Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
TE RĒRENGA O TE RĀ

AUTONOMY AND IDENTITY:

MĀORI EDUCATIONAL ASPIRATIONS

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education

At
Massey University
Palmerston North
New Zealand

Arohia E. Durie

2001
ABSTRACT

Te Rerenga o te Rā, Autonomy and Identity: Māori Educational Aspirations explores the many factors that impact on Māori educational aspirations. Both historical and contemporary trends and patterns are analysed including comparative case studies of two other indigenous peoples, in order to identify the reasons why there is disjunction between educational policies and Māori aims. The first part of the thesis comprises an historical and contemporary analysis of the relationship between Māori and the State, including a comparative exploration of indigeneity. The second part comprises a critique of Māori education research and argues for an indigenous methodology for understanding the lived reality of Māori ‘at school’. The third part comprises critical policy analysis and draws conclusions as to Māori educational aspirations. An extensive examination of policy, together with interviews with forty Māori men and women formed the basis of this research.

Major educational policies are reviewed alongside wider policies and politics in order to demonstrate the connections between the position of Māori within Aotearoa - New Zealand, and the likelihood of meeting educational aspirations. The use of narrative is a standard method of information transfer in a Māori cultural context and was deliberately chosen as a research method for that reason.

The stories about education from participants, about their own times at school, and about the pursuit of their own goals, add a personal element that bring life to the findings and spirit to the inferences.

There is no single factor that will predictably lead to the fulfilment of aspirations but several major conclusions have been drawn. The first is that any analysis of Māori educational performance requires a consideration of the wider policy frameworks within which educational practice is conducted. It is of limited value to assess classroom interaction without being cognisant of the context that gives shape to the practice. The thesis draws a strong link between the degree of Māori enthusiasm for education and the extent of the state’s recognition of Māori in its policies and the legislation.
The second major conclusion is that socio-economic standing, while an important measure, is not by itself a sufficient indicator of Māori aspirations. Attention is drawn to the difference between attaining socio-economic parity with non-Māori and being able to live as Māori. The third is that the retention of a cultural identity is a critical determinant of Māori satisfaction and the ability to determine directions for the future is another. Both identity and autonomy are seen as significant prerequisites for the development of an education system that is aligned with Māori objectives.
He Mihi

Tūtiro ō mata ki Hikurangi maunga, ki te toka whakairo e tū ake nei
Whakarere iho ki te riutanga o Waiapu ki ngā mātākurae o Te Tai Rawhiti
Porourangi tipuna, Porourangi tangata!
Whakawhiti atu ki Te Whatumatarau, ki Te Kawakawa mai Tawhiti
Ka tau ki Hinerupe e rere rā koe Awaitere ki waho rā ki pae tawhiti e!
Ka piko atu anō rā ki Horoera ki Mātahi o te Tau
Tākiri mai te atua ka rere ko te rā!
Rere ana ki Te Motu o Kalawa ki Ngā Kuri a Tarawhata
Hōatu to kauhau tangata ki uta, pikiia ake te tīki taumata ki Ōtiki
Ka mārama te tūtiro ki Rangiata, ki Matarēhua – kāinga o Te Whānau a
Tarahauti Tau ake rā ki Te Ahikāroa, ki Te Tipare o Niu
E ara ki Te Roto o Kautuku, ki te manawa ora o te īwi
E tiu koe e taku manu kōrero! Koī, koī, koīa e ara e!

Kei nga maunga kōrero, pari karangaranga puta noa te motu, tena koutou katoa. Koia tēnei ko te kupu whakamihi atu i runga i te karanga whānui o tēnei kaupapa rangahau e kiia nei ko 'Te Rerenga o te Rā'. Ko te tūmanako ia, mā ngā whakaputanga o tēnei kaupapa rangahau, e āhei ai te īwi Māori kia eketia ngā taumata teitei o te mātauranga, kia tū rangatira ai tātou katoa i roto i te Ao Mārama.

Tēnei anō te tuku mihi atu ki nga puna kōrero, otirā ki a koutou katoa i tautokohia ai tēnei kaupapa mahi. Ko koutou anō te take i whakatūnanahia ai ngā wawata o roto i te kukū o taku manawa. Nō reira tēnā rawa atu koutou.

Ko te mātauranga hoki he ara tika hei whāingo mā tātou katoa. Ko te pūtaki o ēnei kōrero he arahi i a tātou i runga i tēnei ara.

‘Ko te pae tawhiti whaia kia tata, ko te pae tata whakamaua kia tīnā’
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

While in the end this undertaking was my own, it would not have been possible without the cooperation, support, and encouragement of others.

There were many who pioneered Māori educational advancement and they have left a lasting legacy of dedication beyond the cause, absolute commitment to their pupils, and champions of the rights of learners. Their efforts are part of the heritage that gives Māori education a distinctive character.

Nā rātou i whakatakoto tenei kaupapa. Nā rātou te kī.

I am also conscious of the scholars and researchers who have preceded me. Much of their work has been quoted in this thesis and regardless of the viewpoints advocated, I have appreciated their writings and wisdom, and the opportunity to study their work in a wide range of publications. Teachers from many persuasions, learners at primary, secondary and tertiary levels, and parents and grandparents, have similarly left their mark on this thesis. In that respect I am particularly grateful to the forty people whose stories provided the substance for chapters 8 and 9. Their recollections and keen insights have been invaluable and incredibly illuminating. Tēna koutou.

Closer to home, I wish to acknowledge my two supervisors, Professors John Codd and Richard Harker. Although their tolerance was often tested, their advice and constructive criticism was never failing and has been much appreciated. So too has the quiet support from Te Uru Māraurau, the Department of Māori and Multicultural Education at Massey University.

Finally, I am grateful to my own family, and the wider whānau, for bearing with me, and more than that, for never doubting the outcome. Tēna koutou katoa.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>He Kupu Mihi</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Appendices</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glossary of Māori Terms</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1 Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Māori Educational Participation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Aim</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Waitangi Tribunal</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crises within Crises</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Māori Political Representation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power Shifts</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Control</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Welfare State</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Neo-liberal Reforms</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideological Misfits</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whānau Expectations</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contested Knowledges</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahi Rangahau: Research Strategies</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART ONE
THE LEGACY OF COLONIALISM: RESISTANCE AND STRUGGLE

Chapter 2 Māori and the State 36

Establishment of the State ........................................ 36
The Historical Context of the Treaty .......................... 36
Power and Control: Aotearoa-New Zealand as a nation state ...... 43
Māori Claims ......................................................... 47
Principles of the Treaty ........................................... 47
Māori Participation in the Affairs of the Nation .................. 51
Defining the Partnership ............................................ 52
Role of the State .................................................... 55
The Welfare State ................................................... 59
The Minimal State .................................................. 60
Constitutional Arrangements ....................................... 61
The Bi-national State ............................................... 62

Chapter 3 Māori Representation and Representations of Māori 63

Fairness and Justice .................................................. 63
Constitutional Reform ............................................. 65
The King Movement – Māori Sovereignty ....................... 69
Right Rites .......................................................... 72
Instruments for Justice ............................................ 77
Equality of Representation ......................................... 79
Colonial Stories ..................................................... 80
Nation Building ..................................................... 84
Conclusion ........................................................... 85

Chapter 4 Indigeneity 87

Sovereignty Claims .................................................. 89
Indigenous Aspirations for Autonomy ........................... 90
Indigeneity versus sovereignty ........................................... 97
Doctrine ................................................................................. 99
Decolonisation ........................................................................ 100
Who is indigenous? ................................................................. 101
Indigenisation ........................................................................ 103
International Recognition of Indigenous Rights .................. 105
Educational Case Studies ....................................................... 110
Saami Experiences ................................................................. 110
Nisga’a Experiences ............................................................... 114

PART TWO
MĀORI AT SCHOOL: VOICES FROM EXPERIENCE

Chapter 5    Re-searching Māori Education  119

Colonialism and Research ..................................................... 119
Critical or Critique? .............................................................. 121
Research Positioning ............................................................... 128
International Comparisons .................................................... 131
Researchers as agents of imperialism ...................................... 136
Good Research ....................................................................... 140
False Premises ....................................................................... 142
Māori Standpoints ................................................................. 143
Māori Freedom Models for Māori Development .................. 156
Te Hoe Nuku Roa ................................................................. 157
Cultural and Ethnic Factors .................................................... 158
Appropriate and Appropriation ............................................... 158
Diasporic logic ....................................................................... 161
Chapter 6  A Paradigm for Māori Research: Ngākau Māori  166

Methodological Considerations

New Perspectives ..............................................166
Ngākau Māori Research .......................................169
Māori Development Research .................................171
Iringa Korero - Narrative Research ........................173
Analysis ..........................................................176

Ethicality  .........................................................179
Research Ethics Committees .................................179
Ethical Themes ..................................................181
Ngākau Māori Research and Ethicality .......................184
The Mana Factor ................................................184
Benefiting from Research ....................................186
Forty Voices ......................................................187

Chapter 7  Māori at School: Forty Voices  188

Stories and Narratives ........................................188
Participants .....................................................191
Wāhanga Korero: Hearing the Voices .......................194
Analysis: Tāhuhu iringa korero .............................196
Five Themes .......................................................197
Readiness for Life ...............................................197
Being Māori .......................................................202
Māori at Home ..................................................217
Motivation .........................................................217
Diminished Horizons ..........................................220
Forms of Discrimination ......................................223
Catching the Tide ...............................................228
PART THREE
EDUCATIONAL POLICY AND CULTURAL IDENTITY

Chapter 8  Policy Discourse in Māori Education 230

In Search of a School ............................................ 230
Policy Directions .................................................. 232
Assimilation ....................................................... 233
Integration .......................................................... 235
Biculturalism ......................................................... 244
Autonomy ............................................................. 248
Māori in Mainstream English Schools ....................... 251
Policy Platforms .................................................. 254
Hui Taumata .......................................................... 255
Te Urupare Rangapu ............................................... 257
Devolution ............................................................ 258
Ka Awātea ............................................................. 259
Re-centralisation .................................................... 262
Gaps or Spaces ...................................................... 264
A Māori Education Authority .................................. 268
The Ministry of Education ....................................... 270
The Broad Strategies ............................................. 272

Chapter 9  Māori Educational Aspirations: Contradictions and Compromises

Context and Compromises ....................................... 276
Inequality ............................................................. 278
Kāwanatanga, Kura and Kainga ................................. 283
Te Reo Māori, The Māori Language ............................ 286
Monocultural Ideals ................................................. 287
Urbanisation .......................................................... 288
Curriculum Progress ............................................... 294
Māori Identity ........................................................ 298
Māori in Education ............................................... 299
LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples
Appendix 2: Interview Questions
GLOSSARY OF MĀORI TERMS

Ahikaa retention of a territorial right by continuing occupation
Ākoranga Māori Māori learning and teaching
Āpiti hono joining together
Hāhi church or religion
Hapū tribe
Hawaiki a homeland in the Pacific; point of origin for early voyagers
He Whakapūtanga o te Rangatiratanga the Declaration of Independence
Rangatiratanga o Nū Tirene
Huara hi road, pathway, direction
Hui a gathering, seminar, or conference
Iwi tribe, or people
Ka Awātea title of a report for the Minister of Māori Affairs, signifying a new beginning
Kainga home, village
Kapa Haka performing arts
Kaumātua older person, elder
Kaupapa Māori Māori agenda; Māori focused activities
Kāwanatanga the government
Kawenata covenant (used to describe the Treaty of Waitangi)
Kingitanga Māori king movement
Kō a digging implement
Kohanga Reo Māori language nest
Kōrero talk, discussion
‘Ko te pae tawhiti whaia kia tata, ko te pae tata whakamaua kia tina’.
Kura School
Kura Kaupapa Schools where Māori language and values are practiced
Mahi Rangahau research activity
Mahinga kai  traditional food sites
Mana a iwi  the standing of a tribe
Mana Moana  tribal authority over water
Mana Motuhake  autonomy
Mana tangata  personal dignity
Mana whakahaere  rights to undertake an activity or process
Mana whenua  traditional rights over land
Marae  tribal or community gathering place
Marae ātea  ceremonial gathering place
Mātauranga Māori  Māori knowledge
Mate  sickness or death
Nga āhuatanga - noho-a-tangata  social policy
Nga Matatini Māori  Māori diversity
Ngā - Whakanekeneketanga  change over time
Ngākau Māori  a research method based on commitment to Māori
O rātou taonga katoa  all their possessions
Paihere Tangata  collectivity and common bonds
Pākehā  New Zealander of Anglo-Saxon descent
Pāngarau  mathematics
Putaiao  science
Rangahau Māori  Māori research
Rangatiratanga  authority
Roopu Māori  a Māori group
Runanga  tribal or community council
Taha Māori  a Māori component
Takatakahi mana  disrespect for authority
Takiwā  region,district
Tangata whenua  indigenous status
Taonga  valued possession
Taonga katoa  all valued possessions
Tapu  system of prohibition
Tatai hono  joining together
Te ao Māori  the Māori world
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maori Term</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tēna koutou</td>
<td>greetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Te reo Māori</td>
<td>Māori language (or tongue)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tikanga</td>
<td>rules, regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tino rangatiratanga</td>
<td>absolute authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tipuna</td>
<td>ancestor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tupu</td>
<td>growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turangawaewae</td>
<td>ancestral land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waitohu</td>
<td>indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whakakotahi</td>
<td>unity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whakamana</td>
<td>create pride, esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whakapapa</td>
<td>genealogy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whakatauaki</td>
<td>proverb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whānau</td>
<td>extended family, or a group behaving as if it were a family</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>