Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Developing writing pedagogy and tertiary learning advice in a disciplinary programme at a New Zealand university

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in English

Massey University, Albany, New Zealand

Martin McMorrow

2018
Abstract

This thesis provides a summary and interpretation of a three-year action research study conducted by a tertiary learning advisor (TLA) at a New Zealand university (referred to in the study as NZU). The study investigated how a TLA, working as an informal writing consultant to staff and students in a disciplinary programme, could make positive contributions to writing pedagogy and TLA practice.

The main sources of data were a reflective journal together with interviews and focus groups with NZU students and staff. Interviews were also held with TLAs in other New Zealand institutions to supplement the limited body of relevant literature. Other data comprised classroom observation, recordings made by lecturers while marking student work and disciplinary and institutional documentation. Data was collected and analysed interpretively and subjectively on a continuous, iterative basis.

Significant contributions were made to writing pedagogy in this disciplinary programme. Progress was based on incremental ‘small wins’ through prolonged engagement with staff and students. This resulted in the provision of resources and workshops to support students in writing effectively within their disciplinary and professional context. Some collaborations had a formative influence on disciplinary writing practices themselves, particularly reflective writing. However, changes in writing pedagogy remained limited to courses in which staff had volunteered to participate and initiatives requiring substantial time and effort from them had limited success.

The main contributions to TLA practice were a greater involvement in classroom teaching and in the professional development of disciplinary teaching staff. However, two shifts in TLA practice which have been advocated in the literature were not supported in this context. Rather than supporting a shift away from one-to-one consultations with students, the study found that they contributed to TLA expertise and to the teaching and learning practices within the programme. The handing over of responsibility for teaching writing from the TLA to disciplinary teaching staff was also not supported; rather, continued involvement of the TLA in direct teaching was seen as consistent with the plurality of expertise and teaching roles which existed in much of the programme.
Acknowledgements

This project could not have been completed without the sustained support and guidance provided by my supervisor, Associate Professor Lisa Emerson and co-supervisor, Dr Gillian Skyrme, over seven years. They were generous with their time and provided me with insights and practical suggestions at each stage.

The detailed insightful and constructive comments of the three examiners were much appreciated and highly valuable in making revisions to my thesis before submission. I could not have wished for more dedicated and sympathetic readers of my work.

Thanks are also due to my fellow tertiary learning advisors who contributed so much, both directly and indirectly, to this project.

The project involved close collaboration with students and staff in a disciplinary programme. Their dedication and generosity sustained the project and made my work and research deeply rewarding.

Finally, my family and friends have supported me in innumerable ways during this project. So many of you have played your part, but I do need to make special mention of Chin Feng Shih, Emma, Elfie and Mollie Kenyon, Giuliana del Corno Silveira, Lyn Shave, and Eden May Genegaban Libres for being with me through the thick and thin of doctoral study.
Table of Contents

Abstract ............................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................... ii
List of Tables ........................................................................................................ viii
List of Figures ........................................................................................................ ix
Glossary of Terms ................................................................................................ x

Chapter 1: Introduction ....................................................................................... 12
  1.1 Introduction.................................................................................................. 12
  1.2 The focus of the study ............................................................................... 17
  1.3 Research methodology ............................................................................. 18
  1.4 The evolving research question ................................................................. 19
  1.5 Data collection and analysis .................................................................... 21
  1.6 Thesis Organisation .................................................................................. 22

Chapter 2: Methods ............................................................................................ 25
  2.1 Introduction.................................................................................................. 25
  2.2 Action research methodology ................................................................... 25
  2.3 The socioconstructivist / interpretivist paradigm ........................................ 31
  2.4 Data collection ........................................................................................... 35
  2.5 Data analysis .............................................................................................. 48
  2.6 Quality criteria .......................................................................................... 52
  2.7 Conclusion ................................................................................................ 54

Chapter 3: Social and organizational context ................................................. 56
  3.1 Introduction.................................................................................................. 56
  3.2 Expansion and diversification of tertiary education .................................... 56
3.3 Approaches to organizational change .................................................. 58
3.4 Student learning in the contemporary tertiary environment.................. 61
3.5 Student retention and success initiatives ............................................. 63
3.6 Conclusion ............................................................................................ 64

Chapter 4: Tertiary Writing ................................................................. 66
4.1 Introduction ........................................................................................... 66
4.2 Tertiary writing practices .................................................................... 67
4.3 Concerns about the quality of tertiary writing ....................................... 74
4.4 Academic writing courses ................................................................... 77
4.5 Feedback on assessed written assignments ........................................... 78
4.6 Writing across the curriculum (WAC) .................................................. 82
4.7 Conclusion ............................................................................................ 86

Chapter 5: Tertiary Learning Advice ...................................................... 89
5.1 Introduction ........................................................................................... 89
5.2 Data collection and analysis ................................................................. 90
5.3 Causes and effects of the marginalisation of TLA practice .................... 91
  5.3.1 The ad-hoc and reactive nature of TLA recruitment ......................... 91
  5.3.2 The volatility of the institutional units in which TLAs practise .......... 93
  5.3.3 Low institutional status of TLAs. ...................................................... 94
  5.3.4 Remedial perceptions of TLA practice ............................................. 96
  5.3.5 The association of TLA practice with one-to-one support ............... 99
5.4 Responses to marginalisation ............................................................... 102
  5.4.1 Establishment of a professional community .................................... 102
  5.4.2 Calls for academic contracts .......................................................... 105
  5.4.3 A shift to working in disciplinary contexts ...................................... 108
  5.4.4 Institutional networking ................................................................. 116
  5.4.5 Involvement in curriculum, pedagogy and assessment .................... 118
Chapter 6: Reconnaissance

6.1 Introduction

6.2 Data-collection

6.3 Findings

6.3.1 Analysis of assessed writing within the BAH programme.

6.3.2 Observation of instructions for a first-year assignment.

6.3.3 Analysis of written feedback on first-year assignments.

6.3.4 Analysis of interviews with BAH staff members.

6.3.5 Analysis of focus group of first-year BAH students.

6.3.6 Selections from my reflective journal

6.4 Discussion

6.4.1 Implications for BAH writing pedagogy

6.4.2 Implications for TLA practice

6.5 Conclusion

Chapter 7: Findings Part 1

7.1 Introduction

7.2 Orientation workshop for new first-year BAH students

7.2.1 Planning, implementation and development.

7.2.2 Implications for BAH writing pedagogy.

7.2.3 Implications for tertiary learning advice.

7.3 Assessment feedback and student referral

7.3.1 Planning, implementation and development.

7.3.2 Implications for BAH writing pedagogy

7.3.3 Implications for tertiary learning advice

7.4 Conclusion
Chapter 8: Findings Part 2 ................................. 169

8.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 169
8.2 Critique and literature review workshop for Year 1 students ..................... 170
8.3 Case study report writing workshop for Year 1 students ......................... 173
8.4 Case study and reflective writing workshop for Year 1 students ........... 176
8.5 Essay writing workshop for Year 1 students.................................................. 178
8.6 Reflective writing for Year 2 & 3 students.................................................... 180
8.7 Research report workshop for Year 4 students ........................................... 184
8.8 Writing to learn classroom activities for Year 1 students ......................... 189
8.9 Summary of findings related to BAH writing pedagogy ......................... 192
8.10 Summary of findings related to tertiary learning advice .......................... 204
8.11 Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 208

Chapter 9: Findings Part 3 ................................................. 211

9.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 211
9.2 One-to-one support for BAH student writing............................................. 212
  9.2.1 Increased uptake of one-to-one consultations ........................................ 212
  9.2.2 Implications for BAH student writing ...................................................... 216
  9.2.3 Implications for tertiary learning advice ................................................... 221
9.3 Staff development workshops and resources ............................................. 224
  9.3.1 Planning, implementation and development ......................................... 224
  9.3.2 Implications for BAH writing pedagogy ............................................... 233
  9.3.3 Implications for tertiary learning advice ............................................... 235
9.4 Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 238

Chapter 10: Discussion ......................................................... 241

10.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................... 241
10.2 Contributions to BAH Writing pedagogy .................................................. 244
List of Tables

Table 1: Institutional positioning of NZU interviewees (excluding BAH) .................. 36
Table 2: Interviews (I) with BAH staff ................................................................. 37
Table 3: BAH student focus groups (F) and interviewees (I) ................................. 38
Table 4: Text types of BAH writing assignments in 2012 .................................. 130
Table 5: Analysis of Sarah’s comments on student assignments ..................... 135
Table 6: Features of applied health writing mentioned by staff and students ...... 138
Table 7: Reflections on writing development 2010 – 2011 ................................. 141
Table 8: Reflections on TLA practice 2010 – 2011 .............................................. 143
Table 9: Course-specific BAH writing workshops ............................................ 170
Table 10: Consultations with BAH students during the project ....................... 213
List of Figures

Figure 1: Extract from transcript of interview with a BAH student................................. 49
Figure 2: Extract from the transcript of an interview with a BAH staff member ........... 50
Figure 3: Extract from summary of themes from interviews with BAH staff.............. 51
Figure 4: Extract 1 from the BAH Writing Competency Framework.......................... 228
Figure 5: Extract 2 from the BAH Writing Competency Framework.......................... 230
Figure 6: BAH writing audit form ................................................................................. 232
Glossary of Terms

AD  Academic developer

AH  Applied health (pseudonym for an area of community health and educational support in which the BAH programme qualifies students to practise)

BAH  Bachelor of applied health (pseudonym for the four-year degree programme which is the focus of this study)

ESOL  English for speakers of other language

LTU  Learning and Teaching Unit (used to describe the institutional units in which TLAs operate. These are most often Student Learning Centres or Centres for Teaching and Learning, but other arrangements and titles are also found in tertiary institutions in New Zealand and elsewhere)

LTW  Learning to write (one strand of WAC / WID)

NZU  New Zealand University (pseudonym for the university in which the project took place)
PBRF  Performance-based research fund, administered by the New Zealand Tertiary Education Commission; 60% of funds are allocated to institutions on the basis of a quality review of the research carried out by its staff members. The remainder is allocated according to student completions and institutional success in generating external funding (mostly from industry).

PTF  Professional teaching fellow

TLA  Tertiary learning advisor

WAC  Writing across the curriculum

Wānanga  New Zealand tertiary institution with a Māori ethos

WID  Writing in the disciplines

WTL  Writing to learn (one strand of WAC / WID)