Personal, interpersonal and organisational factors that enable or constrain the development of attachment-type relationships between infants, toddlers and their teachers in Aotearoa New Zealand early childhood settings

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Education

at Massey University, Manawatū,
New Zealand

Raewyne Louise Bary

2018
Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Abstract

Research has demonstrated that close and affectionate relationships between infants/toddlers and teachers within early childhood settings are of vital significance. It is within these relationships that infants and toddlers cognitive, emotional and physical health is promoted and protected (Dalli, White, Rockel, & Duhn, 2011; Rolfe, 2004; Shonkoff & Phillips, 2000). It is also in these close foundational attachment-type relationships that children develop adaptive emotional regulation and individual self-concept. These relational experiences form the blueprint for the manner in which children and adults approach and negotiate current and future relationships (Treboux, Crowell, & Waters, 2004). The goal of this mixed-method design study was to identify the structural and process quality factors that predict high quality relationship development opportunities between teachers, infants and toddlers.

Three case studies were undertaken in the first phase of data generation. The sample for the research comprised groups of teachers, infants/toddlers and their families/whānau. Case study data identified organisational factors that influence the opportunities for quality relationships to develop in Early Childhood Services (ECS); these organisational factors were then further validated in phase two through a national survey of 213 centres that were identified as catering for infants and toddlers.

Results showed there is a need for centres to develop relationship-based approaches, which could include primary/key teacher programmes within an organisational climate that is flexible, safe and open to critique and change. This relationship development requires specific attention in each of the three planes of activity: personal, interpersonal and institutional (Rogoff, 1998). The three planes pay attention to: participation of an individual within an activity and how this participation transforms during the course of the activity (personal focus of analysis), the individual’s collaboration and relationships with others (interpersonal focus of analysis), and on cultural/institutional/historical factors (community or cultural or contextual focus of analysis).

It is in the structures such as rosters, or duty lists, and staff rotations where relationship opportunities get missed or unfulfilled. The findings suggest that the reduction of teacher rotation in the infant and toddler areas should be considered to promote consistency and continuity for the infants and toddlers and their families/whānau. The need for increasing infant and toddler specific preparation within initial teacher education and on-going professional learning programmes were identified as key factors in improving the development of quality teaching practice.

Implications from this study include the need for teachers to recognise the importance of developing attachment-type relationships with the infants and toddlers with whom they work, and to engage in on-going professional learning focused on infant and toddler pedagogy. Finally, the findings recommend that policy makers should develop regulations to ensure ratios for infants and toddlers be maintained at one adult to three children (1:3) for under two-year-olds. There is a call to reinstate the 100% fully qualified teacher requirements (particularly for infants and toddlers); and a need to provide financial and professional support to ensure all infant and toddler teachers can be exposed to a variety of on-going professional learning opportunities. The framework of planes of activity (Rogoff, 1998) has been utilised to make coherent sense of so many variables, each of which contributes to quality relationships between the teachers and the infants, toddlers.
Acknowledgements

As a doctoral student at Massey University Palmerston North Aotearoa New Zealand, I have come to know and benefit from the encouragement, support and guidance from many university lecturers and staff. I want to acknowledge those individuals who have been especially helpful along the way. First of all, I want to express my deep appreciation for my supervision team of Associate Professor Alison Arrow and Professor Claire McLachlan. They have been astounding teachers, mentors, and coaches throughout all aspects of my academic experience at the University. They have not only taught me the skills I needed in my first attempt as a mixed method researcher they also taught me the art that is required to look and look again. They challenged me time and time again to question assumptions and to look outside of my bias.

I would like to thank my workplace, Massey Child Care Centre and to acknowledge the Centre’s Management Committee, senior leadership team and all teachers and staff (past and present) for the support given as I continued to work fulltime and undertake doctoral studies. In particular, I would like to thank Faith Martin, Karen Laird, Caryn Deans, Kim Putze, Susan Claire, Alison Angel and Helen Eades. The commitment and understanding afforded to me as I tussled with concepts, feelings of dismay, overwhelming excitement (where I needed to talk and talk and talk) and during those inevitable tough times, was invaluable.

I am especially grateful to the teachers (case study and survey respondents) and families/whānau who agreed to participate in my study. Their generosity of time, and willingness to share their experiences so openly in the spirit of learning was truly inspiring. Additionally, I want to acknowledge the owners/managers of the centres. These individuals were helpful in multiple ways throughout the study, and they made sure to provide coverage for participant teachers during research interviews that required them to be off the floor. Of
course, I also need to express my thanks to the infants and toddlers themselves being reminded of their innocence, vulnerability and absolute beauty made this process professionally and personally challenging.

Finally, I want to thank sincerely my family who has been extraordinarily patient and understanding while I have been completing this degree. I will be forever grateful for their willingness to be there for me, and for their confidence in my potential. In particular thanks to my husband Kem who supported me all the way with never a doubt or too much complaining, and with the always-needed cup of coffee not too far away. Thank you to my three children, Alivia, Craig and Karl, who continually encouraged and supported me. Last, but certainly not least, are my three amazing grandchildren - Max, Zoe and Tom - you three provided me with the impetus and drive to see this to the end.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ iii

Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................................... iv

List of Figures .................................................................................................................................. xii

List of Tables ................................................................................................................................... xiii

Glossary ........................................................................................................................................... xiv

Chapter 1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1
  Overall research aim...................................................................................................................... 2
  Background .................................................................................................................................... 5
  Purpose and design of the study ................................................................................................. 8
  Overview of chapters .................................................................................................................... 9
    Chapter 2 - Literature Review .................................................................................................. 9
    Chapter 3 – Methodology ........................................................................................................ 10
    Chapter 4 – Case Studies Results ............................................................................................ 10
    Chapter 5 – Survey Results ...................................................................................................... 11
    Chapter 6 - Discussion ........................................................................................................... 11
    Chapter 7 - Conclusions .......................................................................................................... 12
  Summary ....................................................................................................................................... 12

Chapter 2 Literature ....................................................................................................................... 13
  Attachment theory ....................................................................................................................... 14
    John Bowlby .......................................................................................................................... 14
    Mary Ainsworth ...................................................................................................................... 17
    Cross cultural studies on attachment ....................................................................................... 20
    Intergenerational attachment ................................................................................................. 21
    Summary ................................................................................................................................. 22
  Attachment theory in ECS ......................................................................................................... 23

Defining quality for early childhood settings .............................................................................. 25
  Secure base ................................................................................................................................. 29
  Intersubjective attunement ....................................................................................................... 32
  Internal working model ............................................................................................................ 34
  Issues in the implementation of quality .................................................................................... 35
Attachment concepts and the Aotearoa New Zealand context ..................................................... 37
Achieving quality practice ........................................................................................................... 39
  Teacher education .................................................................................................................... 39
  Continuity of care .................................................................................................................... 42
  Organisational structures ....................................................................................................... 44
Programmes to support relationship development ................................................................. 50
  Group care/multiple carers .................................................................................................... 50
  Barriers to group care ......................................................................................................... 51
  Key person/primary care ....................................................................................................... 52
  Barriers to primary/key teacher practices ............................................................................ 56
Theoretical framework and research questions ....................................................................... 60
Summary .................................................................................................................................. 62

Chapter 3 Methodology ........................................................................................................... 64
Epistemology and theoretical framework .................................................................................. 64
Methodology ............................................................................................................................. 66
Phase one case study ................................................................................................................ 68
  Sampling procedure case study .......................................................................................... 71
  Totara .................................................................................................................................. 73
  Rimu .................................................................................................................................... 73
  Miro ...................................................................................................................................... 74
Teachers qualifications ............................................................................................................ 76
Methods .................................................................................................................................... 76
  ITERS-R................................................................................................................................. 78
  Video .................................................................................................................................... 81
  Interviews ............................................................................................................................... 83
  Documents .............................................................................................................................. 85
Phase two survey ....................................................................................................................... 85
Sampling procedure survey ..................................................................................................... 87
  Pilot testing ............................................................................................................................ 88
  Sample .................................................................................................................................. 89
  Demographics of survey respondents .................................................................................. 90
Data analysis ............................................................................................................................... 92
  The Three Planes of Analysis ............................................................................................... 92
  Phase one case study ......................................................................................................... 94
  Phase two survey ................................................................................................................. 95
Ethics ....................................................................................................................................... 96
Chapter 4 Case Studies .................................................................................................................. 102

Totara ........................................................................................................................................... 102
  Daily arrivals and departures ....................................................................................................... 103
  Family perspectives .................................................................................................................... 107
  ITERS-R ...................................................................................................................................... 108
  Interviews .................................................................................................................................... 109
  Documentation ............................................................................................................................. 109

Totara Summary .............................................................................................................................. 110

Rimu ................................................................................................................................................. 111
  Daily arrival and departures ....................................................................................................... 112
  Family perspectives .................................................................................................................... 113
  ITERS-R ...................................................................................................................................... 114
  Interviews .................................................................................................................................... 115
  Documentation ............................................................................................................................. 116

Rimu Summary ............................................................................................................................... 117

Miro ................................................................................................................................................. 118
  Daily arrivals and departures ....................................................................................................... 118
  Family perspectives .................................................................................................................... 120
  ITERS-R ...................................................................................................................................... 121
  Interviews .................................................................................................................................... 122
  Documentation ............................................................................................................................. 123

Miro Summary ............................................................................................................................... 123

Presentation of case study findings ............................................................................................... 124

Discussion across the three planes of analysis ............................................................................ 129

Personal plane .................................................................................................................................. 130
  Family perspectives .................................................................................................................... 130
  Initial teacher education and professional learning ................................................................. 131
  Teachers’ values and beliefs ........................................................................................................ 132

Interpersonal Plane ........................................................................................................................ 134
  Family perspectives .................................................................................................................... 134
  Attachment/relationship development ....................................................................................... 136
  Key teacher, primary care and multiple care systems ............................................................... 136

Institutional Plane .......................................................................................................................... 138
  ITERS-R ...................................................................................................................................... 138

Validity of data ................................................................................................................................ 99
Summary .......................................................................................................................................... 100

Case Studies
Organisational structures.......................................................................................... 139
Rosters...................................................................................................................... 141
Philosophy ............................................................................................................. 144
Summary ............................................................................................................... 146

Chapter 5 Survey ................................................................................................. 148
Demographics of services and teacher education.................................................. 149
Personal plane ..................................................................................................... 151
  Professional learning infants and toddlers........................................................... 151
Personal plane Sub themes .................................................................................. 154
  Initial teacher education and professional learning.......................................... 154
  Teachers’ values and beliefs.............................................................................. 155
Interpersonal plane ............................................................................................... 156
  Attachment/relationships.................................................................................. 156
Interpersonal plane Sub themes .......................................................................... 156
  Key teacher/primary care .............................................................................. 156
Institutional plane ................................................................................................ 160
  Organisational constructs............................................................................... 160
Institutional Plane Sub themes .......................................................................... 161
  Infant and toddler programmes and philosophies........................................... 161
  Rosters............................................................................................................. 164
Summary ............................................................................................................... 168

Chapter 6 Discussion ........................................................................................ 170
Personal plane ..................................................................................................... 171
  Personal plane objective sub question 1......................................................... 172
  Personal plane objective sub question 2......................................................... 177
  ITE and professional learning........................................................................... 180
Interpersonal plane ............................................................................................... 183
  Interpersonal plane objective sub question 1............................................... 184
  Interpersonal plane sub question 2................................................................. 193
  Interpersonal plane sub question 3................................................................. 195
Institutional plane ................................................................................................ 196
  Institutional plane sub question 1................................................................. 196
  Institutional plane sub question 2................................................................. 199
Summary ............................................................................................................... 200

Chapter 7 Conclusions ....................................................................................... 203
Key findings......................................................................................................... 204
Contribution of this study ........................................................................................................... 207
Strengths and limitations of the present study ........................................................................ 208
Implications and future research ............................................................................................ 209
  Implications for teaching practice ......................................................................................... 210
  Implications for early childhood services ............................................................................. 210
  Implications for ITE and ongoing professional learning ....................................................... 211
  Implications for policy ........................................................................................................... 212
  Suggestions for further research ........................................................................................... 213
Summary .................................................................................................................................... 213
References .................................................................................................................................. 217
Appendices .................................................................................................................................. 235
Appendix A .................................................................................................................................. 236
  A. Survey Questions ............................................................................................................. 236
Appendix B .................................................................................................................................. 246
  B. ITERS-R Subscales and Items ......................................................................................... 246
Appendix C .................................................................................................................................. 247
  C1. Interview schedule parent/whānau ................................................................................. 247
  C2. Interview schedule staff ................................................................................................. 248
Appendix D .................................................................................................................................. 249
  D1. Letter to Child Care Centre and or Centre Corporation (requesting permission for research) ......................................................................................................................... 249
  D2. Management consent form ......................................................................................... 250
Appendix E .................................................................................................................................. 251
  E1. Letter to Child Care Centre and or Centre Corporation (requesting permission for research) ......................................................................................................................... 251
  E2. Staff information sheet ................................................................................................. 254
  E3. Parent/whānau information sheet – non case study ....................................................... 257
  E4. Parent /whānau information sheet – case study ............................................................. 260
Appendix F .................................................................................................................................. 263
  F1. Staff consent form ......................................................................................................... 263
  F2. Parent/whānau consent form – child non case study ....................................................... 265
  F3. Parent/whānau consent form – child case study ............................................................. 267
Appendix G .................................................................................................................................. 269
G. Confidentiality agreement .................................................................................................................. 269

Appendix H .............................................................................................................................................. 270

H1. Authority for release of video footage parent/whānau ................................................................. 270
H2. Authority for release of video footage staff member ................................................................. 271

Appendix I .............................................................................................................................................. 272

I.1 Authority for release of tape transcripts parent/whānau ........................................................... 272
I2. Authority for release of tape transcripts staff member ............................................................ 273

Appendix J .............................................................................................................................................. 274

Email to perspective survey participants ............................................................................................ 274
List of Figures

**Figure 3.1.** Conceptualisation of analysis method........................................96

**Figure 5.1.** Decile rating of schools nearest to the surveyed early childhood services.................................................................148

**Figure 5.2.** Qualifications held by respondents..............................................149

**Figure 5.3.** Infant and toddler specific professional learning experiences........152

**Figure 5.4.** Teachers engagement with the infants and toddlers in their key group........................................................................157

**Figure 5.5.** Influences Impacting on Programmes and Practice....................162

**Figure 5.6.** Policies and procedures specific to infants and toddlers............163

**Figure 5.7.** Rosters and duty lists.................................................................164

**Figure 5.8.** Rotation of rosters and duty lists................................................165

**Figure 5.9.** Changes in working hours..........................................................166

**Figure 5.10.** Reasons for changes in working hours.......................................167
List of Tables

Table 3.1. Mixed method QUAL→quan sequential research design ......................... 67
Table 3.2. Overview of the Research Design .......................................................... 68
Table 3.3. Triangulation of case study data ............................................................ 70
Table 3.4. Centre structures ..................................................................................... 75
Table 3.5. Teacher pseudonyms ............................................................................. 75
Table 3.6. Case study participant children and families/whānau and pseudonyms .. 76
Table 3.7. Case study qualifications.......................................................................... 77
Table 3.8. Service type ............................................................................................ 91
Table 3.9. Current roles in the centre ..................................................................... 91
Table 3.10. Qualifications held by survey respondents .......................................... 94
Table 3.11. Analysis steps ....................................................................................... 96
Table 4.1. Original themes ...................................................................................... 125
Table 4.2. Original themes colour coded ................................................................. 126
Table 4.3. Categories of similarity ......................................................................... 127
Table 4.4. Final condensed themes and sub themes ............................................... 128
Table 4.5. ITERS-R scores at baseline. Scale: 1-7 1-Inadequate, 3 – Minimal, 5 – Good, 7 – Excellent ........................................................................................................... 137
Table 5.1. Flexibility of Teacher Daily Practice ...................................................... 159
Table 5.2. Infant and Toddler Specific Philosophy .................................................. 161
Table 5.3. Comparison of Rosters to Flexibility ..................................................... 167
Table 7.1. Findings across the three planes ............................................................ 201
<p>| Glossary |
|-----------------|-----------------|
| <strong>Centre</strong> | Early childhood place, building or institution. The Ministry term is ECS. |
| <strong>Education Review Office ERO</strong> | The New Zealand Ministry of Education Review Office |
| <strong>Initial Teacher Education (ITE)</strong> | Initial Teacher Education, takes place largely or exclusively in institutions of higher education. A teacher can first obtain a qualification in one or more subjects (often an undergraduate bachelor degree), and then studies for a further period to gain an additional qualification in teaching. Other pathways are also available; it is possible for a person to receive education as a teacher by working in an early childhood centre whilst studying part time with an approved provider. |
| <strong>ITERS-R</strong> | Infant/Toddler Environment Rating Scale - Revised Edition |
| <strong>Key teacher/primary care</strong> | Based on attachment theory; successful implementation requires attention to activity in each of the three planes of analysis: <strong>The institutional</strong> ECS culture, philosophy, staffing and low adult:child ratios, planning for continuity of teachers; routines, assessment procedures  <strong>The interpersonal</strong> warm, caring, intersubjective attunement to cues to children’s needs and interest; collaborating teachers and <strong>The personal</strong> for chn: secure attachments to a few teachers; confident exploring and peer and adult relationships; for teachers: fulfilling, shared understandings. |
| <strong>Profile</strong> | A profile is a record of the child's process of learning: what the child has learned and how she has gone about learning and how she interacts, intellectually, emotionally and socially with others. Generally contains: stories, photos and examples of artwork. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Profile teacher</td>
<td>In this study the profile teacher is commonly the teacher assigned to document the child’s learning, often with input from other teachers. This role does not equate to that of a key teacher or primary care role.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Learning PL</td>
<td>The term professional learning in this study is used in reference to a wide variety of specialised learning opportunities, intended to help educators improve their professional knowledge, competence, skill, and effectiveness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three Planes of Analysis</td>
<td>A system of analysis in which the focus can be on one of the planes while the others remain in the background. The three planes focus on: participation of an individual within an activity and how this participation transforms during the course of the activity (personal focus of analysis), the individual’s collaboration and relationships with others (interpersonal focus of analysis), and on cultural/institutional/historical factors (community or cultural or contextual focus of analysis).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whānau</td>
<td>Extended family or community of related families who live together in the same area.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>