Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Gender Awareness

In
Japan International Cooperation Agency’s
Development Assistance

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of

Master of Philosophy in Development Studies
Massey University

Junko Matsui

1999
For my parents
Michiko and Nobuo.
Abstract

In the past, development efforts have failed to bring about genuine women's development which concerns both women's well-being and their status in the Third World. In order to achieve women's development, thorough understanding of the causes of women's underdevelopment, sound conceptualisation of women and development and strategies to bring about women's development are required. States and development agencies have specific perception on women and conceptualise women and development in various ways. From the different concepts we could expect different outcomes. In this research I look at implications of Japan International Cooperation Agency's women in development policy concerning women's development in the Third World.

In the first part of this research, I discuss concepts and strategies for women's development. The earlier thought on women and development, emerged in 1970s, attributes failure of past development efforts bringing about women's development, to preconceptions policymakers and planners have about women's roles in their families, communities and nations. However, women's issues and women's projects were often continued to be marginalised within the development efforts which is informed by the perspective. Another perspective identified women's subordination to men as the fundamental cause of women's disadvantages they face.

Strategies for women's development are suggested based on the perspective problematising women's subordination in this research. The strategies must involve the improvement of women's immediate conditions and the change of unequal gender relations. Women's needs to achieve their well-being and ones derived from their tasks need to be identified and addressed. It is recognised that improvement of women's status is necessary to achieve their well-being. Women's needs could be addressed through both women specific projects and mainstream projects. In order to alter women's subordination to men transformative intervention was suggested. The transformative intervention seeks to address women's interests in transforming gender relations in a project addressing women's material needs. Moreover, in order for women to become
agents of their development and to alter power within gender relations, women's self-empowerment process must be encouraged. Self-empowerment is regarded as complementary to the strategies. Self-empowerment includes conscientisation about oppressive structure, and mobilisation of women to meet their own needs.

JICA concerns about women's participation in development projects, identification of gender division of labour and improvement of women's well-being in the Third World. However, JICA's concept of Women in Development is grounded on the perspective advocated in 1970s and is not informed by the failures of attempts made during 1970s and 1980s. JICA fails to problematise unequal gender relations and to develop strategies to transform gender relations. Hence, self-empowerment and transformative intervention are not recognised. JICA also lacks awareness toward marginalisation of women's issues and women's projects in development operation. Women's subordination in planning procedures reflects in the number of WID-related projects implemented and the kinds of needs addressed through development projects.
Acknowledgements

First of all, I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Barbara Nowak for her advice, comments, and constant encouragement. I was grateful for her guidance as I completed this research. I also appreciated Dr. John Overton for his encouragement.

I would like to thank the staff from the Environment, WID and other Global Issues division of JICA for providing useful documents and answering my questions.

I also would like to thank all staff and students of Development Studies for providing a pleasant intellectual environment. It was a great experience to be amongst people who are really concerned for the poorest of the poor. Since I spent a great amount of time at our department, I would like to say thank you to my good company: Harumi, Andrew Kiblewhite, Ako, Emma Dunlop, and Anna Mosely.

I would like to express my appreciation to my friends in New Zealand. Jeanette Andersen-Burt has been a good friend and taken care of me very well. She also spent time on proof-reading of some of the chapters in this research. My cousin Eriko and I have helped each other to survive in NZ. Kyle Burmeister lent me his computer and has been a good friend. I asked to borrow his computer for two weeks but at the end I loaned it for six months. He also drew the figures in this copy.

I really appreciated my aunt Katsuko’s constant encouragement for me to have overseas experience and to take up post graduate study.

Finally, I am grateful to my mother, Michiko, and my father, Nobuo, for their support, understanding, and encouragement.
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................................................ III

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ............................................................................................................................. V

TABLE OF CONTENTS ............................................................................................................................. VI

LIST OF FIGURES ..................................................................................................................................... IX

ABBREVIATIONS ....................................................................................................................................... X

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................ 1

INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................................................... 1

RESEARCH AIMS ........................................................................................................................................ 3

THE STRUCTURE OF THIS RESEARCH PROJECT ....................................................................................... 3

CHAPTER 2: THEORIES OF WOMEN'S DEVELOPMENT ................................................................ 5

INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................................................... 5

DEVELOPMENT INTERVENTION AND WOMEN BEFORE 1970 ............................................................................ 5

Welfare approach .................................................................................................................................... 9

WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT .......................................................................................................................... 9

Emergence of WID ................................................................................................................................... 9

Empirical studies ..................................................................................................................................... 11

Perspective of WID .................................................................................................................................. 13

WID Critique of Sex-role Theory .................................................................................................................. 13

Equity approach ...................................................................................................................................... 14

Anti-poverty approach ............................................................................................................................... 15

Efficiency approach .................................................................................................................................. 18

Critical of WID ...................................................................................................................................... 19

WOMEN AND DEVELOPMENT .................................................................................................................... 19

GENDER AND DEVELOPMENT .................................................................................................................... 21

Gender relations ...................................................................................................................................... 23

Gender ideology ....................................................................................................................................... 23

Gender Division of Labour ......................................................................................................................... 24

CHAPTER 3: STRATEGIES FOR WOMEN'S EMPOWERMENT ................................................................. 26

WOMEN'S CONDITION ............................................................................................................................... 26

Education ................................................................................................................................................. 27
List of Figures

Table 1: Incidence of WID projects ................................................................. 78
Source: JICA’s WID related cooperation from FY1990 to FY1996 ...................... 78
Figure 6-1: Location of WID/GAD in development operation .......................... 90
Figure 6-2: Integrationist version and agenda-setting version of mainstreaming .... 91
Figure 6-3: Types of project and implications .................................................. 94
Abbreviations

CIDA  Canadian International Development Agency
CSW   United Nations Commission on the Status of Women
CCIC  Canadian Council for International Co-operation
DAWN Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era
FY    fiscal year
GAD   Gender and Development
GNP   gross national product
JICA  Japan International Cooperation Agency
JOCV  Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteer
MoFA  Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japan
NGO   non-governmental organisation
NZODA New Zealand Official Development Assistance
ODA   Official Development Assistance
OECD  Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OECD/DAC Development Assistance Committee of OECD
OECF  the Overseas Economic Cooperation Fund
SAP   Structural Adjustment Policy
SID/WID Women in Development caucus of Society for International Development
WAD   Women and Development
WID   Women in Development
UN    United Nations
**Chapter 1: Introduction**

**Introduction**

Women's living conditions and status in the Third World are still devastating. Many women face disadvantages as a result of their gender, and their life opportunities are limited. What attempts have people made to improve women's condition and status? Women have been, to varying degrees, a subject of consideration on the international agenda for years. United Nation’s Commission on the Status of Women (CSW) was formed in 1946. The principle of equality of women and men is recognised in both United Nation (UN) Charter in 1945 and UN Declaration of Human Rights in 1948. In the 1950s and 1960s, a chief concern was improving the status of women. Several UN conventions of particular concern to women were held, that included:

1949 Convention for the Suppression of Traffic in Persons and the Exploitation of the prostitution or Others
1951 Equal Remuneration for Men and Women Workers for Work of Equal Value

This effort was carried on to the convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women, in 1979. However, these promises made to women during these conventions are still unachieved not only by way of implementation but also by the further commitment of many nations. In fact forty-six years after the first convention, in 1995, the CSW still “found it necessary to adopt a resolution on traffic in women and girls” (Steady 1995: 13)

Although, the conventions focused on the particular issues, more comprehensive way to understand women’s situation and approaches for improving women’s material conditions and status derived from a debate on women in development process, Such approaches have been suggested from several different perspectives. It was in the early 1970s within a development context, the global community affirmed centrality of the
issue of equality between women and men. International advocates, such as Women’s movement, UN mandate and Development Assistance Committee of Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD/DAC), started demanding for national governments and international development agencies to adopt special policies, strategies and measures to promote women’s advancement. Four World Conferences on Women were organised by the UN—in Mexico in 1975, in Copenhagen in 1980, in Nairobi in 1985 and in Beijing in 1995. They have propelled an integration of policies, which share a certain perspective called Women in Development (WID). Till now such policy is often called WID.

The effectiveness of WID policy and measures in promoting women’s advancement and gender equality have been well researched over time. Perspectives of WID which sees women’s problem as lack of political and economic power has been reconsidered.

Development aid is provided through various forms of international aid agencies including bilateral (e.g. United States Agency for International Development) and multilateral donors (e.g. the World Bank). Among countries extending financial and/or technical aid, Japan is one of the largest donor countries.

Japan has allocated Official Development Assistance (ODA) since 1954. Japan’s ODA extends to over 150 Third World countries in Asia, Africa, South Pacific, Middle East, Central and South America and Europe. Japan became the world’s top donor country in 1989 and has retained that position since 1991 (Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japan (MoFA)) 14 Oct 1998). Japan’s ODA is significant to recipient countries in terms of its budgetary scale. In 1993, Japan’s ODA shared 20.2% of world’s ODA in net disbursement base (MoFA 1995b: 1).

Japan expressed its intention to assist the social development sector which addresses poverty alleviation through addressing so called basic human needs, as well as the other key sector of economic infrastructure. Japan’s ODA support of the social development sector shared 22.6% of Japan’s bilateral ODA in 1993 (MoFA 1995b:1). The issue of
WID often appears in Japan’s aid policy dialogue, sometimes as an issue under social development. Japan’s efforts towards social development was again emphasised when it announced the reduction of ODA expenditure in 1996. Japan’s Ministry of Foreign Affairs when budgeting for ODA said it was seeking quality than quantity. Women’s development was articulated as an important sphere of this quality assistance. Thus, WID is regarded as an important policy concern by Japan’s Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Japan’s ODA integrated WID policy much later than some other aid agencies, as for example, Canadian International Development Agency’s WID integration in 1976. The Japan’s Ministry of Foreign Affairs established WID Steering Committee and also appointed a staff each to all division within the Economic Cooperation Bureau of MoFA to take charge of WID promotion. In terms of Japan’s other aid implementation body, the Overseas Economic Cooperation Fund (OECF) and Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), the substantial WID promotion started in 1990s.

Research Aims

In this study I examine the WID or gender-awareness policy in Japan’s grant aid technical co-operation, which is dealt by JICA. I aim to identify to what extent JICA’s co-operation contributes to women’s development. This research consists of two parts. Firstly, scrutinising the past experiences and philosophy as well as current thought, approaches and strategies in the achievement of women’s development. This also gives a framework for a second part of the research, which is specifically an assessment of JICA’s WID policy.

The structure of this research project

There are six chapters to this research project. Chapters Two, Three and Four present theoretical discussion on policies and strategies for women’s development. What is required for development assistance to be gender-aware becomes distinct through those three chapters. Chapter Two focuses on analysis of aid policies toward women in and on
ideologies on which the policies are formulated. In Chapter Three, I include a discussion of empowerment, as a strategy which may be complement to improve both women's living conditions and women's status. Chapter Four describe self-empowerment, that is first introduced in Chapter Three. Self-empowerment is an important process which helps women develop them so that they can claim and realise gender equality in a bottom-up manner. In Chapter Five JICA's WID policy and its executed projects are analysed from Gender and Development (GAD) perspective that recognises there is a fundamental problem in women's underdevelopment which lies in women's subordinate position relative to men. Chapter six, the conclusion discusses gender politics underlying in integration of gender-awareness into development efforts.

Although, development agencies became to give more attention to women's development, both the diffusion of gender awareness within the agencies and the effectiveness of their strategies to women's development are not satisfactory. In this research, I intend to explore the reasons of women's underdevelopment, the strategies to improve it and the problems in JICA's WID policy.
Chapter 2: Theories of women's development

Introduction

Devastating conditions in which women live in the Third World is still and even increasingly reported, for example, more than half a million women die each year in childbirth and in sub-Saharan Africa maternal mortality increased during 1980s (UN 1995: xxi), despite of the past almost five decades of development assistance. Our question would be what has and has not done for women’s development. How the problems are tackled is dependent on how the problems are perceived. Women have been addressed by development initiatives based on the particular perceptions. Feminists have explained problems in women’s development and advocated strategies. The interaction between feminists thoughts and development efforts have taken critical roles to form the strategies for women’s development.

Concepts of women in the development processes have changed over time. In this chapter I will look at the emergence of the Women in Development (WID) discourse, and the resultant the policy approaches employed by development agencies, including the examination of their rational for their strategies. I will then look at the changing paradigm from WID to GAD.

Development intervention and women before 1970

In 1950s and 1960s development was recognised as economic growth with the gross national product (GNP) perceived as an adequate measurement of development (Young 1993: 13). It was modernisation theory that dominated mainstream thinking on international development at that time (Rathgeber 1990: 162). General assumption of modernisation theory- that is, that develop is a linear, cumulative process will as expansionist and diffusionist - that of comparing traditional values against modern ones, reflected modernisation theory's view on women and development (Jaquette 1982: 268). Modernisation appeared to require self-initiated men to leave the household, abandon
tradition, and assume their rightful place among other rational men. Women and the household are regarded as belonging to past and symbolic of irrationality and backwardness (Scott 1995: 39). Modernisation theory does not recognise there are the different form of rationality within tradition and the household (Scott 1995: 40). Therefore, in modernisation theory, if women want to take part in the developed societies, they need to attain the value or characteristics same as men, for instance rationality which was assumed as men's attainment. The domination of modernisation theory among development agencies affected not only the agencies aid policy designs but also those practitioners and advocates that were supposed to provide critical view on such aid agencies’ policies and practices.

From a modernisation perspective a market is seen as the place where “universalistic criteria applied and where individuals are impersonally rewarded on the basis of objective results rather than good intentions, patronage networks or ‘ascribed’ characteristics such as sex, caste or race” (Kabeer 1994a: 18). Also, in principle, women are free to enter the market, as long as they can also manage reproductive work. Therefore there is no disadvantages in modern sector to women who have been bound to traditional society; women who chose to enter the market would receive the same benefits as men. According to the modernisation perspective, “traditional societies are male-dominated and authoritarian, and modern societies are democratic and egalitarian” (Jaquette 1982: 269). So even women who chose not to enter the labour market would indirectly benefit from modern society which would undermine the old authoritarian structures within the family (Kabeer 1994a: 18). As societies become modernised, women would be expected to be liberated through the development process and the administration of development policies and programmes which are perceived as sex-neutral or advantageous to women (Jaquette 1982: 269). For example, Jaquette says:

Industrialization is seen to reduce the social impact of biological asymmetry between men’s and women’s physical strength; birth control was said to give women freedom from the endless cycle of involuntary reproduction; and modern
values and expectations are expected to increase women’s mobility and freedom of action (Jaquette 1982: 269).

In 1950s and 1960s, development assistance were considered to be gender-neutral and expected automatically benefit both men and women (Karl 1995: 94). Development assistance can be categorised into two types; a financial aid for economic growth which focused on increasing productive capacity of male labour force, and secondly relief aid, which provided through women, for socially "vulnerable" groups such as children, the old and women (Moser 1989: 1807). Reproduction was the only sphere in which development agencies recognised women’s roles. Women were exclusively focussed on only as mothers and carers, as a "vulnerable group". This was reflected in the development assistance assigned to women. Women were seen as mere beneficiaries of welfare with respect to nutrition, child care, health and population, with a view of improving family well-being and controlling women’s fertility (Karl 1995: 94).

A reason of this dualistic interventions would be explained by sex-role theory in its integration into modernisation theory. Sociological sex-role theory has informed modernisation theory and it underlies most development policy makers’ mindset. The western notion of a family and a household was applied to sex-role theory, which considered that every household should takes the same form: a nuclear family consisting of a male breadwinner/ dependent house wife and children. The sex division of labour was based on an idea of comparative advantage which claims there are works which women can perform advantageously compare to men and vice versa. Given women’s major role in procreation, it would be rational for them to take a domestic work, which was compatible with their biological role. On the other hand, men specialised in full-time production for the market. Sex-role theory identifies the different roles given to women and men, also particular characteristics gained by them. Kabeer (1994a) summarises that:

Women and men were socialised into personality types that fitted them for different roles within the family. Men specialised in instrumental roles and acquired the characteristics that went with them: rational, objective, competitive
and aggressive. Women were entrusted with the affective, homemaking role within the private sphere of family life (Kabeer 1994a: 17-8).

Undoubtedly these assumptions of sex-role theory have shaped a model of development interventions that allocated projects in the production sphere to men and provided welfare to families through women.

The sex-role theory is biologically deterministic. Ortner (1996) suggests the common tendency of women’s taking homemaking role and some aspects of feminine psyche are not innate for women. Given women’s biological function of childbearing and breast feeding, caring for small children is seen as extension of women’s work. Women are confined to a domestic realm in this way (Ortner 1996: 31). According to Chodorow (1974) the differences between male and female personality, roughly, that men are more objective and inclined to relate in terms of relatively abstract categories, women more subjective and inclined to relate in terms of relatively concrete phenomena are general and nearly universal. However, the differences are not innate or genetically programmed; they arise from nearly universal features of family structure, in which women are largely responsible for early child care and for later female socialisation. During early socialising period both boys and girls lean mothers’ general personality, behaviour traits, values and attitudes, boys however, shift to learn masculine role identity. For girls the personal identification with mothers, which was created in early infancy, can persist into the process of learning female role identity. For both men and women personality can be generated by social-structural arrangements (Chodorow 1974).

Ortner argues that women’s subordination may attribute to the cultural view which sees those women’s social role and psyche are less transcend ‘nature’ than more cultural process in which men are involving. Therefore, complying the pattern of sex-role results in sustenance of women’s subordination.
Welfare approach
Buvinic summarised such policy approach towards women and given a name as the welfare approach (Buvinic 1983 cited in Moser 1989: 1807). The welfare approach is grounded on the modernisation theory and the sex-role theory. The welfare approach sees itself as family-centred in orientation, which focuses on women in terms of their reproductive roles, while the production oriented assistance is geared to men. The implementation practice of welfare approach is through "top-down" handouts of free goods and services or training skills considered appropriate for housewives and mothers. Those are such as food aid, nutritional education, contraceptive knowledge and technology (Moser 1989: 1809), handicraft production, knitting, sewing. These small, women's programmes in female domains are still widely used today because it can be "easily attached to ongoing development projects without challenging existing gender relations and patriarchal structures in society" (Braidotti et al 1994: 78). The assumptions which underpinned the welfare approach are that women are passive recipients of development rather than active participants, that motherhood is the most important role for women in society, and child rearing is the most effective role for women in all aspects of economic development.

Women in Development
The first account for women and development process, WID was advocated by liberal feminists. Liberal feminists focus on public sphere and seek legal changes for example to educate women, to enfranchise them with political rights and to create equal entitlements and fields on which to compete for opportunities and resources. However, liberal feminists’ argument tend to neglect a central factor of gender injustice, reproductive work.

Emergence of WID
The term “Women in Development” came into use in the early 1970s, which was first used by the women’s committee of the Washington, DC (Rathgeber 1990: 490). The
concern for women in development emerged from Western women’s expanding their interest in women’s equal opportunity to the Third World context.

Advocates of Women in Development are founded on two different institutes for women, the UN Commission on the Status of Women and the US women’s movement (Tinker 1990: 28). They were primarily interested in equality before the law, the greater access of women to education and the right to equal employment opportunities, initially within their organisations. The First Development Decade 1961-70 declaration did not mention women specifically, but in 1962 the UN women’s commission was assigned to prepare a report on the role of women in social and economic development. “At that time most governments and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) consulted assumed that economic and social development would bring about any desired changes for women” (Tinker 1990: 29). Members of the commissions rather concentrate on its primary goal of women’s equal rights, emphasising “the human element in development”, and required “greater investment in women as human resources” (Tinker 1990: 29). International Development Strategy for the Second Development Decade, declared in 1970, the importance of encouraging “full integration of women in the total development effort” (Tinker 1990: 28).

Also in 1972, the federation of organisations for Professional Women was formed in Washington, D.C., seeking equality in their working environment. More women’s caucuses were formed to be encouraged by these activities. Women in Development is one of the many caucuses, set up by Society for International Development (SID/WID) (Tinker 1990: 30). SID/WID was formed to address women’s professional interests including enhancing women’s employment opportunities in development agencies, and their substantive interests of giving visibility to a phenomenon: “development seemed to be having an adverse impact on women” (Tinker 1990: 30). The advocates from SID/WID were interested in the data which primarily dealt with poor women, instead elite privileged women in developing countries and also, with the growing phenomenon of women-headed households (Tinker 1990: 30). Boserup’s Woman’s Role in Economic Development was “discovered” in the process of SID/WID’s production of a bibliography
in 1974 (Tinker 1990: 30). The SID/WID group, which sought to influence and work within the development community at both the national and international levels, utilised scholarly materials "to bolster policy arguments", that is a significant aspect of the WID's effort (Tinker 1990: 30).

The WID movement in U.S. succeeded to integrate WID policy in to their official development agency. The persuasive testimony of SID/WID moved State Department members to promote an amendment to the U.S. Foreign assistance Act of 1973. It required the U.S. Agency for International Development to administer its programmes "so as to give particular attention to those programs, projects, and activities which tend to integrate women into the national economies of foreign countries, thus improving their status and assisting the total development effort" (Tinker 1990: 30).

In this way concern towards women in development process was firstly advocated by professional women in the West, who made scope for such concern in development policies. However, this top-down manner of changing legislation and practice of development institutes would face its limit to provide firm foundation for execution of this will be pointed out later in this chapter.

**Empirical studies**

Since 1970s feminists started criticising the past practices and some of assumptions of development. In 1970, Boserup (1970) used gender as a variable in her analysis of development. She was the first to bring people's attention to different impact of development on women and men. Beneria and Sen (1986) summarised Bosrup's study. Firstly, women's works are various across countries and regions therefore could not be generalised, in spite of reproductive roles are commonly assigned to women. Also, gender was identified as "a basic factor in the division of labour" (Beneria and Sen 1986: 141). Secondly, development practitioners' western bias contributes to classify cultivation as a men's work, therefore, modern technologies and cash crops were introduced to only men. Women were "relegated to the subsistence sector of food production" with traditional methods. Even women had to provide their labour forces to
cash crop production with no remuneration. Women were marginalised because their work increased yet they had, less power and received less from development than men (Beneria and Sen 1986: 142). Thirdly, women's subsistence activities were under-reported and underestimated, that prevented "proper understanding of women's participation in economic life" (Beneria and Sen 1986: 143). Also, Boserup (1970) claims that traditionally women's status is determined by their participation in production; women significantly involved in production enjoy freedom of movement and some economic independence (Boserup 1970: 50 cited in Kabeer 1994a: 20). This study documented the need to differentiate the experiences of men and women in the process of the Third World development, and of necessity to pay attention to the gender division of labour.

Boserup and others have been taken up as empirical evidences to inform WID advocates who have tried to lead policy makers attention to women’s equal rights. Since the 1970s a number of studies were done on women in the Third World countries, which revealed development programmes often had negative effects not only on women but also on the whole community (Karl 1995: 94). The reason for the high rate of failure of development policies, programmes and projects appears attributable at least in part to the lack of knowledge of women’s productive and reproductive roles (Karl 1995: 94). The studies found that the improvement of the relative position of women to men diminished only slightly during 1950s and 1960s, and in some sectors the position of women declined in the Third World (Rathgeber 1990: 491). The jobs in which women engaged in the formal industrial sector were the “lowest-paying, most monotonous, and sometimes health impairing” ones (Rathgeber 1990: 491). The rate of enrolment to schools particularly secondly and tertiary education remained low for females (Rathgeber 1990: 491).

Since 1970s, feminists highlighted Third World women’s differential roles from men, and also the reality women were discriminated in many aspects of their lives. With this recognition the feminists advocated that unless development efforts address women’s needs and secure women’s equal rights, the efforts would not be successful.
Perspective of WID

The WID perspective was derived from scepticism toward the assumed neutrality of modernisation and development interventions. Kabeer (1994a) notes that:

...[c]ontrary to early expectations, women had not been given access to new productive opportunities; technology had not liberated them from domestic drudgery; and market forces had not led to gender-neutral outcomes. Prejudice and preconceptions about women persisted in society in spite of the forces of modernization (Kabeer 1994a: 19).

From the WID perspective, the cause of women's problems in development was that women had been seen as passive beneficiaries of development who were only responsible for domestic work. Women's role in economy had rarely been considered separately from men. Also, from the WID perspective the male experience in socially and economically changing societies was considered generalisable to females (Rathgeber 1990: 491). Women had not be consulted separately. Furthermore, according to liberal feminism, women's unequal status and social position are attributed to women's exclusion from the public sphere, which is the result of the sexual division of labour and women's biological role (Young 1993: 129).

**WID Critique of Sex-role Theory**

Sex-role theory was criticised firstly by feminist then WID scholars. Feminists claimed that sex roles could no longer be seen as complementary division of labour rather as an women's lower status in society. It was sex role socialisation that lessened women’s potential, framing their attitudes, preferences and expectations. It compelled their conformity to the domestic role, one which impose passivity, obedience and dependence while investing men with the ambition, achievement and financial rewards associated with the roles in labour market (Kabeer 1994a: 24). To this critique, WID scholars added their own perspectives with respect to development interventions. They pointed out the negative influence of sex-role theory in blinding policy makers' acknowledgement of
women's productive labour. The diversity of the gender division of labour across the world was shown by empirical evidences, which was used by WID scholars to challenge the idea of male breadwinner/female dependent model of household and derived assumption of division of labour is naturally given. Then people's explanation in division of labour was shifted from biological determinism to cultural one (Kabeer 1994a: 24).

**Equity approach**

Benefits from development generated in the modern sector and cash economy, were presumed to be distributed through the market. Hence, the WID approach seeks to integrate women into the process of economic modernisation, especially the formal sectors (Bandarage 1984: 498). Although a reassessment of the family and societal roles assigned to different sexes was called for, but more superficial strategy was chosen (Kabeer 1994a: 7). Also, the alleviation of work burdens through provision of appropriate technologies, improvement of access to modern knowledge and to other resources such as credit programmes, agricultural extension or other training were adopted as solutions (Young 1993: 130, Rathgeber 1990: 491). Women's access to resources and socially organised services were expected to build women's capacity to contribute more fully and effectively to economic production (Antrobus 1991: 312). WID advocates for women to receive more of the benefits of development (Antrobus 1991: 312). The World Plan of Action that emerged out of the 1975 International Women's Conference is an example of the equity approach.

The equity approach started as a feminist movement in the West and consequently, concerns all women, rather than only the poor women. The approach is interested in changes in gender relations and the gender division of labour, as well as meeting women's needs from their current responsibilities. The equity approach argues for the redistribution of resources and power at all levels from equality within aid agencies to the Third World development sites. The redistribution perspective induced resistance from male dominated development agencies (Kabeer 1994a: 7). Also, the aid agencies resisted the equity approach because they were reluctant to intervene in cultures and traditions of the Third World countries, which they thought may be disrupted by the equity
programmes (Moser 1993: 65). The Third World governments also resisted, they claimed that the western feminism is irrelevant in the Third World context (Moser 1993: 65).

**Anti-poverty approach**

In early 1970s, there was a growing recognition among development thinking that liberal economic strategies with the expectation of the ‘trickle down’ of benefits to households at the bottom of income hierarchy, failed in its objectives. During the UN First Decade of Development, while many Third World countries experienced economic growth rates of over 5 per cent, they failed to redistribute income and to solve poverty and unemployment. The declaration of the UN Development Strategy for the Second Decade in 1970 concluded that “the ultimate objective of development must be to bring about sustained improvement in the well being of the individual and bestow benefits on all. If undue privileges, extremes of wealth and social injustice persists, then development fails in its essential purposes” (cited in Kabeer 1994a: 3). The growing consideration towards poverty encouraged development agencies’ addressing needs of the poorest population. In the case of the World Bank’s strategy, its purpose was to meet basic needs: food, clothing, shelter and fuel, and social needs such as education, human rights and ‘participation’ in social life through employment and political involvement (Moser 1993: 67). Poor women were seen as a target group for interventions. Women gained attention because development agencies recognised the exclusion of women from development plans was accountable to the failure of benefiting to the poor in the past, also, the agencies became to perceive women as traditionally important to meet basic needs of their families (Buvinic 1982 in Moser 1993: 67). Third World women became the focus of development agencies that were interested in women’s potential to facilitate other development objectives (Jackson 1996: 490).

Given the importance of increasing women’s productivity to alleviate poverty and to promote balanced economic growth, development efforts focused mainly on women’s productive role. The origins of women’s poverty and inequality with men are assumed to be their lack of access to private ownership of land and capital, and to sexual discrimination in the labour market. Moser calls this approach towards poor women the
'anti-poverty' approach. Income-generating project prevailing in 1970s tended to remain small in scale and focused on an increase of productivity in women's traditional activities rather than introducing new areas of income-generating opportunities to women. Rural-based production projects were preferred as opposed to those in service and distribution sectors, which are far more widespread in the urban areas of many developing countries (Moser 1993: 68).

Buvinic (1986) identified the problems derived from projects implemented by women's organisations, which were common types of projects emerging at that time. The weakness of income-generation projects are observed in the substance of the projects. 'Women only projects' were an example of the earliest response of most donor agencies to WID. Women's organisation or church groups were often chosen to implement such programmes. Given lack of experiences in creating viable income activities for the poor and in running their own organisations on a business basis, these organisations' programmes tended to engage in activities within women's stereotypic domestic roles. These programmes made incorrect assumptions about poor women's needs, daily activities, or skills. Their assumption was that women were predominantly housewives with abundant free time who only needed a little money to supplement household expenditure. Moreover, women only projects often intended to utilise skills which women already possessed, since they were largely remained within the female sphere such as making baskets or tablecloth, baking crackers, the projects did not challenge inequality between women and men. Furthermore, the insufficient analysis of available markets contributed to failure of such small-income projects. The projects relied on women's voluntary effort to market their products (Tinker 1990: 38).

The income-generation projects also had problems in implementation procedures and limitations in a nature of such projects. 'Anti-poverty' projects rarely asked women to participate in the planning stage of projects, hence projects had a top-down intervention. Moser (1993) suggest this is because the procedures to ensure involvement of women's organisations were undeveloped (Moser 1993: 68). Moser (1993) summarises the limitations of anti-poverty projects and constraints on opportunities to women's
increasing income. In spite of the prevailing recognition of “the limitations of the informal sector to generate employment and growth in an independent or evolutionary manner, income-generation projects for women continue to be designed as though small-scale enterprises have the capacity for autonomous growth” (Moser 1993: 69).

Moser (1993) points out the constraints women face due to the gender division of labour and resultant responsibilities. But the approach tends to reinforce the perception of separating reproduction from production sphere of a life. Also, there are the problems associated with ‘balancing’ productive work alongside domestic and childcare responsibilities. There are cultural constraints on women’s mobility restricting women’s competition with men in similar enterprises. Where men control household financial resources, women are unable to save unless special facilities where women can safely keep their money are provided (Sebsted 1982 in Moser 1993: 69) Also, there is a lack of credit and a tendency to perceive women’s income generation as less important than men’s and as a supplementary income resource for households (Moser 1993: 69).

Moser (1993) concludes that anti-poverty income-generating projects may provide employment for women, and thereby meet their immediate material needs, by augmenting their income, but unless employment leads to greater autonomy it does not meet women’s interests of changing unequal gender relations. Moser continues that:

...... In addition, the predominant focus on the productive role of women in the anti-poverty approach means that their reproductive role is often ignored. Income-generating projects which assume that women have ‘free time’ often only succeed by extending their working day and increasing their triple burden. Unless and income generating project also alleviates the burden of women’s domestic labour and child care - for instance, through the provision of adequate socialized child caring - it may fail even to meet practical gender need to earn an income (Moser 1993: 69).
Efficiency approach
At a time when women were associated with the welfare sector, efficiency-based arguments were used by WID practitioners within aid agencies to bring about efforts of redressing women's issues from the margin to mainstream of development planning. Maguire (1984) points out that “a specific economic recognition of the fact that 50% of the human resources available for development were being wasted or under-utilized” is underlying the efficiency argument (Maguire cited in Moser 1993: 70). Although, the perception on women as economic agents can already be seen in Boserup’s work in the 1970s, in the 1980, the focus of argument shifted from the ‘adverse impact of development on women’ to as Rogers (1980) stressed ‘the adverse impact of women’s exclusion on development’ (Kabeer 1994a: 25). Women’s involvement was perceived as necessary for development. Moser (1993) suggests underlying this shift of focus away from women to development, there is an assumption that “increased economic participation for Third World women is automatically linked with increased equity” (Moser 1993: 70).

The efficiency approach regards the key issue underlying women in development as an economic one and the theme of women as agents is emphasised in the efficiency argument. This argument brought a major rationale for gender awareness in the planning process; women would be rational agents, responsive to incentives and had been ill-served by past assumptions of passive dependency. The chance of project success would be maximised when project planners are sensitised about women’s roles and utilise their labour.

The efficiency argument was aimed to bring the WID efforts to mainstream of the development operation, given the marginalised position of the WID projects during the anti-poverty phase. However, the efficiency approach have been receiving criticisms.

The efficiency approach was translated into practice which based on neo-liberal economic theory, which worked against some of the objectives of WID advocated. The efficiency approach attracted international aid agencies and national governments, in the
context of deteriorating world economy and adoption of Structural Adjustment Policy (SAP) by the many of Third World governments, because with the approach development agencies could claim their attention towards women in development. When the public expenditure was cut largely as a part of SAP programmes, the responsibility for welfare services was shifted from the paid to the unpaid economic sectors, often through women's unremunerated labour. This disproportionate participation in development was seen to make development more efficient and effective, and at the same time this participation and equity were seen as the same thing (Braidotti et al 1994: 81).

Moreover, the disadvantages against women to enter production were neglected. The efficiency approach within the neo-liberal market economy underscored 'gender trap' for women. If the allocation of resources primarily depend on mechanisms of the market, for women who generally have less purchasing power, the services they need to reduce their domestic burden is not purchasable. On the other hand, if they are unable to purchase these labour-replacing services then they will be unable to pursue the range of activities that would help them to increase their purchasing power (Kabeer 1994a: 26-7). Also, lack of education and use of under-productive technologies have been recognised as the predominant constraints affecting women's participation (Moser 1993: 70).

Critique of WID
Although WID criticised women's disadvantages in modernisation, they sought solutions within liberalism. "It was not the mainstream model of modernization that was under attack, but the fact that women had not benefited from it. It was not the market solution per se that had failed women, but planners - and sometimes women themselves - whose irrational prejudices and misplaced assumptions led to discriminatory outcomes" (Kabeer 1994a: 20). What was sought here was a way to ensure modernisation benefited women.

Women and Development
Neo-Marxist feminists presented a concept of Women and Development or WAD drawing on dependency theory in the second half of 1970s. The WAD perspective offers a critical perspective on the relationship between women and development processes,
precisely expansion of capitalist economy, WAD focuses more on the inequalities between industrialised market oriented countries and the Third World countries within the development process, and on the nature of development itself; the inequalities and the nature of development are seen as the primary determinants of women's poverty, marginalisation and inequality. Such a view was also suggested by the feminist in the South. Third World women's network DAWN (Development Alternatives with Women for New Era) is one of the first groups who advocated a re-examination of the dominant development model into which third world women have become integrated (Young 1993: 133).

Men and women are involved in production and reproduction differently (Overton 1995: 35). The services such as reproducing the products for use, labour power on a daily and a generational basis, are carried out within family, mainly by women. WAD points out that women have always been active agents of economy in their society and that their work in terms of both production and reproduction is central to the maintenance of those societies. But this integration, primarily serves to sustain existing international structures of inequality (Rathgeber 1990: 492-3). Reproductive work is unremunerated, hence is not recognised. This characteristics of reproductive work is critical to capitalism. Even though maintenance of labour power is inevitable to capital accumulation, these services are provided through private relationships located outside of capital. WAD perspective argues that capitalists exploit this arrangement which characterised by their voluntaristic nature and the absence of any explicit contracts regulating the distribution of domestic duties, the working time devoted to each of them, or the remuneration of these services.

WAD also pays attention to the gender division of labour, not only on the micro level of reproductive work versus productive wage employment, but also at the 'new international division of labour' level (Overton 1995: 35). The latter involves the process of relocation of western capital to Third World countries, seeking cheap labour. When some countries are industrialising, women are seen as cheap and docile labour. Women engaged in production can involve only in unskilled menial employment and capitalism exploits this class severely providing cheap wages and very poor conditions (Overton 1995: 35).
Therefore, capitalist development worsens women’s position, relying more on their reproductive work but taking advantage of their productive labour with little reward (Overton 1995: 35). Neo-Marxist feminists perceive class as creating gender inequality. From WAD perspective, an unequal international economic system, capitalism and class exploit women and create gender inequalities, then WAD assumes that only capitalists are getting benefit from unequal gender relationships. Although WAD feminists recognised “the ideological subordination of women within private sphere, they were reluctant to acknowledge the material extent to which it benefited men, both as a social category and as individuals (Kabeer 1994a: 49). The social relations of gender within the same class, patriarchy, were given only little attention (Rathgeber 1990: 493). WAD failed to take account the relationship between patriarchy, differing modes of production, and women’s subordination and oppression as a whole (Rathgeber 1990: 493).

In sum, WAD came to seek improvement of women’s position in a more equitable system of production. WAD suggested that there can be no real development, economic or otherwise, unless and until there is a more equal international economic system (Young 1993: 134). In the meantime, however, the under-representation of women in economic, political and social spheres can be solved by carefully designed intervention strategies rather than by more fundamental shift in the social relations of gender (Rathgeber 1990: 493). However, addressing needs and interests within the reproductive sphere was not a concern of WAD perspective.

**Gender and Development**

As an alternative to the earlier WID, WAD and some socialist account of globalisation of patriarchy, gender and development, or GAD emerged in 1980s GAD draws on a socialist feminist perspective (Rathgeber 1990: 493). It identifies the limitation of focusing on women isolated from men (Moser 1989: 1800) since such a perspective precludes men’s contribution to women’s subordination in the development process (Kabeer 1994a: 54). GAD then takes gender as its analytical category. The basic
problematic is regarded not as women's integration into development, or their invisibility, or their lack of training, education, credit, self-esteem, but as the structures and processes that gives rise to women's disadvantage (Young 1993: 134). Although the operation of social structures and women's subordination are its components of analysis, GAD does not overly generalise the effect of capitalism and patriarchy to women's situation like neo-Marxist does. GAD is a less monolithic framework. (Kabeer 1994a: 54).

The relation between women and men is one of the power relationships in society, consisting of male dominance and female subordination. Then, rather than analysing adverse impact of development/capitalism on women, GAD seeks to understand “the ways in which unequal relations between women and men may have contributed to the extent and forms of exclusion that women face in the development process (Kabeer 1994a: 54).

The significant analytical scope of GAD is that GAD sees both the relations of production and relation of reproduction and puts entire women's lives in its scope. In other words GAD proponents do not focus singularly on productive or reproductive aspects of women's and men's lives excluding each other (Rathgeber 1990: 494). Furthermore, GAD recognises that women and men experience inequality through other social relations as well as gender. While gender is always a critical determinant, it never appears in a pure form. Gender is always interwoven with other social inequalities, such as race, class and ethnicity.

GAD seeks a fundamental re-examination of social structures and institutions and, ultimately, to the loss of power of the entrenched elite, that will affect some women as well as men (Rathgeber 1990: 167). Also, GAD intend to extend its analysis to men and involve them as change agents.
Gender relations

The primary sites in which gender is likely to be a decisive operator are family and kinship (Young 1993: 138). Family and kinship relations are systems for organising rights, responsibilities and resources for different categories of members in different social groups. “Familial relationships are a primary mechanism through which social meanings are invested in, and social controls exercised over, women’s bodies, labour, sexuality, reproductive capacity and life choices” (Kabeer 1994a: 58). In the domestic sphere, the positions, such as husband, wife, father, mother are ascribed to either men or women. Then, for each set of the relations such as, husband : wife, father : daughter, and so forth, there are “a socially sanctioned pattern of appropriate behaviour” (Young 1993: 138), that is often deference, subordination, submission, out other forms of social striking of difference if not inferiority. While outside of domestic sphere, in the community or wider society, characteristics of relations are not ascriptive but when they involve male and female, they tend to replicate the order, that is, male domination (Young 1993: 138).

Gender ideology

The salient feature of the gender approach is that is concerned with the processes by which biological differences become socially constructed as gender differences and gender identity. This concern encourages us to challenge the notion that women and men are somehow naturally suited to certain tasks and activities.

The pervasive stereotypical view on what women and men do and how they should be, admits that men and women differ fundamentally. Men are superior to women both physically intellectually or at least men and women think differently and are naturally drawn to different forms of intellectual and other activity. It is assumed that physical difference influences mental traits, which sequentially influence aptitudes and predisposition; that such differences are natural and unproblematic (Young 1993: 137). This perspective provides a justification for existing relationships between women and men, which is inevitable and derived from a biological mode of human nature (Young 1993: 137). However, Rubin (1975) points out that although women and men are likely to
be seen as mutually exclusive categories, the male and female of the human species are biologically similar in most ways (Rubin 1975: 178 cited in Kabeer 1994a: 55). Therefore, ideologies representing gender differences as natural or indeed divinely ordained involve to sustain unequal gender relations (Young 1993: 137).

The gender approach perceives that gender difference is not absolute, abstract, or irreducible. The social arrangement of gender determines the different ways women and men experience the world. In the gender approach, attainment of masculinity and femininity by men and women is not a simple process, and involves both psychological events and socialisation. Then gender relations are further constructed through the social rules and practices. Young (1993) notes that:

'It involves both acquiring an identity (social and sexual) and learning a set of differentiated behaviours and capacities appropriate to the masculine or the feminine. Acquisition of gender identity is not in most societies left to the 'invisible psychic hand' but is constantly reinforced and refined by a wide range of other social practices (Young 1993: 137).

Gender Division of Labour

Gender division of labour is about allocation of particular tasks to particular people. “It becomes a social structure to the extent that this allocation poses a constraint on further practice” (Connell 1987 cited in Kabeer 1994a: 59). From the GAD perspective although the gender division of labour appears to be a form of social separation, allocating men and women to different tasks, it is actually a form of 'social connection' (Young 1993: 140). The one feature of gender division of labour is that by undertaking different activities and producing different goods and services, men and women dependent upon each other but not without conflict, hidden or obvious (Young 1993: 140).

Second feature of gender division of labour is also pointed out by WID, that roles are not merely allocated, but values become embodied in the tasks and in who does them. Some tasks are given high social recognition, others are not, and those who do them are also
valued differently. Men and tasks they perform have a cultural value which is typically more highly esteemed than women and the work they do (Young 1993: 141). Also, the routine assignment of women and men to specific tasks becomes intimately related to what it means to be a ‘man’ or a ‘woman’ in specific contexts (Whitehead 1991 cited in Kabeer 1994a: 59). Gender division of labour is a critical factor maintaining and/or recreating gender inequality. Therefore, by changing the division of labour, gender inequality would be undermined, and men and women’s full potential for the development effort would be released (Young 1993: 141).

In conclusion, women’s development is hardly achieved unless development efforts address unequal gender relationships as a central issue. Unequal gender relations are sustained in and reinforced by both people’s thoughts and social practices. The efforts for transforming gender relations must be directed at both the ideologies and social practices. Women’s issues and development efforts towards women’s development have been marginalised from mainstream development agenda and operation because of women’s subordination. The sound conceptualisation of women and development is necessary to bring about credible strategies which are capable to challenge unequal gender relations.
Chapter 3: strategies for women’s empowerment

This chapter suggests a comprehensive approach for women’s development. In this chapter, it is recognised that women becoming agents of development must be on the premise of their representing and being agents of themselves. Thus an approach for women’s development should start with examination of construction of women’s disadvantages and subordination. Then the strategies must address the root cause of problems. This chapter also identifies complementary aspects of different policy approaches and strategies. It also provides a framework to examine development projects/programmes with respect to their implications of challenging unequal gender relations.

Women’s condition

The word condition in this research refers to states of material and infrastructural availability in which people live. Satisfaction of immediate material needs and basic needs are considered. It is also recognised that women’s condition is influenced by their status. This involves needs which are common world-wide and which are specific in each context.

There are many reports on women’s living conditions which suggest an improvement in women living in the Third World. The needs of women that are predominantly focused on and claim development assistance, are education and health services. They are the minimum requirements for people to maintain some extent of well-being and to help themselves get out of poverty. Women’s better education and health conditions are also expected to have a positive impact on a wide range of people and sectors including their families, communities, and nations, as well as women themselves.

Women’s conditions are also determined by whether and how easily they can find fulfilment of their needs derived from roles and responsibilities assigned to women in daily life. Women often face constraints to fulfil them. The kind of needs that emerge out
of women's daily roles and responsibilities are often called 'practical needs'. In this section we will observe areas of intervention which imply significant contribution to an improvement in women's conditions in the Third World. And also, how such needs are addressed by development agencies is suggested, in terms of types of projects.

**Education**

*Positive effects*

Education is a key determinant of a person's well-being. Education provides opportunities for people to tackle their poverty more effectively. Most subsequent training is only open for those who received basic education. Without basic education, economic opportunities are limited to the informal sector only. Literacy helps women to express their needs, interests, concerns in development projects (Ballara 1992: 42) and in their lives in general. Also, a study shows that educated women are more likely to use the provided information and services, such as health, nutrition, maternal care, and child-care (Gannicott and Avalos 1994).

Education is considered one of the most important means to develop women's capabilities with the knowledge, skills and self-confidence necessary to conduct their own lives and their well-being. “Educated women marry later, want fewer children, are more likely to use effective methods of contraception, and have greater means to improve their economic livelihood” (UN 1995: xix).

Where reproduction is concerned, educated women are at an advantage. They are more able to control their lives and fertility. The average marriage age of women with 7 or more years of education is 3 to 5 years older than women with no education. Also, higher levels of education enhance the prevention of unwanted conceptions (Rosenzwing and Schults 1985). Women with only short periods (or low levels) of education have higher fertility rates than women with extended education.

---

1 In Molyneux's (1985) concept, it is referred as 'practical interests'. Moser (1989) and also Young (1993) conceptualise it as 'practical needs'.
Current status of women’s education

With recent promotion of universal primary education and special efforts to increase educational opportunities for girls, world-wide illiteracy rates for women have been steadily declining. This trend is most clearly illustrated by the significantly lower illiteracy rates among young women (Seager 1997: 85). Literacy rates for women have reached at least 75% in most countries of Latin America and the Caribbean, and Eastern and South Eastern Asia (UN 1995: xix). But illiteracy prevails among an estimated 965 million people; a quarter of the world’s adult population, and about two thirds of them are women (Seager 1997: 120).

High rates of illiteracy among women prevail in northern and sub-Saharan Africa and in Southern Asia and in a few countries in western Asia, Oceania and Latin America and the Caribbean (UN 1995: xix). In 19 countries from those regions, the illiteracy rate for women exceeded 75% as of 1990. In such countries, both men’s and women’s illiteracy rates are more or less equally high. However, women’s illiteracy rates are almost always higher than men’s. In many cases the differences are significant. In countries such as Morocco, those in sub-Saharan Africa, Southern and Western Asia, the illiteracy rate among young women aged 15-24 is at least 25 percentage points higher than among young men (UN 1995: 89).

As a result of having no or very limited educational opportunities for women a decade or more ago, illiteracy rates among women over 25 years of age are typically twice or more than those of young women aged 15-24. Not only is there an age disparity among women’s education but there are also differences between rural and urban areas within a country. Everywhere, illiteracy rates are higher both for men and women in rural areas. Women in rural areas are particularly disadvantaged in attaining literacy. Recent data which is available from a few countries, shows that the illiteracy rate for young women in rural areas is two to three times that of women in urban area (UN 1995: 91).
Where literacy rates have reached 50%, higher level educational achievement and attainment is measured by primary-secondary school enrolment ratios. Primary-secondary school ratio the total number of enrollees at both primary and secondary levels compared to the total population in the relevant age group. This ratio shows improvements in overall school enrolments. Almost everywhere girl's enrolment rates have increased faster than boy's, and the ratio is now almost equal for girls and boys in Latin America and the Caribbean and is approaching near equality in Eastern, South-Eastern and Western Asia (UN 1995: 91).

The generally positive trend in the enrolment ratios reversed in 1980s for both girls and boys, particularly in countries experiencing problems of war, economic adjustment and declining international assistance. The rates of growth of primary and secondary enrolments sharply reduced in many other countries, although they were not absolute declines (UN 1995: 92). Education appears not to be given a high priority among social policies at the time of economic crisis.

The ratio of girls to boys in secondary enrolment was nearly equal for many countries in 1990, with the exception of Latin America and the Caribbean, where girls were still less likely to receive education than boys, and were removed from school at an earlier age. The biggest gaps between girls and boys enrolment is observed in sub-Saharan Africa (where remarks 68 girls per 100 boys) and in southern Asia (where remarks 60 girls per 100 boys) (UN 1995: 92).

**Determinants of girls schooling**

There are various reasons that girls are more likely to be kept out of schools than boys. Son preference is commonly observed, since they assure contribution to the family, and would be a source of income and financial security for the parents in their old age. But the birth of a girl is more likely seen as a financial burden. For example, a custom of early marriage discourages parents from educating their daughters, who go into the husbands' household and villages and do not bring material benefit to the parents of girls (Gannicott and Avalos 1994). Comparing the cost for schooling and recoups, many
parents identify educating daughters as unjustifiable (King and Hill 1993), and prefer investing their limited resources in their sons’ education with a view to parental support in old age. Moreover, girls are withdrawn from schools earlier, as they are needed for household or agricultural labour. A labour force input from daughters is critical for poor households.

The other reasons parents give are, for example, “fear of too much freedom, lack of a birth certificate, which is often required for school attendance”, “better job prospects and wage rates for men, traditional stereotypes of women’s roles and customary patrilineal inheritance systems” (UN 1995: 89, 91). There are also numerous other reasons including lack of transport in societies and purdah.

**Health**

Many women in the Third World are in poor health. To improve their health requires approaches from multiple sectors such as education, employment, social services, such as water/sanitation, as well as health care services.


However, in many Third World countries life expectancy is far below 70 years for both women and men. It is generally low in sub-Saharan Africa, and twenty countries in sub-Saharan Africa and Asia still have life expectancies for women and men below 50 years (UN 1995: 68, 84-88).

Infant mortality has declined over the past two decades mainly because of increasing control of the major childhood and communicable diseases and the widespread improvement in health services (UN 1995: 67). In developed regions the average infant mortality is as low as 10 deaths per 1000 live births, a few counties marked 5-6 in 1995.
In developing regions infant mortality is still high, although it has declined. Among the highest in the world, sub-Saharan Africa averages 95 deaths per 1000 live births, and in Southern Asia 89, in Northern Africa 60, in South-Eastern Asia 58.

**Indication of women’s disadvantage**

There are some figures which indicate that Third World women are facing particular disadvantages than their First World counterparts. It is a world-wide norm that women live longer than men. In the developed countries and in central Asia, female life expectancy at birth is 6 to 8 years more than males. However, in most Third World countries the differences are smaller. Women just live longer than men by 3 years in Africa and have the same life expectancy as men in southern Asia. In other Third World countries the differences are 4 to 5 years in favour of women (UN 1995: 65-66, 84-88).

**Girls disadvantage shown in mortality rate**

In the First World countries, girls have a significant advantage over boys during the first year of life. The average ratio of female to male infant death is about 0.8. In most Third World counties where data is available, girls have a similar advantage. One of the exceptions is China, with a 1.2 to 1 disadvantage for girls. Also, data is not available for many countries including those where son preferences are strong. In terms of child mortality (ages 1-4), in developed regions it is lower for girls than boys; about 8 female compared to 10 male deaths in the age group, with a ratio of 0.8. However, girl children in the Third World are facing disadvantages of survival., 17 out of 38 countries where data is available, there are more female than male deaths. High ratios are reported, for example, in Egypt (1.4), Pakistan (1.6) (UN 1995: 67).

A reason for girls’ disadvantage, contrary to natural tendency, is attributed to son preference. Parents see daughters as a burden and not beneficial, since they marry into their husbands household and they cannot work for their own parents and in cultures with the custom of a dowry, a daughters’ marriage is costly. Parents prefer to allocate resources to their sons and to care for them. Parents wean daughters earlier, feed them less or give less nutritious food and are less likely to take them to doctors when they are
sick than their male siblings (Nowak and Scheyvens 1998: 35, Seager 1997: 109). Thus, “the biological advantage of girls has been cancelled out by their social disadvantage” (Ostergaard 1992: 121), then girls hardly survive. The most extreme forms of son preference are demonstrated by the abandonment of a baby girl, female infanticide and sex-selective abortions. A new-born female’s life is terminated in the following ways: by “providing female infants the bare minimum for their survival, or by not providing them with any sustenance at all so they will slowly die; or by ending the baby’s life by such techniques as suffocating them, burying them alive or drowning them” (Nowak and Scheyvens 1998: 35-6). A female foetus may be killed. A foetus is terminated when a couple come to know it is a female with modern technology. Lives of females are jeopardised by gender based discrimination.

Reproductive health

Women’s risk of death and disease increase at the time of child-birth. About 600,000 women die each year during pregnancy and child-birth (Seager 1994: 113). Prenatal care has been integrated into primary health care for the past two decades. About 90% of women in Eastern Asia and the Caribbean are covered while only about 70% in Latin America. But in Southern Asia, the figures are as low as 35% making it the region with the highest maternal mortality rate (UN 1995: 77). The high rate of maternal mortality is partly attributed to the environments where women deliver; in the Third World only 55% of births take place with a trained attendant, in southern Asia it is 31%; and only 37% in hospitals or clinics (UN 1995: 77).

Maternal mortality is highest in sub-Saharan Africa. It marks about 700 maternal deaths per 100,000 live births in 1988, and women’s lifetime risk of dying from pregnancy-related causes is estimated at 1 in 23. The maternal mortality ratio is 570 in southern Asia, where 1 in 35 women die of pregnancy complications (UN 1995: 77).

The major direct causes of maternal death are haemorrhage, infection, eclampsia and preeclampsia, obstructed labour, illegal abortion and ectopic pregnancy. Haemorrhage is difficult to predict and unless the bleeding is stopped immediately it can kill a woman.
Adequate skills and ready access to medical facilities which provide transfusions and surgery are required. Infection after child delivery or poorly performed or illegal abortion accounts for about 15% of maternal deaths. Obstructed labour may be because of stunted growth a women experienced in childhood, which prevented their pelvises developing or women become pregnant too young, before pelvic growth is complete. Obstructed labour is also one of the main complications of female circumcision. The poor practice of abortion causes deaths of women. Even where abortion is legal, women may seek unqualified practitioners, when women cannot afford the fees charged by a clinic. Other health conditions aggravated during pregnancy are: malaria, anaemia, heart diseases, hypertension, diabetes mellitus and viral hepatitis (Nowak and Scheyvens 1998: 20-2, UN 1995: 78-9).

Women’s reproductive health is largely determined by women’s status. Women’s poor maternal health is deeply related to their experience since childhood. As girls they were given lower nutrition, less opportunities of education and burdens earlier than boys. They are unlikely to gain employment to improve their situation. That experience urges women to seek social status by responding to what the society expects of them: getting married and having a lot of children, especially sons (Winikoff 1988 cited in Kabeer 1992b: 26). As for marriage, it is also quite often that Fathers forced their daughters to marry at too young an age in some societies.

Responding to the expectations of husbands and parents-in-laws, and societies, childbirth is often too early in life and too late, or too close together and too many. These situations have severe effects on the not fully developed, undernourished and overworked mother’s body. The society limits women’s access to resources. Some societies put restrictions on women who wish to seek prenatal care with respect to cultural modesty. Then women cannot get appropriate treatment when they want and need it. Such a culture also denies women’s autonomy to access family planning services. Where women have no access to economic resources to ensure medical treatment for themselves, the decision may depend on male heads of households or the elders in a families. Therefore, women’s status need to be raised to improve women’s health.
As it mentioned earlier, education and women’s fertility are related. That means that education has a positive impact on reproductive health. Women with an education are likely to marry later, to use family planning methods and to take care of themselves. Therefore, they do not start their childbearing too young, are likely to control space and number of pregnancies, which may contribute to women’s health (Nowak and Scheyvens 1998: 23).

**Women’s ill health from work**

Women’s heavy workload in various situations from rural agriculture to household to wage labour is another reason for women’s ill health. Overwork increases the health risks of poor Third World women; time-budget studies in some places show that working 15 hours a day, seven days a week all year round is not unusual for poor women. In some places macro-economic policy favouring export-cropping deprived formerly productive small-scale farmers of land, and combined with population pressure the farmers became dependent on cash income to buy food. This in turn has led to a massive male migration, which has left the women alone in rural areas, responsible for the survival of their families (Østergaard 1992: 117).

Increasing use of pesticides jeopardises female farmers’ health. The chemicals are intended to be handled with extreme caution, precautionary measures are usually not adopted in many Third World countries. Spraying pesticides is carried out normally by untrained persons, who are often women, with no safety devices. Moreover, accidents from the use of sub-standard agricultural machinery are also increasingly reported (Østergaard 1992: 117-8). Female agricultural labours are at the risk of contamination and injury.

The poor women often engage in ‘cottage-industry productions’, which are carried out in their home for extremely low piece rates. This kind of work can be health injurious. A piece-work like very fine embroidery is a severe strain on the eyes. Other women’s works such as the rolling of indigenous cigarettes and wood smoke cooking fires may cause
lung diseases (Nowak and Scheyvens 1998: 32, Østergaard 1992: 118). One study in Nepal shows that women spent about five hours for cooking a day. That results in the very significant health risks to many women. For example, abnormally high levels of chronic respiratory diseases, with mortality rates (UN 1995: 49).

Working conditions in factories such as electronics or garments are harmful. Although women are underpaid especially because they are often not able to be unionised. In some cases, governments in the Third World countries waive worker protection rights and declare labour unions illegal both of which might result in increased labour costs. They do this in order to attract multinational corporations to their countries, seeking creation of employment opportunities and generation of capital (Grossman 1978/79: 8 cited in Nowak and Scheyvens 1998: 38). Women in such factories have to conduct repetitive low-skilled labour tasks in dusty, overheated factories, fulfilling extremely high production standards. They work virtually around the clock during periods of peak production. Then, in a case, “female labour is constantly supervised to the extent that extremely brief toilet visits are regulated and controlled; meal breaks are so short that it is virtually impossible to finish eating” (Østergaard 1992: 118). Many women rarely have other means of livelihood, but continuing to work means losing their health in such conditions. This example demonstrates that there are critical women’s issues in a wide range of state policies.

**Violence against women**

Violence against women is the other critical cause of women’s ill health both physically and mentally. Violence against women is any act which cause, or likely to cause physical, sexual and psychological harm or suffering to women. They could occur in the family or in the community and are perpetuate or condoned by the state. For example, there are batterings, sexual abuse of female children, dowry related violence in the family, rape and sexual abuse and harassment in the public sphere and sexual abuse, rape and murder and sexual slavery in situations of conflict by the state. Domestic violence has often not been seen as a problem requiring public intervention to solve. But it is increasingly perceived as a social problem and dealt with publicly. Female infanticide and sex-
selective abortions are the other forms of violence against women. “Cultural acceptance of incest, rape and battering demonstrate women’s low status” (Nowak and Scheyvens 1998: 33-4).

In sum

There are specific women health issues which require attention of development efforts. Women’s health is affected by many factors, including macro-economic policy, social services and the livelihood of poor women. Women are vulnerable for specific reasons, such as their reproductivity.

Social services and infrastructures need to be sufficient in number and able to respond to women’s needs. Women’s ill health partly attributes to their reproductive and various occupational roles. Also, there are factors induced by macro policies such as export orientation and favour of multinational corporations, that implicates micro level realities need to inform macro level policies. Also, promotion of women’s status and empowerment are necessary for women to get out of industrial exploitation and controls over their health and body in close or familial relationships. Discrimination towards girls and women directly jeopardise their lives or leave them physically vulnerable. One of the fundamental solutions for women’s poor health may be sought to their equalise status with men.

Practical needs

In the past, women’s work in production has often been invisible to development practitioners. For example, women in farming households in sub-Saharan Africa do the productive tasks and have responsibilities. Women’s work has often been missed out of development planning because many of Third World women’s tasks do not accord with stereotypical western notion of ‘work’. Work as a family labourer has often not been regarded as real ‘work’ by both the male head of the household and development practitioners (Whitehead and Bloom 1992: 43).
Women's practical needs are derived from women's roles and the responsibilities that are assigned to them. They are needs that fulfill and ease women's tasks. Women have such needs for both their reproductive and productive tasks. For example, women worldwide take major responsibility for maintenance of the household. It is much more time consuming in the Third World. Women may have needs for better water provision and alternative forms of fuels or efficient stoves which require less fuel.

Women in rural areas of the Third World spend major parts of their day in subsistent farming, gathering fuelwoods, cooking and collecting water. The median time spent by women collecting fuelwood is one half hour per day, and is at least several times that in highly deforested areas. The amount of help women receive from men varies depending on regions, but in many societies men help in collecting fuelwood just occasionally (UN 1995: 49). Cooking with biomass: wood, or dung, in poorly ventilated areas means that women are exposed to high levels of indoor pollution which cause health problems.

Water scarcity affects many counties in Africa, Asia and Latin America. Water collection burdens women with the inordinate time involvement (UN 1995: 50), exhaustion and weight. The median time for collecting water in the dry season is 1.6 hours a day, in wet seasons, 0.6 hours. Collecting water from rivers or springs cost more time than from other sources (UN 1995: 50).

Such burdens as collecting fuelwood and water affect parents' decision over their family sizes. In poor rural areas, child labour is essential for the family, and the continuing demand for such work force girls', in the faces of environmental degradation, to keep their fertility high (UN 1995: 50).

Women's practical needs may include, for example, employment or income generating opportunities, housing, access to forests, services such as transport child care facilities and access to informational meetings which are relevant to women's lives. Women's lives and mobility are framed by different factors than men. For instance, women use bus services at different times of the day than men. Also, many activities in a house are
gender specific. Women have certain needs for design of a house. Women’s gender specific needs deserve the attention of development planners.

It should be noted that although there are many needs common among women in the Third world, their practical needs and priority could vary from society to society. Development practitioners should not create a new preconception about women’s needs or list practical needs almost as a priori.

What is required of development planners is to identify a complex set of rights and obligations for the family within which the gender division of labour is situated and any other factors which concern women’s lives, and to look at women’s needs to enable them to complete their tasks, and then address these needs. By doing so development interventions could facilitate women’s conditions.

**WID-specific and WID-integrated projects**

Development initiatives identify two ways to integrate gender awareness into their projects/programmes. One targets women exclusively as participants and beneficiaries and addresses their needs and interest; often called, a WID-specific project. The other one integrates some measures (e.g. gender analysis) in order to ensure women’s participation in and benefit from prevailing, mainstream projects/programmes which are operated in certain sectors or certain regions: often referred to as a WID-integrated project. Many development agencies (e.g. JICA, CIDA, NZODA) adopt both types of programming approaches.

As we saw in Chapter 2, in the past development planning for women tended to concentrate only on special projects dealing with particular spheres of women’s lives which often reflected stereotypic views of the development practitioners. And such, it tends to lock women into the domestic sphere. Moreover, the separated approaches to women, which were often small in scale and budget, and relied on unprofessional planners, resulted in further marginalisation of WID in development agencies. WID-
specific project focus has deterred consideration of gender issues in macro- and sector-policy frameworks and in major programmes.

Bringing gender awareness into mainstream projects/programmes has been advocated widely. Some claims equity and justice in development efforts although, the other makes an efficiency argument. WID- integrated projects are supported for two reasons. “First, women already participate in most sectors, and efforts are needed to facilitate a more effective role for them. Secondly, neglect of women in development co-operation programmes result in a negative impact on women themselves, and on development in general. Efforts to involve women more equitably invariably result therefore in better development co-operation” (Moser 1993: 152).

However, the mainstreaming of women holds a danger of diluting women’s needs and interests in projects/programmes. Where there are interests of many other parties involved in development assistance, advocates of women’s issues lack political strength “There is a very real danger that widespread proliferation of gender, rather than women and development may ironically result in women losing out again” (Moser 1993: 153).

In recent arguments, women-focused special projects are again considered to be needed by many within donor agencies as well as in national governments, in order to facilitate the creation of a women’s voice, autonomy and empowerment (Jahan 1995; 68). CIDA (1995) with its interest in gender equity with respect to equality of results rather than equal treatment of women and men, states it call for the differential treatment of groups in order to end inequality and foster autonomy. Then "special measures for women (e.g. women-specific projects) are often required" (CIDA 1995 15th June ‘98).

GAD feminists remind us that a WID-specific projects must be distinguished from the older gender-stereotyped development equation which targeted men for production-related interventions and women for welfare-related interventions, based on planners’ biases and preconceptions. An accurate analysis of the prevailing division of labour, responsibilities, and needs must inform a WID-specific project. “The difference between
a women-specific intervention being regarded as gender-aware rather than gender-blind rests on the difference between a project design which is based on the analysis of gender-specific constraints and one that is based on prior assumptions about "proper" roles for women" (Kabeer and Subrahmanian 1996: 12).

**Introduction of self-empowerment**

Feminists advocate that women's development is hardly achieved by mere improvement in material conditions brought by development projects/programmes. Jahan (1995) says:

"Over the years, there has been gradual recognition that mere access to resources or provisioning of services is not adequate to challenge the root causes of gender inequality; that women need to assert their own agency, and only through self-empowerment can they aspire to break out of gender subordination" (Jahan 1995: 7).

The central focus of the empowerment approach is a critique of the way power and development are interlinked (Crawley 1998: 832). Antrobus (1991) claims women's self-empowerment is necessary to secure and ensure that their practical needs are met. Without self-empowerment, women can hardly be ensured benefits from superficial changes in development practice and in distribution of resources and opportunities. Even after women gained access to resources through development intervention, they could lose control (Antrobus 1991: 312). As an alternative to or a complement to conventional policy approaches, self-empowerment has been highlighted.

Self-empowerment processes should be discussed in this research, since self-empowerment seems not just an alternative option but an essential part of the strategy for women’s development. Better understanding of the processes of self-empowerment would lead to support of women’s self-empowerment activities and/or help to plan and design development projects and programmes in a way to encourage and facilitate self-empowerment processes rather than inhibit them.
The concept of self-empowerment

The self-empowerment is a bottom-up approach to development. The purpose of self-empowerment of women is ultimately "to remove the existence and effects of unjust inequalities" (Ward and Mullender 1991 in Rowlands 1997: 15-6). In other words, empowerment is a process seeking to change "the nature and direction of systemic forces" which oppress women and other disadvantaged (Sharma 1991-1992 in Batliwala 1994: 130). Batliwala (1994) summarises the goals of women's self-empowerment as:

- to challenge patriarchal ideology (male domination and women's subordination);
- to transform the structures and institutions that reinforce and perpetuate gender discrimination and social inequality (the family, caste, class, religion, educational processes and institutions, the media, health practices and systems, laws and civil codes, political processes, development models, and government institutions); and
- to enable poor women to gain access to and control of, both material and informational resources (Batliwala 1994: 130).

Young (1993) says that "empowerment is about people taking control over their own lives: gaining the ability to do things, to set their own agendas, to change events, in a way previously lacking" (Young 1993: 158). That includes achieving access to and control over political power (Townsend 1993: 173).

Rowlands (1997) suggests that what has been written about empowerment in industrialised societies is also relevant to the Third World context, because the lack of resources and formal power is significant for poor or marginalised women and men in both in the First and the Third World. Therefore, the definition of empowerment developed in the First World context may be applied in this research.

The term of 'self-empowerment'

'Self-empowerment' is more commonly referred as 'empowerment'. The term 'empowerment' already implies processes generating power by people themselves,
therefore adding the idea of 'self' is not necessary. 'Empowerment' often means different things to people, and especially as the term diffused and integrated into many development agencies, sometimes it is regarded as giving power to the powerless by outsiders. 'Empowerment' is likely to refer to anything which possibly contributes to women's well-being. I use the term 'self-empowerment', when I mean processes of women's spontaneous generation of power: women's emancipating their abilities and making positive changes in their lives.

Given the importance of self-empowerment in women's development, its implication to the plan and design of development interventions and confusion in its meaning, what self-empowerment refers to needs to be clarified more. Self-empowerment process will be described in chapter 4 of this research extensively.

Transformative intervention

GAD perspective requires more than gender-neutral interventions which "stem from an accurate assessment of the existing gender division of resources and responsibilities and ensures that policy objective are met as effectively as possible within a given context" (Kabeer and Subrahmanian 1996: 10). Because, even though a project is designed to meet women's practical needs such a project normally does not challenge and change existing gender division of labour and women's low status. Women's needs concerning their conditions are also gender neutral and could be addressed in gender-neutral ways.

However, to overcome some of the disadvantages women face, as are highlighted in education and health sections, the GAD perspective suggests that approaches which are geared to transformation of gender relations with explicit intentions are needed. Following the self-empowerment approach, this section suggests an approach for changing gender relations is transformative intervention.
Transformative intervention: challenging gender relations

The useful analytical tool firstly developed by Molyneux (1985), then modified by Young (1993), is the distinction of practical needs, and strategic interests. Strategic interests arise from the fact that women as a social category have unequal access to resources and power, and are attempting to achieve an alternative, more satisfactory set of arrangements to the current ones (Molyneux 1985: 232).

For example, such interest could be access to information. Information is the prerequisite of empowerment, but by discrimination poor Third World women often lack information about themselves or about the social, economic and political factors which govern their lives and circumstances. With more information women are able to make better decisions for themselves and to claim better structural change for example in property relations, legislation and provision of services (Mayoux 1995: 254). Another example of women's strategic interest may be changing the gender division of labour.

The reason for feminists' focusing on strategic interests derives out of failure to make significant progress toward improving the status of women through development strategies addressing only women's practical needs. Young (1993) suggests that “changing the symptoms of disadvantage -giving women training, credit. etc. - is not a solution but only a useful first step in women's empowerment” (Young 1993: 134). Without addressing women's strategic interests together with implementation unless they are already empowered to some extent, women would lose their benefits even after they gain access to (Goetz and Sen Gupta 1994).

For women struggling to maintain themselves and their families, meeting their daily needs and lightening the burden of responsibilities that women carry, creates situations which are more desirable to induce empowerment. Because, such improvement allows women to have time, space and develop critical consciousness about their lives. However, it is suggested not to be satisfactory. Although their practical needs must be met, “they cannot be an end themselves” (Batliwala 1994: 128).
Moreover, when we think about the difficulties women encounter when trying to meet their needs and interest, "women’s actual location in the social structure has important implications for the degree of manoeuvre individual women have" (Young 1993: 154). How easily and sufficiently women can satisfy their needs is dependent on their social position. Furthermore, it is suggested that focusing on improving the daily conditions of women’s existence even curtailed women’s awareness of, and readiness to act against, the less visible but powerful underlying structures of subordination and inequality (Young 1988 in Batliwala 1994: 128).

**Linking practical needs and strategic interests**

Although the categories of practical needs and strategic interests are a useful analytical tool which can help to conscientise policy-makers to strategic points of intervention in different contexts (-legal reform, information, employment opportunities-). In practice practical needs and strategic interests are not always totally separated and not necessarily meant to be separately addressed. For example, basic numeracy and literacy skills required in the local market could be women’s felt and immediate needs. Those skills also may bring the longer term strategic advantage of enabling women to participate more effectively in community organisations or training courses (Williams 1994: 10).

On the other hand, education itself is not automatically transformative, despite it being well documented that educating girls has affect on various aspects of people’s lives in the Third World. The kind of education that women/girls receive often is damaging. For instance, girls often receive a restricted curriculum: education on traditional female fields like health, domestic economy and handicrafts may restricts women’s options for employment in a world where technology plays an increasingly important role (Lycklama a Nijeholt ed. 1991: 148). Also, the stereotyping of women’s and men’s activities found in school literature; and the low expectations of girls held by parents, teachers and girls themselves, reinforce and heightens their sense of inadequacy as girls (Mosse 1993: 81). Meeting practical needs of education may reproduce gender inequality and internalise it in society and individuals.
Rather than posing a dichotomy between needs and interests, Young (1993) focuses on the inter-related dimension. She suggests for women to interrogate practical needs if they can become or transform themselves into strategic interests. In other words, it is sought that the capacity or potential of practical needs to question, undermine or transform gender relations and the structure or subordination, the idea is called ‘transformatory potential’ (Young 1993: 156).

Young draws a simple minded example of how to shape the plan to meet women’s practical needs in ways which have transformatory potential is that of the need for a cash income. There are several ways to meet these needs: by providing home based piece work to women; by setting up a small enterprise which allows women to meet together within a work context which is not highly structured; or by providing factory employment. In the first case, women remain in isolation, and the work may merely add a new burden. In the third case she needs to fulfil production norms, to complete a fixed and rigid working day, within a context in which men are likely to be in positions of power and authority over the women, curtail women’s sense of self-worth and agency. The second case of a small local enterprise can provide the conditions for women’s self-empowerment2 (Young 1993: 156).

Allowing women more control over projects is also empowering. Income-generating activities including components of training for accounting skills, management of organisations, and control over primary resources, may challenge existing gender inequalities and ensure women’s control over the benefits of the project.

Taking these strategies gender transformative intervention intend to go beyond the reach of gender neutral intervention in terms of GAD goals. Gender transformative intervention can be illustrated which may target women, men or both and which recognise the existence of gender-specific needs and constraints. What differs from a gender neutral

---

2 The process of self-empowerment and how it would be facilitated are introduced in a next section of this chapter and discussed further in chapter 4.
intervention is that transformative interventions additionally seek to change the existing gender relations in a more egalitarian direction through the redistribution of resources and responsibilities.

This is politically challenging since it does not simply seek distribution resources to women within current division of labour but almost inevitably requires men to give up certain privileges or take on certain responsibilities in order to achieve greater equity in the development process (Kabeer and Subrahmanian 1996: 12).

Implications of transformatory intervention
The strength of giving interventions transformatory potential is that it allows the politically most feasible ‘entry point’, due to their apparently non-threatening concerns, such as a welfare or a poverty approach, to have an empowering effect. Then women build up the capacity to take on the more deeply entrenched aspects of their subordination, such as the abolition of a coercive gender division of labour, measures against violence, reproductive rights, ending the sexual division of labour, establishment of political equality, all which are likely to meet profound resistance (Kabeer and Subrahmanian 1996: 24).

The concept of transformatory potential highlights “the ‘how’ of a policy approach is as important as the ‘what’” (Kabeer and Subrahmanian 1996: 16). In the other words, the means used to implement a project will determine whether it remains in gender neutral, leaving the underlying causes of gender inequality intact, or whether it contributes to longer-term strategic change, namely gender transformation.

Summary

Chapter three examines strategies for women’s development by way of empowering women. Firstly, two critical determinants of women’s condition, education and health, are looked at. Gender segregated data shows disadvantages Third World women face in both sectors. Feminists scholars draw our attention to women’s needs derived out of roles
and responsibilities assigned to them. Realising equity in development intervention is possible by ensuring women's needs are identified and addressed. The observation of women's state in the education and health sectors highlights women's lower status relative to men as the fundamental cause of problems in women's access to the resources.

The concept of self-empowerment was introduced as an ultimate bottom-up approach to challenge and dismantle the root causes of gender inequalities, and to ensure gender equity in development intervention and implementation of legislative changes. Self-empowerment is a key to women's setting themselves free from external and internal oppression and being their own agents and also of development. Self-empowerment is not just an effective alternative approach but necessary processes for women to take.

The last section of chapter three suggests the idea of gender transformative interventions. This idea derives from two concerns. One is that self-empowerment can hardly be a single approach to women's development where the material conditions under which they live have deteriorated. The other is a type of intervention suggested in the first section of this chapter that is, designing projects and programmes to make life 'easier' for women to help them in their given roles does little to change unequal gender relations. Transformative intervention shows that gender-awareness is not only about 'what' is addressed but also about 'how' to address women's needs. Then by integrating the idea, mainstream development projects and programmes are also able to challenge unequal gender relations.

The examples of the ways for development projects and programmes to be gender transformative is to meet practical needs in the way which fulfil strategic interests at the same time. It is suggested the different implications held on how to treat existing gender relations and the distribution of resources and responsibilities, must be challenged when designing projects and programmes if women's subordinated status is to improve.
Chapter 4: Self-empowerment

Roots of self-empowerment

The roots of self-empowerment could be seen in the multifaceted effort of many of those who under domination to achieve self-determination and to free themselves from external control (Stein 1997: 54). Stein identified the roots of self-empowerment in grassroots led social movement of Anti-colonialism in India, Africa and China, and of Anti-dependency movement in Latin America. Both influenced the community social work in USA, based on which self-empowerment was primarily conceptualised. Practices of self-empowerment among women in the Third World was also influenced by anti colonialism and/or anti-dependency movement (Stein 1997: 52).

Anti-colonialism showed the examples of strategies which were “alternative forms of resistance, the use of group processes to develop political consciousness, and the importance of pride in one’s ethnicity”. The movement appeared to inspire women in the movement, civil rights movement and women’s movement in USA, along with others (Stein 1997: 54).

The centre of strategies in civil rights movement was the creation of opportunities for the development of critical consciousness. For those who have been rendered invisible by the dominant culture, it appeared crucial to gain value such as dignity and self-respect, which were the measure of people’s own determination to resist oppression. Characteristics of strategies for civil rights movement such as “the localness of the program, the role of the leaders as participants, the process of group conscientization and the goal of community organization” became the important model to the women’s movement and to conceptualisations of self-empowerment (Stein 1997: 55).

The present feminist movement was partly developed by the white women who participated in the civil rights movement and northern movement of opposition to the Vietnam war and supporting student rights. The women came to realise that they were also facing an oppression based on their gender and started to organise themselves as
women. They use the informal group for consciousness raising as their primary technique (Stein 1997: 56-7). The significance of the strategy was that by having opportunity to see the other women, they “could examine the nature of their own oppression and share the growing knowledge that they were not alone” (Evans 1979: 215 in Stein 1997: 57).

Although US feminist movement focused dominantly on white middle class women’s issues, some of the women from this movement came to write about women in development and empowerment. Those from the US women’s movement found enough in common with women in the Third World to work together and help one another. Thus there was interaction between the women’s movement in US and the Third World (Stein 1997: 57).

The self-empowerment is largely informed by the concept of 'popular education' developed in Latin America in 1970’s, which has a root in Freire’s theory of 'conscientisation' (Batliwala 1994: 128). Freire’s theory seeks that with a sensitised leader, a group of oppressed people raise their consciousness of their social and political situation through a process of popular non-formal education, and ultimately the transformation of society (Stein 1997: 60). As for gender related conscientisation, although Freire did not pay attention to gender, feminist popular educators developed their own approach (Batliwala 1994: 128).

According to Stein, US social work is also a source of the concept of self-empowerment; it appears the primary site of intellectualisation and conceptualisation of self-empowerment occurs. A self-empowerment discourse within social work advocates the replacement of common attitude among social workers and professionals towards clients, which means from ‘doing for’ to ‘doing with’. The attitude of ‘doing for’ was argued that it leads those traits representing the absence of empowerment: “powerlessness, real or imagined; learned helplessness; alienation; loss of a sense of control over one’s own life” (Rappaport 1981: 3 in Stein 1997: 58).
One of the important reasons to claim relevance of the self-empowerment approach to women in the Third World is that self-empowerment for women has been practiced by them (Moser 1989:397). Initially in the Third World women form or join organizations in order to meet their various needs: credit, basic needs literacy, environmental protection, human rights and consciousness-raising. The organizations seem to have a common process, “a cycle of identification of problems, coming together to solve them, and then continuing to work on those problems while identifying others” (Stein 1997: 32). “Women’s organizing as a means for survival is taking on a particular form, incorporating the process of empowerment” (Stein 1997: 43). Thus the self-empowerment approach to Third World women is not an idea given to them by West.

In sum, the self-empowerment approach is derived out of activities and ideologies within which the disempowered, by themselves, develop critical consciousness, claim rights, mobilize themselves to meet their demands and change relationships with those who have power. The original meaning of self-empowerment appears to contain political connotations.

Power and self-empowerment

The concept of power is disputed, and that causes the confusion about the meaning of empowerment (Rowlands 1997: 9). Academics provide accounts of power operating in gender relationships. It shows dynamics of women’s oppression and what could be meant by self-empowerment.

Power and observable conflict

Some definitions of power concerned with the ability of one person or group to get another to do something against their will (Rowlands 1997: 9). This form of power is in finite supply; if one person has more, the other has less. It can be expressed in forms as violence or intimidation. It creates a relationship of domination and subordination.
Power could be observed when it is associated with decision-making on issues over which an observable conflict exists. Power is seen as the ability of people to undertake activities, “to set their own agendas and change events” (Crawley 1998: 26). This notion of power concerns “interpersonal decision-making capacity” (Kabeer 1994a: 224).

Empowerment of women may mean to give women chances to occupy positions of power, with respect to political and economic decision-making. Thus it implies the view that power could be bestowed by one person upon the other, “giving people an active role in a decision-making process” (Crawley 1998: 26).

The focus of the power expressed overtly in decision-making processes fails to capture the other aspects of power which can suppress conflict. A person with power could prevent a less powerful entity from voicing its wishes and exclude certain issues from decision-making agendas (Kabeer 1994a: 225, Rowlands 1997: 10). The decision of not to do something, for example, not to object, may result from the exercise of power (Rowlands 1997: 10). The power to suppress interests of the disempowered “inheres in the implicitly accepted and undisputed procedures within institutions which, by demarcating decisionable from non-decisionable issues, systematically and routinely benefit certain individuals and groups at the expense of others” (Kabeer 1994a: 225).

Power, thus, could have institutionalised basis, as well as being exercised interpersonally.

Rowlands points out that most frameworks for understanding power are unaware about how power is distributed within a society (Rowlands 1997: 11). In reality there, are power dynamics between genders, races, classes or any other relations. Feminists recognise much of male power is operated on an institutionalised basis. The notion of institutionalised power highlights gender biases implicit within the rules and practices of social institutions. There is no need for men to explicitly exert discrimination when routine institutional procedures assure their privilege (Kabeer 1994a: 226).

**Power and Unobservable conflict**

Those two notions of power focused above deal with conflicts of interests which have been identified and articulated, although they might be suppressed. However, Lukes
suggests the possibility that “interests might be unarticulated or unobservable” and above all that “people might be mistaken about, or unaware of, their own interests” (Lukes 1974: 14 cited in Kabeer 1994a: 226). Ultimately power could prevent people from thinking of having conflict (Rowlands 1997: 10). Power may shape people’s “perceptions, cognitions and preferences in such a way that they accept their role in the existing order of things, either because they can see or imagine no alternative to it, or because they see it as natural and unchangeable or because they value it as divinely ordained and beneficial” (Lukes 1974: 23-4 cited in Rowlands 1997: 10). Unobservable conflict is between interests of the dominant and what the subordinate would have if they were in a position to think clearly and articulate their own real interests.

For the oppressed, the strategic interests are not taken for granted. The implication could be remarkably important where women’s development is concerned. Molyneux (1985) points out that “the relationship between what we have called strategic gender interests and women’s recognition of them and desire to realize them cannot be assumed. It is not spontaneous for some women to recognise and identify better arrangement of gender relations and how to bring it in to different aspects of their lives. Even the ‘lowest common denominator’ of interests (e.g. complete equality with men, control over reproduction, and greater personal autonomy and independence from men) are not readily accepted by all women” (Molyneux 1985: 234 cited in Kabeer 1994a: 228).

The dynamics of oppression includes internalisation of it by the subordinate.

People who are systematically denied power and influence in society internalise the messages they receive about what they are supposed to be like, and they may come to believe the messages to be true (Rowlands 1997: 11).

The ‘internalised oppression’ is an example of unobservable conflict. For instance, a woman who is abusively rejected to express her opinions, may start to withhold them, and eventually come to believe she has no opinions of her own.
Another three reasons of the lack of transparency of women’s strategic interests are suggested by Molyneux and Kabeer. Firstly, women’s ‘false consciousness’ against the standard of some objectively given set of interests is pointed out. Although, the ‘false consciousness’ is acknowledged as a possible factor, Molyneux also points out the temporal negative aspects of meeting strategic interests. “Changes realized in a piecemeal fashion can threaten their short-term practical interests or entail losses which are not compensated for are likely to be resisted by women themselves” (Kabeer 1994a: 228). Thus, women may make trade-offs in order to cope with the effects of oppressive relationships in their lives.

The other reason suggested considers the idea that interests are always rooted in experience. Some interests emerge out of practices of daily life. Others are only likely to become identifiable by involving different kinds of practice, which bring about a new basis for experience and knowledge from which to reassess the old one. Women who are likely to have restricted life choices including mobility, have less opportunities to know other ways of being and “to engage in the analytical process by which their structural, rather than individual, interests as a subordinated category come more clearly into view” (Kabeer 1994a: 228).

**Summary of forms of power**

Knowing what forms power can take helps us to make clear what we are seeking through self-empowerment processes. Four forms of power involved in the self-empowerment process include; power over, power to, power from within and power with (Rowlands 1997: 13).

Power over is controlling power. A gender analysis shows that power is wielded predominantly by men over other men, and by men over women. In other forms of social differentiation, “power is exercised by dominant social, political, economic or cultural groups over those who are marginalised” (Rowlands 1997: 11). This is the conventional way of understanding power, that is, the ability of one person or group to get another person or group to do something against their will. “...[I]f person A and person B want
things which are incompatible, and person A gets his or her way, then power has been exercised by A.

Self-empowerment based on 'power over' definition of power is often regarded as women's gaining positions in the decision making arena. This highlights participation in the economic sphere; in political structures and formal decision-making (Rowlands 1997: 11-14). In this context, the ability to obtain an income has been given an important position in the strategy for women’s development especially by WID thinkers, since it appears to enable women to participate in economic decision making (Kabeer 1994a: 225). This kind of power is often seen as 'zero-sum': the more power one person has, the less the other has. Therefore, when power is defined as 'power over', if women gain power it will be at men’s expense.

The other forms of power focus on processes rather than domination. For feminists self-empowerment includes 'power to' and 'power from within'. ‘Power to’ is “generative or productive power... which creates new possibilities and actions without domination” (Rowlands 1997: 13). ‘Power from within’ is “the spiritual strength and uniqueness that resides in each one of us and makes us truly human. Its basis is self-acceptance and self-respect which extend, in turn, to respect for and acceptance of others as equals” (CCIC 1991 cited in Williams 1995: 234).

Finally, ‘power with’ is defined as “a sense of the whole being greater than the sum of the individuals, especially when a group tackles problems together” (CCIC 1991 cited in Williams 1995: 234). This implies that empowerment of women involves women allying with each other and challenging their subordination.

What is power in empowerment?
Insights of the operation of power and mechanisms oppressing women highlights the kinds of power that should be sought through self-empowerment strategies for women. For example, women’s self-empowerment must include ‘power from within’ in its meaning; the kind of power which entails the experiential recognition and analysis of the
structural mechanisms by which women’s subordination is maintained and reconstituted in specific contexts. Women’s self-empowerment must involve the alteration of women’s consciousness and building a positive perception of themselves. That would emancipate women from oppression including internalised one and their genuine interests which is free from male control, would be discernible. As Crawley (1998) suggests that empowerment is a “concept that goes beyond the issue of participation” and more than simply widening access to decision-making (Crawley 1998: 26). Instead of power to dominate others, focus of women’s self-empowerment could be to gain creative and enabling power, such as power to, power from within and power with. Kabeer suggests that “empowerment strategy for women must built on ‘the power within’” (Kabeer 1994a: 229). Thus, feminists regard that the self-empowerment process involves gaining or generating ‘power to’, ‘power from within’ and ‘power with’.

**Process of self-empowerment**

The concept of empowerment does not have a consistent definition (Stein 1997: 61). It is context specific (Shetty 1991: 8 in Rowlands 1997: 18), hence there is no single model which could be applied to every situation. However, there are several aspects of the empowerment approach emphasised using a GAD perspective. Summarising these could be useful to assess various development agencies interventions from a GAD perspective.

**Conscientisation**

"In order to challenge their subordination, women must first recognize the ideology that legitimizes male domination and understand how it perpetuates their oppression" (Batliwala 1994: 131). Women or other oppressed people, do not spontaneously demand change. They often have been led to participate in their own oppression, through, for example, in terms of women, religious sanctions, behavioural training, hierarchies among women in the family and control over their sexuality. “Because questioning is not allowed, the majority of women grow up believing that this is the just and natural order (Batliwala 1994: 131). External forces working to alter consciousness and raise awareness that an existing social order is unjust and unnatural, is sometimes needed to
make oppressed people such as women aware that they are oppressed and to assist in
inducing a movement towards their self-empowerment. Those outsiders who facilitate
this process are often called facilitators, change agents, or catalysts. Rowlands identifies
the role of the facilitators in promoting women’s empowerment is “potentially a pivotal
one” (Rowlands 1997: 136). The skills and attitudes required for facilitators need careful
examination in order to be effective. Although, they will be depending on the cultural and
the social context. The process is often called awareness-raising or conscientisation.

Conscientisation involves raising awareness of people who have been taught not to (or
have not been taught to) think about their feelings, who have suppressed their anger
and/or who have often accepted an unjust situation. Women understanding their situation
is important; if women do, they are more likely to act to change it (Rowlands 1997: 15).

Conscientisation is described as “recognizing one’s individual experience of oppression
and understanding its significance within the wider setting that generates the oppression
and defines its social function(s)” (Hubbard 1990: 17 in Stein 1997: 8). It expects to lead
women to alter their self-image and their beliefs about their rights and capabilities; to
create awareness of how gender discrimination is one of the forces acting on them; to
challenge the sense of inferiority that has been imprinted on them since birth; and to
recognise the true value of their labour and contributions to the family, society and
is a time when individuals start seeing themselves in relation to the world and the world
in relation to themselves, and then recognise their ability to influence events and people
context” enables a woman, for example, to move out of the gender-assigned roles which
her context and culture have given to her (Rowlands 1997: 113). Transformation as a
vision of social change and a process and outcome of throwing off oppression would
occur following conscientisation (Lee 1994: 14).

One point that should be noted is that developing an initial consciousness is not leading
people to a predetermined conclusion about their reality (Lee 1994: 117). The act of an
forcing outsiders preconceptions and agenda onto the disempowered is not in accordance with the strategy for self-empowerment.

**Component of empowerment at Individual level**

At the same time as enhancing women’s understanding of their circumstances through conscientisation, the self-empowerment must include “the processes that lead people to perceive themselves as able and entitled to make decisions” (Rowlands 1997: 14). The “inner psychological or psycho-social processes” is often referred to as the most significant area of change by most outside observers (Rowlands 1997: 111). Enhancing positive self-perception and the undoing of ‘internalised oppression’, the psychological and the psycho-social aspect seems to be central to the process of self-empowerment (Rowlands 1997: 111).

I draw examples of psychological changes of individual women from Rowlands’ (1997) findings. Rowlands (1997) identifies some of psychological and psycho-social processes involving women’s self-empowerment: “the development of self-confidence and self-esteem, and a sense of agency, of being an individual who can interact with her surroundings and cause things to happen. Rowlands (1997) also includes ‘dignity’, which is the word, used by many of her research participants, meaning "self-respect, self-esteem, and a sense of being not only worthy of respect from others, but of having a right to that respect" (Rowlands 1997: 113). In order to make changes within close relationships, values such as ability to negotiate, communicate and defend one’s rights are also recognised as critical (Rowlands 1997: 119).

Those components of self-empowerment do not include all that are thought to be important by those who reflect on the self-empowerment, nor are all necessarily equally important. The degree of importance of each component varies from individual to individual and from culture to culture (Stein 1997: 67). At the same time, one cannot say, 'this is what self-empowerment consists of', by taking out any one of the components. ‘Having more self-confidence and dignity do not necessarily lead to changes in how power is exercised or experienced (Rowlands 1997: 127).

**Empowering women in a group environment**

Many researchers studying self-empowerment advocate the method of conscientising women within a group environment. Also, group work appears to be an effective way of mitigating factors inhibiting women acting on making changes and facilitating self-empowerment.

Many women in the Third World have only limited mobility. They are often not allowed to go out of their houses or villages without permission. The isolation which women experience is described as a severe limitation on their lives (Rowlands 1997: 113). This isolation would be broken down by group activities in a number of ways (Rowlands 1997: 113).

Groups provide women with time and space to exchange life experiences and reflect on their own lives thus enabling them to raise critical consciousness; each woman could understand more about their circumstances and know they are not the only one experiencing it. Rowlands (1997) identifies a number of features which contribute to the psychological or psycho-social empowerment process such as self-esteem or sense of agency.

"Travel, activity outside the home, sharing of problems and group activities, reduce the isolation of the individual woman in her home and immediate family, and give her widen opportunities for interaction" (Rowlands 1997: 113).
In a group, individual women also have the chance to develop particular skills, both practical (such as literacy) and social (participation in meetings and discussions) (Rowlands 1997: 113).

Stein (1997) suggests that "groups provide individuals with experiences in which they have control. This in turn provides them with a perception of that control" (Stein 1997: 63). That perception brings "a causal attribution of successful control to oneself", which further leads to "future expectations of control and characteristics of hopefulness" (Stein 1997: 63).

**Collective mobilisation**

Where women work collectively, a positive self-empowerment emerge not only in the way, as examined previously, facilitating self-development and individual action to improve their lives, but also in the way that enables social action. Many feminist researchers recognise that women can act more effectively to meet their interests when they work as a group. Humble (1998) says the GAD perspective focuses on women’s self-empowerment at two levels: “at a personal level its concern is women’s self-confidence and sense of personal potency; at a higher political level women’s capacity to make public decisions and control resources is the focus” (Humble 1998: 35-6).

Focusing on individual empowerment cannot effect significant changes in women’s status within society. Personal empowerment does not lead to empowerment within close relationships either (Rowlands 1997: 26). In order to realise women’s strategic interests or "the transformation of the structures of subordination" (Moser 1989: 1816) self-empowerment processes must include components of collective action. One reason for this is that without "the sustained and systematic efforts" made collectively by women, their strategic interests are hardly met (Moser 1989: 1816). Young (1993) argues that:

"it is increasingly recognised that women must form their own organisations so as to make women’s concerns intrinsic to political bargaining and negotiations. If policymakers are to do more than listen to women, there needs to be some
political compulsion behind their demands political will flourishes when there is political impetus" (Young 1993: 161).

For example, "almost everywhere women are either absent or excluded from the main political arenas. At both the international and the national level women are poorly represented" (Young 1993: 160). Heyzer (1981) analyses the consequence of women's low political status, and she says that:

"[b]ecause women are politically weak in the sense that no government will fall from power based on its policies affecting women, it is rare that the interests of women are explicitly considered in either the economic or political aspects of development planning, and the creations of various women's organisations and national machinery for women during the Women's Decade has not changed this" (Heyzer 1981: xiii in Young 1993: 159-60).

How could policies be accountable to women? Young (1993) suggests that "policy makers are responsive to directives and pressures from a variety of political arenas and actors of varying degrees of power and persuasiveness. Thus in many cases to get them to recognise an obligation to do something about even women's pressing practical needs, such needs have to be expressed in such a way as to become a critical political problem which is amenable to a planning solution" (Young 1993: 160). In other words, in order for women's needs and interests to come high on politicians' agendas, it is important that "women from a wide social spectrum take up the challenge and enter the political arena" (Young 1993: 160).

For women to attain justice in society, the requirement would be changes in institutions and practices which are "organised from a male perspective, with male life experience as typical" (Young 1993: 158). They are, for example, "law, civil codes, systems of property rights, control over women's bodies, labor codes and the social and legal institutions that underwrite male control and privilege" (Moser 1989: 1816). It is a crucial component of empowerment that the disempowered become able to take collective social action to
alleviate particular socio-economic and political conditions, and claim power (Crawley 1998: 29).

Therefore women organising themselves into groups, and linking those groups with each other, enhances women's collective empowerment; and women's collective social action becomes an essential part of the self-empowerment process. Although, as Young says, the self-empowerment is too often referred to a development of "entrepreneurial self-reliance" in a very individualistic sense (Young 1993: 159). The self-empowerment process is encouraged further when women form groups or women's organisations and also the groups link each other and develop networks. Individuals' working together achieve a more extensive impact than each could have had alone (Rowlands 1997: 15). Collective action enables "women collectively to take control of their own lives to set their own agendas, to organise to help each other and make demands on the state for support and on society itself for change" (Young 1993: 158-9).

The shift in the direction and processes of development in favour of women's needs and their vision occurs with the collective empowerment of women (Young 1993: 159).

**Dimensions of self-empowerment**

Where do women experience and demonstrate self-empowerment. Rowlands (1997) identifies three dimensions of self-empowerment. Actions may take place and changes could be made within personal, relational and collective dimensions. For example, with developed psychological and/or sociological values such as self-esteem and the ability to communicate, in personal dimensions, women may increase their ability to participate in and influence new spaces. Women may make changes within close relationships, such as their husbands and families, women, for instance, gain increased capacity to make their own choices. Also, women develop core values and make changes collectively (Rowlands 1997: 15, 111-121). Rowlands (1997) recognises the three dimensions are closely linked: "positive changes in one dimension can encourage changes in either the same dimension or in another" (Rowlands 1997: 127). Women's self-empowerment possibly takes place in those three dimensions and they are interlinked.
Summary

The self-empowerment has been suggested by GAD feminists as an approach to challenge and change unequal relationships in gender and also in other social relations. The conscientisation and awareness-raising are pivotal for women to question and analyse their situation. Women's confidence, self-esteem and sense of agency need to be encouraged and developed, then women would be able to confront the power and structures which allocate them their current position in their families, societies, nations and global community. The profitability of women meeting in a group for encouraging individual women's self-empowerment has been identified by GAD feminists. Moreover, the self-empowerment approach suggests women working together collectively towards their common strategic interests. That provides the means to go beyond empowering women to challenge their private relationships individually, and to put their agendas in mainstream decision making arenas, and such agendas to be addressed. Finally, it is suggested that self-empowerment not only be expanded in women on an individual basis, but also in groups; building the capacities to work effectively and reaching higher levels in the political arena.
Chapter 5: JICA’s WID Efforts

Introduction

Development is interpreted as a process in which enhancement of people’s potential and their empowerment will not only solve their material want and social inequalities, but will eventually bring institutional reforms and economic and social development (JICA: 21 April 1998).

In Chapter 3, I discuss the strategies to achieve women’s development from a GAD perspective. The discussion takes into account the possible and ideal ways of cooperation by development agencies. Chapter 3 suggests development interventions to address the improvement in women’s condition, while also highlighting the importance of women’s self-empowerment and the gender transformative projects and programmes which are stimulants of self-empowerment. In Chapter 4 the process of self-empowerment is described, in order to show the importance of self-empowerment in enabling women to participate in development as full agents for themselves. In other words, for women to be effectively involved in decision-making and control their lives, women need to experience self-empowerment.

In this chapter I assess JICA’s WID policy. The discussion is based primarily on two papers produced by JICA, Study on Integrating WID into Japan’s development Assistance, JICA’s development programmes, and Manual on Integrating WID Considerations into Development Programs. I also, mention ‘Japan’s Official Development Assistance Charter’ announced in 1992 and “Japan’s Initiative on WID” announced by Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA) in 1995. JICA deals with several different types of development programmes, which include, in JICA’s terms, Training affairs, Expert dispatch, Project-type technical cooperation, Development studies, Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers (JOCVs), Project formulation, and Equipment.
I discuss JICA’s interventions from a GAD perspective, which is based on a framework developed in Chapter 3.

Construction of this chapter
In the first part of this chapter I present background information on Japan’s development aid implementing structure and JICA’s position within it, and the emergence of Women in Development policy in JICA. The second part focuses on JICA’s ways of conceptualisation WID and the progress of mainstreaming WID, that is, integration of gender-awareness into development activities.

Overview of Japan’s ODA: implementation structure and establishment of WID policy in JICA

Before I explain how Japanese WID policy has been integrated into ODA, I want to clarify Japan’s ODA institutional structure. “Japan’s ODA is classified into three categories: (1) bilateral grants (2) bilateral loans, and (3) contributions and subscriptions to international organizations” (JICA: 21 April 1998b). In this study we will not look at categories of co-operation as in (2) and (3). Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) deals with the Bilateral Grant: Technical Cooperation and the facilitation of a part of Grant Aid administered by MoFA.

Integration of WID policy
Responding to WID advocacy, some donor countries adopted principals on WID into their aid policies: Sweden in 1968, United States in 1973 and Canada in 1976. Comparing with those countries, recognition of women in development issues were raised much later in Japan. Special attention to women in the Third World in a context of international development co-operation was formally drawn in the resolution adopted by the plenary session of the House of Councillors on 22nd June 1989. The resolution shows the Japan’s

---

3 These are the English titles of programmes provided by JICA. JICA employs the American English spelling system, and JICA’s terms appear in this research as given.
intention was to "...place priority on overcoming poverty and improving basic living conditions, paying particular attention to the needs of women and children..." (MoFA cited in JICA 1991a: 9). This was the first time women were concerned as a separate entity in an aid dialogue.

**JICA’s attempts**

JICA have done a series of studies on specific global issues each year since 1988. Study groups have been formed to address selected issues such as the environment, poverty, WID, population, education, participatory development and good governance. The study groups consist of JICA staff along with outside experts and researchers. The groups analyse each topic and discuss approaches Japan’s ODA should take. The results of their study and recommendations are compiled into a final report (JICA: 21 April 1998b). JICA has been institutionalising WID in accordance with this report.

The Study Group on Development Assistance for Women in Development was launched in 1990. The study group was chaired by a woman the former Ambassador Nobuko Takahashi. The study group surveyed the condition of women in Third World countries and the WID-related efforts of other development agencies; e.g. UN, OECD and NGOs, and made recommendations. JICA accepted the study group’s recommendations. The recommendations were compiled into a report in 1991. Titled *Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development*. The recommendations include basic approaches and priority areas for Japan’s development assistance for WID.

**Summary of Japan’s WID programmes under bilateral aid programmes in the past**

In *Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development*, concludes that Japan’s ODA has not created a comprehensive action plan or programmes for WID and that “this situation is extremely regrettable” (JICA 1991a: 10).

---

4 This is JICA’s translation for ‘bunyabetsu (kaihatu to jyosei) enjyo kenkyukai’.
The study group found a few examples of bilateral Japanese aid programmes and projects which focus on women as the main beneficiaries or address sectors of which directly relate to women's living and working conditions. However, projects and programmes which intentionally "expand the role of women in society" were few (JICA 1991a: 10). In terms of JICA's activities, some technical co-operation programmes such as maternal and child health, family planning, nursing education, and government administrations primarily target women. There are few examples of JICA taking into account the need to reduce time-consuming tasks by women. A few examples of gender aware projects are observed among the projects such as "rural infrastructures, drinking water supplies and other topics related to the improvement of living environment and labour conditions" (JICA 1991: 10-1).

The grant aids which are counted as women related by the study group include the construction of nursing schools, elementary and junior high schools, and rural drinking water facilities. Two grassroots oriented grant aid schemes were established in 1989, that is, the Small-Scale Grant Assistance and the NGO Project Subsidy; women's organisations in the Third World countries have started receiving assistance through them.

The other development efforts which the study group points out as women-related are the activities in regional development and improving the incomes of women in rural areas done by Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers (JOCV) under JICA. Approximately one-third of the volunteers were women at the time studied.

However, the study group points out that overall little of the assistance shows clear awareness about women's participation in and benefit from development co-operation. The study group concluded that:

...it is rare that the role and participation of women are expressed targets of programs, or that a conscious effort is being made to analyze, consider, or evaluate projects in these terms. There is also deficiency of records showing what
kinds of checks were made, considerations given, and recognition of efforts on the participation of women at different phases of the planning and implementation of aid projects (JICA 1991a: 11).

Because Japan's ODA did not have clear intentions to integrate gender awareness into its projects and programmes, no special attention on women was paid in the past development assistance.

**WID division in JICA**

Establishment of a WID division is one of the study group's recommendations. It became known as 'Environment, WID and Other Global Issues Division' in the Planning Department of JICA in 1991\(^5\). What global issues this division deals with are not stated.

However, there is a clue in the document, *Concept Paper: JICA's Efforts in Women in Development*, published by environment, WID, and Other Global Issues Division. It points out the issues demanding an international response. They are environmental conservation, women in development, poverty, population, HIV/AIDS, refugees, human rights, and education. These issues are more or less related to WID and require paying attention to women. Each issue however, calls for serious attention and specialist knowledge.

In JICA's document, *Manual on integrating WID considerations into development programs*, JICA encourages field workers to consult about WID issues in particular sectors or regions, with WID experts in Environment, WID and Other Global Issues division or those in JICA's research and training institute, Institute for International Cooperation (IFCF) (JICA 1994: 10). This indicates there are some staff specialising in WID issues in JICA. The number of staff in Environment, WID and other Global Issues Division in 1998 was 5 out of about 1200. Among them 2 staff are dedicated to WID, with 2 contract junior WID experts. WID staff are also responsible for other global issues: poverty, education, population and AIDS and welfare for disabled. The scale of

\(^{\text{5}}\) The name of the division came in use in 1993.
the WID division is too small to deal with the most concerned issues in the world. JICA does not commit to WID to the extent enough to get substantial progress in women’s development.

**Study on Development Assistance for WID**

The document, *Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development*, consists of two parts. Part one is a review on women in Third World countries, on WID concepts, on WID efforts made by United Nations, OECD and NGOs, and those made by Japan’s ODA in the past. The second part of the document consists of the study group’s recommendations.

**Assessment of The concept of WID presented in Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development**

The study group recognises that for the achievement of “the total social and economic development of the country”, women would need to be not only the beneficiaries of development, but the ones who “make development happen” (JICA 1991: 4). The study group emphasises that ‘development’ does not only mean economic growth, but means social and economic development which leads a human-oriented social development thus improving the quality of life.

Here, the study group perceive that development requires participation of both men and women. The current situation where women find themselves in, prevents women from doing so. The study group’s perception of concept of WID is that: “(1) having women actively participate in all fields and processes of development not merely as beneficiaries but as active agents, (2) improving the social and economic status of women and their situations in general, and (3) developing greater international understanding and cooperation on the part of both developing countries and industrialized countries.” (JICA 1991a: 4). Japanese language version of the copy express the nuance that (2) and (3) are the prerequisites of the (1). The study group points out crucial women’s needs to be met in order for women to take an active role in development with respect to number (2)
above. This includes better educational opportunities, easier access to the training information and to means of production required to achieve economic independence, and a greater participation in decision-making processes.

In general, women's development could be regarded as the ends of development itself, at the same time women as a human resources are one of the critical means to achieve it. Development assistance for women's development could be argued on its own sake. Then the strategies for women's development could be sought from a gender centred perspective. The study group, rather, argue, from a development centred perspective, the expansion of women's roles in various social sectors in order to accelerate development. Enforcement of women's participation is regarded as indispensable to development. Women being active agents are more likely contribute to women's development when they work for their own priorities. Also, the study group's approach is individualistic, highlighting women's individual self-reliance. Women's collective work towards their development is not paid attention to. Without careful consideration of the philosophy behind women's development, however, bringing women in development efforts could mean a utilisation of women's labour, as we see in an aspect of efficiency approach. The study group states that:

...women have a vital role to play in economy, education, health, and other fields. it is therefore indispensable for women to be included in all areas of development, not only as beneficiaries of programs, but as active agents (JICA 1991a: 4).

How the WID study group perceives the faults of past development initiatives
For the study group, the faults of past development initiatives are that women have been involved in the development process only as beneficiaries of welfare plans and programmes. This happened because women’s socio-economic roles had not been identified. The reasons for promoting women’s participation in the development process is that because development programmes and projects which have not taken the socio-economic role of women into full account result in having a negatively impact women. Consequently, the development interventions also often resulted in reducing the overall
positive development effects in the society. The other reason pointed out is to mitigate projects' failing to meet their objectives because of aiming at wrong target groups. That happens because without clarifying the gender division of labour, projects tended to be planned based on planners' preconceptions about women's and men's works (JICA 1991a: 4).

This way of analysing past interaction between women and development interventions are the same criticisms as those mentioned by the early WID advocates (for example see Boserup 1970). Critics argue the reason for the failure of development projects is due to the lack of knowledge of women's multi-dimensional roles and the biased view of development workers who see women only as mothers and wives (Kabeer 1994a:24).

Even though the document, *Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development*, is published in 1991, the faults in past development interventions which are pointed out by the study group are very limited. Those faults are all critiques made about 'the welfare approach' used since 1970. Development agencies, however, have adopted several different approaches to facilitate women's development over time. Also, the criticisms have been made towards those development initiatives by feminist scholars and activists. Those problems identified during 1970s and 1980s are not studied or mentioned in *Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development*. This failure to learn from other attempts such as the equity, the anti poverty and the efficiency approaches implies significant shortcomings in recent JICA's perception in women's issues in development.

Feminists' analysis of problems in women's development recognised institutionalised women's subordination to men as a root cause. Women's subordination lays the ground work so that women cannot achieve equal opportunities in development projects/programmes, nor in any aspect of their lives including education, health services, income-generation, and decision-making. Because of this, women during past two decades keep loosing out in many kinds of development intervention. Also, despite of their involvement in wide range of activities, women tend to lose or have no control over
the products of their labour. Women’s lack of control over their own body is also the consequence. Moreover, WID effort itself has been marginalised from the agencies’ mainstream operations and budgetary allocation. In general, past WID efforts and overall development processes have not succeeded to improve women’s position. Therefore, the inevitable issue for development efforts is problematising unequal gender relations and the transformation of institutions which subordinate women.

Clearly, in order to realise the ultimate goal of human development for women and women becoming active agents of development and gaining benefit from it, equality in gender relations has to be achieved. Even though this is a necessary component of strategy for women’s development the Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development failed to pay attention to, nor even consider and discuss this perspective. Consequently, second of the WID concepts which is regarded as a strategy to achieve the first mentioned concept on page 6, women’s active participation in development, is not enough.

In Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development, education, economic independence and access to decision making are seen to facilitate women’s participation in the development process. Education and self-reliance are necessary to improve women’s lives, and their implication to other spheres of women’s lives is significant. However, it should be noted that a mere fulfilment of the demand of basic needs or increase in the availability of the needs are not sufficient for women to be full agents for themselves.

Moreover, women’s involvement in decision-making could enhance women’s control over their own lives, although women need to be self-empowered. In order to participate in decision-making from an equal position as men and with acknowledgement, then to exert their influence, women require dismantling the internalised oppression, and by attaining a more positive and potent sense of self, of taking control over their lives through experiencing self-empowerment and transformative interventions, as we see in Chapter 3 and Chapter 4. If JICA neglects self-empowerment, powerless women are
likely omitted from development planning or decision-making opportunities. Also, self-empowerment facilitates women recognising their own strategic interests, especially those which unlikely derive from their current limited experiences. It also encourages women to realise their strategic interests and in longer term, creates a foundation for their spontaneous political action.

Therefore, meeting women's strategic interests and facilitating women's self-empowerment should be a central part of the strategy for developing women's potential and capacity as equal partners in development with men.

The policy seeking transformation of gender relations allows the innovation of project plans. For example, such policy may introduce educational material which intends to raise awareness around issues in women's lives such as husband's alcoholism, a literacy project, or develop the educational materials which avoid implanting fixed notion of gender division of labour to readers through illustration.

Furthermore, considering delaying promotion of gender-awareness in their work, equity for women's interests within aid agencies needs to be achieved as well, as gender justice for themselves and in order to promote assistance for women's development further. Under-representation of women and WID proponents in, and penetrated notion of male superiority in institutions are the obstacles for advancing WID policies.

In many of those institutions female staff and WID proponents are under represented in terms of their number, the notion of inequality in gender is ingrained and male interests are often institutionalised and routinely privileged. Gender equity within donor policy making bodies and aid agencies is inevitable in order to put gender issues on the agenda and gain agencies' commitment to them.

Women's invisibility or development planners' prejudice and preconceptions about women's roles are not always a reason for development interventions' failing to address women's needs and interests. In Study on Development Assistance for WID, more
information about and recognition of women's productive and reproductive tasks are assumed to be sufficient to design projects and programmes to contribute to women's development. However, this assumption has been denied by some case studies. Dixon points out even though in sub-Saharan Africa, women farmers are documented as self-employed cultivators in labour force statistics, the distribution of development resources such as land, livestock and credit does not accord to women's visibility. Dixon's findings shows that women's economic contributions are not merely overlooked by development efforts but men in power are reluctant to share them with women (Dixon 1985 cited in Kabeer 1994a: 35). GAD's focus of gender relationships highlights the effects of male power, which refuses to share resources and decision-making while promoting the efficiency approach, could impedes planning for women's development.

The priority areas
The study group recommends six priority areas for Japan's WID assistance: (1) promotion of economic participation; (2) promotion of education; (3) promotion of health, medicine and family planning; (4) greater participation in environmental protection and management; (5) strengthening the internal systems of developing countries; and (6) expanded access to information (JICA 1991a: 16).

The internal systems of developing countries refers to national machinery and NGOs. "Expanded access to information" refers to a facilitating women's access to information in areas such as law, health services, or social services. It also means a promotion of gender disaggregated data on censuses; and establishing networks between development organisations (JICA 1991a: 22).

Among the priority areas above, (1) to (4) are related to women's practical needs, and (5) and (6) are strategic needs. As described above, (6) involves both grassroots oriented co-operations that is, access to information, and national level ones. In terms of actual implementation, there are just a few programmes addressed to strategic needs mainly through the programme called Training affairs in 1997, and none of them are grassroots oriented.
**WID Policy in Japan's ODA**

In 1990s Japanese government announced two major policies on WID. One is the Official Development Assistance Charter approved in 1992. The other is "Japan's Initiative on WID" announced in 1995.

**Japan's Official Development Assistance Charter**

"Official Development Assistance Charter" provides principles to Japan's ODA activities. It states that "full consideration will be given to the active participation of women in development and to the securing of benefits for women from development" (MoFA 1994).

This policy provides measures for the effective implementation of official development assistance. This concerns how women are treated in development operation, but does not present substantial objectives for women's development.

**Japan's Initiative on WID**

At 'the Fourth World Conference on Women' in Beijing in 1995, the Japanese government, that is Ministry of Foreign Affairs announced "Japan's Initiative on WID". The basic ideas of 'Japan's Initiative on WID' is that:

The primary responsibility for achieving the gender equality necessary to participate in and benefit from development rests with the developing country itself. However, the developed country can assists the self-efforts of the developing countries in this respect through development cooperation that integrates gender considerations. Such development assistance can contribute to the achievement of balanced sustainable development and will also facilitate the empowerment of women and the closing of gender disparity in the developing countries (MoFA 1995).

MoFA sets three priority areas of co-operation include education, health, and economic and social participation.
Discussion

The centre of the policies which is the promotion of women’s participation in and benefit from development effort are concerned only about integrating women into mainstream development operations. Achievement of Women’s empowerment and gender equality appear depending only on women themselves, with the benefit from development whatever it is and even they are only basic needs. Moreover, the institutional issues come to be questioned: how these intentions would be translated into practice. Sufficient allocation of resources and political will of all personnel involved in development co-operation are required to ensure the achievement in integrating gender awareness. Given JICA is one of the implementing bodies of Japan’s ODA, it takes this initiative into account.

JICA’s programmes

The following section assesses JICA’s effort to integrate WID considerations into its programmes: Project-type technical cooperation, Development studies, Project formulation, and Grant Aid Programs.

One of JICA’s programme, Development studies, involves dispatching consultant teams to recipient countries in order to provide assistance in formulating development plans for the public sector and other basic infrastructure areas that are a key to the socio-economic development of the developing countries (JICA 1993:21). Another JICA’s programme Project formulation is a research which is “conducted when information regarding the requests from developing countries is insufficient, or when requests in aid priority areas are not forthcoming due to circumstances in the relevant country” (JICA 1997 b: 5).

Among nine categories of Japan’s Grant AID: Grant Aid for General Projects, Non-Project Grant Aid for Structural Adjustment Support, Grant Assistance for Grassroots Projects, Grant Aid for Fisheries, Grant Aid for Cultural Activities, Grant Aid for
Disaster Relief, Food Aid, Grant Aid for Increase of Food Production, and NGO subsidies Scheme, JICA deals with the ones underlined.

The importance of paying special attention to integrating gender considerations into development projects and programmes has been advocated since 1970s in WID/GAD discourse internationally. Especially responding to marginalisation of WID unit and activities in the past, feminists advocate to integrate gender awareness into mainstream of development agencies' operation. Two components involving are: integrating gender issues into entire activities such as projects, programmes and policies, and diffusing responsibilities for gender-awareness integration beyond a WID unit. My research involves only in the first dimension of mainstreaming, extent of mainstreaming in aid programmes. The term ‘WID-related projects’ (e.g. WID-related Development studies) is employed by JICA to refer to the projects and programmes that integrate gender awareness systematically in JICA's procedure.

WID related projects for JICA are either WID-specific or WID-integrated, that are selected as the “projects with a higher priority for WID consideration”, and to them are applied JICA’s ‘five principles of WID consideration’, which are:

1. Situation analysis of women at the planning and evaluation stages. 2. Consultation with women at the planning stage. 3. Measures to promote women’s participation at the planning and implementation stages. 4. Women’s participation at the implementation stage. 5. Utilization of WID expertise at the planning, implementation and evaluation stages (JICA 21 April 1998a).

These principles are applied when a given project is under consideration as viewed as having implications for women. WID projects are chosen during new project appraisals. A proposed project is identified as the one with a high priority for WID considerations, when it falls into any of following categories:
Due to differences in gender roles and needs in the target community or in the particular area of cooperation:

(1) women’s participation in the planning and implementation of the project needs to be considered;
(2) women will be either the sole or part of the intended beneficiaries of the project; or
(3) the project would have a negative impact on women, unless some WID considerations are incorporated into it (JICA 1994 internet).

This criteria considers gender impact of interventions which can be attributed to current division of labour. Paying attention to gender division of labour and responsibilities, and needs that come with them, these criteria seek to implement more gender sensitive development interventions and more equitable results from them to both genders. It seeks gender neutral effect rather than redistributive, in terms of distribution of power, responsibilities and resources.

The extent of gender-awareness: incidence of WID projects

Next, we observe the changes in incidence of WID-related projects in the three types of assistance that we are assessing in this section: Project-type technical cooperation, Development studies, Project formulation (table 1), and Grant Aid. The records of WID-related assistance available for this study start in 1990, but not all types of assistance were surveyed by JICA in that year. Also, the first cases of WID-related Project formulation occurred in 1994.

The ratios of WID-related Project-type technical cooperation to all Project-type technical cooperation shift around 15% each year during FY 1993-96. There is a decrease in 1996. WID projects in The ratio of WID-related Development studies to the total Development studies rises 7.5% in 1993 to 19.6% in 1996. A constant increase in numbers of WID-

---

6 JICA’s WID division was established in 1991.
related Development studies is observed, although, the ratio had a setback in FY 1995. In terms of WID-related Project formulation the number of cases shifted up from 5 to 10 cases, and the ratio of them to total Project formulations in each year changed from 4.8% to 8.7% in FY 1994 to 1996. In the case of Grant Aid, among JICA's scope only one project in 1995 and two in 1996 have been acknowledged as subjects of WID consideration.

In 1996 the number of WID related projects remains low and stagnated. After seven years of promoting WID in JICA, gender awareness seems not adopted widely. There must be a greater acceptance of projects accountable to women. Allocation of resources such as personnel, budget, and time, requires firm understanding of gender issues by a wide range of development practitioners, and the will to incorporate gender awareness into their works. In order to ensure the project is gender sensitive, there needs to be further efforts to integrate WID into all projects.

### Table 1: Incidence of WID projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Project-type technical cooperation</th>
<th>Development studies</th>
<th>Project formulation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>29 (17.1%)</td>
<td>22 (7.5%)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>35 (16.2%)</td>
<td>32 (10.5%)</td>
<td>5 (4.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>35 (16.0%)</td>
<td>52 (8.5%)</td>
<td>8 (6.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>33 (14.5%)</td>
<td>60 (19.6%)</td>
<td>10 (8.7%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Unit: Number (WID share of related cooperation)

Source: JICA’s WID related Cooperation from FY1990 to FY1996

**The extent of gender-awareness: focused sector**

The following section examines the WID-related projects in FY 1996 with respect to the classification of sectors of assistance. Most of the WID-related Project-type technical cooperation are in health sector, which consists of about half the total 33 cases. WID-
related Development studies concentrate on the water and irrigation sector, which consists of 25 out of 60 cases, followed by 12 cases in agriculture and agricultural village development, and 11 cases in forestry.

In terms of Project formulation 5 cases out of 6 are in the education sector. Women's needs and interests are hardly taken up in the mainstream agenda in such countries where decision-making is dominated by men. States are often reluctant to share resources with women and tend to neglect women's issues. With the disadvantages for women in recipient countries it may difficult for JICA to extend its WID efforts, since basically, Japan distribute its aid as responses to recipient countries spontaneous requests. The request-based approach may impede Japan taking the initiative to plan for women. The Study Group recognises this point, and suggests to bring Japan's policy of WID consideration into aid policy dialogue with Third World countries (JICA 1991a: 14). Along with the WID promotion effort in aid dialogue, JICA's Project formulation which has been allocated a budget since 1994 may have important implications for women's development. It may allow JICA to innovate projects for women's development. Especially, those projects with gender transformatory implication may need to be suggested on JICA's own initiative. There are areas of interventions suggested by the study group which may require an initiative, for example, attempts toward improving labour conditions and work environment for women, educating female workers on their rights and legal conditions, and promoting women's organisations (JICA 1991a: 17). The possibilities of both WID-specific and WID-integrated projects should be researched.

As we saw before, the project which will integrate JICA's WID principles into the project cycles are selected at the project appraisal phase. The selection is inescapable with limited resources available for WID division, and also WID/GAD circles outside JICA as a whole does not supply enough resource and gender experts are scarce. JICA points out

---

7 Small scale irrigation and agricultural village development in Turkey, is counted in agricultural sector projects. Also, some agricultural village development projects may involve irrigation or water projects.
two major constraints; there are “budgetary constraints in including a WID expert in all of JICA’s Study Missions” and there are few experts with adequate training in social analysis on gender issues in Japan (JICA 21 April 1998a). In terms of budgetary allocation, it is stagnated at a certain level. The expenditure on WID-related programmes shared 3.9% of the total expenditure of JICA’s technical co-operation in 1991. It rose up to 9.0% in 1994 and has kept under 10% as of 1996. WID consideration has not been well promoted by JICA.

The process of designating projects as WID-related ones may allow biases and preconceptions of development practitioners towards women’s needs and interests to remain largely in the development co-operations. The concentration of WID-related projects in a limited social sectors could be to some extent a result of JICA’s setting priority areas as well as the recipient countries’ interests. Health, water supply and agriculture are often primary sectors which demand development assistance. These needs are well reported in, for example, World’s Women 1995: Trends and Statistics (1995) published by United Nations. Also, arguing necessity of aid towards those sectors are rather convincing, since they appear indispensable. The concentration of WID-related aid in specific sectors, however, also indicates that there are limited opportunities for attention to be paid to various women’s grassroots needs and interests or to be planned for. Women’s interests which challenge gender relations expect contradictory response. For example, a vocational training for women, so women may obtain secure better-paying jobs in the industrial sector, where women have been discouraged or prohibited entering, appears to be a low priority for development efforts.

At this point, it must be remembered that “the planning process itself as a site of gender politics” (Kabeer 1992: 33). The needs and the interests which men and women outside the planning institutions have, may not necessarily be shared by bureaucracies which are organised around different goals and reflect different “institutional imperatives” (Kabeer 1992: 33). At the selection of projects given higher priority in terms of WID, it is likely that women’s interests are dismissed in some ways; the other political agendas in
development institutes get dominance and to some extent the gender-blindness remains in development institutions.

**Assessment of Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers**

Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteer (JOCV) is a programme run by JICA. JOCVs are sent in response to the recipient countries' request, and live and work with the people in those countries for two years. Dispatch of JOCVs is one of JICA's major activities. JICA counts JOCV's activities which target women as a contribution to JICA's WID.

The number of volunteers who work for women's projects has increased. In 1991, there were 120 volunteers, or 4.3% of the total volunteers. The number of WID volunteers came to 479 in 1993, 541 in 1995, and 535 in 1996. The ratio of WID volunteers to total JOCVs are 16.3% in 1993, 16.1% in 1995, and 16.1% in 1996. Numbers and ratio of WID volunteers have increased significantly from 1991 to 1993, but stayed around 16% in the three years between 1993 and 1996. It might be the reason that the ratio of WID volunteers is regarded as sufficient by JICA.

The WID activities performed by JOCVs are restricted to a narrow range of sectors requiring development. In 1995, 541 volunteers were dispatched to work with women in the Third World. Among them, 184 volunteers (consisting 34% of total WID volunteers) were nurses, and other medical staff or nutritionists. Another 155 volunteers (29%) taught sewing, home economics, art craft or cooking to local women. This tendency was carried on to 1996. Among 535 volunteers dispatched, 184 (consisting 34% of total WID volunteers) were nurses, and other medical staff or nutritionist. Another 151 volunteers (28%) worked in areas of sewing, home economics, art craft or cooking. Most of the remaining volunteers were sports coaches or primary or secondary school teachers in both 1995 and 1996.

As is evidenced by the above listing of volunteers' activities, the work is likely to be chosen based on stereotyped perceptions of women's roles and needs and of what
contributes to women’s well-being. They are politically non-controversial. They are practical as entry points of intervention so that they do not automatically challenge gender relations and women’s roles.

For example, assistance in health sector surely respond to women’s demand on health services. However, how much health sector assistance can be effective to women’s empowerment? Improvement in women’s health depends in large part, on whether the root causes of women’s ill health are being addressed, and whether women’s subordination, hence their strategic interests are dealt with. Considering the nature of individual voluntary work, it is unlikely that measures addressing such strategic points, would be dealt with. Therefore, JOCV’s contributions improve the availability of health services, but there limited implications for the long-term effectiveness of on women’s well-being.

These activities which remain stereotyped around women’s domestic roles have been criticised by feminists. These interventions often assume that “women were predominantly housewives with ample free time who only needed ‘pin money’ for supplementary food or clothing” (Tinker 1990: 37-8). Also, the activities which intend to generate income through skills which women already have, remain “firmly within the female sphere” (Tinker 1990: 38), and do not challenge status quo. Effectiveness of such activities as sewing to facilitate women’s development is limited, since they only focus on women’s domestic tasks, and further restrict women to the status quo.

There, however, are other possibilities. Firstly, the kind of activities women take can be more varied, for example, holding a self defence class. Alternatively, some empowering activities can be added on to JOCV’s works. For example, sewing class would be combined with discussions of women’s rights. Or less politically controversial activity than this could be securing marketing opportunity for women to gain income from their sewing or setting up co-operatives. In this way JOCV’s activities could be more empowering.
Snyder also suggests sometimes starting projects with teaching women traditional skills like sewing is adequate (1995: 251). It is easier to start with teaching traditional skills, in terms of its acceptability by local people. Assigning women tasks of sewing or arts and crafts facilitate women’s self-empowerment process in certain contexts. Then what are the enhancing factors for it? For some women who have limited opportunity to take any activities outside their houses, the following things would be empowering, they are meeting other women, leaving home, ending isolation, being part of a group and participating in its activities. Those factors encourage and develop the “core” aspects of empowerment such as self esteem, sense of agency, and sense of self in wider context, (Rowlands 1997: 113). Minimum level of self-empowerment could be facilitated. This strategy, however, is significantly effective only when further transformative or empowering activities are added on. Without introducing non-traditional technologies or women taking up new activities, which strategically expand women’s control over resources, and induce transformation of gender relations, teaching women domestic skills unlikely encourage and develop process of empowerment.

The nature of JOCV’s activities, which is grassroots oriented, small in scale, and providing spaces for women to meet each other, has potential for women to raise awareness of their own life circumstances and identify their own needs. If these needs are addressed by further intervention, that would contribute to women’s empowerment. Longwe (1991) suggests in her framework named “Women’s Development Criteria”, that women’s empowerment and gender equality become further advanced when women’s issues derived from conscientisation is realised through women’s participation in decision making and women’s gaining equal control over resources and benefits with men (Longwe 1991: 150-153). Then as Aoki (1996) suggested that it is relevant for JICA to establish of co-operative system with JOCV, and to plan projects responding to women’ needs identified through JOCV’s activities.

**WID concept in Manual on Integrating WID Consideration into Development Programs**

83
Manual on Integrating WID Consideration into Development Programs was produced by the WID division in order to present JICA’s perception on WID and procedures to integrate WID consideration into JICA’s work. This is written for use of JICA’s staff and practitioners working for JICA’s programmes. Given that the Manual would be used by policy makers, planners and researchers who are not familiar with WID/GAD discourses, I think it is important any critical concepts which supports gender analysis, be explicitly articulated.

Awareness towards participation

The Manual presents the concept of participation and urges policy makers and planners to integrate a participatory approach into projects. Then, women’s participation in every stage of the project cycle would be ensured. Participation is often seen as a key to equity for women. Paying attention to women’s participation in development projects appears taken as state of gender-awareness. In Japan’s ODA annual report (1997) descriptions of how particular projects are related to WID, are provided. For example, JICA’s Development studies project, Feasibility Study on Road Rehabilitation and Improvement in Grenada says that:

"Examination of participation by women in road construction, as well as consideration for involvement by women in the maintenance and management of roads" (MoFA 1997: 81).

Question remains about what is the nature of women’s participation or involvement in a project by women. Participation in a project itself is not always automatically beneficial for women unless women have control, women’s autonomy is respected and women’s participation allows to make a project attuned to women’s needs. Women’s participation could mean utilisation of women’s labour seeking efficiency in the project. Development interventions need to employ a principle such as women’s autonomy or empowerment to determine and ensure nature of participation is beneficial one for women.
Awareness towards strategic interest

Although an idea of women’s participation is recognised, the Manual does not suggest the concept of practical needs and strategic interests. Without any explicit presentation of the concept of strategic interests, women’s strategic gender interests are unlikely to be recognised by policy makers and planners. Also, without strong emphasis on giving priority to addressing and realising women’s strategic interests, such political issue, as transformation of institutionalised gender inequality hardly become subject of implementation.

As we saw before, in order for women to be active agents to “promote equitable as well as sustainable development” (JICA 21 April 1995a), the strategy is not sufficient when it intends to use the current division of labour and responsibility only for making interventions efficient. It is important to identify strategic gender interests, as it will locate the “strategic points of intervention in different contexts” (Kabeer 1992: 35). Addressing women’s strategic interests in the same projects catalyse the projects addressing practical needs to be more redistributive with respect to responsibilities, resources and power.

The lack of presentation of the concept of strategic gender interests leaves room for translation of JICA’s concept of WID to policy makers/planners. For example, the concept of WID is given as

WID approach means implementing development projects with fair consideration of the gender division of labor, as well as different social needs between men and women in the target society. It aims to promote equitable as well as sustainable development through such projects (JICA 21 April 1998a).

Identification of the division of labour appears the key to the gender equity. In this description what the different social needs between men and women (JICA 1994 21 April 1998a) refer to is not obvious. It allows a project to solely pay attention to women’s practical needs, and remain blind to possible interests for changing the current division of
labour. Women’s social position or status are unlikely to be recognised or identified, hence altered.

Although an appropriate strategy is hardly identifiable, in the Manual JICA perceives the one of objects of projects is changing gender relations. The reason of necessity of WID consideration in development efforts is given as:

Many women living in developing countries are economically and socially disadvantaged, which prohibits just and equitable development of the society. Therefore, it is important to plan and implement development projects with a view to improve the social and economic status of women and to change gender relations\(^8\) (JICA 21 April 1998a).

The examples of the negative consequences of women’s disadvantages to development given with the above statement are the hampering effect of women’s low level of literacy for promotion of project addressing health and hygiene. The other example given is the effect of lack of knowledge about hygiene and state of malnutrition to high rate of maternal mortality and incidence of illness. The statement above urges policy-makers and planners to pay attention to women’s development and to consider more equitable resource distribution. These examples do not lead policy makers/planners attention beyond basic needs. It presents insufficient recognition of any strategy to change gender relations advocated by GAD thinkers.

The other reason for urging gender awareness in development co-operation is that:

\(^8\) However, the phrase “to change gender relations” is not expressed in the Japanese language version of the Manual, published in 1993, a year prior to English version published.
Due recognition of the “invisible roles” that women play in both economic and social activities in developing countries, will enhance the effectiveness of development projects (JICA 1994 internet).

This concept may raise policy makers’/planners’ awareness to the potential of women to contribute to development interventions. Productivity arguments may facilitate distribution of resources to women when their roles are identified. However, it is unlikely to redirect resources to women whose activities and access to resources are constrained because of subordination.

**WID view points**

In order to show how WID consideration can be integrated into development works, JICA provides very extensive examples of check points where project practitioners should pay attention. It also gives examples of constraints which women likely face at various occasions (e.g. participating in projects or planning), and suggests how such constraints could be overcome. This may mitigate gender blindness in projects. If these WID view points are fully utilised to design projects, gender equitable projects would be realised. Moreover, the Manual suggests for project planners to identify women’s groups and to catalyse their works in given projects. This could facilitate women’s empowerment, but without planners’ commitment for integrating empowerment strategy into their works under the circumstances of WID policy’s neglect of women’s collective empowerment, the extent of projects’ promoting women’s empowerment is uncertain.
Chapter 6: Conclusion

Favoured policy focuses

The antecedents of gender policy discourse mean that interaction between criticisms and demands towards development agencies which WID and GAD feminists made and the responses of development agencies to those feminist advocacy. That interaction shows that in what manners the agencies sort out the critiques and demands and the agencies favour particular concerns over others. Five policy approaches for WID discussed in Chapter One do not necessarily fully reflect feminists’ concerns.

Four focuses of policies are identified, those are women, expediency of development intervention, women’s issues which has political implication and the issues perceived as indispensable. There are two sets of criteria for prioritising policy focuses for development agencies. The first one is about beneficiaries of policies; whether policies put women at the centre of policy focus or prioritise the benefit of development projects and programmes. Women centred policies have developed around women’s development. On the other hand aid centred policies seek expediency of development intervention by integrating women. The second set of criteria is the type of women’s needs and interests sought to be address. There are policies seeking to address women’s issues with political connotation, such as gender equality, women’s advancement or women’s empowerment, while the others focus to meet the basic needs of the poor and disadvantaged. These four focuses of policies: women; expediency; political issues and the indispensable, are not mutually exclusive, in fact they all need to be concerned. However, some policy focuses have gained greater popularity over others among development agencies.

For example, the most accepted policy approach by development agencies is the efficiency approach whose centre concern is expediency of development interventions rather than women. Policy approaches which openly state their concern towards women as women centred policies, have tended to fail. The equity approach and the
empowerment approach fall in such category. Also, those two approaches have not been successful because of their political implications. The equity approach worked for advancement of women at all levels of society rather than just poor women, which consequently threatens men.

The critical balance of the criteria presented earlier is observed in the manipulation of the anti-poverty approach by development agencies. Although the anti-poverty approach dominantly focuses on women and there is no connotation of expediency to aid interventions, this approach gained acceptance since its predominant focus on poorest of the poor and income-generation appeared somewhat indispensable. However, addressing only women's needs, the anti-poverty approach has been refused its share of resources in mainstream planning hence has become marginalised. The similar account can be applied to the welfare approach which only addresses basic needs of the poor.

Overall, the most popular policy approach so far is the efficiency approach, whose popularity can be attributed to its aid centred expediency and no explicit interests in political issues of women. Also, policies addressing women's basic needs have successfully integrated into development agencies agendas.

The manner of institutionalisation of WID/GAD

WID has been criticised with its focus on 'integrating' women. The focus of the critiques take two different dimensions of the institutionalisation of gender awareness. The first is the location of WID/GAD intervention in agencies' whole operations (Fig. 6-1), the second is the relationship between women's voices and the mainstream agenda (Fig. 6-2). The fault in first dimension is well illustrated in the income-generation projects of the anti-poverty approach. Neglecting women in development efforts (Fig. 6-1-a) was criticised by WID advocates. Responding that critiques, development agencies 'integrated' projects targeting women, in the way of adding women in, but such WID specific projects remained small scale and allocated marginal positions in agencies' mainstream of operations (Fig. 6-1-b). Through this experience, feminists started
demanding to mainstream gender awareness, that is addressing women’s issues in mainstream projects and programmes. Such a mainstream development intervention which reflects gender-awareness is often called WID-integrated project. In this argument, the marginalisation of WID intervention is the problem and the solution is sought in mainstreaming WID intervention within development operation (Fig. 6-1-c).

The other line of critique towards 'integrating' women stems from women's discontent to be integrated into the asymmetrical world order which reproduces women's subordination (Fig. 6-2-a). This critique was made by GAD feminists when discussing the WID perspective. GAD feminists advocate an agenda-setting approach which seeks the transformation of the current development agenda with a gender perspective (Fig. 6-2-b). The key strategy is the participation of women as decision makers in determining development priorities and the ensuring centrality of women's agendas within
mainstream discourses. This would mean the nature, priority and direction of development would be fundamentally changed. Women would not merely share a part of the mainstream discourses but reorient the nature of the mainstream. The agenda-setting approach is suggested rather than integrating women into inequitable development process.

Those are two major critiques and demands made by WID and later GAD feminists towards development agencies practices. The mainstreaming approach of participation in and full benefit from a mainstream operation gained popularity among development agencies with its implication to collaborate with the efficiency approach. While aid agencies rarely refer to agenda-setting approach.

![Figure 6-2: Integrationist version and agenda-setting version of mainstreaming](image)

**Self-empowerment**

Empowerment has been suggested as an alternative and a complementary, bottom up approach to development. It is about people, especially the poor and disadvantaged taking control over their own lives. It appears there are different accounts on what is required to realise people's empowerment. By recognising power is an inherent characteristic of
social relations, the GAD perspective highlights that the poor and disadvantaged are in their given situation not only by material in availability but also and primarily by oppressive social relations. Given gender relations are a source of women’s oppression, tactics of women’s empowerment must challenge the unequal gender relations.

Therefore, feminists’ accounts give distinguished focus on some components of the empowerment process to which many of development agencies do not pay attention. In order to highlight empowerment as a strategy advocated by feminists who are seeking to change unequal gender relationships into more equitable ones for women, I use the term empowerment instead of self-empowerment. Ambiguity of the term ‘empowerment’ has allowed development initiatives to refer any kind of benefits from development intervention as empowering. Easier access to safe water is beneficial to those who had no access, such access per se, however, does not contribute to self-empowerment spontaneously. A project could encourage self-empowerment processes, for example, by designing the project to be transformative and raises the awareness of women about unequal gender division of labour in their society.

Self-empowerment largely refers to an intangible dimension of empowerment in the psychological and political arena. Examination of power operating in gender relations shows how women are oppressed; even they internalise the oppression. That highlights and suggests the necessity of addressing fundamentals of gender inequality. Self-empowerment is the strategy suggested, as well as transformative interventions which is informed by self-empowerment process.

Self-empowerment approach recognises the importance of women’s becoming able to analyse their situation critically. Conscientisation and awareness raising especially through group works are suggested as key components of the strategy for self-empowerment. Various activities such as travelling, discussion with other women, contribute to encourage and develop women’s self-esteem, confidence and dignity so on. It result in self-empowerment in individual level and between familial or close relationship. GAD feminists seek for self-empowerment to go beyond individual and
private levels; women’s collective political actions are anticipated. This movement from below would be a primary advocate of women themselves and ensures that women’s voices are heard, their needs are meet, and their interests addressed.

**Transformative intervention**

Development interventions planned by the agencies are given to emphasise the material needs of people. The strategy of transformative intervention to allows development projects and programmes to address practical needs which have potential for challenging the fundamentals of gender inequality. Such interventions are, for example, designed to stimulate the self-empowerment process or to challenge the gender division of labour. Combining women’s practical needs and strategic interests is also one of strategy. The strategic interests may, however, be identified after women are empowered to some extent.

Figure 6-3 shows that women’s self-empowerment processes may be facilitated through a WID-specific project which explicitly address women’s conscientisation and mobilisation. Also, both a WID-specific and a WID-integrated project which concern practical need could encourage the self-empowerment processes or have gender transformative effect by addressing needs and interests gender transformative way.
Figure 6-3: Types of project and implications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Project</th>
<th>WID Specific</th>
<th>WID Integrated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What to Address</td>
<td>Practical Needs</td>
<td>Women's and men's Needs and interests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Address</td>
<td>Gender Transformative way</td>
<td>Gender Neutral way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implication</td>
<td>Self empowerment</td>
<td>Gender Neutral way</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

JICA’s WID Policy

The central objective of Japan’s Initiative on WID, which was announced by Ministry of Foreign Affairs in 1995 is the promotion of to women participate in and benefit fully from the development effort. That is assumed to contribute to sustainable development, women’s empowerment and gender equality. The question here is how much did JICA’s projects and programmes, where women participated to achieve empowerment and gender equality for women.

In terms of the objectives of WID policy, JICA’s stance is in accordance with the tendency found in history of WID policies. JICA’s recognition of necessity of gender awareness in its work is about bringing equity to meeting practical or basic needs and
realising expedient or efficient development intervention. The priority areas of intervention given both in *Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development* and *Japan's Initiative on WID* are concentrated on basic needs, which are regarded as indispensable. With sufficient basic needs and benefit from their own participation in development projects and programmes, women are expected to liberate themselves.

With expediency interests JICA’s WID policy ensure to bring gender-awareness into mainstream operation. However, any women’s issues with political implication such as gender equality, women’s self-empowerment and women’s advancement are dismissed. Also, JICA does not consider the profound implication of gender construction; of asymmetrical power relations, gender ideology and identities attained by both genders and gender relations which support and reinforce gender inequality nor does JICA explicitly intend to challenge gender inequality from its foundation. Gender transformative intervention is not recognised, nor does not intend to challenge the current division of labour. Such intervention stays at a neutral level in terms of gender-awareness especially when goals and objectives of the intervention are predetermined by policy makers and planners.

**JICA’s programmes**

Chapter five of this study identified that agenda-setting is only seen as an ultimate goal of development efforts by JICA and appears not to be expected to provide a framework for strategies for women’s development and to be encountered through JICA’s regular operation. That limits the promotion of gender-awareness in and effectiveness of JICA’s women’s development effort.

JICA seems unaware that women’s underdevelopment and disadvantages are caused by women’s subordination, which is apparent of many societies, both donor as well as recipients countries. Hence, an institution like JICA itself could be a site of reproducing women’s subordination. Interests of capital also appears to hamper for women’s issues to get the attention of development planners. These concerns are induced from an analysis
of JICA's practice. The implemented projects, programmes and JOCV's activities do not appear to identify or reflect women's needs and interests fully and primarily. Also, the ratios of WID related projects and programmes to total assistance remains low and are not increasing. This implies that some particular entities involved in development practice 'power over' the decision-making process; in other words in face of the interests of those in power, resources are hardly allocated toward women in the Third World who are assigned lower status. Male domination and the notion of male superiority underlying policy making and planning processes are unrecognised and unaware by those involved in the processes. GAD perspective has increasingly recognised that a political will to promote women's development determines whether gender-awareness is diffused in development intervention. However, in aid dialogues gender-awareness is often argued only with implementation of gender analysis, participation in and benefit from development intervention. Gender-awareness needs to be practised not only in the site of development intervention in the Third World but also in policy making, planning, structures and practice of JICA itself.

Examination of what have been implemented for women through JICA's WID programmes shows that the 'what' of JICA's intervention does not imply a transformative effect; that endorses the policy focus. JICA approaches women's development through addressing their productive roles in a narrow range of sectors and meeting their basic needs which primarily involves education, health and water supply. This tendency can be observed in ranges of JICA's programmes from Expert Training Affairs to Project Type Technical Cooperation. Also, there are WID interventions which likely assign and constrict women to domestic reproductive roles, such as cooking and sewing. This kind of stereotyping was observed in JOCV's activities. These types of interventions appears easier to be approved by JICA due to Japan's ODA's current mainstream discourse, in which the concern on social development, human development and the basic human needs approach share Japan's ODA's attention with economic growth. In this context assistance for women is explained as an execution of justice in provision of basic human needs.
Hence, JICA offers little to women seeking greater access to the local, national and global decision-making process which control their lives. Women's strategic interest in making their voice heard and bringing gender issues in mainstream of public discourse is not regarded as a subject of intervention by JICA, rather is regarded to be achieved by women themselves after they sufficiently benefit from development and become capable to do so.

In conclusion, in terms of institutional aspect of WID policy, its concept and focuses limit JICA's programmes integrating gender transformative approach and allowing the space for women's agenda-setting. At the same time the policy also limits extending the scope of the agenda-setting approach to JICA's policy making and planning processes; women's ideologically subordinated position within the institution remains. That feeds back to the construction of WID policy and also affects planning process.

With its WID policy, JICA may achieve gender equity or equality of opportunity in its mainstream development co-operation, and may expect improvement in women's living conditions. However, JICA fails to argue implications of 'how' to meet women's needs; JICA has no intention of designing projects with transformatory potential for meeting women's strategic interests. Thus, JICA's co-operation has little possibility of challenging existing gender relations and inducing women's self-empowerment.
Bibliography


Kilby, Patrick ed. (1996) Australia’s Aid Program: mixed messages and conflicting agendas. Australia: Monash Asia Institute & Community Aid Abroad


**DOCUMENT OF THE JAPANESE GOVERNMENT**

Japan International Cooperation Agency (1991a) *Study on Development Assistance for Women in Development*.

Japan International Cooperation Agency (1991b) *Bunyabetsu (Kaihatu to Josei) Enjokenkyuukai Hokokusho*.

Japan International Cooperation Agency (1997) *Kokusai Kyoryoku Gigyodan Nenpo (JICA’s annual report, author’s translation)*


Ministry of Foreign Affairs (1995b) *Shakaiteki kousei o mezasite: shakai kaihatu to nihonno ODA* (Towering social equity: social development and Japan’s ODA) pamphlet

Ministry of Foreign Affairs (1997) *Japan’s ODA, Annual Report*