Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
PREJUDICE, PARADOX and POSSIBILITY

Nursing people from cultures other than one's own

Deborah Spence

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of Health Sciences
Massey University
New Zealand

November 1999
Abstract

This study explores the experience of nursing a person, or people, from cultures other than the nurse’s own. Informed by the tradition of philosophical hermeneutics, and drawing specifically on some of the notions articulated by Hans-Georg Gadamer and Charles Taylor, it seeks to understand everyday nursing practices within their cultural and historical context.

Against a background of Maori resurgence, nurses have been challenged in Aotearoa-New Zealand to recognise and address racism in their practice. Meeting the health needs of all people has long been important in nursing yet the curricular changes implemented in the early 1990s to enhance nursing’s contribution to a more equitable health service created uncertainty and tension both within nursing, and between nursing and the wider community.

In this study, I have interpreted the experiences of seventeen nurses practising in an increasingly ethnically diverse region. Personal understandings and those from relevant literature have been used to illuminate further the nature of cross-cultural experience from a nurse’s perspective.

The thesis asserts that the notions of prejudice, paradox and possibility can be used to describe the experience of nursing a person from another culture. Prejudice refers to the prior understandings that influence nursing action in both a positive and a negative sense. Paradox relates to the coexistence and necessary interplay of contradictory meanings and positions, while possibility points to the potential for new understandings to surface from the fusion of past with present, and between different interpretations. As New Zealand nurses negotiate the conflicts essential for ongoing development of their practice, the play of prejudice, paradox and possibility is evident at intra-personal and interpersonal levels as well as in relation to professional and other social discourses. This thesis challenges nurses to persist in working with the tensions inherent in cross-cultural practice. It encourages continuation of their efforts to understand and move beyond the prejudices that otherwise preclude the exploration of new possibilities.
Acknowledgments

The tension-filled and paradoxical journey to present this thesis has been contributed to by many people. First and foremost, I wish to thank my husband and partner in life, Alistair, for his patient and unerring belief that I could complete this work. Our daughters, Sarah and Elisabeth, and our extended families, have similarly supported and understood the demands and lengthy commitment required.

Sincere thanks go to the nurses who generously shared their stories. Without their belief that this was a valuable project, the thesis would not have eventuated. The encouragement of friends, colleagues and fellow doctoral students is also acknowledged.

I would like to thank my supervisors, Professors Paul Spoonley and Julie Boddy for their assistance and expertise, Dr Judith Christensen for her early guidance, Dr Bob Wicks and Isabelle Sherrard for valuable critique of aspects of the work.

Last, but never least, I am indebted to my friend and mentor, Liz Smythe, from whom I have learned so much.

Thank you all for making this possible.
Key to Transcriptions

In presenting the research findings, the following abbreviations and conventions have been used:

*Italics* identifies the interview data provided by the nurses participating. Entries quoted from the researcher’s journals are also italicised.

Names With the consent of the participants, the nurses' voices are identified through the use of pseudonyms.

(Name, 1:53) References the participant’s name, interview and page number.

[] Indicates alterations made by the researcher to enhance clarity and grammatical flow.

… Denotes material deleted from the original text
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT ......................................................................................................... II

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ...................................................................................... III

KEY TO TRANSCRIPTIONS ............................................................................. IV

TABLE OF CONTENTS ...................................................................................... V

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 1
   Becoming involved ..................................................................................... 1
   Refining the question ................................................................................. 3
   Selecting the approach .............................................................................. 4
   A summary of my beginning position .......................................................... 5
   The justification for selecting hermeneutics ................................................ 5
   The philosophical assumptions underpinning the study .............................. 7
   The key terms used ................................................................................... 9
   An overview of the study ........................................................................... 10
   An overview of the chapters ...................................................................... 11
   Conclusion ................................................................................................ 13

CHAPTER TWO: CULTURAL AND HISTORICAL HORIZONS ...................... 15
   Early horizons ........................................................................................... 15
   The meeting of two disparate cultures ....................................................... 15
   Nursing culture: humanitarian intentions ................................................. 19
   New Zealand’s vision of opportunity for all ............................................... 25
   Nightingale’s legacy .................................................................................. 27
   Stimulus for change .................................................................................. 27
   The middle horizon ................................................................................... 28
   Increasing diversity ................................................................................... 29
   Unmasking the visions .............................................................................. 30
   Signs of change in the nursing focus .......................................................... 30
   The recent horizon: two decades of challenge and change .................... 32
   Revisiting the Treaty ................................................................................ 35
   Glimpses of possibility .............................................................................. 37
   The current situation: an overview ............................................................. 38
   Conclusion ................................................................................................ 40
## CHAPTER THREE: EXPLORING THE MEANINGS OF CULTURE IN NEW ZEALAND NURSING

- Colonial Meaning: Nurses as bearers of 'civilised' health care .......................................................... 42
- The relative invisibility of 'culture' in nursing ........................................................................................ 46
- The emergence of an 'anthropological' understanding of culture ....................................................... 46
- The beginnings of a 'sociological' interpretation of culture .................................................................. 48
- The emergence of a 'sociopolitical' meaning of culture ........................................................................ 50
- Nursing as negotiated and equal partnership ....................................................................................... 52
- Parallel developments in the practice arena ........................................................................................... 54
- The heightened visibility of 'culture' in nursing ...................................................................................... 56
- Cultural safety in nursing education ..................................................................................................... 57
- Responses within nursing education to the introduction of cultural safety ........................................... 58
- Cultural safety becomes synonymous with 'political correctness' ...................................................... 60
- Culture and the potential for division within nursing ........................................................................... 62
- Revisiting the meaning of culture in nursing ......................................................................................... 64
- The 1990s: an overview ......................................................................................................................... 65

## CHAPTER FOUR: FROM PHILOSOPHY TO METHODOLOGY

- Hermeneutics: origins and meanings ..................................................................................................... 67
- Hermeneutics: understanding, interpretation and experience ............................................................... 68
- The hermeneutic circle: evolving understandings ................................................................................. 69
- Understanding and historicity ................................................................................................................ 71
- The modern sense of self, understanding and emotions ....................................................................... 74
- Language and understanding ................................................................................................................ 75
- Understanding as fusion of horizons ...................................................................................................... 77
- Extensions/challenges to Gadamerian philosophy ................................................................................. 78
- Cross-cultural understanding ................................................................................................................ 79
- Understanding and the research question .............................................................................................. 80
- Conclusion ............................................................................................................................................. 81

## CHAPTER FIVE: FROM METHODOLOGY TO METHOD

- The issue of rigour in hermeneutic research .......................................................................................... 83
- Laying open the audit trail ...................................................................................................................... 85
- Ethical approval ..................................................................................................................................... 86
- Selecting the participants ....................................................................................................................... 87
- Gaining consent and maintaining anonymity and confidentiality ......................................................... 87
- Criteria for participation ........................................................................................................................ 88
- The study participants ........................................................................................................................... 88
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>CHAPTER SIX: ENCOUNTERING DIFFERENCE</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Difference is ‘different from me’</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Encountering ‘difference as ethnicity’</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other differences that matter</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interpreting difference to mean Maori</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Considering Identity and Difference</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Encountering difference as difficulty</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Communication difficulties</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Difficulty as competing demands</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Encountering Difference: bringing the meanings together</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>CHAPTER SEVEN: EXPERIENCING TENSION(S)</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experiencing tension: how I came to this theme</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experiencing tension as lived through in encounters</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experiencing frustration</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experiencing guilt</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Simultaneously experiencing fear and hope</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experiencing tension as questions</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experiencing tension as horizons in conflict</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tensions between nursing and society</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tensions within nursing</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tensions between nurses and their significant others</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experiencing tension(s): bringing the meanings together</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recommendations ............................................................................................... 217
Study limitations and the need for further research ........................................ 220
Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 221

APPENDIX A ...................................................................................................... 224
APPENDIX B ...................................................................................................... 228
APPENDIX C ...................................................................................................... 229
APPENDIX D ...................................................................................................... 232
REFERENCES .................................................................................................... 233