Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
A trial of the Effective Lifelong Learning Inventory (ELLI):
A case study

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Education (EdD)

At Massey University, Manawatū

Maureen Margaret Hyett
2018
Abstract

The purpose of education is to prepare learners for the world they are going to live in. Education should actively support learners to develop the capabilities they need to engage productively with the difficult and challenging problems that are part of today’s world. The Effective Lifelong Learning Inventory (ELLI) is a programme designed to assist in the development and measurement of the learning dispositions of: strategic awareness, changing and learning, meaning making, creativity, critical curiosity, learning relationships and resilience. This thesis has taken a case study approach to explore the process of the trial of ELLI within one urban secondary school. The introduction of the tool actively supported the developing learning culture of the students and the learning culture of the staff. Drawing on the perspectives of both staff and students and unpacking the difficulties associated with the implementation, this thesis analyses the process involved in trialling the tool.

To document the trial process, data were collected from observations of all meetings and presentations, and interviews with both the teachers and students involved in the trial. The reasons the school undertook the trial were explored, through interviews with the principal and teachers, by examining the culture of learning and the professional learning history in the school. The GPILSEO model for sustainability of school change was used to examine the key factors of goals, pedagogy, institutions, leadership, spread, evidence and ownership of the trial process. The impact of the trial process on students was explored by examining their academic results, their ELLI profiles and listening to the students.
Acknowledgements

Mā te huruhuru ka rere te manu.

Without the support of many this journey would not have been possible. I would like to acknowledge the following people. Thank you for your invaluable help with this journey.

My family: My parents Natalie and Leslie instilled in me a love of learning and the value of education. My sisters Jeanette and Shirley-Anne encouraged, supported and inspired me to finish. My daughters Emma and Fern always believed I would get there. My granddaughters Lilla and Dylan provided the necessary distraction at times.

I thank the board of trustees and the principal of the school involved for allowing me to undertake this research. My grateful acknowledgment and appreciation to Debbie Shakesheave-Thomas, Deb King, Grant Jones, and Eileen Dorricot for their willingness to participate and their insightful contributions. My friends and colleagues who asked questions and engaged in challenging conversations. The students who willingly shared their time to contribute to this research, and their journey. And, to all young people who work hard every day trying to make sense of the world and their place in it, thank you.

My supervisors, who have guided and challenged me, throughout this process. Professor Margaret Walshaw has stuck with me through many challenges with unfailing confidence and support, Doctor Rowena Taylor who began the journey with me, and Doctor Tim Burgess who always found the right question to ask.

Kirsty Farrant, thank you for sharing much of this journey with me, I have appreciated your wisdom and pertinent questioning. Thank you to Peter Morrow for your eagle-eyed proof reading and to Francie Morrow for her formatting skills.
Contents

Abstract ............................................................................................................................. iii
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................... v
Contents ............................................................................................................................ vii
List of Tables .................................................................................................................... xiii
List of Figures ................................................................................................................... xiv
Glossary ............................................................................................................................ xv

Chapter 1  Introduction ................................................................................................. 1
  1.1  Introduction ............................................................................................................. 1
  1.2  Background ............................................................................................................ 1
    1.2.1  Learning as differentiated versus learning content ...................................... 4
  1.3  Research Questions ............................................................................................... 7
    1.3.1  The Research Questions: ............................................................................. 7
  1.4  Context for the Research ..................................................................................... 7
    1.4.1  Competencies ............................................................................................... 7
  1.5  Significance of the research ............................................................................... 9
  1.6  Definition of terms .............................................................................................. 10
    1.6.1  Competencies ............................................................................................. 10
    1.6.2  Learning dispositions ............................................................................... 11
    1.6.3  Learning power ........................................................................................ 11
    1.6.4  Engagement ............................................................................................... 12
    1.6.5  Assessment for learning .......................................................................... 12
  1.7  Organisation of chapters ..................................................................................... 13

Chapter 2  Literature Review ......................................................................................... 16
  2.1  Introduction .......................................................................................................... 16
  2.2  Programmes to enhance learning ....................................................................... 16
    2.2.1  The Learning Futures Programme ............................................................... 19
    2.2.2  Te Kotahitanga ......................................................................................... 20
    2.2.3  Ka Hikitia .................................................................................................. 23
  2.3  Enhancing student learning ............................................................................... 25
2.3.1 Positive Behaviour for Learning: School-Wide (PB4L: School-Wide) ................................................................. 25
2.3.2 Engagement .................................................................................. 27
2.3.3 Listening to students ...................................................................... 29
2.3.4 The Key Competencies .................................................................. 32
2.3.5 The Effective Lifelong Learning Inventory (ELLI) ....................... 35
2.3.6 Links between the key competencies, ELLI dimensions and Te Kotahitanga principles .............................................................. 40
2.4 A model for sustainability of school change ................................... 45
  2.4.1 GPILSEO ......................................................................................... 46
  2.4.2 Establishing goals and expectations ............................................. 47
  2.4.3 Pedagogy ......................................................................................... 48
  2.4.4 New institutions and structures ..................................................... 51
  2.4.5 Leadership ....................................................................................... 53
  2.4.6 Spread ............................................................................................ 55
  2.4.7 Evidence Based ............................................................................. 57
  2.4.8 Ownership ...................................................................................... 58
2.5 Summary .......................................................................................... 59

Chapter 3 Research Methodology .......................................................... 61
  3.1 Introduction ...................................................................................... 61
  3.2 Research theories and approaches .................................................. 61
    3.2.1 Sociocultural theory ..................................................................... 62
    3.2.2 Qualitative Research .................................................................... 63
    3.2.3 Numeric data ................................................................................ 64
    3.2.4 Case study ................................................................................... 64
  3.3 Description of research site ............................................................... 66
    3.3.1 Research site: School .................................................................... 66
    3.3.2 The school assessment system ..................................................... 67
  3.4 Participants ....................................................................................... 68
    3.4.1 The leader .................................................................................... 68
    3.4.2 The form teachers ......................................................................... 68
    3.4.3 The form classes ........................................................................... 68
3.5 Methods of data collection ................................................................. 69
  3.5.1 Observations .................................................................................. 70
  3.5.2 Interviews ....................................................................................... 72
  3.5.3 Numeric data .................................................................................. 73
  3.5.4 Field notes ..................................................................................... 74
3.6 Data Analysis .................................................................................... 74
3.7 Ethical issues ..................................................................................... 78
  3.7.1 Research in my own school .......................................................... 78
  3.7.2 Working with students under 16 ................................................... 79
  3.7.3 Interviews ...................................................................................... 80
  3.7.4 Observations ................................................................................ 80
  3.7.5 School Data .................................................................................. 80
  3.7.6 Confidentiality and anonymity ..................................................... 81
3.8 Trustworthiness ................................................................................. 81
  3.8.1 Generalisation .............................................................................. 82
3.9 Summary ............................................................................................ 82

Chapter 4 The Findings ........................................................................ 84
4.1 Introduction ....................................................................................... 84
4.2 The lead up: 2010 ............................................................................. 85
  4.2.1 Culture of Learning in the school ................................................ 86
  4.2.2 Building Learning Power ............................................................... 86
  4.2.3 Teacher Learning Culture ............................................................. 87
  4.2.4 Neighbouring Intermediate School practice ................................ 87
  4.2.5 Assessment for Learning ............................................................... 88
  4.2.6 Professional learning history in the school .................................. 90
  4.2.7 ELLI training ............................................................................... 93
  4.2.8 Summary of events for The Lead Up: 2010 .................................. 93
4.3 Phase I: A good start: 2011 ............................................................ 93
  4.3.1 Introductory session: 5 September 2011 .................................... 94
  4.3.2 Initial planning meeting: 23 September 2011 ............................. 98
  4.3.3 Parents evening: 27 October 2011 ............................................... 99
  4.3.4 Initial interview with Form Teacher One: 7 October 2011 ........ 100
4.3.5 ELLI Questionnaires: October, November 2011 ..................103
4.3.6 Posters on form class walls .............................................104
4.3.7 Student comments: 6, 7 December 2011 .............................105
4.3.8 Summary of events in Phase I: A Good Start: 2011 .............109
4.4 Phase II: Waiting for the platform... 2012 ...............................110
  4.4.1 Initial Planning Meeting: 10 February 2012 .......................111
  4.4.2 “Top Tips”: February - March 2012 .................................114
  4.4.3 Goal setting ......................................................................115
  4.4.4 Progress Conference Day: 27 March 2012 ..........................118
  4.4.5 Posters: 2012 ..................................................................120
  4.4.6 MyPortfolio: 2012 .............................................................121
  4.4.7 Planning Meeting: 16 August 2012 ....................................122
  4.4.8 Teacher Reflection: 2012 ....................................................124
  4.4.9 Student comments: 2012 ...................................................129
  4.4.10 Summary of events in Phase II: Waiting for the Platform: 2012
        .....................................................................................135
4.5 Phase III: A new start? 2013 .................................................136
  4.5.1 Form teacher meeting to plan way forward: 5 April 2013 .........136
  4.5.2 Profiles taken: 17-19 April 2013 .......................................141
  4.5.3 Planning meeting: 29 May 2013 .........................................142
  4.5.4 Action ..............................................................................145
  4.5.5 Planning meeting: 10 September 2013 ...............................146
  4.5.6 Form Teacher One reflection: 23 September 2013 ..............151
  4.5.7 Interview/Meeting with the AFLM 18 October 2013: ............160
  4.5.8 Student Profiles .................................................................163
  4.5.9 Principal’s reflection: 8 October 2014 .................................167
  4.5.10 Summary of events for Phase III: A new start? ...................171
  4.5.11 Student Comments: 2013 ...............................................172
  4.5.12 Student Comments: 2014 ...............................................177
  4.5.13 NCEA Results .................................................................180
  4.5.14 Learning Dispositions .......................................................180
4.6 Summary of key findings .......................................................183
Chapter 5  Discussion ................................................................. 186
  5.1  Introduction ........................................................................ 186
  5.2  Research Question One: Why did the school trial the use of ELLI? ... 186
    5.2.1  Building Learning Power 2009 ......................................... 189
    5.2.2  The key competencies 2010 .............................................. 190
    5.2.3  Assessment for learning 2011 .......................................... 190
    5.2.4  Summary .................................................................... 191
  5.3  Research Question Two: How did the school trial the use of Effective Lifelong Learning Inventory? ................................................. 192
    5.3.1  Goals ........................................................................ 193
    5.3.2  Pedagogy ..................................................................... 196
    5.3.3  Institutions ................................................................... 199
    5.3.4  Leadership ................................................................... 203
    5.3.5  Spread ........................................................................ 205
    5.3.6  Evidence ...................................................................... 207
    5.3.7  Ownership ................................................................... 209
  5.4  Research Question Three: What was the impact of the ELLI trial process on students? ............................................................... 211
    5.4.1  NCEA results ............................................................... 211
    5.4.2  Changes to learning dispositions ..................................... 211
    5.4.3  Student Comments ....................................................... 213
  5.5  Positive outcomes and barriers to the effectiveness of the trial ........... 215
    5.5.1  Positive outcomes of the trial ......................................... 215
  5.6  Meta-level summary .............................................................. 217
    5.6.1  Technology ................................................................. 217
    5.6.2  Student centred learning versus/and academic achievement ..... 218
    5.6.3  Goals ........................................................................ 221
    5.6.4  Mentoring ................................................................... 224
    5.6.5  Leadership ................................................................... 225
Chapter 6  Conclusion ..................................................................... 227
  6.1  Broad summary of the research ............................................ 227
  6.2  Implications ...................................................................... 229
6.2.1 School wide initiatives not dependent on technology ..........230
6.2.2 Group size ...........................................................................230
6.2.3 Time to develop concepts ......................................................231
6.2.4 Leadership ...........................................................................232
6.2.5 When to reframe an initiative after a serious setback ............232
6.2.6 Trial versus committed programme .......................................233
6.3 Limitations of the study.............................................................233
6.4 Significance of the study ...........................................................233
6.5 Further research .....................................................................234
6.6 Final words .............................................................................235
References......................................................................................237
Appendices ....................................................................................249
   Appendix A: Junior data..............................................................249
   Appendix B: Student Information Sheet.......................................251
   Appendix E: Student consent form .............................................253
   Appendix C: Information sheet for parents ................................254
   Appendix D: Information sheet for teachers ...............................256
   Appendix F: Parent consent form ..............................................258
   Appendix G: Teacher consent form ..........................................259
   Appendix H: Ethics approval .....................................................260
   Appendix I: The Key Competencies ..........................................260
List of Tables

Table 1: Levels of student involvement from Raymond, (2001, p. 58) ........... 32
Table 2: The seven dimensions of learning power and their contrast poles
(Small, 2010, p. 9) ................................................................................................. 36
Table 3: ELLI dispositions and key competencies alignment (adapted from
Hipkins personal communication November 2010) ............................... 42
Table 4: Te Kotahitanga and ELLI links .......................................................... 44
Table 5: Summary of research design and analysis ........................................ 77
Table 6: Timeline for the Lead Up: 2010 ......................................................... 93
Table 7: Timeline for Phase I: A Good Start: 2011 ....................................... 109
Table 8: Timeline for Phase II: Waiting for the Platform: 2012 ....................... 135
Table 9: Timeline for Phase III: A new start? 2013 .................................... 171
Table 10: Average number of NCEA credits Year 11 2013 ............................ 180
Table 11: Endorsements at Year 11 as a percentage of the group ............... 180
Table 12: Summary of key findings ............................................................... 185
Table 13: PAT mathematics results 2011 Year 9 ............................................ 249
Table 14: AsTTle reading and PAT Listening 2011 Year 9 .............................. 249
Table 15: PAT mathematics results 2012 Year 10 ........................................... 250
Table 16: AsTTle reading and PAT Listening 2012 Year 10 ............................ 250
List of Figures

Figure 1: The strands of Te Whāriki (New Zealand Ministry of Education, 1996). ................................................................. 32
Figure 2: How the key competencies relate to other aspects of the curriculum (Ministry of Education, 2013b). .................................................. 34
Figure 3: What do you think are qualities and characteristics of a successful learner? ........................................................................ 96
Figure 4: How can we develop assessment strategies which strengthen those qualities? ................................................................. 96
Figure 5: How do we help learners to engage their life stories, life worlds and communities in their learning? ........................................... 97
Figure 6: Sofia November 2011 .................................................................................................................................104
Figure 7: Changing and Learning .........................................................................................................................112
Figure 8: Meaning Making ........................................................................................................................................112
Figure 9: Critical Curiosity ........................................................................................................................................113
Figure 10: Creativity ..................................................................................................................................................113
Figure 11: Strategic Awareness ............................................................................................................................113
Figure 12: Resilience ................................................................................................................................................113
Figure 13: Learning Relationships .......................................................................................................................113
Figure 14: Agnes’ profile of April 2013 printed in April 2013 ..........................................................141
Figure 15: Agnes’ profile of April 2013 printed in 2014 .........................................................................................142
Figure 16: Sofia 17 April 2013 .......................................................................................................................................164
Figure 17: Sofia 17 April 2013 printed 2014 ................................................................................................................164
Figure 18: Sofia 29 October 2013 ...........................................................................................................................165
Figure 19: Sofia combined April and October 2013 .................................................................................................166
Figure 20: Form Class One’s average score (%) for the learning dispositions 182
Figure 21: Form Class Two’s average score (%) for the learning dispositions 182
## Glossary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>asTTle</td>
<td>The Assessment Tool for Teaching and Learning assesses students’ performance against the New Zealand Curriculum levels in reading, writing and mathematics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Trustees</td>
<td>An elected board responsible for the governance of a school in New Zealand consisting of the principal, an elected staff member, an elected student representative (secondary school only), and elected parents or community members.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effect size</td>
<td>An effect size is a standardised measure of the strength of relationship between two variables. The larger the effect size the stronger the influence of the intervention or practice on the desired outcome.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELLI</td>
<td>The Effective Lifelong Learning Inventory is an online tool to measure learning dispositions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERO</td>
<td>The Education Review Office reviews and publicly reports on the quality of education and care of students’ in New Zealand schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ETP</td>
<td>The Effective Teaching Profile was the basis of the Te Kotahitanga professional development innovation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPILSEO</td>
<td>A framework for the sustainability of school change with the essential facets of Goals, Pedagogy, Institutions, Leadership, Spread, Evidence and Ownership.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate School</td>
<td>A separate school for Years 7 and 8 in New Zealand between Primary school (Years 1-6) and Secondary school (Years 9-13).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCEA</td>
<td>The National Certificate of Educational Achievement is the New Zealand qualification for secondary students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAT</td>
<td>The Progressive Achievement Tests are a series of standardised tests developed for use in New Zealand schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PB4L:SW</td>
<td>Positive Behaviour for Learning: School Wide is a framework involving staff and students in building consistent approaches to behaviour to enable academic and social success for students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTLB</td>
<td>Resource Teachers of Learning and Behaviour support school students with learning and behaviour difficulties by supporting teachers in an inclusive environment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOLO</td>
<td>The Structure of Observed Learning Outcomes provides a model of learning outcomes and learning language describing five levels of understanding from surface to deep to conceptual understanding.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>