Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
HEAR OUR BOYS’ VOICES: WHAT HINDERS AND ENHANCES THEIR ACADEMIC SUCCESS.

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy Massey University, Albany, New Zealand

Michael Ray Irwin 2007
DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis represents my own work, except where due acknowledgement is made, and has not been previously included in a thesis, dissertation or report submitted to this university or to another institution for a degree, diploma or other qualification.

Michael R Irwin
ABSTRACT

Many boys in New Zealand are having difficulty at school and are not reaching or achieving to their potential. Over the last 30 years there has been an increasing gender gap in education with girls outperforming boys in most curriculum areas. More boys are likely to be disciplined, expelled from school, placed in special education programmes and leave school without qualifications, than girls of the same age and ability.

The aim of this research was to develop a clearer understanding of boys' learning needs and in the process to develop some strategies for improved pedagogy. To achieve this aim and ensure that boys' voices were heard and accurately recorded, boys were trained to be student researchers and consultants within the study. Schools tend to practice a strategy of silence by denying students voice. However students can be valuable collaborators in research and school improvement when given the opportunity.

This thesis recorded the voices of boys from Year level 9, 11 and 13 of three culturally and geographically dissimilar secondary schools. A diverse and broadly representative sample of boys was crucial for the study to establish a boys' perspective on school issues. The methods used to collect boys' experiences and perceptions were individual semi-structured interview, boys' only focus groups and a student motivation measurement. Over 400 boys were involved.

This research established that boys could be taught the skills and abilities to make a valuable contribution as researchers and consultants to the research process. The boys were astutely aware of the issues of education within their school and were able to process information in a responsible and honest manner. There was a uniformity of viewpoint between boys from the three schools and Year levels on ways they perceived factors enhance and hinder their learning. In particular, boys love activity and challenge and require it to engage their body and their mind. A key component to teaching boys is the teacher/boy relationship that establishes a mutual respect, individual care and consistency of expectations. A disturbing revelation is that a number of boys believe that teachers and schools do not expect them to achieve as well as girls. This attitude must be addressed by all concerned with boys' education and well being.
Boys have been part of my life for 40 years as I worked with them in education, scouting and community youth organisations. These boys, plus my two sons Hamish and Alistair have taught me a lot about fun, laughter, quirky sense of humour, taking risks, accepting a challenge, being loyal and looking after mates. Boys have strong emotions and they express and share these in different ways. I have been privileged to be part of this time with many boys. Without these boys, and the boys in this study I would not have the richness of memories that I cherish. I wish to thank my sons and all these boys.

I owe a particular debt to the three schools who willingly participated in the study. Their interest, support and knowledge of teaching boys (and girls) made this research possible. In particular I would like to thank Anne, Chanel and Chris who gave of their time and support in organising the in-school logistics of the research. Bobbie Hunter, friend and colleague, Professor Michael Townsend, Head of School, and the staff at the School of Education, Massey University in Auckland who have shared, encouraged, supported and inspired me to finish. I thank them all.

This was a huge challenge for me; studying for a doctorate was never one of my goals in life. This is especially so when considering my biggest achievements at school was on the athletics track. School Certificate was a 'just scraped by' mark. I often felt lost and disorganised with school work and unmotivated with study and homework. To this end I must acknowledge the valuable contributions made by my supervisors Associate Professor Ken Ryba and Dr Julianna Raskauskas who have challenged my thinking, extended my knowledge and supported me through to the end. They had a difficult task working with such raw material.

An extra special thanks must go to my wife Raewyn who has edited my drafts, demystified my uncooperative computer at times, shared her teaching knowledge and stories of boys; and kept the coffee, nourishment and love coming. I have much appreciated you just being there for me.
Table of Contents

CHAPTER ONE ......................................................................................... 1
Introduction ......................................................................................... 1
  1.0 The Beginning .............................................................................. 1
  1.1 Background to the study .............................................................. 2
  1.2 Research Assumptions ............................................................... 4
  1.3 A Preliminary Study .................................................................... 4
  1.4 Understanding Boys’ Voice ......................................................... 6
  1.5 Using Voice in Methodology ....................................................... 8
  1.6 School Cultures .......................................................................... 8
  1.7 Statement of Research Purpose .................................................. 9
  1.8 Structure of the Thesis ................................................................ 9
  1.9 Summary .................................................................................... 11

CHAPTER TWO ....................................................................................... 12
Literature Review ................................................................................ 12
  2.0 Introduction ................................................................................ 12
Part one: The evidence ........................................................................ 12
  2.1 Do Boys have Significant Problems? ........................................... 12
  2.2 The New Zealand Evidence: Primary Education ......................... 14
  2.3 Education Review Office ............................................................ 15
  2.4 Ministry of Education Gender Differences Review ..................... 17
  2.5 National Education Monitoring Project ....................................... 17
  2.6 Progress in International Reading Literacy Study (PIRLS) ............ 19
  2.7 Literacy ..................................................................................... 19
  2.8 New Zealand Secondary Education ............................................ 20
  2.9 National Certificate of Education Achievement ........................ 20
  2.10 Tertiary Institution Enrolments .................................................. 20
  2.11 Pupil Retention ........................................................................ 22
  2.12 Before NCEA ........................................................................... 23
  2.13 Programmes for International Student Assessment (PISA) ........... 23
  2.14 Stand-Downs and Suspensions ................................................ 23
  2.15 Resource Teachers Learning and Behaviour (RTLBs) ................. 24
  2.16 Crime and Prison ..................................................................... 24
  2.17 Overseas Evidence ................................................................... 25
  2.18 Boys in Decline? ...................................................................... 26
  2.19 Boys Model of Change .............................................................. 27
4.5 Selection of a Multi-dimensional Research Perspective ................................................................. 78
4.6 Qualitative and Quantitative Methodologies ..................................................................................... 79
4.7 Ethnography .................................................................................................................................. 80
4.8 Socio-cultural Perspective .................................................................................................................. 82
4.9 Discourse Analysis ............................................................................................................................. 84
4.10 School Culture ................................................................................................................................. 85
4.11 Motivational Theory ........................................................................................................................ 86
4.12 The Motivational Scale .................................................................................................................... 89
4.13 Data Analysis Framework ................................................................................................................ 92
4.14 Summary ....................................................................................................................................... 93

CHAPTER FIVE ................................................................................................................................. 95
Methodology in Action ......................................................................................................................... 95

5.0 Introduction ..................................................................................................................................... 95
5.1 Field Research Entry ........................................................................................................................ 95
5.2 Research Settings and Participants .................................................................................................. 96
5.3 Research Base .................................................................................................................................. 98
5.4 Research Phases ................................................................................................................................. 98
5.6 Data Collection Methods .................................................................................................................. 101
5.7 Motivation Scale ............................................................................................................................... 102
5.8 Focus Groups ................................................................................................................................... 102
5.9 Interviews ....................................................................................................................................... 106
5.10 Consultative Group ............................................................................................................................ 108
5.11 Data Recording and Analysis ............................................................................................................ 109
5.12 Data Presentation ............................................................................................................................. 111
5.13 Ethical Considerations ....................................................................................................................... 112
5.14 Summary ....................................................................................................................................... 114

CHAPTER SIX ...................................................................................................................................... 115
Mates and other interests ....................................................................................................................... 115

6.0 Introduction ..................................................................................................................................... 115
6.1 Boys: What they like doing Best......................................................................................................... 116
6.2 Mates or Friends ................................................................................................................................. 117
6.3 Benefit of Mates ................................................................................................................................. 118
6.4 The Characteristics of Good Mates .................................................................................................... 121
6.5 Hanging out with Mates: What is Involved? ...................................................................................... 122
6.6 Mates and School ............................................................................................................................... 123
6.7 Mates and Peer Pressure .................................................................................................................... 125
6.8 Mates and Partying ............................................................................................................................. 125
6.9 Comparisons between Schools and Year Levels .............................................................................. 127
6.10 Analysis and Discussion ................................................. 128
6.11 Summary .................................................................. 136

CHAPTER SEVEN ................................................................. 139
Teachers and Learning ..................................................... 139
7.0 Introduction ................................................................ 139
7.1 Boys and Learning Strategies ..................................... 140
7.2 Distraction to Boys’ Learning .................................... 142
7.3 Boys’ Perceptions of Good Teachers ......................... 146
7.4 Boys Seeking Help with Learning ............................. 149
7.5 Boys Learning, Girls Learning ................................. 150
7.6 Analysis and Discussion .......................................... 153
7.7 Summary ................................................................. 162

CHAPTER EIGHT ............................................................... 164
School and Curriculum .................................................. 164
8.0 Introduction ............................................................... 164
8.1 The Best Thing About School ................................ 165
8.2 The Most Difficult Thing About School .................. 167
8.3 Changes Boys Would Make to School ................. 169
8.4 Boys’ Best Curriculum Subjects ......................... 171
8.5 Boys’ Most Difficult Curriculum Subjects ............ 174
8.6 Discussion and Analysis ........................................ 177
8.7 Summary ................................................................. 184

CHAPTER NINE ................................................................ 186
Boys’ Motivation to Learn ............................................ 186
9.0 Introduction ............................................................... 186
9.1 Qualitative Data: What Motivates Boys? ............... 187
9.2 Quantitative Data: The Student Motivation Scale .... 190
9.3 Quantitative Analysis .............................................. 191
9.4 Mean Factor Scores .................................................. 193
9.5 School Level and Socio-economic Effects .............. 195
9.6 Booster Factors ........................................................ 198
9.7 Guzzler Factors ........................................................ 199
9.8 Summary of Quantitative Data ............................. 200
9.9 Discussion and Analysis ........................................ 200
9.10 Summary ............................................................... 208
CHAPTER TEN

Conclusion and Implications

10.0 Introduction.................................................................................................................. 209
10.1 Meeting the Aims of the Research.................................................................................. 210
10.2 Limitations of the Research and Future Directions...................................................... 211
10.3 Limitations of Student Researchers in boy only focus groups.................................... 213
10.4 Boys' Research and Education so far........................................................................... 214
10.5 Contribution to Knowledge........................................................................................... 215
10.6 Implications for Boys.................................................................................................... 217
10.7 Implications for Teachers and Schools.......................................................................... 218
10.8 Implications for Policy.................................................................................................. 222
10.9 Final Remarks................................................................................................................ 223

BIBLIOGRAPHY............................................................................................................. 226

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: Student Motivation Scale........................................................................... 244
APPENDIX B: School Information Sheet............................................................................ 247
APPENDIX C: Human Ethics Approval.............................................................................. 249
APPENDIX D: Boys Information Sheet................................................................................ 250
APPENDIX E: Parent Information Sheet............................................................................. 252
APPENDIX F: Student Researcher Information Sheet......................................................... 254
APPENDIX G: Focus Group Instructions.............................................................................. 256
APPENDIX H: Training Handout for Student Researchers................................................ 259
APPENDIX I: Student Interview Guide for Pilot Study....................................................... 262
APPENDIX J: Student Interview Guide for Main Study....................................................... 264
APPENDIX K: Focus Group Brainstorm Examples............................................................. 266

LIST OF TABLES

Chapter Two

Table 2.1 NEMP Cycle 2 (1999 - 2002)............................................................................ 18
Table 2.2 Referrals of boys and girls to specific educational programmes............................ 19
Table 2.3 National Qualifications Framework Statistics 2004........................................... 21
Table 2.4 Number of Students leaving Secondary Schools in 2004.................................... 22
Table 2.5 Demographic Indicators for Women.................................................................... 31
Table 2.6 Summary of Intervention Strategies................................................................... 43

Chapter Four

Table 4.1 The Main Research Perspectives Informing this Study........................................ 80
Table 4.2 Theories of Motivation .................................................................87
Table 4.3 Theories of Cognitive Motivation ................................................88

Chapter Five
Table 5.1 Number of Schools and Participants in Data Collection ..................96
Table 5.2 Overview of the Study ..................................................................114

Chapter Six
Table 6.1 Boys Preferred Interests ...............................................................116
Table 6.2 Benefits of Mates .......................................................................119
Table 6.3 Characteristics of a Good Mate ....................................................121

Chapter Seven
Table 7.1 Boys' Perceived Best Approaches to Learning ...............................140
Table 7.2 Boys' Perceived Distractions to Their Learning ..........................142
Table 7.3 Boys' Perceived Factors to a Good Teacher ................................147
Table 7.4 Boys' Source for Learning Assistance .........................................150
Table 7.5 Boys' Perceived Relationship & Pedagogy Qualities of Teachers .160

Chapter Eight
Table 8.1 The Best Thing about School for Boys .......................................165
Table 8.2 Boys' Perceptions of Factors that make School more difficult ....168
Table 8.3 Curriculum Subjects that Boys like Best .....................................172
Table 8.4 Identified factors contributing to the Best Subject Choice ...........173
Table 8.5 Curriculum Boys find Difficult ...................................................174
Table 8.6 Why Boys find some Curriculum Difficult ...................................175

Chapter Nine
Table 9.1 Factors that Motivate Boys to Learn ..........................................188
Table 9.2 Eigenvalues and Total Variance Explained ..................................192
Table 9.3 Cronbach's Alpha ......................................................................193
Table 9.4 Item Factor Loadings for the Student Motivation Scale ...............194
Table 9.5 Total Mean & Standard Deviation for Motivation Factors ..........195
Table 9.6 Boys' Mean Factor Scores as a Function of Year Level & SES ....197
Table 9.7 Boys' Perceptions of Motivation linked to Motivation Model ......202

LIST OF FIGURES
Chapter Two
Figure 2.1 Contributing Factors to Gender Gap ........................................28

Chapter Three
Figure 3.1 Ladder of Pupil Participation ...................................................60
Figure 3.2 Reasons for Incorporating Student Participation into Schools ....69
Chapter Four
Figure 4.1 Central Theoretical Perspectives & Associated Motivational Constructs.. 91

Chapter Five
Figure 5.1 Research Phases.................................................................99
Figure 5.2 Research Timeline .............................................................100
Figure 5.3 Operation Framework for Analysis of Text within the Research......111

Chapter Six
Figure 6.1 Iceberg Model of Adolescent Boy Behaviour ..........................130
Figure 6.2 Apex Model of Friendship..................................................133

Chapter Seven
Figure 7.1 Focus Group Brainstorm: Gender Learning Differences..............153

Chapter Eight
Figure 8.1 Conceptual Equations for Boys Liking School .........................178
Figure 8.2 Learning Triangle based on Boys' Perceptions for learning..........185

Chapter Nine
Figure 9.1 Focus Group Brainstorm: What Motivates? ............................190

LIST OF VIGNETTES

Chapter Six
Vignette 6.1 A Boys View on Partying, Drink and Girls ..........................127

Chapter Seven
Vignette 7.1 A Boys Response to Teaching Style ....................................144
Vignette 7.2 A Year 13 Boys Perspective on Learning ............................145
Vignette 7.3 Good Teachers. Bad Teachers .........................................148

Chapter Eight
Vignette 8.1 Illustration of Effect of Teaching Style ................................174
Vignette 8.2 Michael ..........................................................176