Contested Inheritance: The Emergence of Social Science Research in New Zealand

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Social Policy at Massey University

Neil T. Lunt

2004
Abstract

The substantive task of the thesis is to explore a dimension of social change – the emergence of social science research within New Zealand by 1984. The thesis begins by asking questions about the status of any account – as description, understanding, or explanation. In the first instance, these questions are discussed within positivist and anti-positivist traditions. Following on from these, the work examines a series of post-positivist approaches that focus on method, general theory, and methatheorising.

Many accounts of social science development emphasise the role of a rational social science idea, others stress contextual considerations. In finding these wanting, the thesis argues for the incorporation of culture, structure and agency, and discusses attempts at resolving these within the work of Anthony Giddens and Andrew Abbott.

The final part of the theoretical discussion explores the potential of Critical Realism for causal analysis. Within this tradition, Margaret Archer’s work is particularly useful with its commitment to robust notions of agency, culture and structure, and emphasising their interplay through time. With some modest revision to attune her position to the demands of practice, the thesis suggests ‘Retroductive Narrative Realism’ that incorporates ontological insights and the two practical moves of analysis and narrative. The thesis argues that these moves must be explicit, using the analytic to create hypothesis that are then tested via narratives that link emerging structural and cultural forms.

The thesis uses this approach for the substantive task of writing a theoretically informed account of social science research. It works within the spheres of State, University and broader social spaces, centring interests and the role of conditioned interaction. The account is presented within four phases: the inheritance – research by the State for the purposes of the State; in search of independent means – research by the State of broader social forms; alternative benefactors – research of social issues by broader social and University interests; on the brink of bankruptcy – a questioning of the State and social forms by social and University interests. Over these four periods it is possible to trace the emergence of social research, then social science, and then specific disciplines.
Acknowledgements

There are several professional and personal debts that writing this thesis has incurred. Many staff members in the Departments of Politics at the Universities of Durham and York were an early influence on me. Later, whilst a fledgling researcher at the Social Policy Research Unit, York, I was fortunate to have generous mentors that included Karl Atkin, Russell Mannion, Peter Smith, Patricia Thornton, Anne Corden, and the late Sally Baldwin. As well as encouraging greater clarity of thought, they all also demanded greater clarity of expression. My hope is that the thesis captures some measure of both.

I thank Paul Spoonley who made suggestions and provided detailed comments during the various stages of this work. I was also fortunate to benefit from the expertise of Warwick Tie, Kerry Howe and Roger Burrows who read and commented on individual chapters and sections. The support and encouragement I received from Peter Lineham and Mike O'Brien were very welcome.

I received an Advanced Research Degree Award from Massey University for the first part of 2003 which, along with a small award from the Massey University Research Fund (MURF), provided welcome relief from some teaching duties. MURF also contributed towards the cost of the many visits to archives and resources in Wellington. I express my gratitude for all these vital forms of assistance.

Joy Oehlers at Massey University's library helped trace many esoteric references, and obtain the sources, during the completion of this project. Many staff at the National Library, National Archives, Alexander Turnbull Library and Hocken Library provided assistance throughout the duration of the archival research. I am grateful to Dina Cloete for proofreading the final document, and to Louise Penny for her skill in preparing the complex graphics.

During the writing of this work, Carl Davidson and Stephen Dickens gave constant encouragement and offered bearings on reality. I would like to acknowledge their support and friendship during this period.

Finally, I am indebted to Sarah whose sacrifices during the writing of this thesis have been immeasurable. Since the birth of our daughter in 2003 the domestic workload has increased exponentially, and Sarah has borne this with tolerance and forbearance. Without the patience, understanding, love and support of Sarah and Trinity, this work would not have been completed. Moreover, when theoretical doubt weighed heavy, together they provided the most irrefutable evidence possible of the existence of things which are truly irreducible, enduring, and so very real.

NTL
April 2004
Waiheke
Contents

Abstract i
Acknowledgements ii
Contents iii
Figures and Tables vi

Section I: The Task
Chapter One

Introduction
The Background 1
The Study Material 4

Chapter Two

Contested inheritance: Depicting the growth of social science research
Introduction 7
State Reconnaissance 8
The University of New Zealand 13
Post-War Expansion of the Universities 17
Knowledge For Policy in the Post-War Period 19
Summary 22

Chapter Three

The Emergence of Social Science: Explanation within positivist and anti-positivist frameworks
Introduction 25
‘Reportage’ 27
In Search of an Explanation 30
Explanation in Science: The covering law 34
The Role of Social Theory 38
Summary 44

Chapter Four

Post-Positivist Developments: Method, general theory and metatheorising
Introduction 46
The ‘Post’ in Post-Positivism 46
Post-Positivism as a Warrant for Arresting Falsehood 49
Post-Positivism as the Necessity of General Theory 53
Metatheorising 60
The Nature of Reflexivity 62
Summary 67
## Section II: The Tools

### Chapter Five

**Explaining Change: From internalism to externalism**

- Introduction: 69
- The Advancement of Knowledge: 69
- Advancement of Knowledge: A critique: 74
- Causal Structuralist Frameworks: 78
- Summary: 88

### Chapter Six

**Putting Actors Back In**

- Introduction: 90
- False Humanism, Erroneous Economism: 90
- Acting Up: Social actors, people and rule followers: 101
- Re-conceptualising Structures and Embracing the Cultural Turn: 107
- Summary: 109

### Chapter Seven

**Explaining Change: Culture, structure and agency**

- Introduction: 111
- Resolving the Agency + Culture + Structure Equation: 113
- Giddens' Structuration: 118
- Narrative Positivism: 127
- Summary: 130

## Section III: Sharpening the Tools

### Chapter Eight

**Critical Realism: For ontology, towards explanation**

- Introduction: 132
- The Roots of Critical Realism: 132
- The 'Undeniability' of Ontology: 138
- CR in 'Practice': 142
- Summary: 148

### Chapter Nine

**Realising Realism within Historical Sociology**

- Introduction: 151
- Morphogenesis and Methodological Structurism: 151
- Appending Morphogenesis: Towards 'Retroductive Narrative Realism': 160
- Summary: 167
Section IV: Getting the Job Done

Chapter Ten
The Inheritance
Introduction 170
Colonial New Zealand as Structured Context 173
Colonial New Zealand as Cultural Context 183
Interaction and the Emergence of State Research Activities 188
Summary 192

Chapter Eleven
In Search of Independent Means
Introduction 199
Shifting Structural Setting: Expansion of the policy space 200
Shifting Cultural Settings: Science, intervention and conceptual transformation 208
Interaction and Societal Study by the State 213
Summary 220

Chapter Twelve
Alternative Benefactors
Introduction 227
Re-structuring Economy, Society, Polity 228
Re-conceptualised Cultural Considerations 234
Interaction as Extra-State Investigation of the Social 236
Summary 244

Chapter Thirteen
On the Brink of Bankruptcy
Introduction 252
Economic, Social and Political Catallaxy 253
Ideational Challenge and Chaos 260
Interaction and Conflict over the Investigation of State and Society 263
Summary 269

Chapter Fourteen
Conclusion 273

Sources 277

References 281
# Figures and Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table/Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 3.1</td>
<td>Dimensions of change 1920-1984</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.1</td>
<td>Knowledge growth and the institutional mirror</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.1</td>
<td>Summary of theoretical approaches</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.1</td>
<td>Three views of conflation</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9.1</td>
<td>Conflation or synchronic theorising</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9.2</td>
<td>Analytical dualism and the basic cycle</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10.1</td>
<td>The inheritance and searching for independent means</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11.1</td>
<td>Independent means and alternative benefactors</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 12.1</td>
<td>Alternative benefactors and on the brink of bankruptcy</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>