

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**A Profile and Longitudinal Evaluation of Multiple Risk  
Factors, Protective Factors, and Outcomes for Suicidal and  
non-Suicidal out-of-home Adolescents who applied for the  
Independent Youth Benefit (IYB)**

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment  
of the requirements for the  
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

By

NARELLE DAWSON

---

Massey University

2005

Copyright by Narelle Dawson 2005

All rights reserved

©

## ABSTRACT

This research contributes new knowledge to those working in the areas of welfare, child and adolescent safety, and suicide prevention. The aim of this thesis was to succinctly provide clinicians, government and community agencies, researchers and policy advisors, with a snapshot profile of 2029 welfare seeking young people who were homeless and frequently discouraged by negative life events. The research aim was to identify risk and protective factors that impact life outcomes for those seeking the Independent Youth Benefit (IYB), and particularly, to scrutinize salient factors that led a vulnerable group of IYB applicants to die by suicide. It was further aimed that by documenting comments from 200 young adults from this population across a span of seven years, both gaps within the IYB process, as well as useful resources, could be identified in order to improve life outcomes for other homeless youth. For those who attempted suicide and survived, file records and interviews have indicated the triggers and life histories that potentially impacted their decision to try to end their pain of life, and factors that influenced survival and recovery.

Four separate studies were included in this thesis. Study 1 profiled 2029 IYB applicants and determined the most potent risks that led to the granting of the IYB. Study 2 revealed the salient factors that related to the suicide of 6 IYB applicants. Study 3 investigated the outcomes for those who were granted or declined a benefit across the variables of education, employment, income, adverse life circumstances, wellbeing, and family relationships. Study 4 examined a psychological construct, termed cynical distrust, which appeared to be a characteristic trait in welfare seeking youth.

Conclusions from this research provided indicators of youth who will usually be granted an IYB, they are, those who report bullying, abuse, parent psychopathology, single parent homes, a parent on a benefit and foster placement. Applicants who reported suicidal thoughts and suicide attempts and had contact with Police and Child Youth and Family Services also were more likely to be granted an Independent Youth Benefit (IYB). If the applicants were Maori and had previously seen a counsellor for a mental health problem, they also were more likely to receive the IYB. However, when applicants were referred to Family Reconciliation Counselling (FRC), there was a statistically significant association between benefit application and benefit declined.

A unique finding from this population related to the association of 'unknown fathers' with suicide. Absent father literature is now extensive, however, little research has been conducted into the effects of 'unknown fathers', particularly for Maori youth who place much of their strength and wellbeing in their genealogy. Other salient factors leading to suicide for IYB applicants included, previous suicide attempt, co-morbid disorder, unresolved anger, no identified caring adult, foster placement and an impending legal or disciplinary event. Maori males with such factors posed the greatest risk for suicide. Counsellors, psychologists, families and policy analysts need to acknowledge that IYB applicants who attempted suicide, show cynical distrust, and were declined a benefit, had extremely poor life outcomes. The New Zealand youth welfare system could be functioning far more efficiently if documented recommendations become realities.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Four girls and four men deserve special thanks. The girls are my four daughters who shared their mum with research for several years. Jordana, you taught your mum so much about computers, thank-you for always my darling. The four men are Professor Ian Evans (supervisor), Don Baken (statistical expert), Malcolm Ware (computer specialist) and Adrian Woodgate (APA perfectionist). Thank-you Ian for your wisdom, Don for your generosity in sharing your expertise and time, Malcolm for your exceptional knowledge of technology, and Adrian for your methodical editing of my references. Four amazing teachers who went the extra mile, thank-you. I am also extremely grateful to the Te Rapa Rotary Club, especially Charlie Dunbar and Geoff Brazier, for their continued support, and to the Social Policy Evaluation and Research committee for awarding me the SPEaR Doctoral Scholarship.

### *Dedication*

This thesis is dedicated to Cassie, whose file recorded the words, “I’m just a black bitch, I’ve become the monster he created, I’m directionless, Godless, and fatherless.” Cassie died by hanging after she had been sexually abused for years by her step-father who was consumed by pornography, yet publicly admired for his sporting prowess. For all who support the pornography industry, and who keep secrets about abuse within families, you carry the guilt of her death on your shoulders.



## LIST OF TABLES

<i>Table</i>	<i>Page</i>
1.1 Numerical Trends Showing Demographic and Risk Predictor Variables for Both European and Maori IYB Applicants from 1995-2001.	64
1.2 Chi-Square Analysis Investigating Association of Factors Reported by IYB Applicants at an Assessment Interview with the Granting of the IYB.	67
1.3 Ethnicity Comparison of Maori/European IYB Applicants' Suicide Attempts and Resulting Death Rates.	68
2.1 Rates of Suicides per 100,000 for Youth 13-16 Years of Age in Contact with Child, Youth and Family (Average for 1994-1998), Compared with General Population not in Contact with the Department from Beautrais, Ellis and Smith (2001).	102
2.2 Retrospective File Audits Identifying Risks Leading to Suicide and Assets Leading to Survival Following A Suicide Attempt.	119
2.3 Seven Salient Risk Factors Retrospectively Associated with Six IYB Suicides.	121
3.1 Outcomes for 200 Ex-IYB Applicants (One-Way ANOVA).	155
3.2 Outcomes for all Subgroups Ranging from Best to Poorest Across Education, Employment, Income, Adverse Life, Wellbeing, and Family Relationships.	157
4.1 Cynical Distrust Scores for IYB Participants Who Attempt Suicide and Who do not Attempt Suicide.	186

## LIST OF FIGURES

<i>Figure</i>	<i>Page</i>
1.1 Social wellbeing for Maori, relative to Europeans/Pakeha.	36
1.2 Snapshot profiles of 2029 youth who applied for the IYB between 1995-2001 showing common risk factors and demographics.	61
1.3 Frequency distribution of risk factors based on ethnicity for 2029 youth who applied for the IYB between 1995-2001.	66
2.1 Conceptual model of domains of factors for suicidal behaviours among young people.	89
2.2 Percentage comparisons between risk factors for six deceased youth and thirty-six surviving IYB controls.	118
3.1 Mean outcome scores for the four subgroups across the combined variables of education, employment, income, adverse life events, wellbeing, and family relationships.	154
4.1 Total cynical distrust score distribution for 324 high school students.	187
4.2 Total cynical distrust score distribution (tri-modal) for IYB cohort.	187

**LIST OF APPENDICES**

<i>Appendix</i>		<i>Page</i>
A	Conclusions and recommendations targeting, families, schools, policy advisors, and suicide prevention and bereavement personnel	223
B	Outcome Questionnaire	265
C	Scoring Measure for Outcome Questionnaire	273
D	Approval to proceed with research (letter from the Ministry of Social Development)	276
E	Information letter to participants regarding the research	277
F	New Zealand Health Information Service letter outlining access procedure to names of suicide victims	279