The search for sustainable competitive advantage:

A stakeholder management perspective

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

of

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Management

at Massey University, Albany

New Zealand

Minyu Wu

2010
Abstract

Competitive advantage and stakeholder management are two important research streams that have attracted much attention during the past two decades. Although competitive advantage is the core issue of strategic management in which stakeholder management is rooted, the two topics have developed seemingly independently in the literature.

The main purpose of this thesis is to explore how stakeholder management influences competitive advantage. The research is guided by a theoretical framework that employs a stakeholder perspective, linking three perspectives of competitive advantage—the resource-based view, the relational view, and the activity-position view. The general research approach chosen is a qualitative, multiple-case study. Ten cases were selected, from leading firms of several industries in Taiwan, and in-depth interviews were conducted.

Results showed that a firm’s competitive advantage comes from its resource capacity (superior resources, unique capabilities, and solid relationships) and a mix of activities that respond to the competitive context. Competitive advantage, too, can be analysed in terms of two components: resource advantage and positional advantage. Stakeholder management can have significant influences on resource advantages as stakeholders play important roles in the process of value creation. They are the providers who supply valued resources to the firm and, as such, can act as catalysts or hindrances that either facilitate or impede the generation of valued resources. Successful stakeholder management strengthens a firm’s resource profile and thus enhances its resource advantages. Stakeholder management also has considerable influences on positional advantages, as stakeholders are relevant to activities and drivers that determine cost and differentiation. Moreover, stakeholders are key players in the competitive context, who help to shape the competitiveness of the firm.

The study reported that stakeholder management helps to sustain competitive advantage through advancing a firm’s resource capacity—resource commitment, developing capabilities, and building relationships. Stakeholder management also generates several isolating mechanisms that preserve competitive advantage, including time compression diseconomies, causal ambiguity, social complexity, and transaction costs. However, in the face of ever-changing situations, managers need to adopt different strategies for managing stakeholder relations. To achieve sustained competitive advantage in a dynamic context, firms not only have to strengthen the capacity of resource advantage to fit the competitive strategy, but also need to use innovative and entrepreneurial approaches for managing their stakeholder relations.
Acknowledgements

First, I owe particular gratitude to my supervisor, Dr. Gabriel Eweje, for his invaluable supervision of this thesis. He has mentored and guided me for the past four years and cultivated my capabilities of research and teaching at the same time. He gave me many insightful and constructive comments along my research journey. It is always a pleasure to work with Gabriel and I appreciate his remarkable help very much.

I also want to acknowledge my co-supervisor, Professor Tim Bentley, for his time and efforts in support, encouragement and priceless comments. He is a knowledgeable and considerate person. I am deeply indebted to him for his great help.

In addition, I would like to thank all the interviewees who spared their time from their tight schedules to participate in this research. Without their help, it would have been impossible for me to complete this study.

Finally, I would like to thank my fantastic wife and my two children for being in support of me all the time. I am so glad I have finished this thesis and I would like to dedicate it to them.
Table of Contents

Abstract i
Acknowledgement ii
Table of contents iii

Chapter 1: Introduction 1
1.1 Background 1
1.2 Motivation for this study 5
1.3 Justification for the study 6
1.4 Research focus 13
1.5 Key concepts 15
1.6 Research objective, goals and questions 18
1.7 Organisation of the study 20

Chapter 2: Literature review 23
2.1 Introduction 23
2.2 Competitive advantage 23
   2.2.1 The concept of competitive advantage 24
   2.2.2 Perspectives of competitive advantage 28
   2.2.3 Common issues related to competitive advantage 47
2.3 Stakeholder management 50
   2.3.1 The concept of stakeholders 51
   2.3.2 Perspectives of stakeholder theory 54
   2.3.3 Stakeholder management and strategy 66
2.4 Linkage between stakeholder management and competitive advantage 71
2.5 Conclusion 75

Chapter 3: Theoretical framework and methodology 76
3.1 Introduction 76
3.2 Theoretical framework 76
3.3 Approach of the research 88
3.4 Case selection and recruitment 92
3.5 Data collection 98
   3.5.1 Semi-structured interviews 98
   3.5.2 Documentary data 99
3.6 Data analysis 100
3.7 Reliability and validity 103
# Table of Contents

3.8 Ethical considerations 106
3.9 Summary of case companies 107
3.10 Conclusion 124

Chapter 4: Integrating different perspectives of competitive advantage 126
4.1 Introduction 126
4.2 Resource advantages 129
  4.2.1 Resources acquired from the markets 129
  4.2.2 Resources built or accumulated internally 133
  4.2.3 Resources acquired or generated through inter-firm partnerships 135
  4.2.4 Resources built or generated through other channels 140
  4.2.5 Developing a resource profile through numerous sources 142
4.3 Positional advantages 144
  4.3.1 The resource portfolios and positional advantages 146
  4.3.2 The role of activities and drivers 150
  4.3.3 The influences of the competitive context 162
  4.3.4 Configuring activities as responses to the competitive context 166
4.4 Towards an integrative approach 168
4.5 Conclusion 171

Chapter 5: Stakeholder management influences on sources of competitive advantage 173
5.1 Introduction 173
5.2 Stakeholder management influences on resource advantages 175
5.3 Stakeholder management influences on positional advantages 189
5.4 Discussion 199
5.5 Conclusion 204

Chapter 6: Sustaining competitive advantage through stakeholder management 206
6.1 Introduction 206
6.2 The dynamic perspective of the firm and activities related to sustained competitive advantage 210
  6.2.1 Resource commitments 210
  6.2.2 Developing capabilities 221
  6.2.3 Building relationships 230
  6.2.4 A comprehensive version of the dynamic perspective of the firm 238
# Table of Contents

6.3 Isolating mechanisms created by stakeholder management 241
   6.3.1 Time compression diseconomies 241
   6.3.2 Causal ambiguity 245
   6.3.3 Social complexity 248
   6.3.4 Transaction costs 252
   6.3.5 A stakeholder perspective of isolating mechanisms 257

6.4 Conclusion 259

Chapter 7: The manager’s role in developing competitive advantage in a multiple stakeholder context 261
   7.1 Introduction 261
   7.2 The concept of balancing different stakeholder demands 264
      7.2.1 Dimensions of balancing different stakeholder demands 265
      7.2.2 How to balance stakeholder demands 270
   7.3 Balancing stakeholder demands and competitive advantage 275
      7.3.1 Supporting an effective mix of resources 276
      7.3.2 Sustaining competitive advantage 279
   7.4 Dynamic stakeholder relations and strategies for managing stakeholders 282
      7.4.1 Developing and maintaining relations with existing stakeholders 284
      7.4.2 Creating relations with new stakeholders 289
      7.4.3 Sustained competitive advantage and managing new stakeholder relations 294
   7.5 Conclusion 297

Chapter 8: Conclusion, limitation and further research 299
   8.1 Introduction 299
   8.2 Thesis overview 299
   8.3 Research findings 302
   8.4 Contribution and implications of this study 307
   8.5 Limitations of the study and further research 313

Notes 316
References 319
# Table of Contents

## Appendices
- Appendix 1: Interview schedule 360
- Appendix 2: Case study protocol 361
- Appendix 3: Coding list 363

## List of Tables
- Table 1.1: The research goals of the study 20
- Table 2.1: A summary of definitions in the competitive advantage literature 26
- Table 3.1: Comparing different perspectives of competitive advantage 84
- Table 3.2: Profiles of case companies 97
- Table 4.1: Empirical findings: Source of resource advantages 143
- Table 4.2: Positional strategies of case companies 147
- Table 4.3: Empirical findings: Source of positional advantages 151
- Table 5.1: Empirical findings: Stakeholder management and resource advantages 177
- Table 5.2: Empirical findings: Stakeholder management and positional advantages 191
- Table 6.1: Empirical findings: Stakeholder management and advancing resource capacity 212
- Table 6.2: Empirical findings: Stakeholder management and isolating mechanisms 242

## List of Figures
- Figure 3.1: An analytical theoretical framework 77
- Figure 7.1: The concept of balancing stakeholder demands 272
- Figure 7.2: A framework of managing dynamic stakeholder relations 284