	<b>iii</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	<b>iv</b>
<b>Table of Contents</b> .....	<b>v</b>
<b>List of Tables</b> .....	<b>ix</b>
<b>List of Figures</b> .....	<b>x</b>
<b>Chapter 1: Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1 Rationale.....	1
1.2 Research Question and Objectives .....	4
1.3 Carnival Australia and Vanuatu .....	5
1.4 Chapter Outline .....	5
<b>Chapter 2: Development, Corporate Social Responsibility and Public Private Partnerships</b> .....	<b>8</b>
2.1 Immanent vs. Intentional Development.....	8
2.2 The Private Sector and Development .....	10
2.3 Public Private Partnerships for Development .....	14
2.4 Corporate Social Responsibility.....	15
2.4.1 CSR Policy and Reporting.....	17
2.4.2 CSR Debates - Possibilities and Constraints.....	18
2.4.3 CSR and Tourism.....	19
2.5 Stakeholders and the Social Licence to Operate .....	21
2.6 Power Relations in Partnerships.....	22
2.7 The Development First Approach .....	23
2.8 Summary.....	25
<b>Chapter 3: Tourism and Sustainable Development</b> .....	<b>27</b>
3.1 2030 UN Sustainable Development Goals.....	27
3.2 Sustainable Development Aid is Political.....	29
3.2.1 Australia and New Zealand's Aid Objectives.....	32
3.3 Sustainable Economic Development and Tourism.....	33
3.4 Tourism's Potential to Contribute to Sustainable Development.....	35

Facilitating Development	vi
3.5 Tourism's Potential for Negative Impact.....	37
3.6 Cruise Tourism and Sustainable Development.....	40
3.7 Summary .....	41
<b>Chapter 4: Cruise Tourism.....</b>	<b>42</b>
4.1 Cruise as Mass Tourism .....	42
4.2 Growth of Cruise Tourism.....	44
4.3 Cruise Tourism Industry.....	47
4.4 Cruise Tourism Risks.....	48
4.4.1 Captured Spend.....	49
4.4.2 Creation of Fantasyscapes .....	51
4.4.3 Home Ports.....	53
4.4.4 Supply Chains, Food and Resupply .....	53
4.4.5 Globalisation.....	54
4.4.6 Employment .....	55
4.4.7 Flags of Convenience.....	57
4.4.8 Arbitrage.....	58
4.5 Summary .....	59
<b>Chapter 5: Context: Vanuatu, Tourism and Development.....</b>	<b>61</b>
5.1 Vanuatu Geography and Demographics.....	61
5.2 History and Governance .....	64
5.3 Vanuatu as a Small Island Developing State (SIDS).....	67
5.4 Economic Reliance on Aid.....	70
5.5 Importance of Tourism for Vanuatu.....	72
5.6 Cruise Tourism: Vital to Vanuatu.....	76
5.7 Development Sought by Vanuatu .....	78
<b>Chapter 6: Methodology.....</b>	<b>80</b>
6.1 Research Design / Approach .....	80
6.2 Site Selection .....	81
6.3 Participant Selection for Interviews .....	84

Facilitating Development	vii
6.4 Data Collection Procedures.....	86
6.4.1 Observation.....	87
6.4.2 Interviews .....	89
6.4.3 Secondary Data Sources .....	91
6.4.4 Data Analysis.....	92
6.5 Ethics, Reciprocity and Positionality.....	93
6.5.1 Ethics.....	93
6.5.2 Reciprocity.....	94
6.5.3 Positionality .....	95
6.7 Limitations and Issues .....	97
6.7.1 Family in the Field .....	98
6.8 Summary.....	98
<b>Chapter 7: Findings - Carnival, CSR and PPP .....</b>	<b>100</b>
7.1 Carnival's Global Corporate Structure.....	100
7.2 Carnival Australia .....	102
7.3 PPP: DFAT MOU .....	103
7.4 CSR: P&O Pacific Partnership.....	104
7.5 Carnival CSR - Local and Global.....	105
7.5.1 P&O Pacific Partnership.....	110
7.5.2 Weak Local Relationships: Kalo Kindergarten.....	111
7.5.3 Summary of Carnival CSR .....	115
7.6 PPP between Carnival and DFAT.....	115
7.6.1 Examination of the MOU between Carnival and DFAT .....	118
6.6.2 Summary of Carnival PPP.....	122
<b>Chapter 8: Findings - Challenges to Intentional and Immanent Development in Vanuatu .....</b>	<b>124</b>
8.1 Perceptions of Inefficiency and Corruption in Vanuatu's Public Sector .....	124
8.2 An Example of Intentional Development .....	128
8.2.1 Handicrafts, Markets and Biosecurity .....	128



8.3 Challenges to Immanent Development .....	133
8.3.1 Challenges to Multiplying Shore-Based Business Opportunities .....	133
8.3.2 Land Issues and Lack of Opportunities for Local Operators .....	136
8.3.3 The Social Impact of Cruise Tourism .....	139
9.3.4 Power Asymmetry .....	142
8.4 Summary .....	143
<b>Chapter 9: Discussion and Conclusion.....</b>	<b>144</b>
9.1 Immanent and Intentional Development and the Private Sector.....	144
9.2 Cruise Tourism PPP and CSR in Vanuatu.....	145
9.3 Vanuatu and Cruise Tourism.....	147
9.4 Development First Framework and the Private Sector.....	149
9.5 Carnival an Intentional Facilitator of Development.....	152
9.6 Social Impact and the need for Social Indicators.....	153
9.7 Conclusion.....	155
9.8 Key Ideas for Improvements to Ensure Development Benefits from Cruise Tourism....	158
<b>References .....</b>	<b>160</b>
<b>Acronyms .....</b>	<b>a</b>
<b>Appendix:.....</b>	<b>b</b>
1. MOU between Carnival and DFAT .....	b
2. Participant Information Sheet.....	c
3. Participant Consent Form.....	e
4. Vanuatu Research Visa .....	f

## List of Tables

Table 1- Development First framework for assessing corporate social responsibility initiatives in tourism (Source: Hughes & Scheyvens, 2016, p. 478).....	24
Table 2 - Comparing cruise with the characteristics of mass tourism (Adapted from Harrison & Sharpley, 2017, pp. 6-7) .....	43
Table 3 - Comparison of net development aid to Vanuatu 2006-2014 (Source: Lowy Institute for International Policy, 2015).....	70
Table 4 - US\$ Net official development assistance and official aid received by Vanuatu (Source: World Bank, 2017).....	71
Table 5 - Schedule of Cruise ship observation days June and July 2017. ....	88
Table 6 - Record of Semi-Structured Interviews and Informants .....	90
Table 7 - Analysing Carnival's facilitation for development using the Development First framework (Adapted from Hughes & Scheyvens, 2016) .....	149

## List of Figures

<i>Figure 1</i> - 'Why Tourism Matters', a UN image illustrating key statistics related to global tourism (Source: United Nations World Tourism Organization, 2017c).....	2
<i>Figure 2</i> - Logo of the 2017 International Year for Sustainable Tourism Development (Source: United Nations World Tourism Organization, 2016b).....	4
<i>Figure 3</i> - Carnival Corporation infographic 'Cruising • Commitment • Community' stating the CSR approach to "sustainable and transparent operations" (Source: Carnival Corporation, 2017b).....	20
<i>Figure 4</i> - Infographic grid representation of the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (Source: United Nations, 2018).....	28
<i>Figure 5</i> - Graph illustrating cruise tourism's dramatic growth between 1990 to 2020 (Source: Cruise Market Watch, n.d.).....	45
<i>Figure 6</i> - Infographic of tourism spend by five source markets; China, USA, Germany, UK and France (Source: United Nations World Tourism Organization, 2017a).....	46
<i>Figure 7</i> - Map of Vanuatu showing research locations. Luganville and Champagne Beach, Espirtu Santo. And Port Vila, Efate (Source: Nations Online Project, 2017).....	63
<i>Figure 8</i> - Infographic showing the key benefits of tourism to Small Island Developing States (Source: United Nations World Tourism Organization, n.d.-b) .....	68
<i>Figure 9</i> - Graph of Vanuatu's tourism arrivals by air and cruise, 2003-2017, created by author using information from Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO, 2015).....	74
<i>Figure 10</i> - Map of Espiritu Santo showing Luganville, Champagne Beach, key tourist attractions and main tourist accommodations (Source: Wrecks to Rainforest, 2012)....	82
<i>Figure 11</i> - Brand logos of the ten cruise tourism brands forming the global Carnival Plc & Corporation (Source: Carnival Corporation, 2017a). .....	101
<i>Figure 12</i> - Peter Baxter, Director General of AusAID; Ann Sherry, CEO of Carnival Australia; and Prime Minister of Vanuatu, the Hon Moana Carcasses Kalosil following, their MoU signing ceremony in Sydney, Australia, July 2013 (Source: Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, 2013b).....	103
<i>Figure 13</i> - Photo of the P&O Pacific Partnership Truck donated to Save the Children in Luganville, Vanuatu, June, 2017 .....	110
<i>Figure 14</i> - Kalo Kindergarten has open sides as per government approved design. Kalo Village, Santo, Vanuatu, June 2017. ....	113

<i>Figure 15</i> - Kalo Kindergarten building, built to government specification by the P&O Pacific Partnership. Kalo Village, Santo, Vanuatu, June 2017.....	114
<i>Figure 16</i> - Photo of the improved jetty at Champagne Beach, Vanuatu, June 2017...	116
<i>Figure 17</i> - The ablution block built by the ECF development project. The 'Carnival Toilets' at Champagne Beach, Vanuatu, June 2017. ....	117
<i>Figure 18</i> - A view of Million Dollar Point; access is difficult to this popular snorkelling and diving destination, Santo, Vanuatu, June 2017. ....	126
<i>Figure 19</i> - Photo of a wholesale 'Chinese Shop' on Luganville's main road. This image shows plastic hair accessories, fridge magnets and plastic beads. Luganville, Vanuatu, June 2017. ....	130
<i>Figure 20</i> - Examples of handcrafted Ni-Vanuatu bags and souvenirs. Port Vila, Vanuatu, July 2017. ....	131
<i>Figure 21</i> - Attempting to bridge the communication gap: Sanma's tourism's tent in foreground, with a P&O ship in background. Port Luganville, Vanuatu, June 2017. ...	135
<i>Figure 22</i> - The road to Champagne Bay with Dolphin Island in the background and the cruise ship moored offshore. Champagne Beach, Vanuatu, June 2017. ....	137
<i>Figure 23</i> - P&O Ship docked at the Luganville Wharf, with a 'bamboo band' performing in the foreground, Port Luganville, Vanuatu, June 2017. ....	144