LANGUAGE SWITCHING IN AVIATION

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Aviation
at Massey University, Manawatū, New Zealand.

Martina Daskova
2018
Eternal rest grant unto the victims of aircraft accidents, O Lord, and let perpetual light shine upon them. For the sake of Your sorrowful passion, may their souls rest in peace.

Amen
Abstract

Clear and precise communication between pilots and air traffic controllers is a precondition for safe operations. Communication has long been identified as a major element of the cockpit–controller interface, explaining one third of general aviation incidents (Etem & Patten, 1998). Yet, despite multilingualism with English as the lingua franca being a characteristic of aviation communication, little research appears to have investigated the efficiency of operation of bilinguals alternating between their dominant, usually native, language and English in a bilingual air traffic environment.

The studies undertaken for this research sought to rectify this situation by examining the cognitive aspects of situation awareness during language switching in aviation. Quantitatively and qualitatively analysed responses to an online-distributed survey aimed at investigating the current bilingual situation in aviation revealed that while situation awareness for the majority (76%) of native-English speakers was adversely affected by bilingualism, almost 30% of bilinguals also reported their situation awareness being affected. Subsequent experimental analyses using a language switching paradigm investigated how participants recognize a target call sign, identify an error and predict in bilingual compared with monolingual English conditions. The effect of the language condition participants’ native Chinese only, English only, or a mix of both, varied across the three tasks. Call sign recognition performance was found to be faster in the English condition than in the bilingual condition, but accuracy did not differ, a finding that was attributed to the effect of call sign similarity. However, when the task was more complicated, the difference between the conditions diminished. No effect on performance was found for simultaneously listening to two speech sources, which is potentially analogous to cockpit communication and radio calls. The error analyses served to test for response bias by calculating sensitivity, $d'$, and decision criterion $C$ in accordance with Stanislaw and Todorov’s (1999) Signal Detection Theory calculations.

Several cognitive implications for practice were proposed, for example, in Crew Resource Management (CRM) training and personal airmanship development, exploration of own behavioural biases might be used to adjust the placement of the criterion. The cognitive implications largely focused on affecting attitudes to increase awareness. Attention was focused on performance of bilinguals to identify which language condition facilitated faster and more accurate responses. The findings were unable to support any of the conditions, leaving the question: Would a universal language for communication on radio frequencies be worth considering, to allow everyone to understand what is said? Disentangling the effects of language switching on the performance of bilingual pilots and air traffic controllers remains a task for future studies.
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my appreciation to several people for their support and advice over the last three years on my PhD journey. I hold a deep sense of gratitude to my main supervisor, Dr Andrew Gilbey, for his patience, who, despite my shortcomings, helped me to persevere on the right research path. My sincere thanks belongs also to Dr Michael MacAskill from the New Zealand Brain Research Institute, who helped me with the development of the experiments using the PsychoPy software. I am grateful to my second supervisor, Dr Savern Rewetti, and to the entire School of Aviation, for supporting me in all my milestones; whether it was time to recruit participants or was there an opportunity to share my research findings at a conference. I would also like to thank Sarah Fifield for her valuable and insightful comments and suggestions to improve the quality of the thesis. Special thanks to Sherryn Irvine for her support, not only in a work environment, but also for sharing with me a loving atmosphere within her community of friends. Last, but not least, I am grateful to my entire family, who always pooled their resources so that I would be able to complete my studies in comfort.

I give thanks to my best friend, Lord Jesus Christ. Terima kasih, Lord, my Hero, for the gift of all the people during these years and for everything You do for us, within us, and through us. Pardon me as well, for too often I am not even aware of how much you help me, how much You unceasingly care. Mistakes are mine, the good comes from the Lord Jesus Christ.

I wanted to fly; You removed the solid ground.
CONTENTS

Chapter One ......................................................................................................................... 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background of the Study ............................................................................................... 1
1.2. Thesis Outline ................................................................................................................. 4

Chapter Two ........................................................................................................................ 6

THE STUDY CONTEXT

2.1. Bilingualism: Definition and Use .................................................................................. 6
2.2. Bilingual Air Traffic Environment .................................................................................. 7
2.3. Bilingualism as a Contributing Factor in Safety Occurrences ...................................... 8
2.4. Bilingual Air Traffic Conflict ....................................................................................... 10
2.5. English Language Proficiency Regulation in Aviation .................................................. 12
2.6. Language Issues in Aviation after ICAO LPR Implementation .................................... 13

Chapter Three .................................................................................................................... 17

LITERATURE REVIEW

Part I: Defining the Concepts

3.1. Overview ....................................................................................................................... 17
3.2. The Importance of SA in Aviation .................................................................................. 17
3.3. Bilingualism, SA and Cognition ..................................................................................... 23
3.4. Bilingual IFR Communications Simulation Studies ...................................................... 27
3.5. Language Switching ....................................................................................................... 29
3.6. Contrasting Chinese and English Language ................................................................... 34
    3.6.1. Pronunciation and Accent ...................................................................................... 36
    3.6.2. Number of Instructions in One Transmission ....................................................... 37
    3.6.3. Grammar Issues ..................................................................................................... 37
3.7. Numerical Processing .................................................................................................... 39

Part II: Methodological Considerations

3.8. Methodological Considerations ....................................................................................... 44
3.9. The Reason for Including Signal Detection Theory ..................................................... 46
3.10. SDT, SA, and Bilingualism .......................................................................................... 47
3.11. Yes–No Procedure ................................................................. 49
3.12. Response Time: The Challenge ................................................................. 50
3.13. Markers for Language Control ................................................................. 53
3.14. Discriminability Index and Decision Criterion .............................................. 55
3.15. Background Noise and Speech to Noise Ratio .............................................. 59

Part III: Summary

3.16. Summary of the Literature Review ................................................................. 60
3.17. Identification of the Research Problem ......................................................... 62
3.18. Identification of the Research Questions ....................................................... 62

Chapter Four ........................................................................................................ 64

STUDY 1: Pilot and ATCO Current Language Experiences

4.1. Introduction ......................................................................................... 64
4.2. Method .................................................................................................. 66
  4.2.1. Participants ................................................................................... 66
  4.2.2. Materials ...................................................................................... 66
  4.2.3. Procedure .................................................................................... 71
4.3. Results .................................................................................................. 72
  4.3.1. General findings .......................................................................... 72
  4.3.2. Bilingual Air Traffic Environment ...................................................... 74
  4.3.3. Perceived Effects on SA ................................................................. 76
  4.3.4. Experienced Consequences .............................................................. 78
4.4. Discussion .............................................................................................. 81

Chapter Five ........................................................................................................ 87

STUDY 2: Call Sign Recognition

5.1. Introduction ........................................................................................... 87
  5.1.1. Call Sign Aviation Regulation and Research ........................................... 87
5.2. Method .................................................................................................. 89
  5.2.1. Overview ....................................................................................... 89
  5.2.2. Participants .................................................................................... 89
  5.2.3. Design .......................................................................................... 90
  5.2.4. Materials ...................................................................................... 93
  5.2.5. Procedure .................................................................................... 99
5.3. Results ........................................................................................................................................... 100
  5.3.1. General Findings ....................................................................................................................... 100
  5.3.2. Performance Speed ................................................................................................................... 104
  5.3.3. Performance Accuracy ............................................................................................................. 110
  5.3.4. SDT Measures .......................................................................................................................... 113
  5.4. Discussion ................................................................................................................................... 114

Chapter Six ........................................................................................................................................... 120

STUDY 3: Error Identification

6.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................................... 120
  6.1.1. Detection of Erroneous Message ............................................................................................... 121
  6.2. Method ......................................................................................................................................... 124
    6.2.1. Overview ................................................................................................................................. 124
    6.2.2. Participants ............................................................................................................................. 124
    6.2.3. Design ..................................................................................................................................... 125
    6.2.4. Materials .................................................................................................................................. 127
    6.2.5. Procedure ............................................................................................................................... 131
  6.3. Results ........................................................................................................................................... 132
    6.3.1. General findings ....................................................................................................................... 132
    6.3.2. Performance Speed ................................................................................................................ 133
    6.3.3. Performance Accuracy ........................................................................................................... 141
    6.3.4. SDT Measures ........................................................................................................................ 143
    6.4. Discussion ................................................................................................................................... 144

Chapter Seven ...................................................................................................................................... 149

STUDY 4: Prediction

7.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................................... 149
  7.1.1. Many Terms, Same Concept? Anticipation, Prediction, Expectation, Projection ..... 150
  7.1.2. Number Series ........................................................................................................................ 152
  7.2. Method ......................................................................................................................................... 153
    7.2.1. Overview ................................................................................................................................. 153
    7.2.2. Participants ............................................................................................................................. 153
    7.2.3. Design ..................................................................................................................................... 154
    7.2.4. Materials .................................................................................................................................. 157
List of Tables

Table 1 Information–Response Matrix .......................................................... 49
Table 2 Demographic: First Language of Participants by Language Families, and Percentage of Participants Speaking more than Two Languages across Corresponding Language Families ................................................................. 74
Table 3 Survey Participants’ Experiences of Countries Using Bilingual ...................... 75
Table 4 Perceived Effects of Language Alternation on Situation Awareness of Native- and Non-Native English-Speaking Participants ......................................................... 76
Table 5 Reported Frequency of Experienced Struggles to Speak English by Non-Native English-Speaking Participants ................................................................. 78
Table 6 The Consequences of Difficulties Related to Bilingual Air Traffic ..................... 79
Table 7 ICAO Rating Scale, CEFR, and IELTS Comparison Chart ................................ 98
Table 8 Mean Response Times (RT), Mean Durations of Stimuli, and Mean Pure RT in Seconds in First (L1), Second (L2), and Language Switching (Mix) Conditions ........ 103
Table 9 Median (Mdn) Pure Response Times in Seconds across Language Condition and Inter-stimulus Interval (ISI) Factors ................................................................. 107
Table 10 Median (Mdn) Pure Response Times in Seconds across Language Condition and Similarity Factors .................................................................................... 107
Table 11 Median (Mdn) Pure Response Times in Seconds on Chinese and English Word Stimuli in Monolingual (L1 and L2) and Language Switching (Mix) Conditions: Mixing Costs and Switch Costs ................................................................. 108
Table 12 Mean Pure Response Times in Seconds across the English Language Proficiency Levels ................................................................................................................ 109
Table 13 Error Types (Miss and False Alarm), Hits and Correct Rejections (CR), and Total Number of Errors across Language Conditions, and Percentage of Errors from 5100 Stimuli (%ErrorT) ........................................................................................................ 110
Table 14 Number (nerrors) and Percentage of Errors (%ErrorL) across ISI Levels and as a Proportion of Total Number of Stimuli (nstimuli) in Each ISI Level (%ErrorSI) ........ 111
Table 15 Number (nerrors) and Percentage of Errors (%ErrorS) across Levels of Similarity Factor (%ErrorS), and as a Proportion of Total Number of Stimuli (nstimuli) in Each Level of Similarity Factor (nstimuli) ........................................................ 112
Table 16 Frequency of Correct Responses and Errors, and Percentage of Errors (%Errors) across English Language Proficiency Levels ........................................................................ 113
Table 17 Sensitivity (d’) and Decision Criterion (C) of Call Sign Recognition Task across the Three Language Conditions: Native (Chinese) Language (L1), Second (English) Language (L2), and Language Switching (Mix) ........................................................... 113
Table 18 Mean Response Times (RT), Mean Durations of Stimuli, and Mean Pure RT in Seconds, in First (L1), Second (L2), and Language Switching (Mix) Conditions ........ 133
Table 19 Median (Mdn) Pure Response Times in Seconds across Language Condition and Inter-stimuli Interval (ISI) Factors ......................................................................... 136
Table 20 Median (Mdn) Pure Response Times in Seconds on Correct Rejections (CR) and Hits across the Language Condition Factor .................................................................... 137
Table 21 Median (Mdn) Pure Response Times in Seconds on Chinese and English Word Stimuli for Correct Rejections (CR), Hits and Both Combined in Monolingual (L1 and L2) and Language Switching (Mix) Conditions; Mixing Costs and Switch Costs. 138
Table 22 Mean Pure Response Times in Seconds across the English Language Proficiency Levels ................................................................................................................ 139
Table 23 Error Types (Miss and False Alarm), Hits and Correct Rejections (CR), Total Number of Errors and “Say Again” Requests across Language Conditions, and Percentage of Errors from 5200 stimuli (%Error) ................................................................. 141
Table 24 Number (n_{errors}) and Percentage of Errors (%Error_E) across ISI Levels and as a Proportion of Total Number of Stimuli (n_{stimuli}) in Each ISI Level (%Error_{ISI}) .................... 142
Table 25 Number of Participants (n), Correct Responses and Errors, and Percentage of Errors (%Errors) across English Language Proficiency Levels ............................................................. 143
Table 26 Sensitivity (d’) and Decision Criterion (C) of Error Identification Task across the Three Language Conditions: Native (Chinese) Language (L1), Second (English) Language (L2), and Language Switching (Mix) .............................................................. 144
Table 27 Mean Response Times (RT), Mean Durations of Stimuli, and Mean Pure RT in Seconds in First (L1), Second (L2), and Language Switching (Mix) Conditions ............ 164
Table 28 Mean Pure Response Times in Seconds and Standard Deviations (SD) across Language Condition and Position Factors .......................................................... 167
Table 29 Mean Pure Response Times in Seconds and Standard Deviations (SD) across Language Condition and Pattern Factors .......................................................... 167
Table 30 Mean Pure Response Times in Seconds across the English Language Proficiency Levels .................................................................................................................. 168
Table 31 Error Types (Miss and False Alarm), Hits and Correct Rejections (CR), and Total Number of Errors across Language Conditions, and Percentage of Errors from 1920 Stimuli (%Error) ........................................................................ 169
Table 32 Number (n_{errors}) and Percentage of Errors (%Error_E) across Levels of Position Factor and as a Proportion of Total Number of Stimuli in Each Position Factor Level (%Error_P) ................................................................................ 170
Table 33 Number (n_{errors}) and Percentage of Errors (%Error_E) across Pattern Factor Levels and as a Proportion of Total Number of Stimuli in Each Pattern Factor Level (%Error_P) ................................................................................ 170
Table 34 Number of Participants (n), Correct Responses and Errors, and Percentage of Errors (%Errors) across English Language Proficiency Levels ............................................................. 171
Table 35 Sensitivity (d’) and Decision Criterion (C) of Prediction Task across the Three Language Conditions: Native (Chinese) Language (L1), Second (English) Language (L2), and Language Switching (Mix) .............................................................. 171
Table 36 Mean Response Times (RT), Mean Durations of Stimuli, and Mean Pure RT in Seconds in Second (L2) and Language Switching (Mix) Conditions across the Three Tasks with Background Talk (Call Sign Recognition, Error Identification, and Prediction) .............................................................. 193
Table 37 Mean Pure Response Times in Seconds across Language Condition and Background Talk Factors .................................................................................................................. 194
Table 38 Median (Md) Pure Response Times in Seconds on Chinese and English Word Stimuli in Monolingual (L2) and Language Switching (Mix) Conditions: Mixing Costs and Switch Costs .................................................................................................................. 195
Table 39 Mean Pure Response Times in Seconds and Standard Deviations (SD) across Language Condition and Background Talk Factors .................................................................................................................. 196
Table 40 Median (Md) Pure Response Times in Seconds on Chinese and English Word Stimuli in Monolingual (L2) and Language Switching (Mix) Conditions: Mixing Costs and Switch Costs .................................................................................................................. 196
Table 41 Mean Pure Response Times in Seconds and Standard Deviations (SD) across Language Condition and Background Talk Factors .................................................................................................................. 197
Table 42  Number and Percentage of Errors across the Tasks and Background Talks .......... 198
Table 43  Number and Percentage of Errors across the Tasks and Language Conditions, Total Number of Errors (Totals), Total Number of Stimuli within Tasks (N), and Percentage of Total Number of Errors (%ErrorT) within Tasks.......................................................... 199
Table 44  Distribution of Errors (Miss and False Alarm), Hits and Correct Rejections (CR) in Call Sign Recognition Task, Total Number of Errors across Language Conditions, and Percentage of Errors from 1350 Stimuli (%ErrorT)...................................................... 200
Table 45  Distribution of Errors (Miss and False Alarm), Hits and Correct Rejections (CR) in Error Identification Task, Total Number of Errors across Language Conditions, and Percentage of Errors from 1080 Stimuli (%ErrorT)...................................................... 200
Table 46  Distribution of Errors (Miss and False Alarm), Hits and Correct Rejections (CR) in Prediction Task, Total Number of Errors across Language Conditions, and Percentage of Errors from 720 Stimuli (%ErrorT)...................................................... 200
Table 47  Sensitivity (d') and Decision Criterion (C) across the Three Tasks (Call Sign Recognition, Error Identification, and Prediction), and Two Language Conditions, Second (English) Language (L2), and Language Switching (Mix) .................. 201
Table 48  Mean Pure Response Times in Seconds (M), Standard Deviations (SD), Error Counts and Percentage of Errors within Conditions (%Error) of Call Sign Recognition (Task 1), Error Identification (Task 2), and Prediction (Task 3) Tasks with and without Background Talk................................................................. 214
Table 49  Comparison of Sensitivity (D') and Decision Criterion (C) of the Three Tasks Conducted with and without Background Talk in Second (English) Language (L2), and Language Switching (Mix) Conditions ................................................................. 217
List of Figures

Figure 1. Formulas for calculating the switch costs................................................................. 54
Figure 2. Formula for calculating the mixing costs................................................................. 55
Figure 3. Normal Q-Q plot for the outlier data point (L2, ISI 1, Similarity 2)...................... 101
Figure 4. Normal Q-Q plot for the outlier data point (L2, ISI 3, Target).......................... 102
Figure 5. Interaction plots for Language condition, ISI, and Similarity factors.............. 105
Figure 6. Profile plots for English language proficiency groups in the L2 and Mix conditions.. 109
Figure 7. Interaction plot for Language condition and ISI factors....................................... 134
Figure 8. Profile plots for the English language proficiency groups in the L2 and Mix
    conditions. ......................................................................................................................... 140
Figure 9. Interaction plots for Language condition, Position, and Pattern factors.............. 166
Figure 10. Profile plots for the English language proficiency groups in the L2 and the Mix
    conditions. ......................................................................................................................... 168
Figure 11. Study 5 flow diagram with three consecutive tasks performed under background talk; the Call sign recognition, Error identification, and Prediction tasks.............. 180
Figure 16. Profile plots for Background talk factor across the three tasks (Call sign recognition,
    Error identification, Prediction), and two language conditions (L2, Mix). .................... 216
List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASRS</td>
<td>Aviation Safety Reporting System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATC</td>
<td>Air traffic control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATCO</td>
<td>Air traffic controller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAA</td>
<td>Civil Aviation Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CR</td>
<td>Correct rejection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRM</td>
<td>Crew Resource Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESL</td>
<td>English as a second language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FA</td>
<td>False alarm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAA</td>
<td>Federal Aviation Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICAO</td>
<td>International Civil Aviation Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IELTS</td>
<td>International English Language Testing System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISI</td>
<td>Inter-stimulus interval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L1</td>
<td>Native language experimental condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L2</td>
<td>Second language experimental condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPRs</td>
<td>Language Proficiency Requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mix</td>
<td>Language switching experimental condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NES</td>
<td>Native English Speaking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTSB</td>
<td>National Transportation Safety Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPDM</td>
<td>Recognition Primed Decision Making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RT</td>
<td>Response time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>Situation awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDT</td>
<td>Signal Detection Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNR</td>
<td>Speech to Noise Ratio</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>